Vol. LIV—No. 1.

BENGAL LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY
Accn. No. 358
11 SEP 47
LIBRARY

Assembly Proceedings

Official Report

Bengal Legislative Assembly

Fifth Session, 1939

15th, 16th, 20th, 21st, 22nd, 23rd and 25th
February, 1939

Superintendent, Government Printing
Bengal Government Press, Alipore, Bengal
1939

LIBRARY OF THE BENGAL LEGISLATURE
CALCUTTA.

GOVERNMENT OF BENGAL

GOVERNOR OF BENGAL.

His Excellency the Right Hon'ble LORD BRABOURNE, G.C.S.I., G.C.I.E., M.C.

MEMBERS OF THE COUNCIL OF MINISTERS.

(1) The Hon'ble Mr. ABUL KASEM FAZLUL HUQ, in charge of the Education Department.

(2) The Hon'ble Mr. NALINI RANJAN SARKER, in charge of the Finance Department.

(3) The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN, K.C.I.E., in charge of the Home Department.

(4) The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY, in charge of the Revenue Department.

(5) The Hon'ble Nawab Khwaja HABIBULLAH Bahadur, of Dacca, in charge of the Departments of Local Self-Government and Industries.

(6) The Hon'ble Maharaja SRIS CHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar, in charge of the Department of Communications and Works.

(7) The Hon'ble Mr. HUSEYAN SHAHEED SUHRAWARDY, in charge of Commerce and Labour and Rural Reconstruction Departments.

(8) The Hon'ble Nawab MUSHARRUF HOSSAIN, Khan Bahadur, in charge of the Judicial and Legislative Departments.

(9) The Hon'ble Mr. PRASANNA DEB RAIKUT, in charge of the Forests and Excise Departments.

(10) The Hon'ble Mr. MUKUNDA BEHARY MULLICK, in charge of the Co-operative Credit and Rural Indebtedness Departments.

(11) The Hon'ble Mr. TAMIZUDDIN KHAN, in charge of Public Health, Medical, Constitution and Elections Departments.

GOVERNMENT OF BENGAL.

PRINCIPAL OFFICERS OF THE BENGAL LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY.

SPEAKER.

The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur M. AZIZUL HAQUE, C.I.E.

DEPUTY SPEAKER.

M. ASHRAFALI, Esq., Barrister-at-Law.

SECRETARY.

K. ALI AFZAL, Esq., Barrister-at-Law.

FIRST ASSISTANT SECRETARY.

Rai N. N. SEN GUPTA Bahadur.

SECOND ASSISTANT SECRETARY.

Khan Sahib QUAZI MUHAMMAD SADRUL OLA.

REGISTRAR.

K. C. GHOSH, Esq.

BENGAL LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY

ALPHABETICAL LIST OF MEMBERS.

A

Abdul Aziz, Maulana Md. [Narayanganj East (Muhammadan).]

Abdul Bari, Maulvi. [Berhampore (Muhammadan).]

Abdul Hafeez, Khan Bahadur Syed. [Dacca Central (Muhammadan).]

Abdul Hafiz, Mr. Mirza [Tangail West (Muhammadan).]

Abdul Hafiz Mia, Mr. [Kurigram South (Muhammadan).]

Abdul Hakeem, Mr. [Khulna (Muhammadan).]

Abdul Hakim, Maulvi. [Mymensingh West (Muhammadan).]

Abdul Hakim Vikrampuri, Maulvi Md. [Munshiganj (Muhammadan).]

Abdul Hamid, Mr. A. M. [Pabna West (Muhammadan).]

Abdul Hamid Shah, Maulvi. [Kishoreganj North (Muhammadan).]

Abdul Jabbar, Maulvi. [Dinajpur Central East (Muhammadan).]

Abdul Jabbar Palwan, Mr. Md. [Jamalpur North (Muhammadan).]

Abdul Kader, Mr. [Patuakhali South (Muhammadan).]

Abdul Karim, Mr. [Jamalpur *cum* Muktagacha (Muhammadan).]

Abdul Latif Biswas, Maulvi. [Manikganj West (Muhammadan).]

Abdul Majid, Maulvi. [Mymensingh North (Muhammadan).]

Abdul Majid, Mr. Syed. [Noakhali South (Muhammadan).]

Abdul Wahab Khan, Mr. [Bakarganj West (Muhammadan).]

Abdul Wahed, Maulvi. [Mymensingh East (Muhammadan).]

Abdulla-Al Mahmood, Mr. [Serajganj North (Muhammadan).]

Abdur Rahman, Khan Bahadur, Mr. A. F. M. [24-Parganas North-East (Muhammadan).]

Abdur Rahman Siddiqi, Mr. (Muslim Chamber of Commerce.)

Abdur Rasheed, Maulvi Md. [Birbhum (Muhammadan).]

Abdur Raschid Mahmood, Mr. [Serajganj North (Muhammadan).]

Abdur Rauf, Khan Sahib Maulvi S. [Howrah (Muhammadan).]

Abdur Rauf, Mr. Shah. [Rangpur South (Muhammadan).]

Abdur Razzak, Maulvi. [Feni (Muhammadan).]

Abdus Shaheed, Maulvi Md. [Dacca North Central (Muhammadan).]

Abidur Reza Chowdhury, Khan Bahadur Maulvi. [Chandpur West (Muhammadan).]

Abu Hossain Sarkar, Maulvi. [Gaibandha North (Muhammadan).]

Abul Fazl, Mr. Muhammad. [Madaripur West (Muhammadan).]

Abul Hashim, Maulvi. [Burdwan (Muhammadan).]

Abul Hosain Ahmed, Mr. [Netrokona North (Muhammadan).]

Abul Quasem, Maulvi. [Hooghly (Muhammadan).]

Acharyya Choudhury, Maharaja Sashi Kanta, of Muktagacha, Mymensingh. (Dacca Landholders.)

Aftab Ali, Mr. (Water Transport Trade Union.)

Aftab Hossain Joardar, Maulvi. [Nadia East (Muhammadan).]

Ahmed Ali Enayetpuri, Khan Bahadur Maulana. [Jhenidah (Muhammadan).]

Ahmed Ali Mridha, Maulvi. [Goalundo (Muhammadan).]

Ahmed Hosain, Mr. [Gaibandha South (Muhammadan).]

Ahmed Khan, Mr. Syed. [Noakhali South (Muhammadan).]

Alfazuddin Ahmed, Khan Bahadur Maulvi. [Midnapore (Muhammadan).]

Aminullah, Khan Sahib Maulvi. [Noakhali Central (Muhammadan).]

Amir Ali, Md., Mia. [Rajshahi South (Muhammadan).]

Anderson, Mr. J. P. [Calcutta and Suburbs (European).]

Anwarul Azim, Khan Bahadur, Md. [Chittagong South (Muhammadan).]

Ashraf Ali, Mr. M. [Nator (Muhammadan).]

Asimuddin Ahmed, Mr. [Tippera Central (Muhammadan).]

Aulad Hossain Khan, Maulvi. [Manikganj East (Muhammadan).]

Azahar Ali, Maulvi. [Pabna East (Muhammadan).]

Azizul Haque, the Hon'ble Khan Bahadur M., C.I.E. [Nadia West (Muhammadan).]

B

Banerjee, Dr. Suresh Chandra. [Calcutta and Suburbs (Registered Factories).]

Banerji, Mr. P. [24-Parganas North-West (General).]

Banerjee, Mr. Pramatha Nath. [Burdwan North-West (General).]

Banerjee, Mr. Sibnath. [Howrah Registered Factories).]

Banerji, Mr. Satya Priya. [Rajshahi (General).]
Bannerjee, Mr. Monoranjan. [Dacca East (General).]
Bannerman, Mr. H. C. (Indian Tea Association.)
Barat Ali, Mr. Mohammad. [Serajganj Central (Muhammadan).]
Barma, Babu Prembari. [Dinajpur (General).]
Barma, Mr. Puspajit. [Rangpur (General).]
Barman, Babu Shyama Prosad. [Dinajpur (General).]
Barman, Babu Upendra Nath. [Jalpaiguri *cum* Siliguri (General).]
Basu, Mr. Jatindra Nath. [Calcutta North (General).]
Basu, Mr. Santosh Kumar. [Calcutta East (General).]
Bell-Hart, Miss P. B. (Anglo-Indian Constituency.)
Bhowmik, Dr. Gobinda Chandra. [Midnapore East (General).]
Biswas, Babu Lakshmi Narayan. [Nadia (General).]
Biswas, Mr. Rasik Lal. [Jessore (General).]
Biswas, Mr. Surendra Nath. [Faridpur (General).]
Blomenstock, Mr. L. M. (Bengal Chamber of Commerce.)
Bose, Mr. Sarat Chandra. [Calcutta South (General).]
Brasher, Mr. F. C. [Calcutta and Suburbs (European).]

C

Campbell, Sir George. [Calcutta and Suburbs (European).]
Chakrabarty, Mr. Jatindra Nath. [Rangpur (General).]
Chakrabarty, Babu Narendra Narayan. [Bogra *cum* Pabna (General).]
Chattopadhyay, Mr. Haripada. [Nadia (General).]
Chippendale, Mr. J. W. (Anglo-Indian.)
Choudhury, Rai Harendra Nath. [Nadia (General).]
Clark, Mr. I. A. [Burdwan Division (European).]
Crosfield, Mr. L. M. [Chittagong Division (European).]

D

Das, Mr. Mahim Chandra. [Chittagong (General).]
Das, Babu Radha Nath. [Hooghly North-East (General).]
Das, Mr. Anukul Chandra. [24-Parganas North-East (General).]
Das, Rai Sahib Kirit Bhusan. [Murshidabad (General).]
Das, Mr. Monomohan. [Mymensingh East (General).]
Dass, Babu Debendra Nath. [Birbhum (General).]

Das Gupta, Mr. Khagendra Nath. [Jalpaiguri *cum* Siliguri (General).]

Das Gupta, Dr. J. M. [Calcutta Central (General).]

Das Gupta, Srijut Narendra Nath. [Bakarganj South-West (General).]

Datta, Mr. Dhirendra Nath. [Tippera (General).]

Dolui, Mr. Harendra Nath. [Jhargram *cum* Ghatal (General).]

Dutt, Mr. Sukumar. [Hooghly South-West (General).]

Dutta Gupta, Miss Mira. [Calcutta General (Women).]

Dutta Mazumdar, Mr. Niharendu. (Barrackpore Registered Factories.)

E

Edbar, Mr. Upendranath. [Bakarganj South-West (General).]

Emdadul Haque, Kazi. [Kurigram North (Muhammadan).]

F

Farhad Raza Chowdhury, Mr. M [Jangipur (Muhammadan).]

Farhat Bano Khanam, Begum. [Dacca (Muhammadan) Women.]

Fazlul Huq, the Hon'ble Mr A. K [Patuakhali North (Muhammadan).]

Fazlul Qadir, Khan Bahadur Maulvi. [Chittagong North-West (Muhammadan).]

Fazlur Rahman, Mr. [Jamalpur East (Muhammadan).]

Fazlur Rahman, Mr. (Dacca University.)

G

Ghose, Mr. Atul Krishna. [Jessore (General).]

Giasuddin Ahmed, Mr. [Jamalpur West (Muhammadan).]

Golam Sarwar Hosaini, Mr. Shah Syed. [Ramganj *cum* Raipur (Muhammadan).]

Gomes, Mr. S. A. [Dacca Division (Indian Christian).]

Goswami, Mr. Tulsi Chandra. [Burdwan Division North Municipal (General).]

Griffiths, Mr. C. (Anglo-Indian.)

Gupta, Mr. Jogesh Chandra. [Calcutta South Central (General).]

Gupta, Mr. J. N. [Railway Trade Union (Labour).]

Gurung, Mr. Damber Singh. [Darjeeling (General).]

Gyasuddin Ahmed Choudhury, Al-Hadj. [Madaripur East (Muhammadan).].

H

Habibullah, the Hon'ble Nawab Bahadur K., of Dacca. [Dacca Municipal (Muhammadan).]

Hafizuddin Chowdhury, Maulvi. [Thakurgaon (Muhammadan).]

Hamiduddin Ahmad, Khan Sahib. [Kishoreganj East (Muhammadan).]

Hamilton, Mr. K A. (Calcutta Trades Association.)

Hasan Ali Chowdhury, Mr. Syed. [Tangail North (Muhammadan).]

Hasanuzzaman, Maulvi Md. [Tippera South (Muhammadan).]

Hashem Ali Khan, Khan Bahadur Maulvi. [Bakarganj North (Muhammadan).]

Hasina Murshed, M.B.E., Mrs [Calcutta (Muhammadan) Women.]

Hatemally Jamadar, Khan Sahib Maulvi. [Pirojpur South (Muhammadan).]

Hawkings, Mr R J. [European (Calcutta & Suburbs).]

Hendry, Mr David. (Bengal Chamber of Commerce.)

Hirtzel, Mr. M. A. F. (Bengal Chamber of Commerce.)

Homan, Mr. F. T. (Bengal Chamber of Commerce.)

I

Irdis Ahmed Mia, Mr. [Malda South (Muhammadan).]

Ispahani, Mr. M. A. H. [Calcutta South (Muhammadan).]

J

Jalaluddin Ahmad, Khan Bahadur Maulvi. [Cox's Bazar (Muhammadan).]

Jalaluddin Hashmey, Mr. Syed. [Satkhira (Muhammadan).]

Jalan, Mr. I. D. [General Constituency (Calcutta West).]

Jasimuddin Ahmed, Mr. [24-Parganas South (Muhammadan).]

Jonab Ali Majumdar, Maulvi. [Chandpur East (Muhammadan).]

K

Kabiruddin Khan, Khan Bahadur Maulvi. [Netrokona South (Muhammadan).]

Kazem Ali Mirza, Sahibzada Kawan Jah Syed. [Murshidabad South-West (Muhammadan).]

Kennedy, Mr. I. G. (Indian Jute Mills Association).

Khaitan, Mr. Debi Prasad. (Indian Chamber of Commerce.)

Khan, Mr. Debendra Lall. [Midnapore Central (General).]

Kumar, Mr. Atul Chandra. [Malda (General).]

Kundu, Mr. Nishitha Nath. [Dinajpur (General).]

M

MacGregor, Mr. G. G. [Indian Tea Association.]

Mafizuddin Ahmed, Dr. [Bogra North (Muhammadan).]

Mafizuddin Ahmed, Maulvi. [Tippera North (Muhammadan).]

Mafizuddin Choudhury, Maulvi. [Balurghat (Muhammadan).]

Maguire, Mr. L. T. (Anglo-Indian.)

Mahatab, Maharajkumar Uday Chand. [Burdwan Central (General).]

Mahtabuddin Ahmed, Khan Bahadur Maulvi [Dinajpur Central West (Muhammadan).]

Maiti, Mr. Nikunja Behari. [Midnapore South-East (General).]

Maitra, Mr. Surendra Mohan. [North Bengal Municipal (General).]

Maji, Mr. Adwaita Kumar. [Burdwan Central (General).]

Majumdar, Mrs. Hemaprova. [Dacca (General) Women.]

Mazumdar, Mr. Birendra Nath. [East Bengal Municipal (General).]

Mal, Mr. Iswar Chandra. [Midnapore South-West (General).]

Mandal, Mr. Amrita Lal. [Mymensingh West (General).]

Mandal, Mr. Banku Behari. [Burdwan North-West (General).]

Mandal, Mr. Birat Chandra. [Faridpur (General).]

Mandal, Mr. Jagat Chandra. [Tippera (General).]

Mandal, Mr. Jogendra Nath. [Bakarganj North-East (General).]

Mandal, Mr. Krishna Prasad. [Midnapore Central (General).]

Maniruddin Akhand, Maulvi. [Rajshahi North (Muhammadan).]

Maniruzzaman Islamabadi, Maulana Md. [Chittagong South Central (Muhammadan).]

Maqbul Hosain, Mr. [Tippera North-East (Muhammadan).]

Masud Ali Khan Panni, Maulvi. [Tangail South (Muhammadan).]

Millar, Mr. C. [Calcutta and Suburbs (European).]

Mohammed Ali, Khan Bahadur. [Bogra West (Muhammadan).]

Mohsin Ali, Mr. Md. [Meherpur (Muhammadan).]

Mookerjee, Dr. Syamaprasad. (Calcutta University.)

Morgan, Mr. G., C.I.E. [Presidency Division (European).]

Moslem Ali Mollah, Maulvi. [Rajshahi Central (Muhammadan).]

Mozammel Huq, Maulvi Md. [Bhola North (Muhammadan).]

Muhammad Afzal, Khan Sahib Maulvi Syed. [Pirojpur North (Muhammadan).]

Muhammad Ibrahim, Maulvi. [Noakhali North (Muhammadan).]

Muhammad Ishaque, Maulvi. [Bogra South (Muhammadan).]

Muhammad Israil, Maulvi. [Kishoreganj South (Muhammadan).]

Muhammad Siddique, Khan Bahadur Dr. Syed. [Bankura (Muhammadan).]

Muhammad Solaiman, Khan Sahib Maulvi. [Barrackpore Municipal (Muhammadan).]

Mukerji, Mr. Dhirendra Narayan. (Hooghly North-East.)

Mukherjee, Mr. B. [Colliery (Coal Mines) (Labour).]

Mukherji, Dr. H. C. [Calcutta *cum* Presidency Division (Indian Christian).]

Mukherji, Dr. Sharat Chandra. [Birbhum (General).]

Mullick, the Hon'ble Mr. Mukunda Behari. [Khulna (General).]

Mullick, Mr. Pulin Behary. [Howrah (General).]

Mullick, Srijut Ashutosh. [Bankura West (General).]

Musharruff Hossain, the Hon'ble Nawab, Khan Bahadur. [Jalpaiguri *cum* Darjeeling (Muhammadan).]

Mustagawsal Haque, Mr. Syed. [Bagerhat (Muhammadan).]

Mustafa Ali Deyan, Maulvi. [Brahmanbaria North (Muhammadan).]

N

Nandy, the Hon'ble Maharaja Sris Chandra, of Cossimbazar. (Presidency Landholders.)

Nasarullah, Nawabzada K. [Brahmanbaria South (Muhammadan).]

Nasker, Mr. Hem Chandra. [24-Parganas South-East (General).]

Nausher Ali, Mr. Syed. [Jessore Sadar (Muhammadan).]

Nazimuddin, the Hon'ble Khwaja Sir, K.C.I.E. [Calcutta North (Muhammadan).]

Nooruddin, Mr. K. [Hooghly *cum* Howrah Municipal (Muhammadan).]

Norton, Mr. H. R. [Calcutta Trades Association.]

P

Pain, Mr. Barada Prosanna. [Hooghly *cum* Howrah Municipal (General).]

Patton, Mr. W. C. [Darjeeling (European).]

Paul, Sir Hari Sankar. (Bengal National Chamber of Commerce.)

Pramanik, Mr. Tarinicharan. [Malda (General).]

R

Rahman, Khan Bahadur A. M. L. [Rajshahi Central (Muhammadan).]

Raikut, the Hon'ble Mr. Prasanna Deb. [Jalpaiguri *cum* Siliguri (General).]

Rajibuddin Tarafdar, Maulvi. [Bogra East (Muhammadan).]

Ramizuddin Ahmed, Mr. [Tippera West (Muhammadan).]

Ray Choudhury, Mr. Birendra Kishore. [Mymensingh East (General).]

Razaur Rahman Khan, Mr. [Dacca South Central (Muhammadan).]

Roy, Mr. Patiram. [Khulna (General).]

Roy, the Hon'ble Sir Bijoy Prasad Singh. (Burdwan Landholders.)

Roy, Kumar Shib Shekhareswar. (Rajshahi Landholders.)

Roy, Mr. Charu Chandra. [Mymensingh West (General).]

Roy, Mr. Dhananjoy. [Dacca East (General).]

Roy, Mr. Kamalkrishna. [Bankura East (General).]

Roy, Mr. Kiran Sankar. [Dacca West (General).]

Roy, Mr. Kishori Pati. [Jhargram *cum* Ghatal (General).]

Roy, Rai Bahadur Kshirod Chandra. (Chittagong Landholders.)

Roy, Mr. Manmatha Nath. [Howrah (General).]

S

Sadaruddin Ahmed, Mr. [Bakarganj South (Muhammadan).]

Safiruddin Ahmed, Haji. [Rangpur North (Muhammadan).]

Salim, Mr. S. A. [Narayanganj North (Muhammadan).]

Sanaullah, Dr. [Chittagong North-East (Muhammadan).]

Sanyal, Dr. Nalinaksha. [Presidency Division Municipal (General).]

Sanyal, Mr. Sasanka Sekhar. [Murshidabad (General).]

Sarker, Babu Madhusudan. [Bogra *cum* Pabna (General).]

Sarker, the Hon'ble Mr. Nalini Ranjan. (Bengal National Chamber of Commerce.)

Sassoon, Mr. R. M. (Bengal Chamber of Commerce.)

Sen, Babu Nagendra Nath. [Khulna (General).]

Sen, Rai Bahadur Jogesh Chandra. [24-Parganas South-East (General).]

Serajul Islam, Mr. [Bongaon (Muhammadan).]

Shahabuddin, Mr. Khwaja, C.B.E. [Narayanganj South (Muhammadan).]

Shahedali, Mr. [Matlabbazar (Muhammadan).]

Shamsuddin Ahmed, the Hon'ble Mr. [Kusthia (Muhammadan).]

Shamsuddin Ahmed Khandkar, Mr. [Gopalganj (Muhammadan).]

Shamsul Huda, Maulana. [Mymensingh South (Muhammadan).]

Singha, Babu Kshetra Nath. [Rangpur (General).]

Sinha, Srijut Manindra Bhusan. [Bankura West (General).]

Sirdar, Babu Litta Munda. [Bengal Dooars (Western) Tea Garden Labour.]

Smith, Mr. H. Brabant. [Rajshahi Division (European).]

Steven, Mr. J. W. R. [Dacca (European).]

Suhrawardy, the Hon'ble Mr. H. S. [24-Parganas Municipal (Muhammadan).]

Sur, Mr. Harendra Kumar. [Noakhali (General).]

T

Tamizuddin Khan, the Hon'ble Mr. [Faridpur West (Muhammadan).]

Tapuriah, Rai Bahadur Moongtu Lall. (Marwari Association.)

Thakur, Mr. Promatha Ranjan. [Faridpur (General).]

Tofel Ahmed Choudhury, Maulvi Haji. [Bhola South (Muhammadan).]

W

Waliur Rahman, Maulvi. [Jessore East (Muhammadan).]
Walker, Mr. J. R. [Hooghly *cum* Howrah (European).]
Walker, Mr. W. A. M. (Indian Jute Mills Association.)
Warren, Mr. P. F. S. (Bengal Chamber of Commerce.)
Whitehead, Mr. R. B. (Indian Mining Association.)
Wordsworth, Mr. W. C. (Bengal Chamber of Commerce.)

Y

Yusuf Ali Choudhury, Mr. [Faridpur East (Muhammadan).]
Yusuf Mirza. [24-Parganas Central (Muhammadan).]

Z

Zahur Ahmed Choudhury, Maulvi. [Malda North (Muhammadan).]
Zaman, Mr. A. M. A. [Hooghly *cum* Serampore (Registered Factories) Labour.]

THE BENGAL LEGISLATIVE ASSEMBLY PROCEEDINGS

Volume LIV—No. 1.

(Official Report of the Fifth Session.)

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Assembly assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act, 1935.

THE ASSEMBLY met in the Assembly House, Calcutta, on Wednesday, the 15th February, 1939, at 4-45 p.m.

Present:

Mr. Speaker (the Hon'ble Khan Bahadur M. AZIZUL H[illegible]), in the Chair, 12 Hon'ble Ministers and 221 members.

Oath or Affirmation.

The following member made his Oath or Affirmation of allegiance to the Crown:—

Mr. H. Brabant Smith.

Panel of Chairmen.

Mr. SPEAKER: In accordance with the provisions of rule 3 (section 6) of the Bengal Legislative Assembly Rules, 1937, I nominate the following members of the Assembly to form a panel of Chairmen for the ensuing session:—

(1) Sir George Campbell,

(2) Mr. Sarat Chandra Bose,

(3) Mr. Pulin Behary Mullik,

(4) Mrs. Hasina Murshed, M.B.E.

Unless otherwise arranged, the senior member among them present in the above order will preside over the deliberations of this Assembly in my absence and in the absence of the Deputy Speaker.

Obituary.

Mr. SPEAKER: Ladies and gentlemen, it is with profound regret that I have to refer to the death of one of the sitting members of this House, Mr. W. L. Armstrong. The news came with tragic suddenness. He was a member of the old Council since 1931 and of this Assembly since the inauguration of the present Reforms as a representative of the Presidency and Burdwan European constituency. He was interested in the hospital administration and was an active member of the European Group. I am sure, it will be the desire of the House to convey the message of condolence to the relatives of the deceased. I now request you, ladies and gentlemen, to signify your assent by rising in your places.

(All the members rose in their places.)

Mr. SPEAKER: Thank you, ladies and gentlemen. Usual steps will be taken.

The Secretary read the following message received from the Secretary, Bengal Legislative Council:—

"I am directed to send herewith the Bengal Repealing and Amending Bill, 1938, and to convey the message that the Council at its meeting held on the 13th February, 1939, has agreed to the Bill without any amendment."

STARRED QUESTIONS

(to which oral answers were given)

Smoke evils in the residential quarters of railway staff.

*1. **Mr. J. N. GUPTA:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Public Health and Medical Department aware—

(*i*) that residential quarters that are built by the Railways in Calcutta and its suburbs have no adequate ventilation and are without flues and chimneys; and

(*ii*) that a number of railway staff are subjected to smoke nuisances?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the negative, is the Hon'ble Minister considering the desirability of having the staff quarters of Railways situated in Calcutta and its suburbs examined by the Bengal Smoke Nuisances Commission?

MINISTER in charge of the PUBLIC HEALTH and MEDICAL DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Mr. Tamizuddin Khan): Railway being a Federal subject the condition of the railway quarters in Calcutta and its suburbs is not the concern of the Province. The Government of India will however be informed of the question made by the member.

Mr. J. N. GUPTA: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if it is a fact that the Railways running in the Province are to abide by the legislation that has been adopted by the Provincial Government in the matter of public health and irrigation?

The Hon'ble Mr. TAMIZUDDIN KHAN: That is a matter of opinion; I do not think my friend is correct.

Mr. NAGENDRA NATH SEN: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if the nuisance in question violates any municipal laws in Bengal; is it not his province to enquire?

The Hon'ble Mr. TAMIZUDDIN KHAN: Unless my friend refers to any particular breach of any law or rule, I am not in a position to answer.

Statistics of landless agriculturists in Bengal.

*2. **Mr. SASANKA SEKHAR SANYAL:** Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Revenue Department be pleased to state—

(*a*) whether Government have any statistics for landless agriculturists in this Province;

(*b*) whether Government are aware that during the recent years numerous peasants have been thrown out of land in all districts as a result of inability to pay rents owing to successive failure of crops; and

(*c*) whether Government have in contemplation any scheme of insurance whereby peasant proprietorship could be protected?

MINISTER in charge of the REVENUE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Bijoy Prasad Singh Roy): (*a*) Government have no figures other than those contained in the Census Reports.

(*b*) Government are aware that in particular localities tenants having failed to pay their rents for long periods have had their holdings sold for arrears. But in most cases the landlords are generally found agreeable to resettlements with the old tenants on payment of the arrears or a part thereof.

(c) Government are not aware of any right in land in Bengal which may be described as peasant proprietorship. The question therefore does not arise.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if Government are considering the desimbility of collecting statistics of landless labourers in Bengal as referred to in answer (a)?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: The figures contained in the Census Report are, in the opinion of Government, quite sufficient for their purpose; so they do not propose to collect statistics at present.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if he is aware that there has been an increasing tendency for tenants being thrown out of lands causing many kinds of economic difficulties?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: Not to the knowledge of Government.

Mr. SASANKA SEKHAR SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether Government have made any enquiry why tenants failed to pay rents?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: Yes, there are various factors, one of them is economic depression.

Elliot Bridge at Serajganj.

*3. **Mr. ABDULLA-AL MAHMOOD:** With reference to the reply to starred question No. 37 on the 17th February, 1938, and to the deputation which waited upon the Hon'ble Ministers in charge of Communications and Works and Finance at Pabna during their visit on the 17th January, 1939, will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Communications and Works Department be pelased to state whether Government contemplate immediate action in the matter relating to the Elliot Bridge at Serajganj?

MINISTER in charge of the COMMUNICATIONS and WORKS DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Maharaja Srischandra Nandy, of Cossimbazar): No, Sir. The bridge, so far as I am aware, is only of local importance, and I can see no reason at present why it should be reconstructed at the expense of the provincial taxpayer. I will however examine any representation for a contribution from provincial funds which the Municipality makes in the usual way.

Babu NARENDRA NARAYAN CHAKRABARTY: মন্ত্রিমহাশয়, কি জানেন যে সিরাজগঞ্জ বাজার ষ্টেশন যেটা নাকি সিরাজগঞ্জ সহরের সবচেয়ে উল্লেখযোগ্য রেল ষ্টেশন, সেখান থেকে সিরাজগঞ্জ সহরে যেতে হলে এই Elliot Bridge দিয়ে যাওয়া ছাড়া গত্যন্তর নাই ?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: Yes, Sir, I am aware of that fact.

Establishment of drawing office under the Chief Engineer.

*4. **Maulvi ABDUL LATIF BISWAS:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Communications and Works Department be pleased to lay a statement on the table showing for the Drawing Office under the Chief Engineer (Communications and Works Department)—

(*i*) the number of officers existing at present;

(*ii*) of those officers, how many are—

(1) Superintendents,

(2) Head Estimators,

(3) Estimators, and

(4) Draftsmen;

(*iii*) how many among the officers are Musalmans; and

(*iv*) what posts do the Muslim officers hold?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether there was any Muslim Estimator within three years from now?

(*c*) If the answer to (*b*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state—

(*i*) what has become of that officer;

(*ii*) where is he now; and

(*iii*) what is his qualification?

(*d*) Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what qualifications including technical qualifications, if any,—

(*i*) have the respective Estimators got; and

(*ii*) have the respective Draftsmen got?

(*e*) Was any Draftsman appointed within three months from January, 1939?

(*f*) If the answer to (*e*) is in the affirmative will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether such appointment was made after being advertised in any newspaper or *Calcutta Gazette*?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: (*a*) A statement (A) giving the desired information is laid on the table.

(*b*) Yes, one was appointed on probation.

(*c*) (*i*) His services as an Estimator were dispensed with and he was offered the post of Draftsman which he accepted and later resigned.

(*ii*) As a temporary Estimator in the office of the Superintending Engineer, Central Circle.

(*iii*) Passed Upper Subordinate Examination from the Ahsanullah School of Engineering.

(*d*) A statement (B) is laid on the table.

(*e*) Yes.

(*f*) No. The vacancy was filled by the discharged Estimator referred to in the reply to part (*c*) (*i*).

Statement (A) referred to in the answer to clauses (a) (i) to (iv) to starred question No. 4, regarding number of establishment of Drawing Office under the Chief Engineer.

(*a*) (*i*) Number of officers existing at present—17.

(*ii*) Of those officers, how many are—

(1) Superintendents—1.

(2) Head Estimators—1.

(3) Estimators—5 (including one temporary Estimator).

(4) Draftsmen—10.

(*iii*) How many among the officers are Musalmans?—4.

(*iv*) What posts do the Muslim officers hold?—Draftsmen.

Statement (B) referred to in the answer to clause (d) to starred question No. 4 regarding qualifications of Estimators and Draftsmen in the Drawing Office of the Chief Engineer.

ESTIMATORS.

(1) *Head Estimator*—Practical knowledge for 32 years 9 months.

(2) *Second Estimator*—Holds a full course certificate granted by the Government School of Arts, Calcutta, and practical knowledge for 24 years 2 months.

(3) *Third Estimator*—Practical knowledge for 24 years 8 months.

(4) *Fourth Estimator*—Practical knowledge for 13 years 6 months.

(5) *Fifth Estimator*—Passed Overseer Examination from Ahsanullah School of Engineering, Dacca. Practical knowledge for 7 years.

(6) *Temporary Estimator*—Passed B. E. Examination of the Calcutta University and holds A.M.I.E. (India) diploma. Practical knowledge for 7 years.

DRAFTSMEN.

(1) *First Draftsman*—Practical knowledge for 34 years 7 months and holds a full course certificate granted by the Government School of Arts, Calcutta.

(2) *Second Draftsman*—Practical knowledge for 30 years 5 months.

(3) *Third Draftsman*—Practical knowledge for 19 years 4 months and holds a full course certificate granted by the Government School of Arts, Calcutta.

(4) *Fourth Draftsman*—Practical knowledge for 19 years 10 months.

(5) *Fifth Draftsman*—Practical knowledge for 19 years.

(6) *Sixth Draftsman*—Practical knowledge for 13 years 10 months.

(7) *Seventh Draftsman*—Practical knowledge for 32 years 5 months.

(8) *Eighth Draftsman*—Practical knowledge for 11 years 3 months.

(9) *Ninth Draftsman*—Practical knowledge for 21 years.

(10) *Tenth Draftsman*—Passed Overseer Examination from the Ahsanullah School of Engineering, Dacca, and practical knowledge for 4 years.

Maulvi ABDUL BARI: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state why this particular Estimator was discharged? What was the reason for the discharge? May I expect an answer?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: Because he was considered by the head of the department not suitable for the post.

Maulvi ABDUL BARI: On what grounds was he considered unfit by the head of the department? Was any examination held?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: Mr. Speaker, Sir, may I ask for your ruling if in cases like this questions are to be answered by Government giving the reasons as to why a particular officer has been discharged?

Mr. SPEAKER: You can use your discretion and answer accordingly.

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: After the matter was brought to my notice necessary enquiries were made and it was found that the Estimator was not suitable for the post.

Status and standard of Government Silk Weaving Institute at Berhampore.

*5. **Mr. SASANKA SEKHAR SANYAL:** Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Local Self-Government and Industries Department be pleased to state—

(*a*) whether there is a project for raising the status and standard of the Government Silk Weaving Institute at Berhampore in the district of Murshidabad;

(*b*) whether any scheme has been prepared in connection with the said project;

(*c*) if so, by whom has the said scheme been prepared; and

(*d*) whether there is a proposal for placing the Institute under the charge of the Deputy Director of Sericulture?

MINISTER in charge of the LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT and INDUSTRIES DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Nawab Khwaja Habibullah Bahadur, of Dacca): (*a*) and (*b*) Yes.

(*c*) Director of Industries, Bengal.

(*d*) None at present.

Ratio in Government services and compulsory retirement.

*6. **Mr. ABDULLA-AL MAHMOOD:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Finance Department be pleased to state whether Government have decided any course of action to give effect to the resolution passed by the Assembly in the last Session with regard to the fixation of percentage of services and compulsory retirement after completion of 25th year of service?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the negative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the reason therefor?

MINISTER in charge of the FINANCE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Mr. Nalini Ranjan Sarker): The matter is under consideration.

Mr. SYED JALALUDDIN HASHEMY: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to tell us the approximate time when the resolution will be considered finally?

The Hon'ble Mr. NALINI RANJAN SARKER: During this session.

Insufficient Government loan to the flood-stricken people of Bengal.

*7. **Mr. ABUL FAZL:** (a) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Revenue Department aware—

(i) that the Government loan given up to date for amelioration of the condition of the flood-stricken people of Bengal has been insufficient to meet their needs; and

(ii) that there are apprehensions of scarcity in more acute form from March to July, 1939, when the cost of cultivation will have to be met?

(b) If the answer to (a) (i) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what steps, if any, are being taken by Government to meet the apprehended situation?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: (a) No.

(b) Does not arise.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if the decisions of several conferences held in connection with the grant of loans were strictly adhered to, particularly in regard to three points, namely,—

(i) the amount of loan advanced to individuals,

(ii) the relaxation of the rule regarding joint responsibility, and

(iii) the increase in the amount permissible in proportion to the land held by each tenant.

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: May I submit that the reply to (*a*) here is "no", that is to say, Government——

Mr. SPEAKER: I am very sorry, I cannot admit it.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: If I put the question in another way, probably you will find it admissible.

Mr. SPEAKER: Make it admissible.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what is the amount of loan granted on an average to each cultivator?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: I ask for notice.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Is it a fact that the amount varies between Re. 1-8 and Rs. 5 on an average.

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: I ask for notice.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Is it a fact that no one has been allowed to obtain a loan on individual responsibility in the districts of Nadia and Murshidabad as decided in the conference presided over by the Hon'ble Minister himself?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: I ask for notice.

Mr. SURENDRA NATH BISWAS: Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that thousands of agriculturists in South Madaripur have been suffering from want.

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: That is not a fact.

On Mr. Biswas rising again——

Mr. SPEAKER: I am not going to allow any discussion on this. I am absolutely clear in my own mind. In a question of a general character I cannot possibly allow individual districts to be discussed. We did it in the past and found that supplementary questions were taking a very long time.

Mr. SURENDRA NATH BISWAS: May I draw your attention to this? The question is whether the Government loan has been sufficient. The Hon'ble Minister says "yes". Now I want to draw the attention of the Hon'ble Minister to the fact that the loan granted has not been sufficient because there are thousands of people who are in absolute need of loan.

Mr. SPEAKER: You may put another question.

Babu NARENDRA NARAYAN CHAKRABARTY: পাবনা জিলার অন্তর্গত সিরাজগঞ্জ মহকুমার অধীন নিমগাছি অঞ্চলে কংগ্রেসের কাজ বেশী হোয়ে থাকে, সেই জন্যই কি সেখানে কোন Government loan এর ব্যবস্থা করা হয় নাই?

(No reply.)

Appointment of Government Pleader and Public Prosecutor of Rajshahi.

*8. **Maulvi M. MOSLEM ALI MOLLAH:** (*a*) With reference to the reply given to starred question No. 201 on the 24th August, 1938, will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Judicial and Legislative Department be pleased to state whether the vacancy in the post of Government Pleader and Public Prosecutor of Rajshahi has been filled up by now?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the negative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state—

(*i*) the reasons for the delay;

(*ii*) whether applications for selection of candidate have been invited; and

(*iii*) if so, when?

MINISTER in charge of the JUDICIAL and LEGISLATIVE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Nawab Musharruff Hossain, Khan Bahadur): (*a*) No.

(*b*) (*i*) Please see reply to the supplementary question of Dr. Nalinaksha Sanyal.

(*ii*) No fresh applications have been invited.

(*iii*) Applications were invited originally in 1937.

Mr. SPEAKER: I am afraid the answer to the question 8 (*b*) (*i*) is not complete because you have merely referred to the reply to the supplementary question of Dr. Nalinaksha Sanyal. Dr. Sanyal has a reputation for putting any number of supplementary questions and as such it is not clear to what particular question you are referring.

The Hon'ble Nawab MUSHARRUFF HOSSAIN, Khan Bahadur: I will give the number later on, Sir.

Mr. SURENDRA MOHAN MAITRA: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state how long this matter will remain pending?

The Hon'ble Nawab MUSHARRUFF HOSSAIN, Khan Bahadur: The real fact is this. There is a conflict——

Mr. SPEAKER: It will be better if you say how long it will take. I am sorry, Nawab Sahib, I have to say that to-day being a very important day I am anxious that no time should be lost unnecessarily.

Mr. JOGESH CHANDRA GUPTA: If the Treasury Benches deviate from the path of being over-discreet I think this House ought to have the pleasure of listening to a frank statement by the Hon'ble the Minister.

The Hon'ble Nawab MUSHARRUFF HOSSAIN, Khan Bahadur: I think it will be possible to dispose of this case in the course of a month.

Present Deputy Director of Sericulture.

*9. **Mr. SASANKA SEKHAR SANYAL:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Industries Department be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing—

(*i*) the qualifications, general and special, of the present Deputy Director of Sericulture;

(*ii*) his substantive pay;

(*iii*) his extra regular allowance; and

(*iv*) the amount of his allowance while remaining away from the headquarters?

(b) What was the headquarter station of the present Deputy Director of Sericulture during the twelve months from April, 1937, to March, 1938?

(c) How many days did he spend in such headquarter?

(d) How much travelling and halting allowances did he draw during the said twelve months?

(e) How many days during the said twelve months did he spend in Calcutta?

(f) Did he go to Mysore?

(g) If so, why and with what result?

(h) How much did his Mysore trip and stay cost the Bengal Government?

The Hon'ble Nawab Khwaja HABIBULLAH Bahadur, of Dacca: (a) A statement is laid on the Library table.

(b) Berhampore.

(c) 184 days.

(d) Rs. 3,431.

(e) 67 days.

(f) Yes.

(g) The Deputy Director of Sericulture had to visit Mysore in order to acquire a firsthand knowledge of the working of the Sericultural Department of that State. He has collected facts, figures and information which will be of assistance for the improvement of the sericultural industry in Bengal.

(h) Rs. 575-4.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that this officer has been considered by the Tariff Board President to be thoroughly worthless and does not deserve even a single rupee as salary?

Mr. SPEAKER: Order, Order, that question does not arise.

Maulvi ABDUL BARI: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether sericulture in Berhampore has improved in the least since the appointment of this officer as Deputy Director of Sericulture?

The Hon'ble Nawab Khwaja HABIBULLAH Bahadur, of Dacca: That is a matter of opinion.

Mr. SASANKA SEKHAR SANYAL: Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that ever since this gentleman took charge of the Weaving College and Sericultural Institute at Berhampore, both the institutions have gone down in quality?

Mr. SPEAKER: That does not require a reply.

Special posts created since 1st April, 1937.

*10. **Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL:** Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Home (Appointment) Department be pleased to state—

(*a*) what are the new or special posts of officers, temporary or permanent, created or filled up since the 1st April, 1937, in the different departments of Government;

(*b*) who are or have been the incumbents holding these posts and what are or have been their emoluments;

(*c*) whether these incumbents were appointed on the recommendation of the Public Service Commission; if not, why not; and

(*d*) whether any report or reports of the respective work done by each of these officers were received by Government and the justification or otherwise of these new or special posts reviewed by any competent authority?

MINISTER in charge of the HOME DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Khwaja Sir Nazimuddin): (*a*) and (*b*) A statement is laid on the table.

(*c*) Prior consultation with the Public Service Commission was in no case necessary or prescribed under the Bengal Public Service Commission Regulations and Rules of Procedure.

(*d*) In those cases where the officer was appointed to prepare a report, a report has been submitted. Government are satisfied that the appointments were justified.

Statement referred to in answer to clauses (a) and (b) to Starred Question No. 10 showing the new or special posts of officers created or filled up from 1st April, 1937, to 31st July, 1938, in the different departments of Government.

Departments.	New or special posts (created or filled up).		The name of incumbents holding the posts.	Emoluments.
	Permanent.	Temporary.		
Public Health and Local Self-Government Department.	Deputy Secretary ..	....	Rai G. C. Sen Bahadur ..	Grade pay of the listed post in the senior scale of I.C.S. *plus* the usual special pay of Rs. 200 per mensem.
		Special Officer (Additional Deputy Secretary)	Rai Hiranlal Mukharji Bahadur.	Grade pay in the B.C.S. *plus* the usual special pay of Rs. 200 per mensem.
Legislative Department ..	....	Special Officer from 16th April, 1937, to 15th April, 1938.	Mr. E. B. H. Baker, I.C.S	Senior time-scale of pay of the I.C.S.
Agriculture and Industries Department.	....	(1) Special Officer (Director of Rural Reconstruction).	Mr T. I. M Nurannabi Choudhuri, I.C.S.	(1) Grade pay (Rs. 1,900) in the senior time-scale of pay of the I.C.S. *plus* special pay of Rs. 200 per mensem.
		(2) Special Officer (Employment Adviser).	Mr N. Das, I.C.S. ..	(2) Grade pay (Rs. 700) in the junior time-scale of pay of the I.C.S. *plus* special pay of Rs. 150 per mensem.
Forest and Excise ..	....	One temporary post of 2nd Assistant Secretary in Revenue, Forest and Excise Department was created on 18th February, 1938, and continued up to 30th June, 1938, when it was made permanent.	Babu Shailendra Nath Mitra, from 18th February, 1938, to 22nd July, 1938.	Rs. 550 *plus* special pay Rs. 100 per mensem.
			Rai Sahib Brindabon Ch. De, from 23rd July, 1938.	Ditto.

Departments.	New or special posts (created or filled up).		The name of incumbents holding the posts.	Emoluments.
	Permanent.	Temporary.		
Revenue Department ..	....	(1) One post of Special Officer for collecting materials in connection with Land Revenue Commission from 9th August, 1937, to 8th November, 1937.	(1) Rai M. N. Gupta Bahadur, a retired officer of the B.C.S.	Rs. 700 per mensem *plus* pension.
		(2) Ditto ..	(2) Sir F. A. Sachse, C.S.I., C.I.E., a retired member of the I.C.S.	Rs. 3,750 per mensem from 11th November, 1937, to 14th December, 1937, and Rs. 3,000 per mensem from 15th December, 1937, to 7th April, 1938.
		(3) One post of Special Officer to enquire into the grievances of tenants of Government Estates and to suggest method by which administration of those estates can be improved from 27th January, 1938, to 28th June, 1938.	(3) Mr. M. M. Stuart, I.C.S.	Grade pay of Rs. 1,825 (including overseas pay) and Calcutta House Allowance admissible under the Rules from 1st April, 1938.
Commerce and Labour Department.	....	Joint Secretary ..	Mr. R. H. Parker, I.C.S., from 8th July, 1937, to 10th May, 1938.	Grade pay in the I.C.S. (viz., Rs. 1,800 per mensem) *plus* a special pay of Rs. 200 per mensem.
			Mr. A. Hughes, I.C.S., from 11th May, 1938, to	Grade pay in the I.C.S. (viz., Rs. 1,350) *plus* special pay of Rs. 200 per mensem.

Finance Department ..	....	(1) Special Officer from 16th September, 1937, to 23rd February, 1938.	Mr. L. A. Chapman, I.C.S.	Grade pay in the I.C.S. (viz., Rs. 1,150 per mensem for a portion of the period and at Rs. 1,200 per mensem for the rest) *plus* a special pay of Rs. 200 per mensem.
		(2) Special Officer	Mr. E. N. Blandy, C.I.E., I.C.S.	Grade pay as a Commissioner of a Division (viz., Rs. 3,000 per mensem).
		(3) Ditto	Mr. S. K. Ghosh ..	Grade pay in the B.C.S. (viz., Rs. 650 per mensem) *plus* a special pay of Rs. 50 per mensem.
	(4) Deputy Secretary (Budget).		Mr. S. K. Mukharji	Grade pay in the B.C.S. (viz., Rs. 750 per mensem) *plus* a special pay of Rs. 200 per mensem.
	(5) Assistant Secretary (Audit).		Mr. S. K. Ghosh	Grade pay in the B.C.S. (viz., Rs. 650 per mensem) *plus* a special pay of Rs. 100 per mensem.
Home Department ..	..	Special Officer, Home Department.	Mr. H. P. V. Townend, C.I.E., I.C.S.	Rs. 3,000 *plus* overseas pay £13 6-8.
		Ditto	Mr. P. D. Martyn, I.C.S.	Rs. 1,350 *plus* overseas pay £25.
		Ditto ..	Mr. W. H. Saumarez Smith, I.C.S.	Rs. 600 *plus* overseas pay, Rs. 150 *plus* special pay Rs. 100 per mensem.
		Director of Public Information.	Mr. Altaf Hussain, M.A. ..	Grade pay in the B.S.E.S. (viz., Rs. 500 per mensem) *plus* a special pay of Rs. 250 per mensem *plus* a motor car allowance of Rs. 80 per mensem
		Private Secretary to the Hon'ble Chief Minister, Government of Bengal.	Khan Bahadur Saiyid Manzur Murshed, B.A.	Grade pay in the B.C.S. (viz., Rs. 700 per mensem) *plus* a special pay of Rs. 120 per mensem *plus* motor car allowance of Rs. 80 per mensem.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state in connexion with answers to (*a*) and (*b*) how many Civil Service posts have been increased in the province as a consequence of the retention of these Special Officers? I find that in the list there are 11 I.C.S. special posts. I would like to know if that has increased the total strength allotted to the province.

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: No increase has been made in the cadre of the service.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Not in the cadre but in the total number.

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: No increase.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the reason for such permanent posts, as mentioned in column 2, not being considered necessary for reference to the Public Service Commission under Rules and Regulations?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: If the hon'ble member would refer to any particular post, I shall give the reasons.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: May I in this connection draw your attention to the appointment of a special officer for employment, Director of Public Information——

The Honble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: I should like to answer one by one in connection with these special posts. It is not necessary to consult the Public Service Commission with respect to an appointment to a temporary post which is filled by an officer already in the Civil Service.

Mr. ABUL HOSAIN AHMED: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the reasons for allowing motor car allowances to Mr. Altaf Husain and Khan Bahadur Syed Manzur Murshed?

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise.

Khan Bahadur MOHAMMED ALI: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what was the pay of Mr. Sachse at the time of his retirement, and whether he draws the salary of Rs. 3,000 in addition to his pension?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: I ask for notice.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: With reference to the appointment of Mr. Sachse as Special Officer, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if this appointment was made contrary to the assurance given to this House by the Hon'ble the Chief Minister that Mr. Sachse was not and is not in any kind of Government service?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: I submit, Sir, that this question does not arise out of the main question.

Mr. SPEAKER: I think, it is a question of pure opinion. You can simply ask, what was the assurance given, but whether it was contrary to the assurance or not is a matter, Dr. Sanyal, for inference.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if this appointment of Mr. Sachse was in force at the time when the Hon'ble the Chief Minister said that he was not in any kind of Government service?

Mr. SPEAKER: How can that question arise?

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: It is shown that on the 14th December 1937 he was in Government service, but from 15th December he drew the other salary. So there was no time intervening in between.

Mr. SPEAKER: I am afraid, Dr. Sanyal has misunderstood the scope of this question. The whole trend of this question is to find out to what extent Government can exercise their full discretion and to what extent they have to go to the Public Service Commission. The question of merit is a matter foreign to this question. Here the sole contention is whether there is any justification for special posts, whether they have been reviewed by a competent authority, and whether they were appointed by the Public Service Commission, and if so, how they have been done. But it has nothing to do with merit.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: May I submit, Sir, that that is only one part of the whole question, and that relates to the report and justification for the appointments. But with regard to the appointments themselves, it leaves open many channels of questions.

Honorary Magistrates at Gaibandha.

*11. **Maulvi ABU HOSSAIN SARKAR:** Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Judicial and Legislative Department be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing for the Honorary Magistrates at present serving at Gaibandha—

(*a*) the educational qualifications;

(*b*) the profession, which each of them was following before he was appointed such Magistrate; and

(*c*) the reasons for which each of them has been appointed?

The Hon'ble Nawab MUSHARRUFF HOSSAIN, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) and (*b*) A statement is laid on the table.

(*c*) They were considered suitable to act as Honorary Magistrates and there was work for them to do as such.

Statement referred to in the answer to clauses (a) and (b) of starred question No. 11.

Name of Honorary Magistrate.	Educational qualification.	Profession.
1. Maulvi A. R. M. Abdul Wahed, B.A.	Graduate ..	*Jotedar.*
2. Babu Raj Chandra Barman Choudhuri.	Knows English ..	*Jotedar*, a municipal commissioner, a member, Central Co-operative Bank, Gaibandha, and also Director of several other local banks and loan offices and member of District Board.
3. Maulvi Meheruddin Ahmed	Ditto ..	*Jotedar*, Vice-Chairman, Gaibandha Municipality, a member, Central Co-operative Bank, Gaibandha, and Director of several other banks and loan offices and member of District Board.

Working hours of clerks of Gaibandha Civil Courts.

*12. **Maulvi ABU HOSSAIN SARKAR:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Judicial and Legislative Department aware that the clerks of the Civil Courts of Gaibandha are allowed to work in their respective offices even after nightfall in the absence of the presiding officers?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, what are the reasons?

(*c*) If there are no special reasons are the Government considering the desirability of taking steps to stop this practice?

The Hon'ble Nawab MUSHARRUFF HOSSAIN, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) I believe this happens occasionally.

(*b*) and (*c*) The attention of the Judge has been drawn to the matter; I believe it can seldom be necessary if the work is properly organised.

Maulvi ABU HOSAIN SARKAR: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state why working at night is allowed when it is directly against the High Court circular?

The Hon'ble Nawab MUSHARRUFF HOSSAIN, Khan Bahadur: Sorry, I do not know the High Court circular.

Bridge on Bengal-Duars Railway.

*13. **Mr. JATINDRA NATH CHAKRABARTI:** (*a*) With reference to the answer to starred question No. 503 of the 8th April, 1938, will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Communications and Works Department be pleased to state how the matter stands at present?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what further action, if any, has been taken in the matter?

(*c*) If no action has been taken, what steps do Government propose taking to ensure undisturbed flow of water in the said area during the rainy season?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: The honourable member is referred to the reply to question No. 26 in the appendix to the Report of the Assembly Proceedings of the 5th August, 1938, in which it was stated that a survey of the area said to be affected would be made by the Railway authorities before arrangements for any opening could be made. I have asked the Railway authorities to let me know how the matter now stands.

Witness shed in the Civil and Criminal Courts, Serajganj.

*14. **Mr. ABDULLA-AL MAHMOOD:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Judicial and Legislative Department aware—

(*i*) that there is no witness shed attached to the Civil and Criminal Courts at Serajganj; and

(*ii*) that the people and *mufassal* litigants are inconvenienced for want of such sheds?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what steps, if any, the Government contemplate taking in the matter?

The Hon'ble Nawab MUSHARRUFF HOSSAIN, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) The matter is under consideration and the preparation of an estimate and plan for the work cannot be taken up pending decision of the question regarding safety of the proposed site from erosion of the river Jumna by the Irrigation Department.

Using of Government rent-free land.

*15. **Miss MIRA DATTA GUPTA:** Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Revenue Department be pleased to state—

(*a*) the list of persons and institutions enjoying on 31st December, 1938, the privilege of using Government land free of rent or on nominal rent, with or without any lease, and the area under each;

(*b*) the principles, if any, followed in the grant of such privileges;

(*c*) the conditions under which such privileges are enjoyed,

(*d*) whether any institution or person enjoying such a privilege is permitted to put the land into use for profit-earning purposes; and

(*e*) which of the institutions or persons enjoying such a privilege has put the land into use mainly for the exclusive use of particular communities?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: (*a*) No such list is maintained nor can one be compiled without incurring an expenditure not commensurate with the benefit derived from the information.

(*b*) and (*c*) Rule 307 [(4), (5) and (6)] of Crown Estates Manual may be referred to.

(*d*) The institution or person enjoying the privilege can only hold the land so long as it is used for the specific purpose or purposes for which it was granted (*vide* Rule 308, Crown Estates Manual).

(*e*) The information is not readily available but it may be assumed that where the privilege has been granted for the exclusive benefit of a particular community the land is being used for the benefit of that community in the manner stipulated at the time of the grant or lease.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if it is a fact that many station clubs, race courses and clubs running betting institutions in race courses are enjoying Government lands on nominal rents?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: I ask for notice. It is impossible to answer this question off-hand.

Mr. SURENDRA NATH BISWAS: Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that some approver witnesses in political cases have been granted Government lands free of rent and *salami*?

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Does the Government consider the desirability of making a thorough enquiry into these matters to find out if any Government land has been given to parties who do not deserve enjoyment of Government lands free of or on nominal rent?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: No, Sir.

UNSTARRED QUESTIONS

(to which answers were laid on the table)

Surplus process-fees.

1. **Mr. SADARUDDIN AHMED:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Judicial and Legislative Department be pleased to state whether it is a fact that a surplus of the process-fees realised is left with Government every year after paying the process-servers and their *nazirs*?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, is the Hon'ble Minister considering the desirability of either reducing the rate of process-fees to be realised or increasing the pay of the process-servers?

The Hon'ble Nawab MUSHARRUFF HOSSAIN, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) No.

Appointment of an Assistant Matron for Presidency Jail.

2. **Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Home (Jails) Department be pleased to state—

(*i*) whether applications had been invited for the appointment of an Assistant Matron for the Presidency Jail during recent months;

(*ii*) whether it was stated in the notice appearing in the press that preference will be given to suitable Indian lady candidates; and

(*iii*) the names and qualifications of the candidates who applied in response to the advertisement?

(*b*) Is it a fact that suitable Indian candidates were not granted an interview and the appointment has gone to one who is not an Indian?

(*c*) If the answer to (*b*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the circumstances under which this has been done?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: (*a*) (*i*) Yes.

(*ii*) No.

(*iii*) I regret that I am not prepared to publish lists of unsuccessful candidates.

(*b*) No.

(*c*) Does not arise.

Khan Bahadur MOHAMMED ALI: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if there were any Indian candidates?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: Certainly, there were Indian candidates.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if in the advertisement, dated the 20th September, which appeared in the "Statesman" it was specifically mentioned that Bengali candidates would be given preference?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: No, Sir. It said, "natives of Bengal".

Mr. SYED JALALUDDIN HASHEMY: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to tell us the nationality of the Assistant Matron appointed in the Presidency Jail?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: Anglo-Indian.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if there were candidates who had much better qualifications than the one appointed?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: No, Sir.

Mr. ATUL KRISHNA GHOSE: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether Mrs. Chapala Bala Mukherji was one of the candidates and whether she was given any interview?

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise. It is against the rules of parliamentary practice to probe into the details of candidates and their qualifications.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Was any interview granted to the candidates?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: Certainly.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Was any interview granted to Mrs Chapala Bala Mukherji?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: There were two Bengali ladies who were called for interview. One did not turn up and the other who turned up was not considered suitable.

Mr. SYED JALALUDDIN HASHEMY: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the reason why he is not prepared to publish the list of candidates?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: Because it is not fair to publish the names of candidates who had applied but failed to secure the job.

Number of processes executed by the District Nazir of the Howrah Civil Courts.

3. **Maulvi ABDUL HAMID SHAH:** Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Judicial and Legislative Department be pleased to state—

(i) the number of writs of attachment, warrants of arrest and orders for delivery of possession that were served by the District Nazir of the Howrah Civil Courts personally during the year 1938;

(*ii*) the amount of travelling allowance drawn by that Nazir during the same time; and

(*iii*) the special reasons or circumstances, if any, which necessitated this special practice in the Howrah Civil Courts without any formal authority from the courts concerned?

The Hon'ble Nawab MUSHARRUFF HOSSAIN, Khan Bahadur: (*i*) Number of processes executed by the District Nazir of the Howrah Civil Courts during the year 1938—

Writs of attachment—9.

Warrants of arrest—Nil.

Orders for delivery of possession—36.

(*ii*) The sum of Rs. 14 only was drawn by the Nazir on account of his travelling allowance in this connection during the year 1938.

(*iii*) No special practice is in vogue at Howrah and no process was executed by the Nazir without special orders of the courts concerned, as required under Note (1) to rule 101 of the High Court's Civil Rules and Orders.

Abolition of Subdivisional Munsif system.

4. Mr. JASIMUDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Judicial and Legislative Department be pleased to state whether the attention of Government has been drawn to a resolution of the Bengal Civil Service (Judicial) Association recommending abolition of the Subdivisional Munsif system?

(*b*) If so, what is the decision of Government in this respect?

The Hon'ble Nawab MUSHARRUFF HOSSAIN, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) The matter is under consideration.

Maulvi MUHAMMAD ISRAIL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether Government received any other representation for the abolition of the posts of Subdivisional Munsiffs other than the resolution referred to in the question?

The Hon'ble Nawab MUSHARRUFF HOSSAIN, Khan Bahadur: I want notice.

Schemes for dairy farming attached to Bengal Veterinary College.

5. **Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Agriculture and Veterinary Department be pleased to state whether there is any scheme for dairy farming attached to the Bengal Veterinary College approved or under consideration of Government?

(*b*) If so, what amounts of money are proposed to be spent for the same under different heads on account of capital and running expenditure?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether any land is proposed to be purchased in this connection or any other connection for or on behalf of the Bengal Veterinary College?

(*d*) If so, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing—

(*i*) the description of such land or lands showing the area;

(*ii*) approximate price;

(*iii*) names of present and previous owners for the last 10 years; and

(*iv*) the average price prevailing in the locality for similar plot or plots of land?

MINISTER in charge of the AGRICULTURE and VETERINARY DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed): (*a*) Yes, a scheme for a Dairy Section of the Bengal Veterinary College is under consideration.

(*b*) The details of cost have not yet been settled.

(*c*) No.

(*d*) Does not arise.

Mr. SYED JALALUDDIN HASHEMY: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to tell us with regard to answer (*b*), whether the cost is for the preparation of the scheme, or it is meant for the purchase of the proposed piece of land?

The Hon'ble Mr. SHAMSUDDIN AHMED: The cost is for the scheme.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that in the scheme referred to in answer (*a*), there is mention of a provision for the purchase of 20 bighas of land at a cost of about Rs. 20,000 per bigha?

Mr. SPEAKER: How do you know that? It is not in the answer.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: In answer to question (*c*), the Hon'ble Minister says: "No"——

Mr. SPEAKER: But you are furnishing some additional information. I am afraid your question is absolutely beside the point.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: All right, Sir. Will the Hon'ble Minister please tell us if in the scheme there is any provision for the purchase of land and, if so, what it is?

The Hon'ble Mr. SHAMSUDDIN AHMED: That matter has not been examined.

Ministerial officers of Education Department on extension of service.

6. Mr. JASIMUDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Education Department be pleased to state—

(*i*) the names and designations of the ministerial officers of the Education Department (including officers subordinate to the Director of Public Instruction) with their pay who are at present on extensions of service;

(*ii*) the date on which each of them attained the age of 55 years; and

(*iii*) how many of these are Musalmans and how many non-Musalmans?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble Minister considering the desirability of taking steps to retire the officers concerned at an early date and thereby facilitate promotion and make room for the educated unemployed youths?

MINISTER in charge of the EDUCATION DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Mr. A. K. Fazlul Huq): (*a*) (*i*) and (*ii*) A statement is laid on the table.

(*iii*) Three Muslims and eight non-Muslims.

(*b*) As the policy of Government is to give extension only in the interest of public service and as every case is considered on its own merits, this question does not arise. All such cases will be closely scrutinised in future.

Statement referred to in the reply to clauses (a) (i) and (ii) to unstarred question No. 6.

Name and designation.	Scale of pay.	Date on which each of them attained the age of 55 years.
	Rs.	
(1) Babu Bhola Nath Sarkar, Head Assistant in the office of the Director of Public Instruction, Bengal.	300—10—350 ..	16th July, 1937.
(2) Maulvi Abul Khair, Assistant in the office of the Director of Public Instruction, Bengal.	250—10—300	16th July, 1937.
(3) Babu Bireswar Gupta, Assistant in the office of the Director of Public Instruction, Bengal.	250—10—300 .	16th February, 1938.
(4) Babu Surendra Nath Ganguly, Head Clerk, Presidency College	150—10—250 .	16th April, 1938
(5) Maulvi Abdul Quader, Head Clerk, Inspector of Schools, Chittagong Division.	125—10—225 ..	1st July, 1938.
(6) Babu Kulabandhu Chakravarty, Head Clerk, Inspector of Schools, Dacca Range (Dacca)	125—10—225 ..	16th July, 1937.
(7) Babu Pran Kumar Nandy, Head Clerk, Ahsanullah School of Engineering, Dacca.	100—5—150 ..	16th September, 1935.
(8) Maulvi Abdul Latif, Assistant Reader, Bengal Library.	60—4—100 .	16th December, 1934.
(9) Babu Jnanendra Nath Mazumdar, Assistant Clerk, Inspector of Schools, Bakarganj Range.	40—40—45—2—65 (efficiency bar)—2—85.	5th June, 1935.
(10) Babu Chunta Haran Chakravarty, Assistant Clerk, Inspector of Schools, Rajshahi Division.	40—40—45—2—65 (efficiency bar)—2—85.	16th December, 1936.
(11) Babu Narendra Kishore Chakravarty, Clerk, Faridpur Zilla School.	35—35—40—2—60 (efficiency bar)—2—68—3/2—80.	16th June, 1935.

Maulvi MUHAMMAD ISRAIL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the period of extension granted to the officers mentioned in the statement?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: The present policy of Government is not to grant extension of service on any ground whatsoever.

Names and home addresses of clerks and peons in 24-Parganas Collectorate appointed during 1936-37 and 1937-38.

7. **Mr. JASIMUDDIN AHMED:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Revenue Department be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing for the years 1936-37 and 1937-38 the names and home (native) addresses of clerks and peons appointed in the 24-Parganas Collectorate and Magistracy?

(*b*) Has any non-district man been taken in?

(*c*) If the answer to (*b*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the reason therefor?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: (*a*) A statement is laid on the Library table.

(*b*) Yes.

(*c*) The appointments to a district office are made in accordance with the Board's Miscellaneous Rules.

Rule 53 (*ii*) lays down that a District Officer's choice in appointing clerks to the Lower or Upper Division is not limited to his own district or division.

A fortiori, the District Officer has discretion to appoint the best possible candidate to menial posts irrespective of what his native district may be.

Babu KSHETRA NATH SINGHA: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether Government do not think it desirable to give preference to the inhabitants of the district?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: Yes, Sir, it is desirable but Government have left the matter to the discretion of the local officers.

Names and home addresses of clerks and peons in 24-Parganas Civil Court appointed during 1936-37 and 1937-38.

8. **Mr. JASIMUDDIN AHMED:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Judicial and Legislative Department be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing for the years 1936-37 and 1937-38—

(*i*) the name and home (native) addresses of clerks and peons appointed in the Civil Courts under the District Judge of the 24-Parganas;

(*ii*) the number of clerks under the District Judge;

(*iii*) the number of Muhammadans amongst them;

(*iv*) the number of Muhammadans that are natives of the 24-Parganas;

(*v*) the number of Upper Division clerks; and

(*vi*) the number of Muhammadans amongst them?

(*b*) Has any non-district man been appointed?

(*c*) If the answer to (*b*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the reasons therefor?

The Hon'ble Nawab MUSHARRUFF HOSSAIN, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) (*i*) A statement is laid on the Library table.

(*ii*) 211 + 1 in abeyance, and 4 temporary clerks for four additional Courts.

(*iii*) 56.

(*iv*) 41.

(*v*) 30.

(*vi*) 3.

(*b*) Yes.

(*c*) Generally a test examination is held before any recruitment is made. The best available candidates are always taken in. No account has been taken of the home district of the applicant.

The price of sugar adversely affected by the legislation in the United Provinces and Bihar.

8. Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Commerce and Labour and Rural Reconstruction Department aware—

(*i*) that the price of sugar in this Province has gone up recently as a result of certain legislative measures adopted by the Governments of the United Provinces and Bihar; and

(*ii*) that these measures though primarily directed to control the production of sugar and sugarcane in those Provinces are being taken advantage of by the Indian Sugar Syndicate, Limited, a limited company having registered office in this Province to control the sale and distribution of sugar in Bengal, causing some detriment to the consumers of this Province?

(*b*) What steps have Government taken so far or propose to take to find out whether the rights of this Province and its Legislature under the constitution have been interfered with by the said legislations?

(c) If the answer to the second part of (b) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what do the Government of Bengal propose to do in the matter?

MINISTER in charge of the COMMERCE and LABOUR and RURAL RECONSTRUCTION DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Mr. H. S. Suhrawardy): (a) (i) No.

(ii) No. We have no information.

(b) and (c) Do not arise.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state with reference to answer (a) (i), whether this answer has been given simply because the question has been put by me or because he has consulted the trade journals and the daily market reports?

Mr. SPEAKER: I am afraid you cannot ask him about market reports.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Sir, the Hon'ble Minister in his answer says that the price of sugar has not gone up. I want to know the basis of his information—whether he has consulted the market reports or not?

The Hon'ble Mr. H. S. SUHRAWARDY: Sir, as a consumer of sugar of high content I am aware that the price of sugar has gone up; but I deny that the price has gone up solely as a result of certain legislative measures adopted by the Governments of the United Provinces and Bihar. There are other reasons as well.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: May I request the Hon'ble Minister to tell us what are the other reasons for the price of sugar going up? Is it not because of the control exercised by the Sugar Syndicate?

The Hon'ble Mr. H. S. SUHRAWARDY: No, I believe that the rise in prices is due to shortage in the yield of the crop consequent on the floods.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that all sugar mills in the United Provinces and Bihar have got to sell their products through the Sugar Syndicate and cannot sell an ounce of sugar in excess of their quota except through the Sugar Syndicate?

The Hon'ble Mr. H. S. SUHRAWARDY: May be.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that the legislation regarding the control of sugar prices in other provinces comes under Federal List 33 and does not come under the control of the Provincial Legislature.

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise.

Revision of pay of clerks in offices of District and Assistant Inspectors of Schools.

10. Mr. JASIMUDDIN AHMED: Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Education Department be pleased to state what steps, if any, have since been taken to give effect to the revision of pay of clerks, assistant clerks, etc., in the office of the District Inspectors and Assistant Inspectors of Schools, administratively approved in Mr. Lindsay's letter No. 1006-Edn., dated the 13th March, 1928?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: The matter is under consideration in connection with the general revision of pays.

Minimum salary of Government servants.

11. Maulvi ABDUL HAMID SHAH: (*a*) With reference to the reply given to unstarred question No. 5 of the Bengal Legislative Assembly of the 29th July, 1938, will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Judicial and Legislative Department be pleased to state whether he is aware of the fact that a feeling exists among the public of this Province that the minimum salary of a Government employee should in no case be less than Rs. 30 per month?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether he considers the desirability of increasing the pay of the inferior Government servants of his department?

The Hon'ble Nawab MUSHARRUFF HOSSAIN, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) No.

(*b*) The question referred to was addressed to the Hon'ble the Finance Minister; and the matter is a general one affecting all departments.

Promotion of Inspectors to the rank of District Superintendents of Police.

12. Mr. JASIMUDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Home (Police) Department be pleased to state the

number of District Superintendents of Police—Hindus, Muhammadans and Scheduled Castes—appointed directly and by promotion from the rank of Inspectors of Police?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the number of Muhammadan District Superintendents of Police appointed by promotion from the rank of Inspectors is below the quota in the total strength of service warranted by a percentage of population?

(*c*) If the answer to (*b*) is in the affirmative, what steps does the Hon'ble Minister propose taking to remove the inequality?

(*d*) Is it a fact that a number of suitable Muhammadan Inspectors are available for promotion to the rank of District Superintendent of Police?

(*e*) If so, does the Hon'ble Minister contemplate removing the inequality by promoting requisite number of suitable Muhammadan Inspectors to the rank of District Superintendent of Police?

(*f*) Is it a fact that a list of selected Inspectors is maintained by the Inspector-General of Police?

(*g*) If so, does the number in the list make up the communal deficiency of Musalmans and Scheduled Castes?

(*h*) Is it a fact that the number of Muhammadan Inspectors in the list of selected Inspectors for promotion to the rank of District Superintendent of Police which is maintained by the Inspector-General of Police is only 4 out of a total of 38?

(*i*) If so, what steps does the Hon'ble Minister intend taking to bring on to the list the requisite number of suitable Muhammadan Inspectors?

(*j*) Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the number of Muhammadan Inspectors, if any, who were considered fit for promotion to the rank of District Superintendent of Police in the Conferences of Deputy Inspectors-General with Superintendents of Police held heretobefore?

(*k*) Have they been brought on to the list of selected Inspectors (for District Superintendentship of Police), which is maintained by the Inspector-General of Police?

(*l*) If the answer to (*k*) is in the negative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state how he intends to make up the deficiency in the number of Muhammadan Inspectors (fit for promotion to the rank of District Superintendent of Police) in the list kept by the Inspector-General of Police?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: (*a*) to (*d*) In making appointments by promotion the criteria are seniority and merit. The question of steps to secure the promotion of officers on a communal basis does not therefore arise.

The present composition of the cadre which consists of 31 posts is as follows:—

Muhammadans	...	...	...	8
Hindus	...	...	...	17
Vacant	...	...	...	6
				31

(*e*), (*i*) and (*l*) Do not arise.

(*f*) Yes.

(*g*), (*h*) and (*k*) The composition of the list is confidential.

(*j*) The information is confidential.

Stationery articles for process-servers.

13. Maulvi ABU HOSSAIN SARKAR: (*a*) With reference to the reply to clause (*c*) of starred question No. 26 in the Bengal Legislative Assembly on the 15th February, 1938, will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Judicial and Legislative Department be pleased to state whether any circular has since been issued?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the negative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state when the circular letter is likely to be issued?

The Hon'ble Nawab MUSHARRUFF HOSSAIN, Khan Bahadur: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) Does not arise.

Issue of bus licences by Magistrate of 24-Parganas.

14. Mr. JASIMUDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Home (Police) Department be pleased to state—

(*i*) the number of bus licences issued by the District Magistrate, 24-Parganas, which are in force at present;

(*ii*) the number issued to non-Bengalis;

(*iii*) the number issued to the non-residents of the district; and

(*iv*) the number issued to the Musalmans of the district?

(*b*) If the number of Musalman licensees is comparatively smaller than those issued to persons of other communities, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the reason?

(*c*) Is it not a fact that the attention of the Hon'ble Minister has been drawn to the desirability of increasing the number of Musalmans?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: (*a*) (*i*) 195.

(*ii*) 119.

(*iii*) 77.

(*iv*) 15.

(*b*) Because the number of Musalmans who applied for licences was smaller.

(*c*) No.

Roads and bridges projects.

15. Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Communications and Works Department be pleased to state the names of roads and bridges projects on account of which provisions were made in the budgets for 1937-38 and 1938-39 showing—

(*i*) the total sums required for each project;

(*ii*) the amounts provided in each of the years 1937-38 and 1938-39;

(*iii*) the amounts actually spent during 1937-38 for each;

(*iv*) the amounts actually spent up to the 31st December, 1938, on each out of the amounts budgeted for the current year; and

(*v*) brief explanations for such items in which adequate progress could not be made?

(*b*) What action has been taken by Government so far, or is proposed to be taken in near future, to examine the recommendations of the Special Officer, Road Development Projects, and to speed up the sanctioning and construction of new projects.

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: (*a*) A statement giving the required information is laid on the table.

(*b*) The officer was not asked to make any recommendations, but it is expected that he will shortly submit to Government the final chapter of his report, embodying his conclusions on the whole scheme drawn up by him. These will receive the early consideration of Government who, after coming to a preliminary decision, will consult the Provincial Board of Communications as to the general line of policy to be followed in the development of the road system of the province. An officer is now on special duty for the purpose of accelerating the examination of the financial and administrative aspects of road schemes and generally expediting projects which it is proposed to finance from the Road Development Fund.

Statement in the answer to clause (a) to unstarred question No. 15.

Item.	District.	Projects and works.	Amount of estimate	Budget provision for 1937-38	Actual during 1937-38	Budget provision for 1938-39	Expenditure incurred up to end of December 1938	Remarks.
			Rs	Rs	Rs	Rs	Rs.	
	Presidency Circle.							
1	24-Parganas	Improvement to the Calcutta-Jessore Road from Baraset to the boundary of the 24-Parganas district.	1,89,350	1,41,800	1,55,004	20,000	7,055	
2	Jessore ..	Improving the Calcutta-Jessore Road from the boundary of the 24-Parganas district to Gaighata	1,63,812					
3	24-Parganas ..	Ghoshpara Road	4,63,503	24,000	23,903		..	Work completed in 1937-38.
	Central Circle.							
4	Hooghly .	Constructing bridge over the Kunti river	88,250	40,000	22,441	28,000	33,705	
5	Ditto	Diversion of Grand Trunk Road in the 18th mile near Hastings Jute Mill.	91,150	74,000	Nil	16,000	Nil	The land has now been handed over. It is expected that Rs. 65,000 will be spent on acquisition before 31st March, 1939.
6	Ditto ..	Diversion of Grand Trunk Road near Hooghly.	1,16,741	20,000	2,036	50,000	6,035	
7	Ditto .	Saraswati Bridge on Grand Trunk Road	75,000	5,000	92	20,000	Nil	The question of waterway was under consideration for some time. Tenders for the work will shortly be called for.
8	Midnapore .	Burge Bridge over the Cossye at Midnapore	8,30,000	Nil	13,019	1,50,000	3,043	A tender for the construction of the bridge has been accepted: it is expected that the work will be started at an early date.
9	Burdwan ..	Burdwan-Arambagh Road (1st 5 years' programme).	4,60,111	1,65,000	1,58,133	1,43,000	1,09,627	

Item.	District.	Projects and works.	Amount of estimate.	Budget provision for 1937-38.	Actual during 1937-38.	Budget provision for 1938-39.	Expenditure incurred up to end of December 1938.	Remarks.
			Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	
10	Ditto ..	Burdwan-Arambagh Road (2nd 5 years' programme).	6,58,542	75,000	16,214	2,00,000	59,008	There has been some delay on these projects as last year there was a malaria epidemic amongst the coolies in the brickfield. These not only affected the outturn of bricks last year, but the contractor has found great difficulty in getting coolies to work there this year.
11	Ditto ..	Damodar Bridge .	29,32,000	1,00,000	514	40,000	3,860	This year's budget provision was for work on the north approach only. Regarding the bridge itself certain details have still to be decided before tenders can be called for.
12	Nadia ..	Ranaghat-Jaguli Road (1st 5 years' programme)	3,94,464	2,00,000	23,384	1,67,000	60,079	
13	Howrah .	Improvement of Grand Trunk Road from Telkalghat Road to tramway terminus at Shibpur.	34,461	6,000	Nil	..	..	The work was completed in 1936-37.
	Northern Circle.							
14	Pabna	Pabna-Ishurdi Road including Ichamati bridge.	9,18,312	1,49,000	64,770	59,000	24,531	
15	Ditto ..	Extension of the Pabna-Ishurdi Road from Radhanagar to the approach road to the Civil Court buildings, Pabna.	44,900	Nil	Nil	44,900	33,709	
16	Darjeeling ..	Special tools and plant for the Sevoke-Bagrakote Road project.	38,000	18,000	2,82,112	10,000	6,715	
17	Ditto ..	Construction of road from Sevoke to Bagrakote including the bridge over the Teesta river.	14,48,272	3,50,000		6,50,000	1,92,845	This project includes the Coronation Bridge over the Teesta river, the budget provision for which was Rs. 3,50,000. Owing to the early break of the rains, work on the bridge was delayed and the expenditure this year is expected to be Rs. 1,25,000 only. On the other hand the contractors consider that they will be able to finish the work within their tendered time.

	Eastern Circle.							
18	Jessore ..	Constructing Jhikergacha bridge on Jessore Road.	1,13,210	50,000	1,497	50,000	1,982	
19	....	Magura-Jhenidah Road (supplementary works necessitated by floods of 1935)	3,04,796	2,23,000	1,50,340	1,00,000	67,457	
20	....	Satkhira-Navaran Road (2nd 5 years' programme)	5,24,503	1,00,000	80,337	1,50,000	26,985	The contractor for the supply of bricks (burning at site) is behind his schedule
21	....	Magura-Jhenidah Road (2nd 5 years' programme)	3,75,000	50,000	994	50,000	5,606	
22	Tippera ..	Barkanta to Daudkandi (18 miles)	4,85,665	1,50,000	60,508	1,50,000	94,299	
23	Chittagong ..	Improving the Chittagong-Arracan Trunk Road (1st 5 years' programme) minor bridges	3,00,000		2,073	70,000	Nil	*Items 23, 25, 26 and 27.*—It is expected that the full amount provided will be spent before the 31st March of this year provided that the steel suppliers fulfil their contract. Progress is mainly dependent on the supply of steel and its fabrication for the bridges. At present it is uncertain how much of the steel work will be delivered in time for payment this year.
24	....	Kalarpole Bridge ..	90,621	40,000	2,180	34,000	5,729	
25	....	Tankabati Bridge .	92,530	20,000	1,653	72,300	14,659	
26	....	Dalu Bridge	80,160	20,000	926	74,000	15,166	
27	Mymensingh ..	Tangail-Mymensingh Road (2nd 5 years' programme)	10,74,000	50,000	29,779	2,00,000	7,911	
28	Ditto ..	Improving the Muktacha Gobtali section of the Tangail-Mymensingh Road.	4,86,600		.	.	Nil	
29	Dacca ..	Dacca-Narayanganj Road .	5,31,500	47,000	51,331	.	.	Work completed.
		Total .	..	21,17,000	11,43,240	25,48,200	7,74,277	

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: In view of the statement furnished, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to tell us if he finds it impossible for him to spend the whole amount budgeted during the current year?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: My friend as a member of the Board of Communications knows it very well that the figures which have been given in the statement are for the period when the working season hardly began. I hope that the honourable member——

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: On a point of order, Sir. My question was quite specific. May I have your protection? Is the Hon'ble Minister in order in bringing in extraneous matter as to whether or not I have knowledge as a member of the Board of Communications?

Mr. SPEAKER: You have changed your point of order to one of protection!

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: I want your ruling, Sir, whether the Hon'ble Minister is entitled to bring in extraneous matter in answering a question.

Mr. SPEAKER: I am afraid limitation is sometimes a virtue! (Laughter.)

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: I may inform the honourable member that he will find from the revised figures which will appear in the budget to be presented to-day that we expect to spend very nearly the budget amount.

Night classes in Vidyasagar College, Calcutta.

16. Dr. SANAULLAH: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Education Department be pleased to state whether it is a fact—

(*i*) that regular night classes are held in the Vidyasagar College, Calcutta; and

(*ii*) that Muslim students are precluded from attending those classes?

(*b*) Is there any grant-in-aid given by Government to that college?

(*c*) If the answer to (*b*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the reason for this differential treatment between the Hindu and Muslim students?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: (*a*) (*i*) Yes; but only of the Commerce Department.

(*ii*) Yes.

(*b*) No.

(*c*) Does not arise.

Maulvi MUHAMMAD ISRAIL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the reason why Muslim students are precluded from attending the night classes of the Vidyasagar College?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: That is more than I can say.

Adjournment Motion.

Mr. SIBNATH BANERJEE: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I beg to move that the business of the House—

Mr. SPEAKER: Have you got my consent?

Mr. SIBNATH BANERJEE: Yes, Sir, I have got your consent. I beg to move that the business of this House be adjourned to discuss a definite matter of urgent public importance, viz., the promulgation of the Bengal Jute Ordinance. Shall I read the statement also?

Mr. SPEAKER: No, that is not necessary. I hold that this motion is not in order mainly on the ground that the House will have an opportunity of discussing this matter under the statutory right also, and I consider that it will go against the constitutional practice for an adjournment motion to be substituted in place of a statutory right. In these circumstances, your motion is not in order.

Mr. SIBNATH BANERJEE: May I make a submission, Sir?

Mr. SPEAKER: No more.

Mr. DHIRENDRA NATH DATTA: May I know, Sir,—

Mr. SPEAKER: I am going to make a definite rule from this session that the Speaker will not be prepared to give an answer to any query on any matter arising out of the administration of the Assembly Department, on the floor of this House. I am quite prepared to satisfy the curiosity of any honourable member if he consults the office or comes to see me in my private chamber. More than once I have told honourable members not to put such questions to me in the House, and this practice should now be put a stop to.

BUDGET ESTIMATES FOR 1939-40.

The Hon'ble Mr. NALINI RANJAN SARKER: I rise to present the Budget Estimates for 1939-40, and, as is the convention, I also present on this occasion the Revised Estimates for 1938-39 and the actuals for 1937-38: in other words, I rise to prophesy about the coming year, while disclosing the imperfections of my prophecies about its two immediate predecessors. Those uncertain performers, the revenues of the province, which have never yet been known to run according to plan, have given us some anxious moments since last I discoursed about them; added to which the floods which afflicted many districts a few months ago have made an unexpected drain upon our balances. But I am glad to say that things are distinctly better than during the first half of the year, one was sometimes tempted to think they would be. Before I turn to them in detail, let me pass the three years very briefly in review.

It will be remembered that 1936-37 closed with actuals much better than were anticipated owing to an improvement in world trade and that, when I was giving a Revised Estimate for 1937-38 a year ago, I placed the receipts much higher than I had placed them in my original estimate, because the boom had continued well into the year 1937-38. I made what I hoped was sufficient allowance for the signs of a collapse of the boom that had recently revealed themselves. But the position was more serious than I supposed. The receipts for the year were about 46 lakhs better than was originally estimated, but they were a disappointment in comparison with my Revised Estimate.

My estimate of receipts for 1938-39 was based on my Revised Estimate for 1937-38 *plus* the hope that world conditions would get no worse. On the contrary, they deteriorated considerably. I believe that the deterioration has now been checked, at least temporarily, but there is no hope of our touching the figures which I ventured to forecast for 1938-39. Our revenue receipts are likely to be 41 lakhs below original estimate. About half of this drop is due to world causes and the rest to a mixture of economic and political causes much nearer home. The deterioration in the world position was, of course, due almost entirely to the threat of war in Europe and its paralysing effect upon confidence in general; but the Munich Settlement was happily followed by a recovery of confidence that checked the slump. It is, however, on the prospects of peace or war in Europe that the fate of world markets in 1939-40 will mostly depend.

Economic conditions in India reflected those elsewhere and, at the same time, exhibited special stresses of their own. Between the autumn of 1937 and the summer of 1938 imports so increased and exports so decreased that India's balance of trade dwindled to almost vanishing point. This led to a weakening of the Rupee-exchange which

made a heavy call upon the Sterling resources of the Reserve Bank of India. Unsettled conditions invaded the share markets and the Bombay Stock Exchange had to suspend forward trading for a number of weeks. The continuance of the Sino-Japanese War caused a heavy decline in the exports of India's raw cotton, with a consequent depression of the Indian cotton market. Industrial production was, however, maintained at its former level. This in the case of our jute industry meant the continuation of over-production and was therefore a misfortune. Stocks accumulated to alarming proportions, largely owing to the shrinkage in demand in overseas markets; and as a result of this shrinkage the shares and prospective shares of the provinces in the jute export duty declined. The indices of wholesale prices showed a continuous fall till the middle of June. The return of slightly more confidence during recent months is reflected in an improvement of India's trade balance and in some recovery of those provincial receipts which are most directly connected with world trade. We are particularly interested, of course, in the order for 200 million jute bags recently placed in Calcutta. It will benefit both the province as a whole and our Budget. But I wish it had come on a genuine current of improving trade instead of being merely linked with prospects of a destructive war. I will reserve until later my mention of the quasi-political causes nearer home which have recently depressed our revenues.

A resumé of the past is always easier than a forecast of the future, especially in times so unsettled as the present. There are those who consider that the hopes of peace which the Munich Settlement evoked have had little since then to reinforce them. The British Premier's visit to Rome has, to all appearances, produced no worthwhile results; and Franco-Italian tension has in no sense eased. While Herr Hitler's speech to the Reichstag has little in common with his previous utterances, the demand for colonies is voiced in the same strident tones as ever before. Never has civilisation approached a new financial year with a more acute consciousness of the terrible responsibilities which will lie upon the shoulders of its statesmen.

In my estimates for the coming year I have assumed that revenues will come in roughly at the level on which they have flowed during the last few months. I have assumed that war in Europe will not break out. If this proves to be correct our chances of getting better revenues than I have estimated will depend mostly upon the course of events in the United States, an improvement in whose markets would almost certainly set up widening ripples of prosperity. The Anglo-American Trade Agreement should be helpful in this direction.

We have to distinguish between the objective facts of the economic situation, the subjective outlook of the business world and the nature of the international economic relations. The objective facts, so far as

I am able to appraise them, yield no warrant either for the exaggerated pessimism of a year ago, or the easy optimism which company promotors or extravagant financiers would like to adopt when a depression shows indications of drawing to a close. Of one thing we may be reasonably certain that the recession has not deepened into a cyclical depression. The differences between the depression of 1929 and the set-back which occurred in the second quarter of 1937 have not been lost sight of by any government or business interests. This is hardly the occasion for going into details. It should suffice that while it would be rash to count on a rapid progress of all-round business activity there is little or nothing to suggest a further serious deterioration.

I will now turn to each year in detail.

In taking our last look at 1937-38 we are reminded that this was the first year of Provincial Autonomy. We find in the figures for that year, whose accounts have now been closed, the financial position as it was when we began our stewardship, and a notable illustration of the influence upon our financial fortunes that is exercised by world conditions beyond our control. With regard to our stewardship, we took over from the previous administration both assets and liabilities. A valuable asset was the absence of any budgetary deficits and the receipt of substantial additions to revenue on account of the Niemeyer Award. Another fortunate circumstance was the lifting at that time of the world depression which had forced our predecessors to resort to retrenchment and hold up necessary expenditure. But an onerous liability was the large accumulation of undischarged obligations to the people of this province which we inherited from the past. As I said in my first Budget Statement, "The problems that loom very large in our national economy to-day are to no small extent the result of inadequate attention given to them in the past, although the benefit of past wisdom and past endeavour is always present in some measure." To what extent we have succeeded in husbanding these assets and in discharging this liability will be found in the story of the last two years which I shall presently relate. Without entering into any details at this stage, I may say that our best endeavours have been directed towards the amelioration of the conditions of the people without jeopardy to the solvency and the financial prestige of the Province.

In framing the Revised Estimate for the year 1937-38, in my last Budget Statement, I provided for an increase of 88 lakhs in revenue receipts in view of the improvements in the jute trade and in Railway finance, but as I have already indicated, this hope was not realised. Mainly owing to a declension in world trade conditions, but also to certain domestic causes, the revenue actuals for the year were lower by 42 lakhs than the revised. The main contributors to this decline were 18½ lakhs under Jute duty, 2½ lakhs under Income-tax, 11½ lakhs under Land Revenue, 7½ lakhs under non-Judicial stamps and 2 lakhs

under Judicial stamps. (Rai HARENDRA NATH CHAUDHURY: Hear, hear.) The deterioration under the first three heads was mainly due to the economic slump, while that under Land Revenue and Judicial stamps was due to domestic rather than world causes. The decrease under Land Revenue was almost entirely due to the short collection of ordinary revenue from Government estates, while that under Judicial stamps was due to smaller sale of court-fee stamps on account mainly of the formation of Debt Conciliation Boards. These factors still persist during the current year and I shall refer to their implications more fully when I deal with the Revised Estimate for 1938-39.

The actual expenditure on revenue account for 1937-38 turned out to be 24 lakhs less than the figure taken in the Revised Estimate. So the net worsening, instead of being 42 lakhs, was 18 lakhs. The bulk of the savings occurred under three heads, viz., General Administration (8 lakhs), Irrigation (3 lakhs) and Civil Works (5½ lakhs). The savings under General Administration were due to slower progress in the establishment of Debt Conciliation Boards and non-utilisation in full of the supply for the allowances of the members of the legislature. The savings under Irrigation were due to smaller outlay on works and the postponement of the establishment of the Waterways Board. Those under Civil Works were the result of inability to work up to the programme of road construction originally adopted.

On the year's working, the closing balance stood at 1 crore 36 lakhs against 1 crore 91 lakhs anticipated in the Revised. Out of this decrease of 55 lakhs, 18 lakhs is due to the net worsening under Revenue heads already referred to. The balance is due to transactions under the Debt Deposit section of the Budget and is explained by larger investments in Treasury Bills towards the close of the year than were originally anticipated. The reduction on this account is merely an accounting adjustment and does not connote a real diminution in the provincial balance.

Before I take leave of the year 1937-38, I should like to present the House with what may be called the "commercial account" for the year. The province started on the 1st of April, 1937, with a clean slate and unburdened with debt. On the 31st March, 1938, the total liability of Government on account of unfunded debt (e.g., State provident funds —4 crores 16 lakhs), Deposit and Advances (e.g., Civil Court deposits— 2 crores 21 lakhs) and Remittances stood at 6 crores 55 lakhs. Against these Government had on that date liquid assets amounting to 3 crores 75 lakhs as follows: Closing cash balance—1 crore 36 lakhs, Loans and advances—85 lakhs, Investment in Treasury Bills—1 crore 20 lakhs and Investment in securities—34 lakhs. Against the remaining portion of

the debit, 2 crores 80 lakhs out of the total of 6 crores 55 lakhs, Government possess capital assets in the shape of Civil Works and Irrigation projects in which a sum of 6 crores 29 lakhs had been invested.

Judging from these financial results it may be maintained that the first year of Provincial Autonomy was a satisfactory one in many respects. In spite of the reaction in the concluding months, the year ended with revenue surplus of 1 crore 18 lakhs. Government had an adequate cash balance in the Treasuries and in the Reserve Bank throughout the year. The balance in the Reserve Bank was always in excess of the stipulated minimum of 25 lakhs and no ways and means advance had to be requisitioned.

The disquieting feature in the situation, however, was the deterioration in revenue receipts which manifested itself in the closing months. It survived into the year 1938-39 and was there aggravated, under Land Revenue and Court-fees, by domestic developments. These developments demand attention, illustrating as they do that democracy can be expensive not merely in the ordinary sense of that word but also in the other sense of reducing revenues.

In this connection, I would remind the House that nearly 80 per cent. of the total revenue of the province (13 crores) is derived from only five heads, namely, Jute Duty (2 crores 38 lakhs), Land Revenue (3 crores 53 lakhs), Excise (1 crore 55 lakhs), non-Judicial stamps (80 lakhs), and Court-fees (2 crores 7 lakhs). Their main characteristics deserve mention. The income from Jute Duty and non-Judicial stamps depends almost entirely on world conditions. Land Revenue is inelastic, being based more or less on fixed demands, but has hitherto been a very steady source of revenue owing to the sanctions inherent in our Land Revenue system and the good traditions of the tenantry. Excise revenue used to respond to economic conditions with considerable elasticity, but owing to changes in standards of living and to the temperance movement is never likely to yield again as much as it used to. Court-fees have traditionally held pride of place with Land Revenue as one of our two biggest single sources of income, but they have recently let us down very badly owing to decline in litigation. This decline is mainly due to our establishment of Debt Conciliation Boards, but it is also, perhaps, in part attributable to a general weakening of the habit of litigation consequent on economic and political changes on the countryside. If it is true, as I am afraid it is, that Court-fees are no longer likely to be the tower of strength to the exchequer which they were in the past, it means that a considerable change adversely affecting one of Bengal's leading and most honourable professions is taking place.

Before coming to a consideration of the Revised Estimates for the current year I should like to refer to some outstanding domestic events which have in one way or another affected the budgetary fortunes of the year.

The first of these was the widespread floods in as many as 15 districts. These caused acute distress and Government mobilised all their available resources for work in the affected areas. The rules relating to the grant of agricultural loans were liberalised and a sum of nearly 50 lakhs has been distributed as loans to the flood-stricken. The amount spent by Government on test relief works and on gratuitous relief is well over 6 lakhs. Success has attended the measures adopted. There has been no loss of life on account of the floods, and epidemics which generally come in the wake of widespread natural calamities of this nature have been averted by the adoption of timely precautionary measures.

The effect of the floods on the Budget has been threefold. In the first place, there have been heavy outgoings and greatly reduced recovery in respect of agricultural loans. In the second place, there has been considerable increase in expenditure on test relief and gratuitous relief and also on account of the travelling allowance and contingencies of officers deputed to flood relief work. Finally, the floods have contributed, along with other factors to which I shall refer in due course, to a serious shrinkage in Land Revenue receipts. Another consequence which has followed from the floods, though it does not directly affect the Provincial Budget, is of sufficient importance to deserve mention. Education cess had to be suspended in nine out of twelve districts in which it had been imposed and seven out of those nine were districts affected by floods.

The next item of importance to which I should like to refer is the enactment of certain measures affecting our Land Revenue system, conceived in the interest of the tenants and also to satisfy their persistent demands. I refer particularly to the Bengal Tenancy Amendment Act of 1938, which came into effect on the 18th of August, 1938, abolishing landlords' fees on transfer and depriving privileged landlords of the power of realising rents by certificate procedure, and to the suspension for a period of two years with effect from 1st Baisakh, 1345 B.S., corresponding to 14th April, 1938, of the use of certificate procedure in fresh cases for recovery of rents from tenants in Government estates and in Court of Wards estates.

The abolition of landlords' fees on transfer has an adverse effect on the transactions under the Debt Deposit section of the Budget. It will be recalled that, with the separation of our finances from those of the Centre, liabilities for a variety of non-Government deposits banked with the Government of India were passed on to us without the corresponding assets. It was expected, however, that as the incomings in any one year

in respect of these deposits normally exceed the outgoings, the liquidation of the liabilities would present no difficulty. In regard to landlords' transfer fees, we inherited a liability of 49 lakhs on the 1st April, 1937, which was reduced to 45 lakhs on 1st April, 1938. Since further inflow of landlords' fees has stopped, the liability will have to be met from our reserves. The amount of drain upon our reserves on this account during the current year will be about 18 lakhs.

The abolition of certificate procedure as a means of collecting land dues was certain, of course, to have some adverse effect upon the collection of these dues, and part of the considerable fall in land revenue during the current year, both under "Fixed Collections" and under "Collections from Government Estates" is attributable to this cause: precisely how much I am not in a position to say; but it is significant that the deterioration in collections began before the arrival of the floods. The deterioration that was certain to occur was in respect of those on the actual margin of inability to pay; and so long as deterioration does not spread beyond that margin, neither landlords nor the Khas Mahal Department will have just cause to complain. But if it ever happens—or, as some allege, is already happening—that the effect spreads beyond that margin: if people able to pay who used merely to defer payment until a certificate issued, or people who used to pay simply because the power of certification existed, exploit the concession and swell the ranks of defaulters, then the net effect of the concession will be evil, both to landlords, and to the revenues of the province and also to the tenants themselves who will drift into debt which they would otherwise not have incurred. I am not saying that any such exploitation has in fact begun; and, if it does begin, there will be means of dealing with it, including a reversion to certificate procedure in Khas Mahals or some such method for speedy realisation. But I do say that the danger exists and that it is the duty of us all to be on guard against it.

An increase of about 70 thousand in our estimate of expenditure for the current year has been due to a *post*-Budget decision to appoint a number of Committees and Special Officers to investigate various matters affecting the welfare of the people. A list of these Committees and Special Officers will be found in an Appendix to the printed copy of my statement, and I will not give further details here.

Two other enquiries however which are now in progress deserve special mention because of their vital importance to the future economic well-being of the province. Provision for both of these was included in the Budget.

The first enquiry is in connection with our Land Revenue system. A Commission consisting of experts and persons possessing wide administrative and other experience, was appointed in November last

under the Chairmanship of Sir Francis Floud to study the Land Revenue system in Bengal, with special reference to the Permanent Settlement and to the various suggestions for changing that system which are nowadays current, including the suggestion that the rights of Zemindars could be purchased by the State at a profit in the long run to provincial revenues, thereby increasing our capacity for expenditure on social services.

The other is an Industrial Survey directed towards a complete examination of the position of existing large, medium-sized and cottage industries with a view to ascertain what measures should be adopted for their promotion and future development. In order to place our programme of industrial development on a scientific and disciplinary basis, we have appointed for this Survey an expert Committee, under the Chairmanship of Dr. John Mathai, whose services have been kindly lent to us by the Government of India.

Both of these Committees have been set an extremely complicated task, but the membership of each is very distinguished, combining expert technical knowledge with administrative experience and we expect to receive from them reports and recommendations which will have far-reaching effects upon the solution of the two chief economic problems that confront us in this province.

The next item to which I should like to refer is the recent release of detenus. When introducing the Budget for 1937-38, I expressed the hope that it might be possible in the near future to effect considerable reduction in the expenditure which the province had to incur on account of measures taken to combat the anarchist movement. My hopes in this respect have been largely fulfilled. The release of detenus has made it possible to reduce the pitch of abnormal expenditure by no less than 22 lakhs. Further economies to the extent of about 3 lakhs have been proposed in next year's Budget, and it is hoped that if the situation continues to be satisfactory, it will be possible in due course to effect further reduction in expenditure. Among the reasons which make larger savings impracticable at the moment is the need to keep a careful watch upon certain forms of subversive activity which are making themselves manifest in different parts of this province. The existence of an illiterate and uninformed labour force in the Province and the recent release of political prisoners on a large scale are, according to the department concerned, providing a fruitful combination for the preaching of communism by a group of persons who derive their political sustenance from the theories of foreign doctrinaires. The department considers that constant vigilance is required to be exercised over the activities of those among them whose avowed object is to cause a violent upheaval of the existing social order and whose method is to sow seeds of disruption amongst the illiterate workers and peasants of this country by insidious and underground

propaganda. The greater part of this work inevitably falls upon the police force, with the result that the bulk of the unavoidable expenditure in this connection occurs in the Police Budget. From the public also there has been more demand for police protection.

Let me now pass on to the details of the Revised Estimate for the current year. According to the original estimate the year was to start with an opening balance of 1 crore 91 lakhs and end with a closing balance of 1 crore 75 lakhs. The Revised Estimate places the opening balance at 1 crore 36 lakhs and the closing balance at 78 lakhs. This deterioration by 97 lakhs is the net result of the following: a decrease of 55 lakhs in the opening balance; a decrease of 41 lakhs in our revenue receipts; a decrease of 31 lakhs in our expenditure on revenue account and a decrease of about 32 lakhs in the balance outside the revenue account, that is to say, in the working of the Capital and Debt Deposit section of the Budget. I will now give a brief explanation of each of these changes.

The opening balance adopted in the Revised Estimate is the actual closing balance of the preceding year. In my review of the accounts for 1937-38 I have already explained that the decrease of 55 lakhs in the estimated closing balance for that year is due first to a falling off of revenue receipts by about 42 lakhs set off by savings to the extent of about 24 lakhs in revenue expenditure, a net worsening of 18 lakhs; and secondly to outgoings under the Debt, Deposit, etc. heads being larger than anticipations by 37 lakhs, owing mainly to increased investment in Treasury bills in March 1938.

The decrease of 41 lakhs in revenue receipts is mostly due to a fall of 9 lakhs under Jute duty, 32 lakhs under Land Revenue and 39 lakhs under Stamps, offset in part by an increase of 18 lakhs under Other Taxes, 7 lakhs under Excise, 5 lakhs under Income Tax and 7 lakhs from unclaimed deposits in the Suitors' Fund and in Civil Courts. The decrease under Jute duty is due to the slump in world markets, which, however, now shows signs of lifting. The decline under Land Revenue is due partly to the effect of floods and perhaps partly also to the withdrawal of the certificate procedure in Khas Mahals. Fixed collections, that is to say, collections from permanently settled estates, have dropped by 7 lakhs while collections from Government estates have dropped by 19½ lakhs. The balance of the decrease under this head is due to smaller recovery of settlement charges. The decline of 39 lakhs under Stamps is made up of a decrease of 13 lakhs under Non-Judicial and a decrease of 26 lakhs under Judicial. The drop under Non-Judicial stamps is explained by the general dullness of trade, while the decline under Judicial stamps is attributable to the reduction in the volume of civil litigation as a result mainly of the working of Debt Conciliation Boards. Among the improvements which compensate partially for this serious decline under the three main heads of revenue,

that under "Other Taxes" is due to the passage of the Bengal Expiring Laws Act which provided for the continuance of certain taxation measures which were due to expire in the middle of the current year. The 5 lakhs under Income Tax represents arrear receipts on account of 1937-38 which are being adjusted this year. The increase of 7 lakhs under Excise and of a similar amount under Unclaimed Deposits are unexpected windfalls for which no credit was taken in the Budget.

The decrease of 31 lakhs in expenditure on revenue account is the net effect of excesses and savings spread over a large number of heads the details of which are furnished in the Red Book. I shall confine myself to the more important variations. Savings of nearly 13 lakhs occur under Debt Conciliation owing to the slower progress in the formation of Debt Conciliation Boards. There is a decrease of 11 lakhs under Civil Works owing to smaller expenditure on original works, mostly buildings for which revised plans and specifications with a view to secure economy are being worked out. The Police Budget shows a saving of nearly three lakhs owing to retrenchment and a similar amount has been saved under Jails owing mainly to decrease in the number of inmates. There is a decrease of 4 lakhs under Irrigation owing mainly to non-utilisation of the provision for the Waterways Board. Savings of about 5 lakhs have occurred in the General Administration Budget owing partly to the smaller expenditure under Landlords' fees establishment and District establishment and partly to the absence of a session of the Legislature in November. Savings to the extent of nearly 10 lakhs occur under Public Health, Agriculture and Industries owing to the time required for working out details of certain important projects for which lump provisions had been included in the Budget. On the other hand, there is an increase of 16 lakhs under Famine Relief out of which 10 lakhs is on account of the initial contribution to the Bengal Famine Insurance Fund and 6 lakhs is on account of test relief works and of gratuitous relief in areas affected by flood; and an increase of 2 lakhs under Education for the provision of special educational facilities for Scheduled Caste students.

The decrease of 32 lakhs in the Debt Deposit section of the Budget is the net result of a worsening of 50 lakhs owing to larger disbursement and smaller recovery of agricultural loans than was originally anticipated and a worsening of 18 lakhs owing to cessation of further inflow of landlords' transfer fees; set off to some extent by excess of incomings over outgoings, under State Provident Funds and certain other Funds.

The Revised Estimate of a closing balance of 78 lakhs includes 49 lakhs representing the minimum balance to be kept in the Reserve Bank and Treasuries; 3 lakhs representing the unspent balance of the Scheduled Castes Education Fund and 10 lakhs representing the unspent balance of the subvention for Road Development work already received

from the Government of India. The remainder of the closing balance amounting to 16 lakhs is available for general purposes. Thus by far the greater part of the closing balance is earmarked for specific purposes.

There are three items outside this closing balance, viz., 38½ lakhs of securities, 85 lakhs of Treasury Bills, and 10 lakhs invested in the Famine Insurance Fund. These may be described as our reserves for various contingencies including ways and means emergencies.

The budget for 1939-40 contains two changes, constitutional in origin, that are of interest and may be mentioned before we look more closely at the figures for the year. The first change has its origin in section 136 of the Government of India Act, 1935. The definition of provincial revenues which is given in that section has been interpreted to forbid the continued payment direct to local bodies of such monies as the public works cess, fines and penalties leviable by courts under local laws such as the Bengal Municipal Act, the Calcutta Municipal Act, the Bengal Local Self-Government Act, and the Bengal Village Self-Government Act and miscellaneous receipts from ferries and pounds. The provisions of the local laws which contemplated such direct payment were accordingly deleted by an Order in Council made under section 293 of the Government of India Act which takes effect from the 1st April, 1939. The monies in question, amounting to about 93 lakhs, have accordingly now to come into our public account as revenues of the province, and in order to enable local bodies to remain in continued enjoyment of sums which they were hitherto entitled to as part of their own revenues, provision to hand those monies back to them in the form of grants is made on the expenditure side of the budget: so that the net effect on our budget is *nil*.

The second change arises from the difference of wording between the new and the old Acts as regards charging items on the revenues of the province. Sub-section 3(*iv*) of section 72D of the Government of India Act, 1919, charged (or, as they then said, declared to be non-voted) all items of expenditure "of which the amount is prescribed by or under any law"; and a number of grants to local bodies of which the amount was prescribed by local Acts was in consequence non-voted. Section 78(3)(*g*) of the new Government of India Act contains no such provision; it says, instead, that such expenditure shall be charged only if it is declared by an Act of the provincial legislature to be charged. An order in Council was made which held up the effect of this change until the year 1939-40, but as we have made no provincial law to continue the charged character of these grants they appear among the votable demands in the budget for next year. The grants in question are a grant of 4½ lakhs to the Calcutta Corporation under section 10 of the Bengal Motor Vehicles Tax Act, 1932; a grant of 5½ lakhs to the Dacca University under section 47A

of the Dacca University Act, 1920; a grant of 4 lakhs to the New Howrah Bridge Trust Fund under section 11 of the Howrah Bridge Act, 1926; and a grant of sixty thousand to the Leper Hospital at Gobra under section 7 of the Albert Victor Leper Hospital Act, 1935.

Mr. SPEAKER: I think, it would be better, Mr. Sarker, to adjourn the House now for prayer.

The House was then adjourned for 15 minutes for prayer.

(After adjournment.)

The Hon'ble Mr. NALINI RANJAN SARKER: I now turn to the estimates. The year starts with an opening balance of 78 lakhs. Revenue receipts are placed at 13 crores 78 lakhs, or a crore and seven lakhs better than the expected revenue in the current year. Out of this betterness, 93 lakhs is due to the provincialisation of certain revenues of local bodies to which I have just referred, and amounts to nothing, since we propose to incur equivalent expenditure in the form of grants. The heads of receipts which have been swollen by the advent of this 93 lakhs are as follows:—Land Revenue 67 lakhs, representing Public Works Cess; Administration of Justice 14½ lakhs, representing the proceeds of fines, etc., under various local Acts; Police 4 lakhs, representing receipts under the Cattle Trespass Act; and Miscellaneous 7½ lakhs, representing receipts from ferries and unclaimed landlords' fees. The remainder of the increase over the Revised, amounting to 14 lakhs, is the net result of some improvements and some fallings off. I expect Income Tax to be up by 1½ lakhs, Land Revenue by 8 lakhs, Satmps by 5 lakhs and Civil Works by 6 lakhs; but Administration of Justice to be down by 4 lakhs, Superannuation by 2 lakhs and Other Taxes by 1 lakh. With regard to Income Tax, I had to take account of the recent amendments of the Act read with the poor trading results of the current year. Very likely —I hope this will prove to be the case—my estimate is a conservative one. I have raised Land Revenue because the price of jute is rising and because I hope that the causes, especially the floods, which held it up this year will not be present next year. I have raised Stamps by a few lakhs, despite what I have said about Court-fees, because the yield is so abnormally low this year and because we expect more business in the registration offices owing to the recent amendment of section 26 (*c*) of the Bengal Tenancy Act. The rise of 6 lakhs under Civil Works represents a larger transfer from the Road Development account to finance a larger programme of Road Development. The worsening under Administration of Justice is on account of a windfall of 4 lakhs in the current year which will not recur next year. The decline in Superannuation receipts represents pensionary charges

of the Bengal Pilot Service which used to be paid through this Government but which will henceforth be paid direct by India. The decrease under Other Taxes is due to the absence of the Tobacco duties which yielded a little over a lakh in the current year, compensated partly by a growth under the Electricity Duty Act.

Our proposals for expenditure amount to 14 crores 65 lakhs, or 1 crore 72 lakhs more than the expenditure in the current year. For purposes of comparison, however, we may deduct the 93 lakhs which, as I have already explained, is to be given to local bodies in return for the provincialisation on the receipts side of our Budget of that amount of revenue which was previously theirs. The heads of expenditure which are inflated by this 93 lakhs are Miscellaneous (89 lakhs) and Police (4 lakhs). Apart from these items, the increase over the Revised is 79 lakhs. This mostly represents expenditure on new schemes. An account of them is given in the Red Book which I will leave my honourable colleagues to enlarge upon when they come to move the demands for their respective departments. I will content myself with a general description—with special mention of the more important items.

The largest increase (24 lakhs) is under Civil Works and is due to an extensive programme of building projects and of road development fund works. The latter accounts for an increase of about 6 lakhs and the balance is due mainly to new buildings belonging to various departments. Among the larger provisions for buildings may be mentioned 2 lakhs for the Purdah College, 2 lakhs for the Eden High School, 2 lakhs for a new Reformatory School, 2 lakhs for a Civil Court at Howrah, 5½ lakhs for police buildings, 1¼ lakhs for electric installation in Government buildings and ¾ lakh for the construction of witness sheds.

In regard to the increase under Road Fund works a Special Officer has been appointed for expediting Road Development projects and it is expected that the programme laid down for the coming year will be fully worked up to. Out of a total assignment of 1 crore 5 lakhs since the subventions were first received the provincial expenditure up to the end of 1936-37 was only 62 lakhs or a little more than half. The unspent balance in hand on 1st April, 1937, was 43 lakhs out of which all but 10 lakhs will be spent by the end of the current year. Next year's programme of road expansion involves an expenditure of 29½ lakhs, out of which 10 lakhs will be met from the balance in hand and the remainder will be available from the Central Government.

The Education budget contains the biggest increase under service expenditure. Although as I have stated earlier in the course of this statement Education Cess had to be suspended in nine out of twelve districts on account of the flood, it is hoped that the set-back is only

temporary and considerable progress will be possible next year in the matter of extension of District School Boards. The Budget includes a provision of 5 lakhs for supplementing local efforts for the improvement of primary education in areas where primary education cess is being realised. In addition to this 57 thousand has been provided for grants to primary schools for girls in non-School Board areas, and 21 thousand for the extension of free primary education in Municipalities. Next year's requirements in connection with the training of teachers for primary schools is 1½ lakhs and this amount has been included in the Budget, along with a sum of 2 thousand to enable refresher courses to be provided for primary school teachers.

In addition to the provision for aid to girls' primary schools reference to which has just been made, the Budget includes several special provisions for the improvement of female education. Seventy-one thousand has been provided to enable the Purdah College to be started next year in a rented building, pending completion of its own building for which provision has been made under Civil Works as already stated. Fifty thousand has been provided for the Gokhale Memorial School and 15 thousand for the Saleha Isaque High School at Serajganj. Additional grants aggregating 20 thousand have been provided for various institutions such as the college section of the Kamrunnessa Girls' School, the Nari Sikhya Mandir, the Sarojnalini Industrial School, etc. Provision of 1 lakh has been made for recurring grants to girls' high schools. Fifteen thousand has been provided for the extension and improvement of the Bethune College, and a similar amount has been provided for the teaching of two new subjects, namely, Geography and Elementary Science in schools for girls.

In regard to Collegiate and Secondary education there is provision for a grant of 1 lakh to the Dacca University, as the first instalment towards the cost of construction of a new Muslim Hall at a total cost of 2½ lakhs. Capital grants have been provided for a number of other important educational institutions. 1½ lakhs has been provided for the St. Xavier's College and 1¼ lakhs for the Burdwan Raj College. 67 thousand has been provided for supplementing the amounts which may be available locally for raising the Karatia College to a first grade college and 7 thousand has been provided for improvement to the attached hostel. There is provision for a grant of 50 thousand for the City College. Thirty thousand has been provided for the construction of Muslim Hostels attached to the Brojomohan College, Barisal; 27 thousand for a building grant to the Maharaja Cossimbazar Polytechnic Institute and 10 thousand for the Prafulla Chandra College, Bagerhat, to enable it to liquidate some old outstanding liabilities. There is a provision of 24 thousand for improvements in

the teaching arrangements of the Islamia College and the Presidency College and for the holding of Tutorial classes in order to prepare candidates for the All-India competitive examinations." Twenty-five thousand has been provided for a grant to the University of Viswa-Bharati in aid of its educational activities.

Ten thousand has been provided for practical training in Astronomy in Government Colleges and 61 thousand for the teaching of Geography and elementary science in Government and non-Government secondary schools for boys. A sum of 1 lakh 35 thousand has been provided for additional recurring and capital grants to the latter class of schools.

Among other items in the Education budget may be mentioned an additional provision of 86 thousand for grants to Madrassahs; 10 thousand for grants to Sanskrit *tols*, 5 thousand for grants to Buddhist *tols* and a capital grant of 5 thousand to the Bangiya Sahitya Parishad.

At present a sum of nearly 7 lakhs is spent annually in awarding scholarships, stipends and free studentships in educational institutions. It is proposed to create further scholarships and stipends to enable poor students of all communities to prosecute their studies. As a part of this policy additional provision for scholarships was included in the current year's Budget, 50 thousand being for Muslim students and 30 thousand for students belonging to the Scheduled Castes. In next year's Budget additional provision has been included so that the benefit may be extended to a wider circle of students. It has been found that there are many backward communities who have not been included in the list of Scheduled Castes and it is necessary that provision of scholarships should be made for them as well. An additional provision of 1 lakh has accordingly been included in the Budget for awarding scholarships to deserving students. Out of this 60 thousand will be earmarked for Muslim students, 20 thousand for Scheduled Castes students and 20 thousand for others.

As many really meritorious students find themselves unable to continue their studies on account of pecuniary difficulties, a provision of 60 thousand for special stipends in really deserving cases has been included in the Budget. Out of this amount 50 thousand will be earmarked for Muslim students and 5 thousand for students of the Scheduled Castes and 5 thousand for others.

Provision has also been included for two State Scholarships for Indian women to enable them to study abroad; and for special

scholarships for Muslim students at the Ashanullah School of Engineering, Dacca.

Fourteen thousand has been provided as scholarships for the training of students in Agriculture in the United Kingdom; while 10 thousand has been provided for scholarships for technical and industrial training.

For promoting maternity and child welfare activities provision has been made for a grant of 2½ lakhs to the Chittaranjan Seva Sadan which, as the House is aware, is the premier maternity hospital in the province, ministering to the needs of all sections of the people. It has got an attached Children's Hospital, the only one of its kind in Bengal, and imparts training in midwifery to women of all communities. The Budget also includes half a lakh for the establishment of new maternity and child welfare centres in rural areas on a contributory basis and 35 thousand has been provided for grants to existing centres.

There is a provision of 2 lakhs for the improvement of Sadar Hospitals, the grant provided for the purpose in the current year not being fully utilised owing to the absence of a sufficient number of suitable schemes.

Fifteen thousand has been provided for grant to the Association for the Prevention of Blindness in Bengal to enable it to maintain three travelling eye dispensaries. One such dispensary was started in the current year as an experimental measure but there is so much demand for this type of medical relief that it has been decided to provide two more dispensaries in the coming year.

The Irrigation budget contains a provision of 2½ lakhs for the Waterways Board which it has not been found possible to constitute this year but which it is hoped to constitute in the course of the coming year. Ninety-two thousand has been provided for the reorganisation of the Development Circle so as to enable it to draw up urgent Irrigation projects in Eastern Bengal. Irrigation surveys and other schemes estimated to cost ultimately over 4 lakhs are proposed to be taken up next year and a provision of ¾ lakh representing requirements for 1939-40 has been included in the Budget. The most important of these schemes is the Jhargram Irrigation Scheme estimated to cost 2½ lakhs and widening the bed of the Kaliaghye river which is likely to involve an ultimate expenditure of 86 thousand.

In regard to Industry, I have already indicated that a survey is now in progress under the distinguished guidance of the Director-General

of Commercial Intelligence and Statistics and it has been decided to await the results of this survey before any important measures of industrial improvement are undertaken. The 'Budget' accordingly contains no important new projects but aims rather at improving the existing institutions. Eighteen temporary peripatetic weaving schools are proposed to be reorganised at a cost of 30 thousand rupees. Thirty thousand has been provided for a grant to the Sarojnalini Memorial Association, and 20 thousand for a grant to the Calcutta Blind School. Provision has also been included for the revival of mining classes in the coal-fields, and for research and training in the manufacture of articles of common use such as metal polish for which there is great demand in the market.

Provision has been made for the expansion of agricultural training and research according to the programme initiated in the current year. It is proposed to establish a District Agricultural Farm at Chittagong at a cost of 58 thousand; 10 thousand has been provided for promoting the cultivation of flax and 8 thousand for selective multiplication of mustard. It is proposed to establish 22 additional Union Board farms and to continue the scheme for the cultivation of long staple cotton with the help of a contribution from the Bengal Mill Owners' Association. Three thousand has been provided for researches in connection with multiplication of fodder seeds. Three important schemes originally initiated by the Imperial Council of Agricultural Research will be financed this year from provincial revenues as the Council have decided to withdraw their aid. These are the establishment of a horticultural station, a station for grading hides and a staff for marketing. The total expenditure involved in these schemes is 18 thousand rupees. For the improvement of live stock it is proposed to import 300 Hariana bulls for districts where stud bulls are at service and also to import 32 Hariana cows for the cattle breeding section of the Dacca Farm. The provision for this purpose amounts to half a lakh. A similar provision has been made for the establishment of poultry multiplication centres. Provision has also been made for additional staff for animal husbandry and for the purpose of carrying out a census of cattle.

I think I have now mentioned all the more important new projects in our Budget, and I will now give a brief resumé of the expected financial results of the working of the coming year. The year starts with an opening balance of 78 lakhs, a large part of which, as I have already explained, is earmarked for specific purposes. Our revenue receipts amount to 13 crores 78 lakhs and we propose to spend on revenue account 14 crores 65 lakhs or 87 lakhs more than our receipts on that account. We have sufficient reserves to cover this difference,

but we propose to conserve them by resort to a loan, which will be warranted as I will now explain. An appreciable part of our expenditure which has been or which is proposed to be financed out of revenue or out of the closing balance is in reality expenditure which could appropriately have been financed by loan. Thus in the current year a sum of over 60 lakhs is being advanced as loans to agriculturists and local bodies and it is proposed to make a further advance of 16 lakhs on this account in the coming year. All these loans and advances are interest-bearing, and the outlay is consequently remunerative in character. In the second place, it is proposed to spend 12 lakhs in the current year and 11 lakhs next year on commutation of pensions which is remunerative in the sense that it saves recurring pensionary charges debitable to revenue. It is capitalisation of revenue expenditure and as such might appropriately have been treated as capital expenditure. Finally, our plans of expenditure both this year and next include an attack upon the accumulated building requirements of the province involving a large burden which ought to be spread over a number of years instead of being allowed to unbalance the revenues of a particular year. What is more, in many cases the erection of the buildings will be remunerative in the sense of saving money now expended on rents. The amount of the loan which we propose to take is one crore. Credit has been taken under the appropriate deposit head for this sum of 1 crore on account of a long-term loan, the exact terms of which will be settled in due course in consultation with the Reserve Bank. It is this credit which accounts for the surplus of 94 lakhs under the Debt Deposit section of the Budget.

The net result of the working on the basis of the estimates, therefore, will be a surplus of 7 lakhs which will raise the opening balance of 78 lakhs to a closing balance of 85 lakhs. This will include 49 lakhs on account of the minimum balance to be kept in the Bank and in Treasuries, but as the unspent balances of the Scheduled Caste Education Fund and of the subventions from the Road Development Fund are expected to be used up fully during the coming year, the remaining 36 lakhs will be free balance. In addition to this closing balance we shall have our investments: 12 lakhs in the Famine Insurance Fund, 38½ lakhs in securities and 85 lakhs in Treasury Bills. Of these, the first is usable for famine relief only: the second can be converted into cash, if necessary, and used for general purposes at any moment. The 85 lakhs in Treasury Bills, however, is not wholly available as a reserve for revenue purposes. It is mostly a reserve for Ways and Means purposes, that is, for drawing upon in the lean months during which our outgoings exceed our takings.

But it is not sufficient to say that our Budget for 1939-40 will balance. Not merely does it include the initial expenditure of schemes

whose cost per annum will increase hereafter, but it contains no margin wherewith to embark on the many schemes of new expenditure which will have to be undertaken if we are to make any impression upon the needs of the province. In other words, we must face up to the fact, that, with our present resources, we are approaching the end of our tether, and that if we are to make any further progress in nation-building, we must be able to count upon revenues considerably exceeding the expected revenues of the coming year. I am afraid that we cannot count upon a much greater yield from our existing sources of revenue. If trade conditions improve, we might tap an extra 30 lakhs or so under Jute Duty, Income Tax and Non-Judicial stamps; but we have to remember in that connection that our expected revenue from Jute Duty in the coming year is nearly a crore in excess of what it would be if we again struck slump conditions as bad as those of 1921-22. We also have to remember that certain special receipts which now appear in our Budget are about to disappear: for instance, the sum of 13 lakhs or so representing recoveries on account of Survey and Settlement operations and the 5 lakhs or so which we have for the last few years been getting from the Government of India as special grants for rural uplift work. We must also be prepared for a decrease in Excise revenue if the idea of prohibition gains strength and, as I have already indicated, the prospects of much improvement in our Court-fee receipts are probably remote. Further retrenchment can afford no effective relief. If there is any present expenditure here or there which might be abandoned, I must ask the House to believe me when I say that its amount for immediate purposes will in any case be negligible. We plan, for instance, to make a further reduction of pays and to revise the pension rules; but the consequent savings will only accrue gradually. There is nothing for it therefore but to resort to new taxation. I shall introduce two taxation measures this session calculated to bring us about 12 lakhs per annum (one to impose a betting tax on dog-racing and the other to impose an ungraduated tax of Rs. 30 a year on professions, trades, callings and employments exempting those who do not pay income-tax); and I have other proposals under examination with a view to the possible introduction of further taxation proposals in the monsoon session.

I will not burden this statement by enumerating the needs of the province for which we require further funds, but in an Appendix to the printed copy of it will be found a list of some of them with some observations of my own upon them.

So far as the immediate task of explaining the various implications of this year's Budget is concerned, I have done. But it is also my duty to make clear at the time of the Budget the long view of our task especially in regard to the finances which devolves on us as a corollary

of the powers we have obtained. Increasingly and ever more increasingly are the people pressing for every assistance that the Government can render to improve and regulate every sphere of their lives. There is, however, nothing unusual in this demand, for, so long have they lived under conditions of ignorance, superstition and abject fatalism, that with the first suggestion of control over their own destinies through a Government of their making it is but natural that they should now ask the Government to lead them unto a millennium and that immediately. Is it any wonder that they should become impatient and chafe at any delay?

Sir, so appalling is the misery of the masses and so urgent the task of amelioration that every provincial Government realise that a special responsibility devolves on them. It is only necessary to realise that an equally onerous obligation rests on the people and their representatives in the Legislature. The task of amelioration, to which every popular Government is committed, is circumscribed by two important factors. The first refers to the quality of the people. For, as I have so often said, the Government can but provide the machinery, the motive power must come ultimately from the people. To be really efficacious and beneficent, Government intervention presupposes a well-developed civic sense among the people as a whole. Without it, a remedy adopted sometimes proves worse than the disease; society being unprepared for such measures, the measures do not bring the desired results; on the contrary easy attempts to remedy wrongs often aggravate the wrongs in unanticipated ways. In fact, I do not believe it is possible, or, even if it were possible, at all desirable, to spoon-feed any nation into prosperity. In the second place, the ambitions of any Government must necessarily be circumscribed by the available resources both in money and in human material. Sir, the role of a Finance Minister is far from enviable. He is expected to create marvels practically out of nothing. With the ever-increasing variety of the demands of modern democracy, even Aladin's treasures, I am afraid, would soon have been exhausted. But a Finance Minister has to do much more than to think of the immediate demands. He must always have an eye to the future, study the possible repercussions of every new commitment, husband his resources and explore avenues for augmenting them. He must steer the ship of State clear of financial shoals. For, too often in recent history have liberal governments been wrecked on rocks of loose financial policy. This danger must be avoided, but at the same time we must plan to forge ahead.

Sir, I would not like to minimise the difficulties or implications of the stupendous task of mass uplift, to which we have set our hands. We cannot of course work miracles or solve all our problems at once. What we can do is to lay a sound foundation on which, with

improvement in resources and as opportunity occurs, might gradually be built a structure that would give a greater measure of security and happiness to the common man. To equip ourselves for this task, it is necessary that we learn the lesson of the times and adjust ourselves to the new outlook in the political and economic sphere. Both history and our own immediate and direct experience teach us that for the proper functioning of political democracy, the masses should be convinced that the Government is on the side of economic justice. The demand for greater economic justice can no longer be left in cold storage. To do so would be only to accelerate the pace of social rupture and invite revolution. Wealth should no longer be regarded as the sole symbol of success, nor should exploitation be acquiesced in as the inevitable concomitant of healthy competition. In fact, the possession of wealth in modern society, as indeed at any time, carries a deep social obligation. It should be spent in the multiplication of opportunities for the livelihood of the people. This represents no adherence to any extreme economic doctrine, but only a realisation of the social function of wealth. Acquisition of wealth should be contingent on the discharge of social obligations. The principal means by which this is secured in modern society is that of taxation. That is the democratic and evolutionary method as opposed to confiscation which is tyrannical. To supply them with necessary funds to carry through ameliorative measures, Government must necessarily seek the co-operation of those able to provide them. And the hand of co-operation should be willingly proffered; for a prosperous and contented populace is an essential condition for ordered progress for all sections of the community. In this machine age, prosperity and poverty can no longer be a matter of separate concern for the individual. It is an age of mutual interdependence, and the whole community must fall or prosper together. The prosperous and the wealthy must increasingly appreciate this interrelation, and should not grudge the contribution they may be asked to make towards creating a better and richer life all around them.

Sir, to elevate society, to improve the human material, to provide the common man with the barest minimum for a decent life, to open up to him the possibilities for a better and richer life, is a duty which devolves on all of us.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: May I rise on a point of order? This is rather a serious thing. I am informed just now that before the Hon'ble the Finance Minister has finished his Budget speech, it has already been published in one of the evening papers of Calcutta, giving even the budget figures there. I would like to submit that this is a serious breach of the privilege of the House.

Mr. SPEAKER: Order, order. This is a matter to be raised after the Budget speech is finished.

The Hon'ble Mr. NALINI RANJAN SARKER: As Government, we shall do all that we can. As the Finance Minister, I shall not spare myself if any way,—either in imposing taxation, when it is essential, or in agreeing to expenditure where it is necessary. And whatever I may do, I shall be moved into action by my abiding faith in the common man and the possibilities of evolving a society, which will subserve the democratic ideal of egalitarianism in the economic as much as the political sphere.

While affirming my faith in the aspirations of the people, I should, as a practical administrator, emphasise the difficulties in the way and the need even for curbing uninformed enthusiasm in the interest of concrete achievement. A particular section of the community, for example, demands facilities for itself only without adequate realisation of their unfavourable repercussions on other sections. They forget that if they injure other classes in society, they themselves will intimately be adversely affected. As I have said, the various classes in modern society are interdependent. This is a truth which should be learnt by the poor as much as the rich. I should also like to draw attention to the fact that the demands made on Government are too often conflicting and incongruous. For example Government are asked to launch large schemes of social service without additional taxation; to remove illiteracy by universal free primary education without the payment of a cess; to provide a scientific rural credit organisation under conditions where even debtors able to pay are unwilling to discharge their obligations; to stimulate industry and yet grant labour facilities whose cost industry cannot possibly bear; to spend large amounts on irrigational facilities, and yet to reduce the rates charged for the water brought to fields by such irrigation works and so on. The Government are thus expected to manage without new taxation which is odious to the populace; they are asked to remit even existing taxes in some cases and the demand is also made in the same breath for State provision for national health insurance, sickness benefits, etc., all of which obviously presuppose larger resources. The absurdity of all this is too patent to need comment. However, it has to be impressed on the people that no Government's resources could be unlimited, and while the Government have set in motion such ameliorative work as is possible to accomplish within the limits of the present revenues, any large scale and comprehensive ameliorative programme for the people inevitably depends on the ability to obtain more money through fresh taxation. The attitude to taxation has therefore to change.

As important as the realisation of the need for new taxation is the recognition of the limitation of the sources of provincial revenue. While the entire responsibility for nation-building rests on each province, the heads of revenue allotted to it are limited in their scope and inelastic in their nature They are insufficient for the purpose and barring only a few, all the heads are also the same as the provinces had before the inauguration of Provincial Autonomy. Apart from the potentialities of sales tax and taxes on agricultural income which have not yet been explored, the other measures are not likely to yield much. The taxes mentioned in List II of the Seventh Schedule to the Government of India Act are not many. And it is out of their proceeds that the entire provincial administration, including District Boards and Municipalities, etc., has to be financed. Inadequate as these resources are, there has unfortunately been a tendency to restrict the scope of even these taxes by a narrow interpretation of the terms. The proceedings before the Federal Court with regard to the interpretation of item 48 of List II, "Taxes on the sale of goods" are still fresh in your memory and doubt has recently been raised as to the interpretation of item 46 of the List "Taxes on professions, trades, callings and employments". It is contended that this tax does not allow graduation by classifying taxpayers into blocks according to their incomes.

Within the scope available to them, the Government will no doubt introduce taxation measures, whenever necessary. For a successful campaign against the accumulated deficiencies of the past, however, we shall need, in addition to finance, an adequate number of trained men competent to initiate and execute schemes and the enthusiastic support of public opinion. With the co-operation and enthusiasm of the public, substantial results can be obtained in many spheres even without larger capital outlay. Most of the tasks of rural reconstruction, for example, are such that if only the people will think of the benefits of their work to themselves and agree to wait for its fruits instead of insisting on them even at the start in the form of cash wages, the intricate problem of initial outlay will have been largely solved. This country is deficient in capital in the sense of accumulated savings. But the enormous man power of the nation is a form of potential wealth which, if only the people would agree to apply directly to their tasks, can be immediately transformed into kinetic capital. I trust that we will lighten our problems by organising mass effort to the direct achievement of our problems of rural reconstruction. If the average agriculturist who spends about half the year in enforced idleness could be shown ways of profitably using those six months, that itself would bring about a very considerable improvement in his condition and standard of living. This human material could be organised and utilised with equal

advantage for promoting the general welfare of the community in such matters, for example, as the construction of small irrigation canals, fighting the menace of water-hyacinth, etc. With little or no expense in this way, the face of the whole village could be changed quite remarkably. In fact, I am inclined to think that a very great deal of our problem of mass welfare resolves itself into one of finding more work and properly organising the human material we possess.

It is only the strong backing of public opinion which could ensure the success of such a drive. Whichever party may be in power, it is the same problems that must be faced, and I think that the problems are so pressing and so much depend on early and radical efforts for their solution that the situation really calls for concerted action from all parties and a drive which is supported by all sections of the public and the press. We know how working on party lines has been suspended in many countries when they were confronted with emergencies such as a war. I think our situation also is, in a sense, one of emergency and calls for the united and concentrated efforts of all sections for waging war against certain scourges, whose poison the lapse of time will only augment. I believe what I am suggesting is not only not unpracticable but it is also in no way irreconcilable with the aims and policy of the different parties. Of the one party which wields the largest influence in the country—I am referring to the Congress Party—I may say that since its tenets are truth and non-violence and objective mass-amelioration, there is no reason why in Bengal that Party should not be able to give its support to measures, even though sponsored by a Government not its own, which do not run counter to its tenets and objective. Press support, similarly, for measures, which are undoubtedly conceived in the interests of the province, would again strengthen the hands of the Government whatever may be its complexion—to fight the problems which after all are the concern of each and all of us.

I may refer to a few concrete cases to show how in the atmosphere that an enthusiastic public opinion begets it would be possible to achieve many big results with comparative ease and with little expense. If the Government were to have a measure by which each matriculate in the province would have to give a year to the State and devote that time in removing illiteracy among adults, we could in a short time make a considerable headway with the drive against adult illiteracy, and at a small cost to the State. Similarly, in cities and towns, where a large number of doctors practise, and where medical inspection of school children is so essential, if the doctors could each be asked to

give their service free for one or two days in a month, the necessary inspection could be very easily accomplished with little expense to the State. But unless such measures are strongly backed by an enthusiastic public opinion, they will have little chance of success. The Government are, however, anxious to enlist public support for the prosecution of such beneficial measures on a voluntary basis, and intend to make a beginning by organising in the near future a Water-Hyacinth Week with the object of eradicating this menace. But the success of this experiment as well as the possibility of the extension of the method to other and wider spheres would all depend on the nature and extent of public support that will be vouchsafed to such endeavours.

Sir, in view of the stupendous nature of the task that we have to accomplish, is it too much to expect that any measure conceived in the interest of the masses, whose amelioration is the primary objective of all parties, should receive the active support of every shade of public opinion? The present conditions in our province may reasonably be described as a state of emergency, in which the ordinary rules of party government should remain in abeyance till the crisis is over.

Sir, all sections of the House should fully appreciate the fundamental facts of our present situation: the magnitude of our problems, the pitifully inadequate resources at our command, the large demands of the electorate, the natural reluctance to shoulder burdens, and the limited and inelastic nature of the revenues allotted to us. These incongruities are there and must be viewed not as the embarrassment of the party in power, but as the problem of the Government whatever its complexion, indeed of the province as a whole. It would be the duty of all to work for the removal of this incongruity and to create in all the spirit of co-operation.

Sir, this is not a moment for parliamentary obstruction, this is a moment for rapid action; this is not a moment for approaching vital problems as a matter of party scores, this is a moment for an united assault upon them. Sir, there is here no question of even the subordination of principles. For, as to fundamentals and the objective, there is hardly any material difference between the programmes of different parties and groups. The question, Sir, is whether we shall be able to rise to the occasion, to realise the gravity of the situation and willing to face difficulties, sink petty party differences and jealousies, and devote ourselves to the furtherance of the common good.

I apologise to you for the length of my speech. With these words I place before the House the Budget estimate for the year 1939-40.

APPENDIX I.

Summary of the financial position of the Government of Bengal in 1938-39 and 1939-40.

(Figures are in thousands.)

	1937-38. Actuals.	1938-39.		1939-40. Budget.
		Budget.	Revised.	
Receipts.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.	Rs.
Opening Balance	1,05,77	1,90,84	1,36,01	78,02
Revenue Receipts	13,00,85	13,12,73	12,71,29	13,77,76
Capital Receipts	..	.	..	..
Receipts from Debt, Deposits, etc.	17,51,86	16,72,96	20,83,54	21,32,61
Total	31,58,48	31,76,53	34,90,84	35,88,39
Expenditure.				
Revenue Expenditure	11,83,13	13,24,27	12,93,01	14,64,56
Capital Expenditure	−35	−2,98	−2,77	−3,01
Expenditure on Debt, Deposits, etc.	18,39,69	16,80,26	21,22,58	20,41,45
Closing Balance	1,36,01	1,74,98	78,02	85,39*
Total	31,58,48	31,76,53	34,90,84	35,88,39
Net Results.				
Surplus+				
Deficit−				
On Revenue Account	+1,17,72	−11,54	−21,72	−86,80
Surplus+				
Deficit−				
Outside Revenue Account	−87,48	−4,32	−36,27	+94,17
Total—				
Surplus+				
Deficit−				
Excluding Opening Balance	+30,24	−15,86	−57,99	+7,37

*This is exclusive of investment of 12,00 in the Famine Insurance Fund, 38,33 worth of securities and 85,00 invested in Treasury Bills.

APPENDIX II.

Special Committees.

A Committee was appointed to enquire into the incidence of rent in the province with a view to devise ways and means for a reduction of rent where considered necessary.

Another Committee was appointed to investigate the rights of the tenants of non-agricultural lands with a view to advise what can be done to protect the tenants from eviction at the will of the landlords.

A Special Officer was appointed to enquire into the grievances of tenants in Government estates and to suggest methods for the improvement of administration of such estates.

Another Special Officer was deputed to enquire into the management of Crown Fisheries and to investigate the possibility of Government control over riverine fisheries.

Special Officers were appointed in a number of selected districts to ascertain whether operations under section 112 of the Bengal Tenancy Act with a view to reduction of rent was required.

In the field of Agriculture, a Committee was appointed to investigate the problem of jute in all its bearings including the regulation of production, improvement of price, marketing and fixation of the price of jute; and a second Committee was appointed to investigate the problem of improving the price of paddy and rice.

In the sphere of Education, a Committee composed of ladies and gentlemen was appointed to investigate the problem of improving primary and adult education. Another Committee was appointed to consider the question of improving Madrasah education in the province. Committees were also appointed to investigate problems in connection with Secondary Education and with the educational requirements of members of Scheduled Castes.

In regard to Forests, a Committee has been appointed to enquire into the problem of progressive denudation of forest in West Bengal and to suggest methods for prevention.

In the field of General Administration a Committee has been appointed to examine the cases of terrorist convicts and to make recommendations to Government regarding the exercise of clemency in these cases. A second Committee has been appointed to enquire into the working of the Chaukidari system throughout the province and to advise Government on the best methods of policing of rural areas and the apportionment of the cost thereof between Government and Union Boards.

Other Committees have been appointed to advise on local items of administrative importance. Thus for instance, a Committee has

been appointed to examine the question of a suitable site for the headquarters of the Noakhali district; and another Committee has been appointed to consider the possibility of converting the Medical School in Dacca into a Medical College.

APPENDIX III.

1. *Primary Education.*—The introduction of universal free primary education is an item of outstanding importance in the programme of development. The cost involved in this scheme is of course very large. It depends upon the number of years at school for which provision is required. For the purpose of a rough estimate it may be assumed that four years' schooling between the ages of 6 and 9 will enable the pupils to attain literacy. The number of children in Bengal between these ages is about 53 lakhs. On the assumption that each school would be a three-teacher school for 90 boys, and allowing for the expenses for books, writing materials, teaching apparatus and contingencies, it is estimated that the average cost per child will be Rs. 12 per annum. On this basis, even if 25 per cent. of this 53 lakhs of children between 6 and 9 do not for some reason or other join the primary schools, the total cost is not likely to be less than Rs. 4½ crores per annum. This however is exclusive of the cost on account of site and building, for it may be assumed that these will be provided free by the local people. If instead of a four-year course an eight years' course is desired such as is provided in most advanced countries, the cost will obviously be doubled.

The present expenditure on primary education is about 90 lakhs, out of which 33½ lakhs is met from provincial revenues and the balance is derived from the contribution of local bodies and fees. When the education cess is introduced all over the province it will bring in Rs. 1 crore and 20 lakhs. Since fees will not be levied a further sum of nearly three crores will be required to give complete effect to the scheme. It is obviously not possible for the province to find such large resources. And it is to the Central Government, who have big and elastic sources of income, that the province must turn for assistance in this matter. The Central Government may be approached to help the province to the extent of about half the amount required, not of course out of its existing resources but from new taxation imposed on suitable items under the taxation powers of the Centre. It is hoped that such a proposal will have the support of all other provinces as they are equally interested in this matter. To persuade the Government of India to offer such help to the provinces will no doubt take some time. The province should meanwhile try to find out other sources, in addition to the cess from which it is going to meet its own share of the expenses of primary education, assuming that the Centre is prevailed upon to

contribute the share demanded of it. The scheme of primary education cannot apparently start all at once in all districts. As and when it starts in a district the cess will be levied there and for the balance of charges in excess of the amount of the cess, Government will have to explore fresh sources of revenue.

2. *Secondary Education.*—With the extension of primary education an extension of secondary education will also obviously be necessary, for with increase in literacy the demand for secondary education is bound to increase to a very appreciable extent. Moreover, better facilities for secondary education will have to be provided to the scheduled and other educationally backward sections. Facilities would also have to be extended to those who are too poor to afford the charges of education, and secondary schools would also have to be established in areas where there are none at present. All these would involve a very great extension of the expenses at present incurred for secondary education. Many educational institutions started and maintained by the munificence of particular individuals or associations are now obliged to seek financial assistance from Government as sources of private philanthropy are rapidly drying up. The pressure on the public purse in respect of such demands is already very considerable and some of the large capital grants in the coming year's budget indicate the extent to which large private educational institutions are in need of financial relief.

Particulars are given below of the additional expenditure both recurring and non-recurring likely to be required in the next few years to meet educational needs in all the various forms. This is a very rough estimate and is not intended to give anything more than an indication only of the extent of the expenditure that would be necessary.

	Recurring.	Non-recurring.
	Rs.	Rs.
Primary education	1 crore 56 lakhs.	12 lakhs.
Middle schools and madrassahs and Sanskrit *tols* ..	20 ,,	2 ,,
Secondary education ..	15 ,,	30 ,,
College education ..	8 ,,	12 ,,
Women's education ..	12 ,,	40 ,,
Special projects	5 ,,	25 ,,
(Training college for physical training, commercial college, special institutions for defectives.)		
Adult education	..	25 ,,
Building grants to universities ..	..	10 ,,
Total ..	2 crores 16 ,,	1 crore 56 ,,

The capital grants may be financed out of loans for which a provision of Rs. 7 lakhs by way of interest charges, etc., would be necessary. For recurring expenses, new taxation measures are obviously required.

Until recently rural credit had been supplied through the agency of money-lenders, co-operative societies and loan companies. But for various reasons all these agencies have come to grief. There is no organisation at present which could cater to the ordinary credit requirements of the cultivators and the rural population in general. A sound rural credit organisation has therefore to be set up. It is not of course possible for the Government to take the entire responsibility for direct financial assistance. The matter must depend consequently to a large extent on private enterprise. But in addition to directing and stimulating that enterprise, under the prevailing condition of things, Government will have to take the initiative in establishing new machinery for both long-term and short-term loans. The establishment of a chain of land-mortgage banks for long-term loans and the reorganisation of co-operative central banks and village societies are essential parts of a programme for the supply of rural credit and the expenditure which they involve is very considerable.

The rapid development of communications is also essential to the welfare of the province. In the absence of good roads it is not possible to provide adequate facilities for the transport of agricultural produce to important centres of trade. A comprehensive programme of road development has now been prepared by Mr. King, the Special Officer appointed for the purpose, and it is estimated that the execution of the programme will involve an outlay of 39 crores and that the maintenance of the roads after the programme has been completed will require a crore of rupees per annum. There are of course two sources of income which are earmarked for the development of road communications each of which brings in about 14 lakhs a year. The first is the Bengal Motor Vehicles Tax Act the proceeds of which are mostly given to local bodies for expenditure on roads. The second is the provincial share of the subvention from the Central Petrol Fund. But the two of these together will not enable us to improve our roads at anything like the pace at which they ought to be improved, or to maintain them as they should be maintained. It will have to be considered whether it will be possible to augment our resources for road development by an increase in the rate of tax on motor vehicles to the level which other provinces like Bombay have already adopted.

The development of our waterways which must be simultaneously undertaken will also involve large capital and recurring expenditure for which new sources of income will have to be tapped. Government

are considering whether any part of the proceeds from the customs duty on jute can be utilised for the improvement of waterways in this province.

Breach of Privilege.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: As directed by you, Sir, may I draw your attention once more—which I did punctually at 6-38—that long before the speech of the Hon'ble the Finance Minister was finished, the Budget speech as well as certain figures from the Budget which have not yet been distributed to the honourable members have been published in one of the evening papers of Calcutta. I am afraid this is a serious breach of the privilege of the House. Of late, Sir, there has been a tendency to have advance information of this nature from Governmental sources through friends of the Ministers. I hope that this particular evening paper is not one of those which come under that category. I submit that you kindly make enquiries and deal with the paper in the manner that you think fit.

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: May I rise on a point of information, Sir? Will my friend Dr. Sanyal now realise the necessity and importance of my Official Records Bill being passed?

Change in the Order of Business.

Mr. SPEAKER: Before I adjourn the House to-day I would like to know as to whether it would be convenient for the House to take up certain motions regarding the Bengal Jute Ordinance to-morrow or on Monday. I would like to know the views of the House.

Mr. JOGESH CHANDRA GUPTA: Mr. Speaker, Sir, to-morrow the Bengal Jute Ordinance will be laid on the table, and according to the provisions of the Government of India Act, section 88 (2) (a), if I remember aright, the Assembly has the right to move a motion approving or disapproving the action, and in my view that would be the proper occasion to take the matter up and to discuss it.

Mr. SPEAKER: I don't follow. Is it your point that it should be taken not to-day but to-morrow?

Mr. JOGESH CHANDRA GUPTA: The section is this. Section 88(2) says: "An ordinance promulgated under this section shall have the same force, etc., etc." and (a) says, "such ordinance shall be laid before the Provincial Legislature and shall cease to operate at the expiration of six weeks from the reassembly of the Legislature, or if a

resolution disapproving it is passed by the Legislative Assembly and agreed to by the Legislative Council, if any, upon the passing of the resolution or, as the case may be, on the resolution being agreed to by the Council." Under that you will see this Bengal Jute Ordinance will be laid on the table, which is item No. 16 of the List of Business fixed for the 16th of February, i.e., to-morrow. These motions will come up for discussion to-morrow. That is my submission.

Mr. SPEAKER: Your point is that it should come up to-morrow.

Mr. JOGESH CHANDRA GUPTA: It will have to come up.

Mr. SPEAKER: I am not able to catch your point.

The Hon'ble Mr. H. S. SUHRAWARDY: I think Mr. Gupta suggests that to-morrow after the ordinance is laid on the table, the question may be considered as to when the motion should come up for discussion.

Mr. JOGESH CHANDRA GUPTA: I suggest quite the contrary. The Hon'ble Minister knows it very well. I suggest that the proper time to consider a motion on the Bengal Jute Ordinance would be when that item (of laying the Bengal Jute Ordinance on the table) will be taken up.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: May I submit, Sir, in this connection that if you do not take it up to-morrow, because on Monday we shall have general discussion of the budget and under the rules at the time of the general discussion of the budget we cannot possibly postpone it on any other ground, the only date on which you can take it up is the 24th of February unless we meet day after to-morrow.

Mr. SPEAKER: I do not think we are meeting day after to-morrow.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: In that case let us have it to-morrow.

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: To-morrow is extremely inconvenient, Sir, because Government are anxious to move some of the Government Bills which are urgent and important and which have got to be referred to the Select Committee, and because they want that those Bills should go through the House during this session and very likely through the Council as well. Therefore, they are prepared to have this motion discussed on any day after to-morrow.

Mr. SARAT CHANDRA BOSE: May I submit, Sir, that this Ordinance was promulgated as an emergency measure, and, therefore, on principle it ought to have precedence over all other business?

Mr. SPEAKER: I think I should explain the attitude which I propose to take up, subject to such observations as may be made by both sides of the House which might necessitate my reviewing the whole matter again. As you have seen, Government have placed it third in the agenda. That means that supposing the first two items are taken up first, the entire to-morrow is lost. Then it cannot be taken up till after the general discussion of the budget. The correct procedure should be that this Ordinance should be placed first to-morrow on the table, if not under the rules, by convention, because whenever any emergency measure by ordinance is promulgated, the earliest opportunity should be taken to place it before the House. But I also think a few days' time should be given for discussion in order to allow the members an opportunity to examine the question properly. It is not necessary to find out the powers under the rules and convention which the Speaker has to fix this measure for any convenient date. The point has been raised that it may not be taken up on the days fixed for the general discussion of the budget. That certainly is a point which I quite appreciate. But I do not know how long the discussion on Jute Ordinance will take. I take it, however, that the whole discussion of this matter ought to be finished in the course of 2 or 2½ hours, all sections being fully represented. That means that if we cannot take it up to-morrow, one day out of the four days for the general discussion of the budget might be fixed for this measure. But I should like to know what attitude Government would like to adopt.

Mr. SARAT CHANDRA BOSE: May I place before you, Sir, another consideration? You observed just now that this being an emergency measure no time should be lost in laying it on the table of the House, and I would proceed a step further, if I may, and say that it is the right of the Assembly to terminate this Ordinance immediately. That right is given by section 88(2)(*a*) of the Government of India Act. If you consider that section, you will find that such Ordinance "shall be laid before the Provincial Legislature and shall cease to operate at the expiration of six weeks from the reassembly of the Legislature, or if a resolution disapproving it is passed by the Legislative Assembly and agreed to by the Legislative Council, if any, upon the passing of the resolution or, as the case may be, on the resolution being agreed to by the Council." So this Assembly has the right to disapprove of the Ordinance immediately it is laid on the table, and I submit that that right would be infringed——

Mr. SPEAKER: Mr. Bose, you will excuse me for interrupting you at this stage. If you take up that attitude, I can do nothing more than to leave the matter to Government. If you want that it should be immediately taken up, then the time as to when it should be taken up is a matter in which I cannot interfere. I was going to suggest that it would meet the wishes of the entire House if it could be laid on the table as a matter of convention and then left to the Speaker to fix a date as early as possible for a discussion on the matter.

Mr. SARAT CHANDRA BOSE: May I conclude what I intended to say? The life of the Ordinance is six weeks from the reassembling of the Legislature or shorter if a resolution disapproving it is passed. So it is the right of the Assembly to disapprove it to-morrow.

This is an emergency measure and you have already put it on the agenda. This procedure and action, I submit, is covered by the Assembly Rules and Standing Orders. Rule 57 says,—

"As soon as possible after the Governor has promulgated an Ordinance under sub-section (1) of section 88 of the Act, printed copies of such ordinance shall be made available to the members of the Assembly. Within six weeks from the reassembly of the Assembly, any member may, after giving three clear days' notice to the Secretary, move a resolution disapproving the ordinance and if such a resolution is passed, it shall be forwarded to the Council with a message asking for its concurrence."

So the Act read with the rules makes it clear that this is a matter which should be taken up at the earliest opportunity, and I submit that it is a proper construction of the rules to say that it ought to have precedence over all other business. After all, no harm will be done if the Government Bills wait for a day or two. May I remind you, Sir, that this Ordinance was promulgated on the 9th September last year, and copies were circulated to members of the Assembly almost immediately after that, so that the members of the Assembly have had three or four months' time to consider the desirability or otherwise of the Ordinance? I am sure that those who take any interest in legislative work must have made up their minds whether to approve or disapprove the Ordinance. So the plea that the members should have time is a plea which, I submit, has no substance.

Mr. SPEAKER: I think, I should give my decision straight off. I have quite understood the point that from the point of view of expediency it should be taken up as early as possible. But unfortunately, as Speaker, I have nothing to do either with the expediency on my right or with that on my left, but I have to abide by the Government of India Act, as it stands. As the Act stands, there is absolutely nothing in it saying at what particular stage it

should be laid before the House except that it should be laid before the Provincial Legislature. Nothing more than that; even, Mr. Bose, your "as soon as possible" is not there.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: But the interpretation is quite clear.

Mr. SPEAKER: Quite right. As I find the element of time is a matter for which the Government of India Act makes no provision whatsoever, the only question that now remains is whether our Standing Orders are any guidance. There again, as our Standing Orders stand, no indication whatsoever is there as to the amount of time which should elapse after the opening of a session and before the Ordinance is laid on the table. That is the difficulty which the Speaker has to face, and I do not think that it is open to me to intervene except where it cannot be agreed to by all sections of the House. In my opinion time should be allotted for the resolution to be discussed as soon as possible—one, two or three days, it does not matter. If that is not done and if Government refuse to lay the Ordinance on the table to-morrow, then the only course for me is not to interfere with the agenda in any way. I have absolutely no control over the order in which Government business should be conducted. That is the business of the Government, and as such I have no seizin over it. I was only suggesting a compromise. If that is not accepted, then I shall have no other alternative but to leave the agenda as it is. In that case, it will be taken up to-morrow after finishing the first two items.

Mr. SIBNATH BANERJEE: In my opinion, Sir, there is no difficulty because Government have not yet announced that they do not want to place the Jute Ordinance on the agenda before the House to-morrow. In the absence of any such announcement on the order of Government business, the position is, I submit, absolutely clear because the agenda is already there.

I shall make another submission. My adjournment motion was declared out of order on the ground that this House would get a chance of moving a motion approving or disapproving the Ordinance. On that ground alone, Sir, my adjournment motion was ruled out by you, and if now Government refuse to place the Ordinance on the agenda to-morrow then I submit that my adjournment motion is in order. (Cries of "Hear, hear" from Opposition Benches.)

Mr. SPEAKER: You are perfectly at liberty to bring in another motion

The Hon'ble Mr. H. S. SUHRAWARDY: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I do not know precisely what is the urgency for Mr. Bose to fulminate in this House at an early date or to desire to terminate the Ordinance as soon as possible. He need not be anxious with regard to the death of the Ordinance, because the Ordinance is practically dead. If Mr. Bose has been following the course of events he ought to know that the Ordinance is practically dead; it does not surely require the vote of the House to kill it further.

Mr. SARAT CHANDRA BOSE: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I shall not try to emulate, nor am I capable of emulating, the language of the Hon'ble Minister. I expected, Sir, that there would be some observation from the Chair when the Hon'ble Minister used the word "fulminate". Sir, we were discussing a very serious matter, and I should have expected that the Treasury Benches should not behave in a spirit of levity.

Now, Sir, this matter, I take it, was with your consent put on the agenda as a matter which the Government decided to bring to-morrow after the Bengal Excise (Amendment) Bill. If that be so, it is up to them to satisfy you now as to why they want to change the procedure. As regards motions disapproving of the Ordinance, in the usual course they ought to come up as soon as the Ordinance is laid on the table.

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: I want to know, Sir, where Government have suggested a change of procedure.

Mr. SPEAKER: I should think that after finishing the Bengal Excise (Amendment) Bill they propose to lay the Ordinance on the table.

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: Is not three days' notice necessary, Sir, for a motion of this kind?

Mr. SPEAKER: One notice has already come. I want to know from Mr. Bose what course is open to me beyond asking the Treasury Benches as to when this resolution should come up for discussion. Does Mr. Bose insist on its coming up immediately after it is laid on the table?

Mr. SARAT CHANDRA BOSE: Sir, I have endeavoured to make it clear that in my view the motion should come up for discussion immediately after the Ordinance is laid on the table.

Mr. SPEAKER: I have got no power under the Government of India Act or under the Standing Orders and Rules to decide the order of Government business, and I will take the agenda as it is.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: In that case, Sir, let us have it out from the relevant authority—I mean the Government. It will make matters easy for both sides.

Mr. SPEAKER: I should think that from the point of view of actual fact and reality it would have been better for both sides to agree to the suggestion which I made, viz., that it should be put on the agenda of to-morrow and that the discussion should come up on Monday. But since this has not been agreed to, I must stick to the agenda. Whether Government have got any particular date in view for this is more than I can say.

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: We are agreeable, Sir, to discussion on Monday.

Mr. SPEAKER: I am afraid it cannot be done on Monday inasmuch as the Opposition is not agreeable.

Mr. JOGESH CHANDRA GUPTA: Sir, the difficulty is that on Friday the Assembly is not sitting. So, I submit, Sir, that if you postpone the discussion, it will cut into the budget discussion or the voting on the budget.

Mr. SPEAKER: I shall make some other arrangement about that.

Mr. JOGESH CHANDRA GUPTA: Sir, I do not see what is the difficulty in having the matter discussed to-morrow.

Mr. SPEAKER: There will be no difficulty. In any case, I take it that there will be no sitting on Friday.

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: Sir, as regards the suggestion of the Opposition that there should be no sitting of this House on Friday, we agree to it.

Adjournment.

The Assembly was then adjourned till 4-45 p.m. on Thursday, the 16th February, 1939, at the Assembly House, Calcutta.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Assembly assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act, 1935.

THE ASSEMBLY met in the Assembly House, Calcutta, on Thursday, the 16th February, 1939, at 4-45 p.m.

Present:

Mr. Speaker (the Hon'ble Khan Bahadur M. AZIZUL HAQUE, C.I.E.) in the Chair, 11 Hon'ble Ministers and 219 members.

STARRED QUESTIONS

(to which oral answers were given)

Direct road from Naldi to Kalia in Jessore.

*16. **Mr. ATUL KRISHNA GHOSE:** (a) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Communications and Works (Irrigation) Department aware—

(i) that Naldi, Lohagara, Mallickpore, Itna, Patna, Bardia and Kalia are important centres in the district of Jessore;

(ii) that there is no direct road from Naldi to Kalia by the northern side of the river Nabaganga; and

(iii) that more than three lakhs of rate-payers of that area have been undergoing enormous difficulties for want of such a road?

(b) Are the Government considering the desirability of taking up the scheme of a road in that area to remove the longfelt grievance of the people?

MINISTER in charge of the COMMUNICATIONS and WORKS DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Maharaja Srischandra Nandy, of Cossimbazar): (a)(i) This calls for an expression of opinion.

(ii) and (iii) I have no information about road communication between the two places or about the number of people who would be benefited if there was a road.

(b) No, but if the District Board desire to spend on the project any portion of their share of the proceeds of the Motor Vehicles Tax Government will not object.

Mr. SYED JALALUDDIN HASHEMY: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to tell us whether he or his department asked the local authorities to get the necessary information after he received the notice of the question?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: That was not necessary as we had before us the comprehensive report of our Special Officer.

Mr. SYED JALALUDDIN HASHEMY: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state when his department received notice of this question?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: I ask for notice.

Private deed writers of Registration Offices in Bengal.

***17. Mr. MONOMOHAN DAS:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Education (Registration) Department aware—

(*i*) that in every Registration Office private deed writers locally known as *tenias* of the Registration Office write deeds sitting in the compound of the Registration Office;

(*ii*) that they have free access to the clerks and Sub-Registrars of the Registration Office;

(*iii*) that they have no licence; and

(*iv*) that the said private deed writers sometimes extort money from the illiterate people?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, is the Hon'ble Minister considering the desirability of issuing licences to these private deed writers?

MINISTER in charge of the EDUCATION DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Mr. A. K. Fazlul Huq): (*a*)(*i*) Yes, but not in the compounds of all offices.

(*ii*) No.

(*iii*) Yes.

(*iv*) No such complaint has been received by Government.

(*b*) The system of licensing deed writers was introduced in 1910 by the Eastern Bengal and Assam Government but as it led to malpractices and corruption, the system was abolished in 1912. The question of reviving this system in Bengal was examined thoroughly on several occasions and found to be an unnecessary and unsuitable measure. Government do not propose to take up the question again.

Causes of floods in Murshidabad.

*18. **Maulvi ABDUL BARI:** (a) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Communications and Works Department be pleased to state what were the causes of the recent flood which devastated the major portion of the district of Murshidabad?

(b) Have the Government ascertained from expert opinion whether the Hardinge Bridge of Sara is one of the causes of the last flood?

(c) If so, what step do the Government intend to take to remove those causes?

(d) What steps do the Government intend to take to prevent a recurrence of such flood in future?

(e) Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the extent of damages caused by the last flood in the said district?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: (a) Government have made preliminary inquiries and are of opinion that in addition to heavy rainfall in the catchment basins and the melting of snow in the mountains there are other causes such as the natural rise of the spill area, deterioration of spill channels, cutting off of river spill by means of embankments, etc., and extensive deforestation in the catchment area.

(b) It does not appear that the Hardinge Bridge has materially contributed to the recent high floods in the Ganges.

(c) Does not arise.

(d) It is recognised that the question is one that concerns several provinces. A conference of Experts including the Chief Engineer of our Irrigation Branch was recently held at Lucknow and Government are awaiting their report.

(e) It is difficult to give a correct estimate in terms of rupees of the damage caused by the last flood in this district by the destruction of houses, standing crops, food grains and other movables. Damage to standing crops is estimated as follows:—

	Per cent.
Aus	... 90
Jute	... 75
Winter rice	... 25

The statistics collected show that 27,560 houses collapsed and 86,304 were damaged involving a considerable loss.

Maulvi ABDUL BARI: Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that previous to the construction of the Hardinge Bridge, there was no flood at all in the districts of Murshidabad and Nadia?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: From the records, it does not appear to be so.

Maulvi ABDUL BARI: Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that some of the openings of the Hardinge Channel have been closed up in recent years and that is the reason why floods for the last three years have visited the district of Murshidabad?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: I have no information that some of the openings have been closed. Even if that was a fact we could not say that that was responsible for these floods.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: In view of answer (*a*), will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what is the total amount or the volume of water per second permissible to flow through the openings left in the Hardinge Bridge and what was the maximum amount discharged during the last flood season?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: I want notice.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that the level of water on the western side of the Hardinge Bridge was about two feet higher than the level of water on the eastern side during the highest flood season?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: I am aware that there is a view held by a large number of people about the barrage effect of the bridge, but that is not accepted by some of the experts.

Maulvi ABDUL BARI: Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that there is a persistent demand from the inhabitants of the district of Murshidabad to erect a bund by the side of the river Padma to stop the floods?

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that due to the barrage effect of the Hardinge Bridge, more water is being discharged through the Mathabhanga and the Kumar during the last few years?

Mr. SPEAKER: How does that question arise?

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: This question does arise, Sir, from the answer given by the Hon'ble Minister to the supplementary question just put.

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: I would refer the honourable member to the paper on river problems read by our Chief Engineer before the last Science Congress last year.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: On a point of order, Sir. The Hon'ble Minister is not entitled to refer to any document which is either not in possession of the members of the House in the usual course of functioning as members or is not a document published in the Gazette. If he refers to a speech at a Conference, I believe, he ought to give a full account of it.

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: But I have certainly the liberty to refer to a document which is in the mind of my honourable friend.

Maulvi ABDUL BARI: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state when the report of the expert committee is expected to be published?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: It is very difficult to give an idea about the time, but I believe it will come out very shortly.

Babu NAGENDRA NATH SEN: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether his answer to (*c*), viz., "does not arise" refers to (*a*) or (*b*), or both?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: I think it refers to (*b*).

Mr. HARIPADA CHATTOPADHYAY: Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that even the then Governor His Excellency Sir John Anderson opined that the Raota Embankment is the cause of the flood?

Mr. SPEAKER: I am afraid you cannot refer to the Governor.

Mr. HARIPADA CHATTOPADHYAY: Such opinion was expressed by His Excellency at the Durbar at Krishnagar.

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: There are many embankments which are responsible for aggravating floods.

Maulvi ABDUL BARI: With reference to answer (*e*), will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what steps Government are taking to help the people to reconstruct their houses which have been damaged by the floods?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: I am afraid I will have to refer to the Revenue Department for a reply.

Workers in Railway Conciliation Board.

***19. Mr. J. N. GUPTA:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Commerce and Labour and Rural Reconstruction Department be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the Chairman, Conciliation Board for Railways, Calcutta, has appointed a panel of members representing workers to assist him to settle disputes between the railway management and the workers?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state—

(*i*) whether it is a fact that the Bengal Government were asked to nominate members for the panel; and

(*ii*) if so, on what principle was the nomination made?

(*c*) Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state—

(*i*) what experience have those nominated members got;

(*ii*) what Trade Unions do they represent;

(*iii*) how long are those Trade Unions in existence;

(*iv*) what position have they got in those Trade Unions; and

(*v*) what is the reason for not nominating suitable men from Railway Trade Unions?

MINISTER in charge of the COMMERCE and LABOUR DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Mr. H. S. Suhrawardy): (*a*) I am not aware of the fact, beyond seeing a newspaper communique issued by the Government of India announcing the creation of a panel and the appointment thereto of certain employers' and workers' representatives.

(*b*) and (*c*) Do not arise.

Mr. J. N. GUPTA: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if it is a fact that the Government of India circulated to all the Provincial Governments their policy regarding the selection of the panel of members of the Conciliation Board representing workers?

The Hon'ble Mr. H. S. SUHRAWARDY: The honourable member may be better aware of the relationship of the Government of India and the Provincial Governments, but I am not aware of it.

Mr. J. N. GUPTA: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to enquire and to let the House know the names of the representatives of the workers selected for sitting on the Conciliation Board and whether they are *bona fide* union representatives or not?

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise.

Mr. SIBNATH BANERJEE: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether his department was consulted by the Conciliation Officer before appointing the representatives of the workers' union?

The Hon'ble Mr. H. S. SUHRAWARDY: It was not.

Introduction of Rural Reconstruction Scheme.

***20. Mr. ABDULLA-AL MAHMOOD:** Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Commerce and Labour and Rural Reconstruction Department be pleased to state—

(*i*) whether the Government propose to introduce any scheme of rural reconstruction in the near future;

(*ii*) whether any money has been provided in the Budget for carrying out any work of rural reconstruction;

(*iii*) what step, if any, the Government have decided to follow to spend the money for the work of rural reconstruction; and

(*iv*) whether the entire responsibility of carrying out any scheme of rural reconstruction enunciated by the Government will rest with the Director of Rural Reconstruction?

The Hon'ble Mr. H. S. SUHRAWARDY: (*i*) Yes

(*ii*) Yes. A sum of Rs. 2,50,000 has been provided in the Budget for 1939-40 for the purpose, subject to the vote of the Assembly.

(*iii*) I am just considering a scheme submitted by the Director of Rural Reconstruction, the details of which have not yet been finally approved.

(*iv*) As stated above, the scheme is still under consideration but as far as my present intentions go, the scheme will be generally worked under the control and supervision of District Officer with the advice

and assistance of the Director of Rural Reconstruction who will be responsible for co-ordinating the activities in different districts of the province.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state when this scheme was submitted by the Director of Rural Reconstruction and how long he will take to finally approve the scheme?

The Hon'ble Mr. H. S. SUHRAWARDY: As to when it was submitted is a matter for Government files and how long I will take to consider the proposals depends very much on the time at my disposal. But I can inform the honourable member that I shall expedite the matter as much as possible and I hope that when I move my grants I shall place before the House a concrete and detailed scheme.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I have got no reply to the first part of my question and I do draw your attention thereto. The Hon'ble Minister has stated that so far as the first part of my question, namely, the time when the scheme was submitted to Government is concerned, it is a matter for Government files. I would seek your protection and I would like to have a definite reply thereto; otherwise I would like to put a question if the Hon'ble Minister would be pleased to send me that Government file.

The Hon'ble Mr. H. S. SUHRAWARDY: I do not propose to reply to the honourable member as to when a communication is sent by a Government officer to a Government department.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Sir, am I not entitled to this information? It is for you to say. When a particular scheme has been forwarded to Government, are we not entitled to have the information so that we may find out how long Government take to consider it?

Mr. SPEAKER: As I have repeatedly said, you are entitled to put a question and you are perfectly at liberty to put that question, but to what extent it would be in consonance with Government's policy to release their departmental information is a matter for the Hon'ble Minister to decide; I cannot say anything about that.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: I submit that the rules do not permit refusal of information unless it is in public interest. It is for you, Sir, to protect the privileges of this House. The Hon'ble Minister can only refuse information if it is in the public interest and on no other grounds.

The Hon'ble Mr. H. S. SUHRAWARDY: I submit that it is in the public interest that the details of Government files and correspondence between officials should not be divulged to honourable members.

Khan Bahadur MOHAMMED ALI: In view of the fact that the success of any scheme of rural reconstruction depends on the co-operation of the District Boards, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether Government are considering the desirability of consulting the District Boards before the scheme is finally approved?

Mr. SPEAKER: The first part of the question is out of order.

The Hon'ble Mr. H. S. SUHRAWARDY: I think Government have sufficient imagination to know to what extent the District Boards may be called upon to co-operate in the scheme of rural reconstruction and to what extent they ought to co-operate with Government in the matter. I have no doubt that Government will not only take the advice of District Boards, but of all organisations that can help in the scheme of rural reconstruction.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if he has got sufficient imagination to state the general principles involved in that rural reconstruction scheme?

Mr. SPEAKER: That is a reflection.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: The Hon'ble Minister himself said that Government has got imagination. So I am making no reflection on him. Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the general lines along which this scheme has been drawn up and what are the principal recommendations?

The Hon'ble Mr. H. S. SUHRAWARDY: I do not propose to make any statement at this stage. A statement will be made after the scheme has been finally approved by the Cabinet.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if this sum of Rs. 2,50,000 has been provided as a lump sum grant as in the previous budget or it has been on the basis of an actual framing of a full scheme and the amount calculated on the working out of that scheme?

The Hon'ble Mr. H. S. SUHRAWARDY: I have the impression that the Budget has been circulated to the honourable members. I refer the honourable member to the Budget which has been recently circulated.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: May I have the information from the Hon'ble Minister if he has himself looked at the Budget? In the Budget there is no such item mentioned as a lump sum grant.

Mr. SPEAKER: The first part of your question does not arise.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: May I have the information from the Hon'ble Minister if he is aware that in the Budget the details of the scheme are not given?

The Hon'ble Mr. H. S. SUHRAWARDY: I think the question does not arise inasmuch as I have already informed the House the details of the scheme have not yet been worked out.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: I only enquired if it was a lump sum grant or a grant based on the actual drawing up of certain schemes: There is only one reply, I submit. I want your protection against this sort of evasive reply from the Hon'ble Minister.

Mr. SPEAKER: I hope the language of the reply should be suitably couched.

The Hon'ble Mr. H. S. SUHRAWARDY: There is no evasiveness in my reply. It is clear that the honourable member has himself looked into the Budget and found there is no lump grant. He does not need an answer from me.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Let the honourable member himself look into the budget.

Mr. SPEAKER: I think excitements are matters which might be left outside this Chamber and I am not going to permit on any occasion excitement in the nature of an interruption. You are perfectly entitled to put your question. I can appreciate that at times heat does come in, but excitement of this nature I am not going to permit in this House.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: I am sorry I was excited, but it was only because of some fraudulent statements.

Mr. SPEAKER: Will Dr. Sanyal withdraw the expression?

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: I have not made any reflection on anybody.

Mr. SPEAKER: The word "fraudulent" is wholly unparmentary and you must withdraw it.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: I withdraw the word "fraudulent".

Mr. SURENDRA NATH BISWAS: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether the sum of Rs. 2,50,000 provided in the Budget is for preparing the scheme or for giving effect to this scheme?

The Hon'ble Mr. H. S. SUHRAWARDY: Does the honourable member seriously wish to know whether this sum is going to be spent in preparing the scheme?

Mr. SURENDRA NATH BISWAS: Yes.

The Hon'ble Mr. H. S. SUHRAWARDY: Let him wait until I give my Budget speech.

Miss Muktaprova Bose, Assistant Head Mistress, Vidyamoyee Girls' School, Mymensingh.

*21. **Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL:** (a) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Education Department be pleased to state--

(i) whether Miss Muktaprova Bose who held a post in the Intelligence Branch Department has been recently appointed to hold the post of Assistant Head Mistress of the Vidyamoyee Girls' School at Mymensingh;

(ii) if so, in what grade and on what initial salary;

(iii) whether there was any vacancy of this post;

(iv) if so, whether the Public Service Commission was consulted in filling up the vacancy;

(v) whether there was any duly qualified lady teacher already in the employ of Government available for this post;

(vi) whether the case of that lady teacher was examined before this appointment from outside was made;

(*vii*) whether the said Miss Muktaprova Bose has passed the requisite departmental examination; and

(*viii*) whether it was a fact that the previous officiating incumbent for the post of Assistant Head Mistress was required to pass the requisite departmental examination as a condition precedent to her being made permanent in the post?

(*b*) Have the Government received any public complaints drawing attention to the probable effect on the continuance of the present incumbent?

(*c*) If so, do the Government contemplate laying a copy of the complaints on the table?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: (*a*) (*i*) Miss Muktaprova Bose was appointed to act as Assistant Head Mistress, Vidyamoyee Girls' High School, Mymensingh, from 20th June, 1938. She was formerly Head Mistress of the Barisal Sadar High School for Girls (non-Government), but had been for about 4 years employed as Lady Interviewer by the Home (Political) Department of Government.

(*ii*) In the grade of Assistant Head Mistress in the S. E. S. on Rs. 130—10/2—140—20/2—220 on an initial salary of Rs. 200 per mensem.

(*iii*) Yes.

(*iv*) No. The Director of Public Instruction is competent to make appointments in that grade without reference to the Public Service Commission.

(*v*) Yes.

(*vi*) Before it is decided to fill any post by direct recruitment, all circumstances are considered, the qualifications of candidates in the service, the qualifications of possible outside recruits and the needs of the department. Each case is then judged on its merits. This procedure was followed in this case.

(*vii*) No.

(*viii*) No. She was required to pass the examination not as a condition precedent to her being made permanent in the post but because her failure to pass it would have the effect of postponement of her periodical increment and rank promotion.

(*b*) No.

(*c*) Does not arise.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: With reference to answer (*a*) (*ii*), will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state why this Miss Muktaprova

Bose was appointed on an initial salary of Rs. 200 where the starting salary was Rs. 130? Was it as a reward for the special services rendered in the Intelligence Branch Department?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: How many questions will you put?

Mr. SPEAKER: The latter part of your question does not arise. You can put the first part.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: I want an answer for the first part of my question.

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: The appointment was made by the Director of Public Instruction and he was the best judge in the circumstances.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: I wanted to know the reason why this particular incumbent was appointed on a higher salary than the starting salary of the grade. Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that the Director of Public Instruction's choice is as much the action of the Government as that of the Government and the Government have to find out the reasons therefor and we members are entitled to know the reasons?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: In many cases, Sir, competent persons are not willing to join unless they are given salaries higher than the initial salary. I presume that in this case the Director of Public Instruction agreed to give her a higher salary because she was worth Rs. 200 a month and she would not come for anything less than that.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that this lady was given this higher salary on the recommendation of another department of Government and not from the Education Department?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: If the honourable member knows more of the secret, more of Miss Bose's case, I can't help it. I don't accept that statement as a fact.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: With reference to answer (*iii*) "yes", will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if it is not a fact that at the time this Miss Muktaprova Bose was appointed in the Vidyamovee Girls' School there was no permanent vacancy inasmuch as Miss Suphala Roy was holding a lien on that post as she was temporarily appointed in the Eden Girls' School?

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise. You have yourself given all the information. You must put your supplementary question to elicit information.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: I am only helping the Hon'ble Minister.

The Hon'ble Mr. A, K. FAZLUL HUQ: I do not require any help.

Mr. SPEAKER: I will appreciate your help when you are on this side of the House and not so long as you are there.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if it is a fact that the permanent incumbent of this post was engaged elsewhere on a temporary appointment?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: I am glad that the honourable member has made a thorough study of Miss Bose's case, but I can tell him that his statement of fact is not correct.

Mr. SYED JALALUDDIN HASHEMY: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what is the meaning and connotation of the term "Lady Interviewer" in the Home Department and what was the salary of that lady when she was serving as Lady Interviewer?

The Hon'ble Mr. A, K. FAZLUL HUQ: Which question shall I answer?

Mr, SYED JALALUDDIN HASHEMY: Both. What is the meaning of the term and what was the salary?

The Hon'ble Mr, A. K. FAZLUL HUQ. Shall I begin with the last?

Mr, SYED JALALUDDIN HASHEMY: With the first.

The Hon'ble Mr, A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: You want to know what is the meaning of the term "Interviewer."

Mr. SYED JALALUDDIN HASHEMY: "Lady Interviewer".

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise.

Mr. SYED JALALUDDIN HASHEMY: Then I put the second question. Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to tell us the salary she used to draw when she was serving as Lady Interviewer in the Home Department?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: As far as I can recollect she was receiving Rs. 180 a month.

Mr. SURENDRA MOHAN MAITRA: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what is the meaning of the term "Lady Interviewer"?

Mr. SPEAKER: The meaning of the language is not a thing regarding which you can ordinarily put a supplementary question.

Mr. DHIRENDRA NATH DATTA: What are the duties of the Lady Interviewer?

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state with reference to answer (*c*) "yes", if any opportunity was given to those persons already in Government service, to apply for the post and was there any advertisement made? You say that there were suitable candidates in Government service already and yet you took somebody from outside. I want to know whether there was any advertisement made for that post and whether suitable candidates were given an opportunity to apply for the post?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: So far as I am aware, an advertisement was made, but ordinarily unless special permission is given by the head of the department, persons already in Government service are not allowed to apply.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: With reference to answer (*vi*), will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if any advertisement was at all published inviting applications from candidates for this post?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: I ask for notice. I cannot say off-hand.

UNSTARRED QUESTIONS

(answers to which were laid on the table)

The Karatoya Resuscitation Project.

17. Khan Bahadur MOHAMMED ALI: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Communications and Works (Irrigation) Department aware—

(*i*) that the estimate for the Karatoya Resuscitation Project has been almost doubled;

(*ii*) that the previous calculation by the officers of the Irrigation Department has been found to be an under estimate; and

(*iii*) that the work has been held up for the said calculation?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what steps do the Government propose to take to augment their grant to the District Board so that the project may be carried through?

(*c*) Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that the people of the district are being inconvenienced for the delay in the taking up of the scheme?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: (*a*) It has been reported that the original estimate was much too low; the reason for this is being investigated. As the revised estimate has not been sanctioned, work on the project has not been started.

(*b*) This question and that of an increased contribution by the Board will have to be considered when the revised estimate is sanctioned.

(*c*) Yes.

Khan Bahadur MOHAMMED ALI: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what is the difference between the original estimate and the revised estimate of the project?

The Hon'ble Maharaja of SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: As the estimate is still being examined, I am sorry I cannot give a figure.

Khan Bahadur MOHAMMED ALI: Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that the investigation is continuing for over six months?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: I think it is very nearly that.

Khan Bahadur MOHAMMED ALI: Is the Hon'ble Minister considering the desirability of expediting the investigation?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: Sir, certainly. I can give an undertaking that the department's portion of the work will be expedited, but then there is the District Board. If they also expedite, then the whole scheme may make quicker progress.

Irrigation problems of the province.

18. Rai HARENDRA NATH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Communications and Works (Irrigation) Department be pleased to state—

(*i*) how have the Government dealt with the answers that had been received to the questionnaire that was issued with regard to the irrigation problems of the province; and

(*ii*) what conclusions, if any, have been reached in the answers received?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: (*i*) The replies to the questionnaire were considered at a conference of gentlemen interested in the subject held on the 14th, 15th and 16th of July, 1938.

(*ii*) A copy of the minutes with resolutions of the conference is placed on the Library Table.

Rai HARENDRA NATH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether the minutes have been published for public information?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: I don't think so.

Rai HARENDRA NATH CHAUDHURI: Why were they not published having regard to the importance of the subject?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: There was no reason to withhold their publication.

Rai HARENDRA NATH CHAUDHURI: That is no answer to my question. Why were the Minutes not published having regard to the importance of the question? What are your reasons for not publishing the same as yet?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: It is not the usual practice to publish the Minutes of such Committees.

Rai HARENDRA NATH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether the resolutions have been considered by Government as a whole?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: I don't think it is necessary for the Government as a whole to consider all the resolutions. The department have considered and have begun to take action thereon.

Rai HARENDRA NATH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what actions have been taken and on what resolutions?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: It is impossible to give a reply to this question off-hand without referring to the several resolutions which were passed, but I may give one instance and that is about the inter-provincial River Commission regarding which a conference was recently held at Lucknow.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: With reference to answer (*i*), will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to give the names of those gentlemen interested who were present at that conference?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: I want notice.

Rai HARENDRA NATH CHAUDHURI: In view of the fact that only three non-official members were present at the conference and the conference was in fact a packed conference of officials and those belonging to the Port Commissioners, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to publish the Minutes and the Resolutions at a very early date for public information?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: Sir, I may inform the honourable member that that was not a packed conference. We circulated the questionnaire to members of both Houses and to the general public and it was, as I have already stated, a conference of experts and those interested in these problems.

Rai HARENDRA NATH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether having regard to the action that has been taken by the Hon'ble Minister up to date, any provision has been made in the Budget to give effect to the decisions of the Government?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: I do not think it is possible in such a short time.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state how Government ascertained the name of gentlemen interested in the problem?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: Government exercised their discretion

Babu NAGENDRA NATH SEN: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether it is the intention of Government to publish the report and the proceedings of the conference?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: I may assure the honourable member that Government are not reluctant to publish the report.

Change in the order of the Agenda.

Mr. SPEAKER: I find that there is an adjournment motion, bu before taking that up I must admit that there is a considerable feeling with which I have my full sympathy, regarding the change of th agenda at the last moment. But unfortunately, as the rule stands viz., rule 19, on days when Government business has precedence, th Governor may arrange business in such order as he thinks fit. Tha makes my position difficult, as I cannot possibly say anything with a view to control the order of business. I may, however, reques Government on behalf of the House to consider whether it is desirabl that at the last moment important matters should be suddenly throwr before the House for decision. I find that there are certainly some very important Bills, and it is perfectly reasonable that the other side migh like to have an opportunity to know sufficiently beforehand as to wher they would be taken up. At this stage I would not enquire into th question of the authority which the Speaker has with a view to contro the agenda; I am not entering into that question, but I would reques that the Government agenda, if changed, should be given a littl earlier notice of.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: I submit, Sir, the rules do not permit Government to change the already announced order of business. So far as I find the rules——

Mr. SPEAKER: Dr. Sanyal, I have decided already that to-day I am not going to enter into the question as to the power which the Speaker has in the matter of control over the agenda. I shall enter into the question if occasion arises and necessity requires, and I can assure you that if I find that the Speaker has authority, as Speaker I will not hesitate to exercise it in the best interest of the House. For the time being, however, I would request the Hon'ble the Chief Minister to consider whether it is not desirable to have the agenda changed so that the members of the Opposition may have sufficient notice thereof.

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: Sir, when we assembled this afternoon it was represented to us that the change in the agenda would be inconvenient to the members of the Opposition. We considered the matter and have decided not to take up the Calcutta Municipal Bill out of order as has been done. It may be taken up on the 24th. The Calcutta Municipal Bill is one of the most important Bills, and we propose to take it up on the 24th. So far as the other Bills are concerned, they may be allowed to stand, because the members have got sufficient notice of them.

Mr. SPEAKER: I would suggest that the best thing in the circumstances would be to conclude our sitting to-day by only taking up the adjournment motion, and if Government want in the meantime to change the order of the agenda, they are entitled to do so. But I feel that sufficient notice should be given to the members so that they may come ready. If Government agree to take up the adjournment motion only and not the Bills to-day, they will in the meantime be able to decide the order in which these will be taken up and give sufficient notice thereof by to-morrow or the day after. I hope this procedure will satisfy the House. I take it therefore that Government bills will not be taken up to-day if there is an adjournment motion.

The Hon'ble Nawab MUSHARRUFF HOSSAIN Khan Bahadur: I beg to submit, Sir, that I have a Bill——

Mr. SPEAKER: I might draw the attention of the Hon'ble Judicial Minister that the proper stage when he can do so is in between the decision on the adjournment motion and the taking up of the adjournment motion itself. In other words, the normal business of the House does not begin till this question is disposed of.

Adjournment motion.

Mr. PRAMATHA NATH BANERJEE: May I, Sir, hand over the paper containing the adjournment motion to the Secretary for your consent?

The motion is in these words: This Assembly do now adjourn to discuss a definite matter of urgent public importance and of recent occurrence, namely, the situation arising out of the notification No. 656P., dated 10th February 1939, of the Government of Bengal extending the provision of section 7 of the Bengal Criminal Law (Amendment) Act, 1932, and the promulgation of section 144 of the Criminal Procedure Code on the 13th February 1939 for operation in certain parts of the Burdwan district.

Mr. SPEAKER: I would like to know from the Treasury Bench as to whether the motion is in order or not.

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: Sir, while we would welcome the discussion on the subject, I consider that it is not in order, because nothing has happened beyond Government enforcing their legal right, to raise a discussion in this House; no situation has been created in Burdwan and the latest information is that absolutely nothing has happened.

Mr. PRAMATHA NATH BANERJEE: The notification in question appeared in the Gazette Extraordinary. The notification itself will convince you that there has been a recent occurrence. The question is about the collection of certain rates. The ordinary civil tribunals are still functioning there. The fact of the promulgation of the special law passed in an emergency to the collection of rates and the despatch of an armed police in that area for the purpose of collecting rates are, I submit with great humility, occurrences and the promulgation of section 144 (Criminal Procedure Code) you yourself have held, is an instance of such occurrence.

Mr. SPEAKER: Is there anything to be said on this side?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: I cannot deny that people are not paying their legal dues, but nothing has occurred there to create a situation.

Mr. SPEAKER: I have heard both sides of the House on the point whether it is in order, but I think, so far as the promulgation of section 7 of the Criminal Law Amendment Act in connection with the collection of rate or cess, irrigation or otherwise, is concerned, it is

certainly a matter which is outside the ordinary. In view of that and in view of the allegations which have been made, I hold, without entering into the question of merit, that this promulgation extending the provision of section 7 is a matter of urgent public importance to be discussed in the House. And as this matter has arisen only recently and as this is the earliest opportunity to raise it before the House, I hold the motion is in order. I will now ask the members of the House, if the motion has the leave of the Assembly. If there any objection? (No objection was raised.) I take it that there is none. and in view of that fact I fix 5-50 p.m. for the discussion of this motion.

The Hon'ble Nawab MUSHARRUFF HOSSAIN, Khan Bahadur: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I have already said that I want to present the Report of the Select Committee on the Bengal Money-Lenders Bill, 1939.

Babu NAGENDRA NATH SEN: Sir, my objection is that it is not in the agenda.

Mr. SPEAKER: That is not necessary.

The Assembly was then adjourned for ten minutes.

(After adjournment.)

Mr. PRAMATHA NATH BANERJEE: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I move that this Assembly do now adjourn to discuss a definite matter of urgent public importance and of recent occurrence, viz., the situation arising out of the notification No. 656P., dated the 10th February, 1939, of the Government of Bengal extending the provisions of section 7 of the Criminal Law Amendment Act of 1932 to the whole of the Burdwan district with the exception of the Asansol subdivision and the promulgation of section 144 of the Criminal Procedure Code on the 13th February, 1939, for operation in certain parts of the Burdwan district.

Mr. Speaker, a very heavy responsibility is cast upon the shoulders of any member of this House who desires to move, and is permitted to move an adjournment motion, during the budget session. But, Sir, my justification and my defence in taking up this rather unusual step is the situation created in certain parts of the Burdwan district watered by the Damodar Canal operating either under the Bengal Development Act, 1935, or under the Bengal Irrigation Act. Mr. Speaker, the question was raised on the floor of this House by me by way of a cut motion two years ago in connection with the irirgation budget and then, Sir, I pleaded earnestly for a revision of two things—the collection of compulsory levy under section 12 of the Bengal Development Act and the revision of the rates in that area imposed by that

Act. I put it on the ground not of politics. I put it on humanitarian grounds, and on that appeal the Hon'ble the Chief Minister is reported to have said this. He said: "I am free to admit that enquiry has shown that there is a very widespread feeling about the distress of the people in the Damodar Canal and the Eden Canal areas due to the operation of the Bengal Development Act. Sir, I have received representations in numbers which I forwarded to the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Irrigation Department, and I believe, Sir, that the expression of distress by these people must be based on some genuine grounds, and it may be safely assumed that it has not been got up by agitators with an ulterior purpose. Indeed, Sir, this problem is a very complicated one, and nothing can be better than an enquiry on the spot by people who are in a position to give information and then to come to a decision as to what further steps ought to be taken." Pursuant to the expression of sympathy by the Hon'ble the Chief Minister and pursuant to the pledge which he gave before this Assembly, a committee was appointed consisting of certain members of the Government and certain members of the Opposition to go into the whole question. They spent many days in discussing the rate of the levy and came to the conclusion - so far as I remember that the rate of Rs. 2-9-0 was just, equitable and fair The report was not a unanimous one and has not yet seen the light of day The question of the levy in the Damodar Canal area Mr. Speaker, you will remember —is not merely a local question It is a question which affects the irrigation policy of the whole province Now, Sir, in the notification in the Gazette, I find that the lower rate of levy was realised for the years 1936-37 and 1937-38 and then it was decided by the Government to apply the provisions of the Irrigation Act and to supply water in that area on what is regarded as a voluntary basis and, therefore, the rates now fixed are Rs. 3-8-0 for long-term leases and Rs. 4 for short-term leases. Government may very well claim that this is a contract between the tenants concerned and the Government. I hope my honourable friend, the Home Minister, will not take that plea. A contract between the Government and the individual tenant or tenants always reminds me of a certain story in Charles Dickens. Certain chicken had entered into a sort of bargain with an elephant that they would have ball-dancing on equal footing. The ball-dancing began all right, but the result was disastrous to the chicken.

Sir, what has happened now is that in the notification in the Gazette the Government state that the arrears in that area come up to about Rs. 6,42,000 and the collections amounted to less than Rs. 32,000 only. The result has been practically a stoppage of all collections and the communiqué maintains that the stoppage in the collection has been due to political agitation of an undesirable type involving the boycott of officials. It is for this reason that, according to Government,

Government have been obliged to despatch armed police and motor lorries and buses for the purpose of removing properties attached of the tenantry who are either unable or unwilling to pay. They have also promulgated section 144 prohibiting public meetings and they have called in their assistance section 7 of the Criminal Law (Amendment) Act of 1932.

Sir, I have described in my written statement these as extraordinary measures. It may be the defence of Government that these extraordinary measures have been occasioned by the extraordinary situation which has arisen in the locality. It has not been finally settled by the Government whether it is possible for the tenantry in that locality to pay these rates. I am putting my adjournment motion not in a spirit of a very stringent criticism of the action of the Government: I am putting it not on the ground of invoking a vote of censure upon Government, but I am sending an invitation to the Hon'ble the Chief Minister and his colleagues if it is possible to come to a sort of adjustment about the local rates in that particular area. I am making the invitation in the hope that this problem will be retained on both sides as a purely irrigational problem—that no political situation will be permitted to arise on it. I notice further that Government is very keen on the realisation of the arrears. It may be within the recollection of most of the members of the House that Burdwan suffered from drought of an unprecedented nature last year——

Mr. SPEAKER: I may say at this stage that if any members want to go out for saying their prayers they may do so while the discussion on the adjournment motion may go on. But this will not be a precedent in any way. As it will take some time to finish the speech I have already suggested to some Muslim members to do so.

Mr. SARAT CHANDRA BOSE: I need hardly say that we have no objection.

Maulvi ABDUL BARI: In view of the fact that members on this side also like to hear what is said by the other side, we cannot possibly agree to the suggestion.

Mr. SPEAKER: Then I would ask Mr. Banerji to finish his speech in 4 or 5 minutes when I shall adjourn the House for prayer.

Mr. PRAMATHA NATH BANERJEE: It means cutting down my time.

You may recollect, Mr. Speaker, as most members will recollect, that the districts of Bengal suffered from two great natural calamities last year—one was the flood which affected the Eastern Bengal and

Northern Bengal areas and the other was the drought which certainly affected the Burdwan district. In this matter I would advise the Hon'ble the Home Minister, who belongs to Eastern Bengal which was inundated with flood, to refer to his two colleagues who have very important interests in the Burdwan district, and they will, I am sure, be able to confirm the statement which I am making here to-night. Therefore my earnest plea to the members of the Government is that let Government not by the show of force attempt to create a situation where there may not be any such situation. Let the members of the Government and the members of the Opposition in a spirit of goodwill and co-operation in this one matter which need not be made a political matter, settle the disputes and differences between the tenantry and the collecting agents of Government. I hope I shall receive an assurance from the Hon'ble the Home Minister to-night that there will be no question of victimisation, no question of terrorisation, of the tenantry in the affected areas concerned. It is a matter which, I again repeat, is based on purely humanitarian grounds, and on this question let there be no difference of opinion whatsoever. As I indicated in the opening part of my speech and the Hon'ble the Chief Minister had himself admitted it—there was acute distress in the area and that acute distress has not improved by reason of the drought last year and the drought still continues, as you can very well see. Therefore, Law and Order will no doubt be maintained and enforced in that area but there must not be any excessive exercise of it. The armed policemen might very well go back to their homes. I do not know if British troops have been sent: I have received information by telephone that British troops have been sent in this area—to do what?—to perform the miraculous task of collecting the magnificent sum of Rs. 6 lakhs from the tenantry of this affected area. I hope that these British troops will find better employment elsewhere than in this poverty-stricken, this malaria-stricken and this canal-stricken area.

The House was then adjourned for 10 minutes for prayer.

(After adjournment.)

Mr. B. C. MUKHERJEE: আমি এই পরিষদ স্থগিতের প্রস্তাব সমর্থন করি। প্রস্তাবকারী প্রথমেই বোলেছেন যে আইন ও শৃঙ্খলা রক্ষা করা প্রয়োজন—আমরা এ side এর অনেকেই মনে করি যে, আইন ও শৃঙ্খলা রক্ষা করার প্রয়োজন আছেই কিন্তু শত শত মনুষ্য জীবনের বিনিময়ে যেখানে আইন ও শৃঙ্খলা রক্ষা করা হয় সেখানে বিশেষ রকম আঘাত লাগে। আজ এখানে হোম্ মিনিষ্টার বোলেছেন যে তেমন কিছু গুরুতর পরিস্থিতি হয় নাই। কিন্তু সামান্য সাত লক্ষ টাকা আদায় করবার জন্য সেখানে পুলিশবাহিনীর সমাবেশ করা হয়েছে, সৈন্য আমদানি করা হয়েছে এবং জরুরী আইন সেখানে জারি করা হয়েছে। গাড়োলি রেজিমেণ্ট সম্বন্ধে যা শোনা আছে তাতে যে কোন মুহূর্তে সেখানে বন্দুকের গুলি চোলতে পারে এবং কতকগুলি মনুষ্য জীবনের অবসান হতে পারে, এ অবস্থাটা যদি গুরুতর পরিস্থিতি না হয় তাহলে গুরুতর পরিস্থিতি আর কিসে যে হতে পারে আমি জানি না। সবচেয়ে দুঃখের বিষয় এই যে এই প্রজাপীড়ণ মেণ্টের প্রথম বন্দুকের নিশান হচ্ছে আজ দুঃখী কৃষক প্রজা। এতদিন পর্যন্ত এরকম কোনো সমস্যার উদ্ভব নূতন শাসন

প্রবর্ত্তনের পর বাংলায় হয় নাই, আজ এই প্রথম এরকম একটা ব্যাপারের উদ্ভব হয়েছে। যেখানে দরিদ্র কৃষক প্রজা তাদের অবস্থার উন্নতি না হওয়া পর্য্যন্ত গুরুভার ট্যাক্স দিতে পারে না, সে অবস্থায় আজ গভর্ণমেন্টের পক্ষ থেকে কোথায় তাদের প্রতি দয়া দাক্ষিণ্য প্রদর্শিত হবে,—না, তার জায়গায় সেখানে হচ্ছে সশস্ত্র পুলিশ আর সৈন্য সমাবেশ।——(Sj NARENDRA NARAYAN CHAKRABARTY : রুটির বদলে তাদের ভাগ্যে মিলছে—গুলি।) কাল Hon'ble the Finance Minister দেশের লোকের সহযোগিতা ও সহানুভূতির আকাঙ্খা প্রকাশ কোরেছেন। তাঁর কারুণ্য বর্ষিত হয়েছে বহু স্থানে। বহু সহস্র মুদ্রায় তিনি যখন নানা স্থানে করুণা বর্ষণ কোরতে পেরেছেন ১৯০৯ সনের বাজেটে তখন এই দুর্গত দুর্ভিক্ষপীড়িত বর্দ্ধমানের কৃষকদের ৭ লক্ষ টাকা যদি ছেড়ে দিতেন, তাহলে Hon'ble the Finance Minister এর সহযোগিতা ও সহানুভূতি আশা করার কতকটা মানে থাকতো। আজ হয় তো বর্দ্ধমানের সমস্যা সম্বন্ধে, এখানে কিছু আলোচনা করা অপ্রাসঙ্গিক হবে না। আজ যে গুরুতর সমস্যার উদ্ভব হয়েছে—সৈন্য সমাবেশের দ্বারা তার উপর কিছু সমালোচনা কোরতে হলে সেখানকার কৃষকদের দারিদ্রের কথা, তাদের ভিতরকার অবস্থার বিষয় কিছু উল্লেখ না কোরলে সেখানকার এই গুরুতর পরিস্থিতির বিষয়টা বোঝানো শক্ত হতে পারে। এখানে গভর্ণমেন্টের পক্ষ থেকে তাঁদের একমাত্র বক্তব্য এই যে, যে ট্যাক্স গভর্ণমেন্টের প্রাপ্য সেই ট্যাক্স আদায় কোরতে গেলে যদি সেখানকার কৃষকরা নানা রকমে বাধার সৃষ্টি করে, তাহলে গভর্ণমেন্টের পক্ষে তাদের পাওনা আদায়ের কি পন্থা আর হোতে পারে? কিন্তু অপর দিকটাও দেখবার আছে। প্রথমত গভর্ণমেন্টের উচ্চ প্রাসাদ পর্য্যন্ত গরীব কৃষকদের ক্ষীণ আওয়াজ পেঁছায় না, দ্বিতীয়ত যদিও বা পেঁছায় কৃষকেরা একটা কিছু গুরুতর অবস্থার সৃষ্টি যতক্ষণ পর্য্যন্ত না করে, ততক্ষণ পর্য্যন্ত গভর্ণমেন্টের কর্তৃপক্ষ বিচলিত হন না। বর্দ্ধমানে যখন এই canal tax প্রথম প্রবর্ত্তিত হয়েছিলো তখন কৃষকেরা যে বহুবার কোরে আবেদন নিবেদন কোরেছিলো তাদ্বারা গভর্ণমেন্ট কিছুমাত্র বিচলিত হন নাই। তখন গভর্ণমেন্ট বোলে বেড়িয়েছেন যে দামোদর canal এর দ্বারা কৃষকদের অসম্ভব রকম উপকার হোয়েছে। যত রকমের Fantastic fee তারা নিয়েছেন—আর তাদ্বারা দেখিয়েছেন যে কৃষকদের নাকি খুব লাভ থাকে। কিন্তু যখন সেখানে এই রকম একটা আন্দোলন হলো তখন ৫॥৹ টাকার rate যা ছিলো সেটা কমিয়ে কোরলেন আড়াই টাকা। তাহলেই দেখা যাচ্ছে যে সেখানে গভর্ণমেন্ট স্বীকার কোরেই নিয়েছেন যে কৃষকেরা সমবেতভাবে দলবদ্ধভাবে যতক্ষণ পর্য্যন্ত কোন রকম আন্দোলন প্রচেষ্টা না করে ততক্ষণ পর্য্যন্ত তাদের প্রার্থনা গভর্ণমেন্ট উপেক্ষা কোরে চলেন। অতএব দেখা যাচ্ছে, সেক্ষেত্রে কৃষকদের আর কোন পন্থা নাই সমবেত আন্দোলন করা ছাড়া। এর দ্বারা প্রমাণিত হয় যে ব্যাপারের জন্য তারা সঙ্ঘবদ্ধ হয় সেটা কিছু অন্যায় জিনিষ নয়। আজ পর্য্যন্ত সেখানে রাজনৈতিক কোন আন্দোলন তারা করে নাই। এবং এর ভিতর no tax campaign এর কোন গন্ধ নাই, এর ভিতর কোন রাজনৈতিক পরিস্থিতি নাই। তার প্রমাণ,—দু'তিন বছর পূর্ব্বে যখন তারা আন্দোলন আরম্ভ করে তখন প্রথমেই তারা স্বীকার কোরে নেয় যে canal tax এর এক চতুর্থ অংশ তারা নিতে দেবে, বাকি তিন চতুর্থাংশ তারা না দিয়ে গভর্ণমেন্টের দৃষ্টি সে বিষয়ে আকর্ষণ কোরেছিলো—সুবিচার পাবার আশায়। এর ভিতর তাদের বিদ্রোহের ভাব তো নাইই বরং গভর্ণমেন্টকে কোন রকম বিপদে না ফেলবার ভাবই যে রয়েছে—সে বিষয়ে কোন সন্দেহ নাই। দুঃখের বিষয় বর্দ্ধমান জেলার কৃষকদের উপর revenue এর যে হার আছে সমস্ত বাংলা দেশের মধ্যে তা সকলের চেয়ে বেশী। গভর্ণমেন্ট অনেক কিছু প্রচার কোরেছেন——(interruption) ——স্যার উলিয়াম উইলকক্স বোলেছেন সাতটা সয়তানের শৃঙ্খলের দ্বারা বেষ্টন কোরে বর্দ্ধমানকে উচ্ছন্ন দেওয়া হয়েছে। আজ বাংলার ভিতর সবচেয়ে বেশী প্রসিদ্ধ ম্যালেরিয়াগ্রস্ত স্থান বর্দ্ধমানের canal অঞ্চল আর ভাঙ্গকুল্লি (?) অঞ্চল। ম্যালেরিয়া এ দুটী স্থানের সর্ব্বনাশ কোরেছে। বর্দ্ধমানের কৃষকদের প্রতি যে এই অবিচার করা হচ্ছে তবু সবচেয়ে বেশী ট্যাক্স তাদেরই দিতে হয়। তার উপর Rail Road এবং Grand Trunk Road প্রভৃতি রক্ষা করবার জন্য বর্দ্ধমানের স্বাভাবিক পয়প্রণালীকে নষ্ট কোরে অত বড় একটা সমৃদ্ধ জেলাকে দরিদ্রতম জেলায় অবনমিত করা হয়েছে। সেজন্য গভর্ণমেন্টের উচিত ছিলো রেল কোম্পানি প্রভৃতির কাছ থেকে ট্যাক্স আদায় কোরে কৃষকদের রেহাই দেওয়া। তারা একেবারেই কোন ট্যাক্স দেবে না বোলছে না —তারা সবটা দিতে পারবে না। আমরা একথা জোরের সঙ্গে বোলছি—যে আজ পর্য্যন্ত এই

land development এর দ্বারা বিঘা প্রতি এক ছটাক লাভও হয় নাই। এত বড় একটা faulty canal এটা হয়েছে যে, যে সময়ে জলের বিশেষ দরকার সেই সময়েই জল পাওয়া যায় না। যেখান থেকে উৎপন্ন সেখানে কিছু উপকার পাওয়া যায়। মধ্য প্রদেশে না উপকার না অপকার আর নিম্ন প্রদেশে সবারই অপকার হয়। যদি গভর্ণমেন্ট সুবিচার কোরতে চান তাহলে এই তিনটী zone থেকে rate স্থির করা উচিত। আর canal সম্বন্ধে কৃষকদের আন্দোলনের দিকে যদি কেউ লক্ষ্য কোরে থাকেন তাহলে দেখতে পাবেন যে তিনটী স্থানের আন্দোলনের গুরুত্ব পূর্ব্বোক্ত পরিমাণের উপর নির্ভর করে। উত্তরাংশে আন্দোলন বেশী নাই, কিন্তু নিম্ন ও মধ্য ভাগে আন্দোলনের গুরুত্ব ঢের বেশী। এটা থেকে বাস্তবিক বুঝতে পারা যায় যে কারা এই আন্দোলনকারী। এবং এই আন্দোলনের মূলে যা রয়েছে তা নিছক অর্থনৈতিক ব্যাপার। এ সম্বন্ধেও গভর্ণমেন্ট বোলতে পারেন যে এ আন্দোলন চোলতে দিলে ক্রমশঃ সমস্ত পশ্চিম বঙ্গে ছড়িয়ে পড়বে। তাতে সন্দেহ নাই। কেন না সমস্ত পশ্চিম বঙ্গেই canal হওয়া উচিত। এবং হলে কিছু কিছু উপকার হবেই। কিন্তু এ সম্বন্ধে আমাদের বক্তব্য এই যে গভর্ণমেন্টের যে চিরাচরিত পদ্ধতি আছে—ঐ যে expert এর নামে বিদেশ থেকে আনাড়ি আনা হয় সেগুলি আমদানীর পরিবর্ত্তে আমাদের দেশেই ঢের ভাল expert আছে, তাদের দ্বারা অনেক বেশী ভালো কাজ পাওয়া যেতে পারে। বিদেশী expert দের দ্বারা শুধু টাকা এবং শ্রম ব্যর্থ হয়ে যায়। গভর্ণমেন্ট আর একটা নজির হয়তো দেখাবেন যে U. P. তে canal tax এর রেট, এর চেয়েও উচ্চ। কিন্তু সেখানকার canal আর এখানকার canal এর প্রভেদ বুঝতে হলে কোন expert knowledge এর দরকার করে না; সাধারণ চোখে দেখলেই বোঝা যায়। সেখানকার গঙ্গার canal আর যমুনার canal এর সঙ্গে তুলনায় এই দামোদর canal হচ্ছে নালা মাত্র। তাছাড়া সেখানকার কৃষকদের ১০০ ফুট, ২০০ ফুট গভীর কূপ থেকে জল সরবরাহ কোরতে যা cost পড়ে তার তুলনায় canal থেকে তারা যে supply পায় তা সেখানকার উচ্চতর rate এর পক্ষেও লাভজনক। এখানে যে সে রকম লাভজনক নয় তার প্রমাণ—আগের রেট ৫॥৹ টাকার স্থলে এক বৎসর আন্দোলনের পর ওদের তাঁরা জানিয়ে দিলেন যে বাকি, arrear, ২॥৹ টাকা রেটে দেবে; কিন্তু সেই সঙ্গে সঙ্গে কোন logic অনুসারে তাঁরা স্থির কোরলেন যে—এরপর থেকে canal ধরা হবে ৩॥৹ টাকা কোরে optional. তবু যে তারা লাভবান হতে পারে না তার প্রমাণ ১০ per cent. কৃষকও এই rate এ নিতে স্বীকার করেনি। আর খুব লাভজনকই যদি হতো, তাহলে গত বৎসর খুব সুবিধার ছিলো না কৃষকদের পক্ষে, গত বৈশাখ থেকে আষাঢ় মাস কোন বর্ষণ হয় নাই, কৃষকেরা যখন দেখলো যে শস্য জন্মানো কঠিন হবে তা সত্ত্বেও তারা তখন সাড়ে তিন টাকা rate এ contract করেনি canal এর জল নেওয়ার জন্যে। বর্দ্ধমানের কৃষকেরা যে ৩॥৹ টাকা reduduced rate জল নিতেও যে ক্ষতি মনে করে এটা তারি প্রকৃষ্ট প্রমাণ। গভর্ণমেন্টের কাছে আমার এই অনুরোধ যে এই সমস্যা——

Mr. A. M. A. ZAMAN : On a point of order, Sir. আমাদের এ side থেকে একটা serious matter এর উপর বঙ্কিম বাবু বক্তৃতা কোরছেন, আর ওদিকে Chief Minister গল্প জমিয়ে বসেছেন।

Mr. SPEAKER : It is no point of order, go on.

Mr. B. MUKHERJEE : গভর্ণমেন্টের কাছে আমার এই অনুরোধ যে পশ্চিম বঙ্গের Canal Scheme শুরু হোয়ে থাকে তাহলে তাঁদের উচিত হবে European expert নিযুক্ত কোরে বিপুল ব্যয়ভার বহন করবার আগে এখানকার expert দের সঙ্গে আলোচনা করেন এবং যাতে অল্প ব্যয়ে ভালো canal হয় তার জন্য চেষ্টা করেন।

Mrs. HEMAPRAVA MAZUMDAR : বর্দ্ধমান সম্বন্ধে যে স্থগিতের মোসন আনা হয়েছে আমি সেটা সমর্থন করি। আমি শুধু বোলতে চাই এই কথা, যে পরিস্থিতি সেখানে

বর্ত্তমানে হয়েছে এবং প্রজারা যে ভাবে সামনে এগিয়ে এসেছে তা দেখে বোধ হচ্ছে যে নিশ্চয়ই তারা মনে কোরেছে যে—আমাদের যে এই present Government এই হচ্ছে প্রজার বন্ধু এবং প্রজার দরদী। প্রজার মঙ্গলের জন্যই তাঁরা এখানে প্রতিষ্ঠিত হয়েছেন। আজ যেখানে প্রাণের যাতনা আর পেটের দায়ে চরম অবস্থায় এসে তারা উপস্থিত হয়েছে, সেখানে আমাদের সদাশয় গভর্ণমেণ্ট, যাঁরা নাকি হৃদয়ের অন্তস্থল থেকে বোলে বেড়ান যে প্রজার মঙ্গলের জন্যই তাঁরা এখানে বসেছেন, প্রজার, সেই মঙ্গলের ইতিহাস যদি এই ভাবেই গড়ে তোলা হয় তাহলে জানিনা এর ভবিষ্যৎ কোথায় গিয়ে দাঁড়াবে। তাই প্রজার বন্ধু সদাশয় মন্ত্রীমণ্ডলীর কাছে আমার বিনীত প্রশ্ন এই যে তারা যে কাগজে এবং বক্তৃতায় সকল সময়ই যে ভাবে প্রজা দরদী ভাবটা প্রচার করেন তাই সঙ্গে আজকে বর্দ্ধমানে যে পরিস্থিতি হয়েছে সেটা কি খাপ খায়? Law and Order সময় সময় প্রয়োজ্য, কিন্তু আজকে সেখানে পেটের দায়ে প্রজারা সামনে এসে দাঁড়িয়েছে এর জন্য যদি Law and Order এর অপপ্রয়োগদ্বারা তাদের সেই অগ্রগতিকে বন্ধ করা হয়—তাহলে আমি জানিনা প্রজার উপর এই যে দরদ সে শেষটায় কোথায় গিয়ে দাঁড়াবে। কাল বাজেটে বক্তৃতায় আমাদের অর্থসচীব মহোদয় অনেক লক্ষ টাকার দানের বন্যা বহিয়ে দিয়েছেন; অথচ বর্দ্ধমানের নিরন্ন কৃষকদের কাছ থেকে ৭ লক্ষ টাকা আদায়ের জন্য সেখানে army পাঠানোর দরকার কেন হলো আমি তো বুঝতে পারি না। আমি মন্ত্রীমণ্ডলীর সহায়তাকারী সভ্যবৃন্দ, যারা নাকি প্রজার দরদী হয়ে এখানে এসেছেন, প্রতিশ্রুতি দিয়েছেন যে তাদের মুখের অন্নের ব্যবস্থা করাই তাঁদের Assembly তে আসার উদ্দেশ্য, তাঁদের আজ আমি জিজ্ঞাসা করছি—এই ভাবে যদি প্রজার মুখে অন্ন দেওয়া হয়—তবে সে অন্ন কি প্রজার পেটে ছিড়ে পড়ে যাবে না? সেই জন্য আমার অনুরোধ বাজেটে যেখানে লক্ষ লক্ষ টাকা বহু দরিদ্রদের জন্য বরাদ্দ করা হয়েছে, সেখানে সাত লক্ষ টাকার জন্য কৃষক দরদী গভর্ণমেণ্টের পক্ষ থেকে এ রকম পরিস্থিতি উদ্ভব না করাই উচিত ছিল। যদি কৃষকদের দুঃখ প্রকৃতই বুঝে গভর্ণমেণ্ট সেই সব সৈন্য ফিরিয়ে নিয়ে আসেন, এবং বাইরের লোকের দ্বারা enquiry না করিয়ে,—তাঁরা তো অনেকটী আছেন,—যদি তাঁরা নিজেরা কেউ কেউ দয়া কোরে সেখানে যান এবং স্বচক্ষে যদি সব দেখেন তাহলে ব্যাপারটা সহজেই মিটতে পারে। বিলেত থেকে যারা আসেন, তারা পরের কথা শুনে কাজ করেন, কিন্তু দেশের লোকেরাই যেখানে মন্ত্রী এবং তাঁরা প্রজার ভাই, প্রজা দরদী—তাঁদের নিজেদের সেখানে বসে জিনিষটা পরিষ্কার কোরে দেওয়াই ভালো। যদি তাঁরা বাস্তবিকই প্রজার বন্ধু হয়ে থাকেন, তবে তাদের খাওয়ার ব্যবস্থা কোরতেই হবে। সামান্য সাত লক্ষ টাকার জন্য তাদের উপর repression চালানো উচিত নয়। মানুষের কাছে মানুষ মাত্রেরই দাবি আছে। তারা জানে যে আমাদের দেশের গভর্ণমেণ্টের আজ কালকার যারা মন্ত্রী তাঁরা তাদেরই মতন মানুষ, তাঁরাও দেশের ভাই। সেই নিরন্ন কৃষকদের নামে আমি নিবেদন জানাচ্ছি যে Law and Order এর মন্ত্রী মহাশয় যেন সেখানে গিয়ে স্বয়ং enquiry কোরে ব্যাপারটা পরিষ্কার কোরে দেন। আমার আর কিছু বলার নাই।

Mr. ADWAITA KUMAR MAJI: Mr. Speaker, Sir, আমি শ্রীযুক্ত প্রমথনাথ বন্দ্যোপাধ্যায় মহাশয়ের মুলতুবী প্রস্তাব সর্বান্তকরণে সমর্থন করিতেছি। এই প্রসঙ্গে Bengal Government থেকে ১০ই ফেব্রুয়ারীর অতিরিক্ত সংখ্যা কলিকাতা গেজেটে প্রচার করা হয়েছে, এবং কলকাতার কাগজেও উল্লেখ করা হয়েছে, যে কতকগুলি আন্দোলনকারী বর্দ্ধমানের canal অঞ্চলের প্রজাদের জল না নেবার জন্য জলকর না দেওয়ার জন্য প্ররোচিত কোরেছে। এ সম্পূর্ণ মিথ্যা; আমি একথার প্রতিবাদ কোরছি। কারণ চাষীরা কর-ভারে প্রপীড়িত হয়ে যখন জলকর এবং খাজনা দিতে পারে না তখন তারা জল নেয় না। এর ভিতর কোন বাইরেকার লোকের কথা একেবারেই উঠে না। আর এক কথা উল্লেখ করা হয়েছে যে বকেয়া খাজনা আদায়ের বিষয়ে সেখানকার কংগ্রেস কর্তৃপক্ষ কিছু তো সাহায্য করেই নি, বরং সেখানে তাদের বিরত করেছে। কিন্তু বর্দ্ধমান সদর মহকুমা কংগ্রেস কমিটির গত অধিবেশনে আমি উপস্থিত ছিলাম—সেখানে সমবেত প্রজাগণকে বোলে দেওয়া হয়েছে যে বাংলা ১৩৪২।৪৩ সালের যে সমস্ত বকেয়া canal জল আছে সে সমস্ত আদায় দিতে হবে এবং এই সংবাদ কোন কোন পত্রিকায় প্রকাশিত হয়েছিল।

আরো উল্লেখ করা হয়েছে যে বর্দ্ধমানের এরূপ অবস্থা যে সেখানে সংশোধিত ফৌজদারী আইনের ৭ ধারা ও ১৪৪ ধারা জারী না কোরলে তাকে ঠাণ্ডা রাখা যেতো না। এর উত্তরে আমার বক্তব্য এই যে বর্দ্ধমানের canal অঞ্চলে কত খানি জায়গা? তার জন্য সমস্ত জেলার মধ্যে ১৪৪ ধারা জারি কোরে বর্ত্তমান গভর্ণমেন্ট সম্পূর্ণ অবিবেচনার কাজ কোরেছেন। canal থেকে যে কি উপকার হোয়েছে—বর্দ্ধমান জেলাবাসী ও দেশবাসী সকলেই তা জানে। গভর্ণমেন্ট যে তদন্তকমিটি নিযুক্ত কোরেছিলেন সেই তদন্তকমিটি সিদ্ধান্ত কোরেছেন যে দামোদর ক্যানেল অঞ্চলে একরপ্রতি ২॥৴ জলকর কোন রকমে ধার্য্য করা যেতে পারে, যেহেতু ইহাই ক্যানেল পরিচালনার প্রকৃত ব্যয়; তা সত্ত্বেও কমিটির মধ্যে যারা ছিলেন তারা আলোচনা প্রসঙ্গে এই ব্যয় সঙ্কোচ করিবার কথা বলেছিলেন। গভর্ণমেন্ট সেকথায় কর্ণপাত করেন নাই; ইচ্ছামত ক্যানেল অধিবাসীর উপর একটা জলকর ধার্য্য করিয়া দিয়াছেন।—— (interruption) ——বর্দ্ধমান জেলাবাসীর দুর্ভাগ্যক্রমে সেখানকার একমাত্র ফসল ধান এবং সেই ধানের মূল্যও খুব কম, এ অবস্থায় Government ২॥৴ আনা হারে canal কর ধার্য্য না কোরে তারা ধোরেছেন—৩॥৹ টাকা ৪ টাকা। যদি অন্ততঃপক্ষে গভর্ণমেন্ট তদন্তকমিটির মত অনুযায়ী ২॥৴ আনা canal কর ধার্য্য কোরে প্রজাদের সুবিধা অনুযায়ী বকেয়া জলকর আদায়ের ব্যবস্থা কোরতেন তাহলে ভালো হতো। কিন্তু তা না কোরে সেই canal কর আদায় করবার জন্য বর্দ্ধমানে গারোয়ালী সৈন্য পাঠানের প্রয়োজন বর্ত্তমান গভর্ণমেন্ট কোন নীতি মূলে অনুভব কোরলেন বোঝা কঠিন ((Shame, Shame from the Congress side)) এ বিষয়ে আরো একটা ঘটনার কথা বোলছি। বর্ত্তমান বৎসর canal অঞ্চলের অধিবাসীরা canal থেকে জল নেয় নাই। সেখানকার প্রত্যেক অধিবাসী বোলেছিলো গভর্ণমেন্ট যে গতবৎসরের ধানের পরিমাণ করে দেখেছেন ক্যানালজল লইয়া চাষীরা কতবেশী ফসল পাইতেছে এ বৎসর আবার পরিমাণ করিয়া দেখা হউক canal হইতে জল না নেয়ায় প্রজারা কতবেশী ফসল পাইতেছে। canal বাসীদের পক্ষে খাজনা দেওয়া সম্ভব নয়। সেটা বিবেচনা না কোরে গভর্ণমেন্ট ভয় দেখিয়ে যে খাজনা ও কর আদায়ের ব্যবস্থা কোরেছেন সেজন্য কেউ গভর্ণমেন্টকে প্রসংশা কোরবে না। এবং আমার মনে হয়—বর্ত্তমান গভর্ণমেন্ট যদি বর্দ্ধমান জেলাবাসীর এই আবেদন গ্রাহ্য না করেন তাহলে উহা মোটেই প্রীতিজনক হবে না। তাহলে বর্ত্তমান মন্ত্রীমণ্ডল যে জনসাধারণের নাম নিয়ে তাদের কাজ চালাচ্ছেন তাহা মিথ্যা কথা হবে। আমি বোলছি canal সংক্রান্ত ব্যাপারে গভর্ণমেন্ট কর্তৃপক্ষের চেয়ে বেশী জানি। গত ৫ই ফেব্রুয়ারী তারিখে আমি ক্যানেল অঞ্চলে যেখানে (একটী নালা লইয়া গ্রামবাসীদের সত্যাগ্রহ চলিতেছিল) তাহার নিকটবর্ত্তী চুড়ফুল নামক গ্রামে উপস্থিত ছিলাম, সেখানকার অবস্থা বিশেষভাবে অবগত হইলাম, এবং আমি যাহা শুনিলাম তাহাতে মশা মারতে কামান দাগার মত গভর্ণমেন্ট যে সৈন্যবাহিনী প্রেরণ করেছেন এরূপ কোন ঘটনাই হয় নাই। কাল আমি যখন সেখানে উপস্থিত ছিলাম তখন দেখেছি District Magistrate সদর S. D. O. এবং পুলিশ সাহেব সকলেই উপস্থিত হয়েছিলেন, এই সব অবস্থায় যদি দেশবাসীর এবং canal এর অধিবাসীদের মনে আতঙ্কের সঞ্চার হয় সেরূপ পরিস্থিতির জন্য গভর্ণমেন্টকেই দায়ী হোতে হবে। কাজেই সে সমস্ত অবস্থা দূর করা উচিত।

Mr. SUKUMAR DUTTA: On a point of information, Sir. Is it a fact that a member of the Cabinet has resigned on account of the hopeless inefficiency——

Mr. SPEAKER: Order, order. That question does not arise.

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: Sir, the strength of the justice of a case is shown by the speeches that are made in support of it, and especially the speech of a mover of motion of adjournment is a real test. My friend Dr. Pramatha Nath Banerjee.....(Rai HARENDRA

NATH CHAUDHURI: He is not a Doctor, he is simply a Mr.).....I am sorry. ...Mr. Pramatha Nath Banerjee made it clear in his speech that he means no censure on Government; he has no grievance as regards the action taken by Government; all that he wants is consideration of the question from the human point of view and whether he can succeed in his attempt at a further reduction of the rates. And what does he base it on? He bases it on the fact that the districts in Bengal suffered from two calamities—one flood, and the other, drought. So far as Burdwan is concerned, drought was the main trouble, and as there is distress in that area, Government should consider the question of the high canal rate. Now, before I proceed any further, I would like to point out the grave fallacy that he is guilty of. If this question is merely one of drought, then I may say that the canal is there and the water is there and surely drought cannot affect all areas which could have been irrigated by means of canal water. Then he has said it in the course of his speech that for the last 3 or 4 years Burdwan has been suffering from distress owing to failure of crops. He has apparently forgotten the facts. I don't think that even the mightiest champion of the reduction of canal rates will come forward and say that in the canal area during the last three years the people have been getting bumper crops and that there has been no distress whatever in that area. In 1935, when the crops totally failed in the whole of the Burdwan district, as far as the canal rate itself was concerned, there was a bumper crop, a perfect crop, and not only was it admitted by everybody but, as far as I am concerned, I personally visited that area—at that time I happened to be the Member in charge of Irrigation (Mr. PRAMATHA NATH BANERJEE: It was our misfortune)—and in that area there was no question of the people of that area not being ten times better off than the rest of the Burdwan district. (Mr. PRAMATHA NATH BANERJEE: Only ten times! Add another zero.)

Now, Sir, the point which is of importance is that here a definite issue has been raised, viz., an organised effort is being made to refuse to pay the Government dues. Now, as far as the dues are concerned, they were originally assessed at the rate of Rs. 5-8. On representations, and in view of the special circumstances of the Burdwan district, and on the recommendation of the committee, it was reduced to Rs. 2-9. Most of these arrears are due to the non-payment of the canal rate at the rate of Rs. 2-9.

Mr. PRAMATHA NATH BANERJEE: May I correct the Hon'ble Minister that the rate was Rs. 2-9 only for two years, but for the last three years, including this year, it is Rs. 3 or Rs. 4, as I made it quite clear in my speech?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: I don't think, Sir, that the honourable member is correct, because, according to the speech of

the honourable member, in 1937, the Bengal Development Act was enforced; in 1938 this Act was withdrawn and the Irrigation Act was enforced. Now, if I accept Mr. Bankim Mukherji's statement that only ten per cent. of the people made contracts, then the amount due in 1938 is practically nothing. Therefore, the major portion—practically 80 or 90 per cent. of the seven lakhs—is due on account of the rate of Rs. 2-9 which was reduced from Rs. 5-8.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will you please look up the Gazette? It mentions Rs. 3-8-0 and Rs. 4-0-0.

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: Rupees 3-8 was the rate for the year 1938 in which year the Irrigation Act was enforced, and for 1938, according to Mr. B. Mukharji's statement, only ten per cent. of the people made contracts. So far as that year was concerned, the amount would be a very small one. The major portion of the amount is for arrears due under the Development Act at the rate of Rs. 2-9. (Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: And Rs. 5-8 also.) No, not Rs. 5-8, because it was reduced to Rs. 2-9 under the Development Act on the recommendation of the committee. So, how can it be Rs. 5-8? The amount of Rs. 5,78,000 is due for arrears calculated at the rate of Rs. 2-9. Now, therefore, what is the position? Government have acceded to the representations made here. They appoint a committee, they accept that committee's recommendations, and on those recommendations the rate is reduced, and now the people are refusing to pay a rate which has been reduced below 50 per cent. Now, the position is that this is not due to the fact that the people cannot pay or are unwilling to pay. The real reason is that people with political motives and on political grounds have been carrying on a propaganda for the last two or three years in that area, and the reason why this thing has come up now is that these people have gone and told the villagers "If you refuse to pay tax, if you only start a boycott movement, then your rates will be reduced further and possibly you may get off without paying anything." I am sure that there can be no condemnation greater or punishment severer for the people who mislead ignorant and illiterate cultivators and get them to do things which are likely to land them in serious trouble. It is this pernicious propaganda which has misled these people. It is not a question of inability to pay. It is not the question that the people have got any real grievance, but the people have been told: "If you simply carry on propaganda, if you simply refuse to pay, if you go on not paying your current rates, you will get the Government to reduce the rate still further and ultimately you may get off without paying anything." If Mr. B. Mukherji says that this canal serves no useful purpose, then he should have no grievance. That is one of the reasons

why Government have withdrawn the Bengal Development Act from that area and have placed it under the Irrigation Act which makes it optional. If a man thinks that it is going to benefit him, if a man thinks that it is going to be a paying proposition for him to pay Rs. 4 or Rs. 3 then he can take the water. If as Mr. B. Mukherji says that the water, if it is taken, will not produce good crops, then don't take the water. In that case, no cultivator is foolish enough to incur a liability of Rs. 4 or Rs. 3-8. Therefore, we have made it optional, and no cultivator is bound to take water unless he thinks that it is going to be worth while for him to do so. So, the question of Rs. 4 or Rs. 3-8 being too high or being a burden on the cultivators of Bengal or oppressive to the cultivators or being unfair to the Projas is absolutely misleading, and as one speaker said: "The cultivator may take water in the year in which there is severe drought." Then it will be worth while for him to pay Rs. 4 or Rs. 3-8, because in that year other people will get no crops or may get 2 as. or 4 as. crops and the men who take canal water will get 16 as. crops. Therefore, it will be worth while for him to take the water and pay Rs. 4. In other parts of the Burdwan district, people pay Rs. 6 and take water. I therefore fail to see wherein lies the injustice, hardship or unfairness towards the cultivators. But the question is not that. The question is that the Congress and those who belong to the communist party are trying deliberately to foment agitation and create disaffection among the illiterate people and mislead them and get them into difficulties.

Mr. SANTOSH KUMAR BASU: Do not give them handle.

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: That is why Government do not want to give them handle. They have taken steps to see that those who are misleading these people are removed from that area and that is the reason why section 7 has been promulgated so that the ring-leaders—people who are trying to mislead the innocent men—can be got at, because otherwise it will be the poor cultivators who will have to face the police and not the leaders who stand at the back and mislead the people. Therefore Government have taken steps to get at the leaders. At the same time, I am appealing to the members of the Coalition Party and specially those who represent the district of Burdwan to go and explain to the people how they are being misguided and how they are being misled. They should also explain to them that no Government can be run unless the legal dues of Government are paid. Government have already tried their best to explain this to the people. The District Magistrate himself has toured the area. Now, if the non-official members of this House representing the Burdwan district and belonging to the Coalition Party impress this

fact upon them, they will not only be serving the cause of the suffering and protecting the poor men but they will also be rendering great service.

(Interruption by Dr. Nalinaksha Sanyal and others from the Opposition side.)

Mr. SPEAKER: Dr. Sanyal, I am surprised to find that after I appealed to the members not to interrupt in the midst of a speech which is perfectly intelligible to you, you are still persisting in doing so.

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: Persistent efforts are being made in this area and also in other areas of Bengal to mislead the tenantry, the peasantry and the cultivators, and what Government are trying to enforce is the principle that no Government can be run unless their legal dues are paid. Mrs. Hemaprava Mazumdar has laid great stress on the *Prajadarada* Ministers but she must remember that even a mother smacks a naughty child. I like to draw the attention of the members of the House, and the general public through this House, that nothing is more wrong, nothing can be more injurious for the people of Bengal than to go about saying that the people should not pay their legal dues. It has been shown here that no injustice has been done on anybody, that Government have taken into consideration the special grievances of the people of Burdwan, and that even in spite of the fact that the Committee, on which not only the Opposition and Government but also the members of the Coalition Party were represented, had considered that Rs. 5-8 was a fair rate and had recommended Rs. 2-9 as a special case, Government accepted that recommendation——

Maulvi ABUL HASHEM: They did not recommend so.

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: They did not recommend but they were represented on the Committee (cries of "Hear, hear" from the Opposition side). One of the members has said that members of the Coalition Party were there. That shows more clearly that Government are not influenced by their own Party and they do not do anything unless they are satisfied that it is right. Honourable members know very well that if this sort of agitation is carried on no man in the world can get support in his favour. It is this pernicious propaganda, that "you must not pay your rightful dues," is the cause of this trouble. The object of having a large number of police is not that the people should be assaulted but to make the public understand that the Congress has been misleading them and that they are mistaken in not paying their legal dues and that Government are determined to

realise their dues. Any amount of propaganda against it and any amount of misrepresentation of facts will not deter Government from doing their duty.

I am glad to tell the House that already Government action has had its effect and we have been able to arrest the volunteers without any trouble whatsoever. What is more, as far as the principle of fighting the Satyagraha movement is concerned, I am sure the members sitting on my left have got no right to say anything against it. That is a principle well-recognised by their Party and wherever they are in power they are enforcing it with vengeance. We have always recognised the necessity of such steps, but those who were opposed to this principle and so long held up their hands in horror in enforcing the Criminal Law Amendment Act have also now recognised the necessity of such enforcement. We have always enforced the Criminal Law Amendment Act and it is nothing new with us, but it is something new for the members of the party on my left, and what is more, no Government can carry on without section 144. It is the first and foremost duty of every Government to see that their legal dues are collected. Now, Government announced their decision about the canal rates on the 21st April. This matter could have been brought up in the Assembly but it was never brought up. Therefore it is the duty of Government to realise the legal dues, otherwise the Legislature can take Government to task for not realising their legal dues. Government's bounden duty is to see that a thing that has been approved by the Legislature is carried into effect. Rupees 7 lakhs of Government dues are outstanding. It is not a small sum as has been represented. Over and above the question of amount, it is a question of principle. No Government can function unless their legal dues are realised. As far as the question of distress is concerned, there is none in the area. I find, at any rate, that the people of the Canal area are better off than the people of any other part of the Burdwan district and I can say this without any fear of contradiction. On top of that, the tax has been made optional, the taking of water is optional and therefore there can be no hardship on anyone whatsoever. Moreover, the amount of rate has been reduced from Rs. 5-8 to Rs. 2-9. So I maintain there is no justification for any change of policy on the part of Government and Government hope to realise their dues without any difficulty.

Mr. W. C. WORDSWORTH: I regret that I was unavoidably absent from the House when this discussion began, and it is hard to adjust one's thoughts to the course of a debate of which only part has been heard. I am told that the mover of the resolution spoke temperately and with restraint, with only a few harsh adjectives as a concession to the conventions of our debates. I do not know whether any European uses the waters of the Damodar Canal. But this group for which I speak has never disinterested itself in the project, knowing

the canal to be an important addition to the province's economic equipment. Members of this group have studied the project carefully, some at times have made informed speeches about it, Mr. Hendry on our behalf sat on one of the committees and contributed a note of dissent that in our opinion should have had more influence than it has been permitted to have. Recently we have studied the canal's affairs again, but without modifying our opinion, which is that a large work of construction meant to benefit materially a section of the people should be paid for, capital, interest and administration costs, by those who derive material advantage from it; reductions and remissions when necessary to be made temporarily as acts of grace; the temporary difficulties of some should not be accepted as a convincing argument for a general reduction of charges to a level that destroys the financial structure of the enterprise. The canal is an addition to the province's welfare. That is admitted. But only some get material profit from it. And if they escape paying their proper share of the cost it means that others who get nothing from it are unfairly burdened.

The canal is a great work. It was clamoured for for years. It was projected for years. Like Rome, the Victoria Memorial, and this Council House, it was not built in a day. And now we are told those who clamoured for it do not want it. We read, and hear, it called a curse and a terror, because those who use the water are expected to pay for it. It is considered an outrage that they should be asked to pay at even the modest and unprofitable rate to which Government has under pressure reduced it. Especially, it is contended, since the Government of India cancelled the loan by which it had been built. Accounting however is a peculiar art: this cancellation left things much as they were, for the Government of India also kept for itself Bengal's balances.

It is said, the peasants do not want the water. Who say so? Not the peasants. Mr. Townend not long ago found about 1,000 objectors (their objections were varied, not all objected to having the water) among some 43,000 assessees. Also the House knows that the rate has been reduced to Rs. 2-9 an acre, and that use of the water is wholly optional. This contrasts with Government policy in another sphere, in which before long, the Finance Minister warned us yesterday in reference to the excise revenue, we may all find the use of water compulsory. The truth is, we suppose here, that most peasants want the water, but many are persuaded by those who have persuasive tongues rather than any direct interest in water or fields that it is foolish to pay for it. There is grumbling because the charge is the same in wet years, as in dry. That is because the finances of these large works must be arranged on averages, so that good years pay for bad. None of us is able to find an insurance office that will let us off the annual premium in years when we feel particularly fit. Again, it is made a grievance that peasants who wait till the last moment cannot get all

the water they demand at once when it is seen the monsoon will not break early. Again I point out that no insurance company will permit us to insure our lives at their very end, when it is clear that they will soon cease to be our lives.

How far are the merits and demerits of the canal administration in question here? We all deplore the trouble and unrest in the canal area. But is it not, in part anyhow, connected with to-day's widespread encouragement to refuse and disregard obligations of all kinds? And is there not, in this House, as elsewhere, too manifest a disposition to sympathize with those who do try to disregard their obligations? Not that we all do not sympathize with men who dislike paying their water rates. Do we not all pay our rents, rates, taxes, cesses, debts in anger and in sorrow? But so long as they are paid society keeps healthy. It is when men instead of looking them in the face pass by on the other side that social and economic disaster comes. The encouragement of a subversive mentality with especially the purpose of embarrassing Government has gone too far in this province, and it is Government's duty to resist it by all legitimate means in the interest of the general welfare, of the law abiding, of the peasants who wish to take their water and pay for it quietly, and of the officials who, because they do their duty and try to collect Government's dues, are with their families insulted, boycotted, persecuted.

Mr. P. BANERJI: In rising to support the motion moved by Mr. P. N. Banerjee I must first begin with the last speaker, Mr. Wordsworth, the representative of the European Group. Mr. Wordsworth was referring to Mr. Townend, the Development Commissioner, who adduced certain arguments at the time of discussion of the Bengal Development Bill and told us that the country particularly the Division of Burdwan, would be flowing with milk and honey. Now Mr. Townend is not here as Development Commissioner. He is now the Commissioner of the Burdwan Division. As Commissioner of the Division he has found that there is neither milk nor honey, but only stones and thorns. It is a fact that in those days when this Act was passed—if I may refresh the memory of the Hon'ble Minister who was then the Member for Irrigation—Government were able to come to grips with the situation if they were well advised. Sir Bijoy knows it very well that by this canal the old natural system was totally dislocated depriving those tenants of water which they were getting without taxation. The same was the case with the Eden Canal area. Then taxation was much less. To begin with, originally, 50 years ago, it was only 8 annas; it was then raised to 12 annas and then to Rs. 1-8. That was the position before this Act was passed. Now, Sir, the question is not that. The question is, as Mr. Wordsworth

has pointed out, that certain charges have been contracted at certain rates—and that too at the reduced rate of Rs. 2-9. So the tenant must stand by the contract.

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: The Development Act has nothing to do with the Eden Canal area.

Mr. P. BANERJI: I know it very well, Maharaja, just as well as you do—I am now speaking of the contract—whether the contract is to be respected. That was the only argument put forward by Mr. Wordsworth in supporting Government, or rather, in opposing the motion. Such contracts in other sphere have been made void, in consideration of the inability of the tenants to pay.

Mr. FAZLUR RAHMAN: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I beg to move that the question be now put.

Mr. P. BANERJI: Not at the time when I am speaking. I am in possession of the House now.

Mr. FAZLUR RAHMAN: May I have your ruling, Sir, if I am entitled to move that the question be now put in the midst of a speech?

Mr. SPEAKER: So far as the rules are concerned you can do it at any time, but by a sort of general agreement it has been the practice hitherto not to do so till one member finishes unless his speech has become so boring that the members are tired.

Mr. P. BANERJI: Apart from the convention, ordinary courtesy demands that when a brother member is in possession of the House he should at least be given a hearing.

Mr. FAZLUR RAHMAN: It is only a repetition of the same arguments.

Mr. P. BANERJI: Have patience and you will see that I will not repeat the same arguments.

Now Mr. Wordsworth was opposing this motion and supporting the Government. He was justifying their promulgation of section 144 and their sending military to that area to terrorise the people into submission. Now this justification, Sir, always by the European Group in this House, I consider, has been the misfortune of this country resulting always in disturbance of peace and tranquillity in the country. Sir, in the name of law and order, Government have always created lawlessness and disorder in the countryside. I have often said and have warned the Government that if they took extreme steps they should be prepared for the consequence. The result was that Government suffered loss not on one side but on both sides and the same argument, that it was all due to the political activities or propoganda of the Congress or the Communists, have been repeated to-day by the Hon'ble Minister in justification of his action, I challenge that statement and say that the Congress had no hand in the matter.

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: The Congress President has issued manifestoes.

Mr. P. BANERJI: Now, Sir, the Hon'ble the Chief Minister knows it very well that when he was a member of the Committee which went to enquire into the situation at Midnapore he was a signatory to that memorable document.

Now, Sir, because these members have been hard hit by the statement of bare truths which neither the Hon'ble Ministers nor their supporters can refute, they have so often been raising the motion to terminate the debate so abruptly.

Sir, the members on the other side have attacked the Congress for fomenting an agitation where there was no genuine grievance of the tenantry. I submit that that argument has no basis to stand upon, because this grievance is real and genuine. We have often seen the members of the Treasury Bench as also their supporters of the Coalition Party shedding crocodile tears as people's real representatives, having always the interests of the tenants at heart, but I ask, can any real representative of the people of Burdwan, support Sir Nazimuddin whose argument was most fallacious and reactionary in character—arguments that cannot stand a moment's scrutiny. The only argument of Sir Nazimuddin is that the Congress is behind it and that is the only reason why the peasants in those areas have refused payment of their dues. But from my own personal experience—and I have travelled far in the interior not only of Burdwan district but the entire Burdwan Division during the last ten years and have been in intimate

touch with the situation there—I can say that this is a genuine grievance which has also been supported by the other members who have personal experience in the matter, but Sir Nazimuddin must have his "pound of flesh"—even at the point of the bayonet.

(At this stage, the member having reached the time-limit, resumed his seat.)

Several Members: Sir, the question be now put.

(As Mr. Speaker was going to put the motion that the question be now put, Dr. Nalinaksha Sanyal rose to his feet and intimated his desire to speak on the motion.)

Mr. SPEAKER: But the motion, Dr. Sanyal, that the question be now put, has actually been put, and that has got to be disposed of first of all.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: That was for the boring speech just delivered, Sir. (Laughter.)

The motion that the question be now put, was then put and agreed to.

The main question before the House that the business of the Assembly do now adjourn to discuss a definite matter of urgent public importance and of recent occurrence, namely, the situation arising out of the notification No. 656P., extending the provisions of section 7 of the Criminal Law (Amendment) Act, 1932, and the promulgation of section 144, Criminal Procedure Code, for operation in certain parts of Burdwan district, was then put and lost.

Time-limit of speeches on the General Discussion of the Budget.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Before you adjourn the House, Sir, may I enquire what will be the procedure about the meetings of the Assembly in connection with the general discussion of the Budget, so far as time-limits are concerned?

Mr. SPEAKER: Before I adjust the time-table for the general discussion of the Budget, I request the leaders of the different groups to let me have a complete list of speakers by Monday before the House begins. I shall arrange the time-table if the leaders will inform me beforehand how many speakers each of them will put up, after exercising a certain amount of discretion and judgment.

Adjournment.

The Assembly was adjourned till 4·45 p.m. on Monday, the 20th February, 1939, at the Assembly House, Calcutta.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Assembly assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act, 1935.

THE ASSEMBLY met in the Assembly House, Calcutta, on Monday, the 20th February, 1939, at 4-45 p.m.

Present:

Mr Speaker (the Hon'ble Khan Bahadur M. AZIZUL HAQUE, C.I.E.) in the Chair, 11 Hon'ble Ministers and 211 members.

Oath.

The following member made his oath of allegiance to the Crown:—

Mr. David Hendry.

STARRED QUESTIONS

(to which oral answers were given)

Complaints against Subdivisional Officer, Balurghat.

*22. **Mr. NISHITHA NATH KUNDU:** (*a*) With reference to the answer (*d*) to question No. 14 of the statement laid on the table on the 29th July, 1938, containing replies to questions unanswered in the February-April Session, 1938, will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Home Department be pleased to state whether it is a fact that in case of Sridam Sardar the Subdivisional Officer, Balurghat, refused bail in a bailable offence?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the District and Sessions Judge, Dinajpur, in his judgment and order, dated the 29th June, 1937, in Criminal Miscellaneous petition No. 5 of 1937, against the order refusing bail to Sridam Sardar made certain observations against the Subdivisional Officer and ordered for immediate release of the petitioner on bail and also expressed his desire for an enquiry into the matter without delay?

(*c*) If the answer to (*b*) is in the affirmative, was an enquiry made, and if so, with what result?

(*d*) Is it a fact that the District and Sessions Judge, Dinajpur, in his aforesaid order and judgment drew particular attention of the District Magistrate—

(*i*) to the action of the Magistrate in refusing to accept private persons as sureties; and

(*ii*) to the action of the Muktears in not standing as sureties when licensed to do so?

(*e*) When did Mr. Gour Chandra Mandal, the Subdivisional Officer, Balurghat, take charge of the subdivision?

MINISTER in charge of the HOME DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Khwaja Sir Nazimuddin): (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) and (*d*) A copy of the order of the District and Sessions Judge, dated 29th June, 1937, is laid on the table.

(*c*) The District Magistrate held an enquiry; the facts and the law were elucidated and a circular instruction was issued to the Magistrates.

(*e*) 22nd November, 1935.

Statement referred to in answer to clauses (a) and (d) to starred Question No. 22.

IN THE COURT OF THE SESSIONS JUDGE OF DINAJPUR.

Criminal Miscellaneous Petition No. 5 of 1937.

Sridam Sardar—Petitioner.

Order.

29th June, 1937. Heard pleader for petitioner. No appearance for the Crown. The District Magistrate asked yesterday for time but I am not disposed to grant it as all the materials are contained in the certified copies filed.

The petitioner is accused of a bailable offence and for some reason his Muktear has surrendered him. The petitioner then tried to give security of a private person and the Magistrate ordered that a private person cannot be accepted as surety.

I should have thought that a private person as surety was preferable to a Muktear who merely adopts this as a profession and has no real interest in his client. I should, however, be interested to know what the learned Magistrate's authority is for saying that private persons

cannot be accepted as sureties. The curious position exists in this district that in one subdivision a Magistrate at one time was not disposed to accept Muktears as sureties and now another Magistrate insists on having no one else.

A consideration which does not appear to weigh at all is that the rights of the subject are interfered with. If a man is accused of a bailable offence, he has a right to offer bail and to have the fitness of his proposed surety enquired into honestly with the least possible delay. A case of this description would not be tolerated under English law and I do not see why it should be allowed to pass unnoticed under Indian law.

I have a shrewd suspicion that the difficulty over bail has arisen because the petitioner wants to move the High Court for a transfer of his case. The last sentence of the Magistrate's order of 23rd June, 1937, seems to give the clue to the whole matter and, as only Muktears are to be allowed to stand surety, it is very easy for certain persons to dissuade them from doing so

The petitioner will be released on bail *at once* in the amount of Rs. 100 on the security either of a Muktear or a private person, whichever is offered.

The attention of the District Magistrate is particularly drawn (1) to the action of the Magistrate in refusing to accept private persons as sureties, (2) to the action of the Muktears said to be under undue pressure in not standing as sureties when licensed to do so. It appears to me that an enquiry into this matter should be held without delay.

Sd. T. B. JAMESON,

Sessions Judge.

Mr. NISHITHA NATH KUNDU: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what is the substance of the circular that has been issued?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: I ask for notice, Sir.

Mr. NISHITHA NATH KUNDU: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to tell us if there is any special reason for keeping the Subdivisional Officer at one station for more than three years?

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise.

Calcutta Khilafat Committee.

*23. **Maulvi ABU HOSSAIN SARKAR:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Home (Political) Department aware of the existence of an organisation in Calcutta named the Khilafat Committee?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to make a statement as to—

(*i*) its origin, history and activities, past and present;

(*ii*) the number of members of the said bodies in Calcutta proper, and that of the *mufassal* branch or branches; and

(*iii*) its constitution, if any, and the names of the present executives?

(*c*) Is it a fact—

(*i*) that some members of this organisation took active part in organising communal demonstration which was taken objection to by some prominent members of the Assembly during the no-confidence motion discussion; and

(*ii*) that in answer to the charges then brought forward, the present Premier promised to enquire into the charges and to bring to book those organisers if they were found guilty?

(*d*) If the answer to (*c*) (*ii*) be in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether any step was taken to fulfil the promise of the Premier?

(*e*) If no steps were taken, what are the reasons?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: (*a*) and (*b*) I am aware of of its existence but the details of its history and constitution are not within my special cognisance and the information is not readily available.

(*c*) (*i*) I regret that I have not been able to appreciate to what demonstration the honourable member refers.

(*ii*) A careful examination of the proceedings reveals no undertaking in the terms suggested.

(*d*) and (*e*) Do not arise

Mr. SYED JALALUDDIN HASHEMY: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the Hon'ble Mr. H. S. Suhrawardy is the President of the Khilafat Committee?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: I am not aware of it.

Mr. SYED JALALUDDIN HASHEMY: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether the Hon'ble the Home Minister himself is a member of the said Khilafat Committee?

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise.

Prisoners' food in jails.

*24. **Mr. ATUL KRISHNA GHOSE:** (a) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Home (Jails) Department aware of the fact—

(i) that the prisoners in jails do not get any food whatsoever from 11 a.m. to 7 p.m.;

(ii) that all this long period they have got to labour; and

(iii) that due to this arrangement the prisoners in the Husking and Ghunny Department who have got to undergo hard labour feel extremely hungry?

(b) Will the Government consider the desirability of sanctioning one anna more per head so that these prisoners may have some food at 3 p.m.

(c) Will the Government be pleased to state the reason why the Ghunny Department is to be worked out by human beings?

(d) Will the Government consider the desirability of running the Ghunny Department by bullocks and not by men?

(e) Will the Government consider the desirability of allowing the prisoners to smoke?

(f) Is it a fact that the prisoners who clean the refuse are given *biris* to smoke?

(g) If the answer to (f) is in the affirmative, will the Government be pleased to state on what principle this is being done?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: (a) The facts are not as stated in the question.

(b) Does not arise.

(c) to (e) The conditions of oil mill labour and suggestions for privileges such as smoking are now under consideration.

(f) Yes.

(g) It is a concession to convicts who volunteer for an unpleasant duty.

Dr. SURESH CHANDRA BANERJEE: এ জিনিষটা কতদিন যাবৎ বিচারাধীন মাননীয় মন্ত্রী মহাশয় বোলবেন কি?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: Sir, I would like to remind honourable members of this House that questionnaires were circulated and replies received, and Government have come to certain decisions and have asked the Inspector-General of Prisons to put up definite proposals.

Attacks on Hindu processions by non-Hindus.

***25. Rai HARENDRA NATH CHAUDHURI:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Home (Political) Department be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing for the last six months—

(*i*) how many Hindu processions have been obstructed or attacked by non-Hindus mentioning the names of the places and the dates of such obstruction or attack; and

(*ii*) on how many occasions images of gods and goddesses worshipped by the Hindus have been attacked and broken and Hindu temples defiled during the period mentioning the names of places and the dates where such incidents have occurred?

(*b*) What steps, if any, do the Government propose to take to protect the Hindu community from such molestation and to ensure lawful pursuit of their rights and religious observances?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: (*a*) The information is not readily available.

(*b*) All communities are entitled to and will receive the full protection of the law.

Revision of Jail Codes.

***26. Rai HARENDRA NATH CHAUDHURI:** Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Home (Jail) Department be pleased to state—

(*a*) when and on what lines the Government is going to undertake the revision of the Jail Code;

(*b*) whether he is aware that other provinces have already taken up this matter; and

(*c*) whether his attention has been drawn to the lines on which prison administration and treatment of prisoners in jails have been improved of late in England?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: (*a*) The Bengal Jail Code was last revised in 1937. The question of further revision will be taken up as soon as it becomes necessary.

(*b*) I have no information.

(*c*) Yes.

Grievances of fishermen of Bengal.

*27. **Mr. MONMOHAN DAS:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Revenue Department aware—

(*i*) that the fishermen of Bengal such as *Jhalu Malas*, or *Malos* and *Jalia Kaibartas* are the most backward people;

(*ii*) that fishery is the only means of their livelihood;

(*iii*) that the fishermen have no fixed and permanent right and title in fishery;

(*iv*) that the fishermen are to undergo various troubles and oppressions of the landlords in fishery, i.e., in Jalmahal; and

(*v*) that the landlords of Jalmahal realise rent both from the old and the new tenants for the same Jalmahal?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble Minister considering the desirability of instituting an inquiry into the grievances of the fishermen of Bengal with particular reference to those of Kishorganj and Netrokona subdivisions, district Mymensingh, in the matter of every year temporary lease in *Mahals* No. 5114, 7440, 7441, 7442, 7443, 7444, 7445, 7446, of Pargana Nashirujial, district Mymensingh?

MINISTER in charge of the REVENUE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Bijoy Prasad Singh Roy): (*a*) (*i*) They are included in the Scheduled Castes.

(*ii*) This is generally the case.

(*iii*) They hold under annual or periodical leases in most cases, which are often granted to the highest bidders.

(*iv*) Not to the knowledge of Government.

(*v*) Government are not aware of any such case.

(*b*) Government have already appointed a Special Officer to enquire into the matter. The particular cases mentioned will be brought to his notice.

Mr. RASIK LAL BISWAS: মন্ত্রী মহাশয় দয়া কোরে বোলবেন কি Special Officer যে appointed হয়েছেন, তিনি কতদিন হলো appointed হয়েছেন?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: Sir, I think he was appointed in last November.

Mr. RASIK LAL BISWAS: মন্ত্রী মহাশয় দয়া করে বোলবেন কি এই report কত দিনে বেরুবে ?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: The report is expected in the course of this year.

Babu KSHETRA NATH SINGHA: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether lease was given not to the highest bidder but to the bidder who did not bid higher than one belonging to the fisherman class?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: Generally, leases are given to the highest bidders.

Babu MADHUSUDAN SARKER: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether Government are prepared to consider the desirability of reducing rent inasmuch as fishery rights are covered by the Bengal Tenancy Act and whether they are prepared to give special privileges to the fishermen classes?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: Sir, it all depends upon the report of the Special Officer appointed to enquire into the whole problem.

Maulvi MUHAMMAD ISRAIL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the terms of appointment of the Special Officer?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: I ask for notice.

Non-agriculturist tenants.

***28. Mr. NISHITHA NATH KUNDU:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Revenue Department aware of the hardship caused to the non-agriculturist tenants residing within the municipalities or having their homesteads and shops or stalls in market, bazar or *chandina* lands by the existing law of ejectment and in absence of any law restricting enhancement of rents?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, are the Government considering the desirability of bringing in legislative measure to ameliorate their condition?

(*c*) If so, when do they propose to bring in a Bill in this Assembly?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: (*a*) Government have received suggestions to this effect from time to time.

(*b*) A committee has been appointed by Government to investigate the rights of the tenants of non-agricultural lands in the province and to make recommendations as to what can be done to protect the tenants from eviction at the will of the landlords.

(*c*) After the report of the committee is received and considered Government will decide their line of action.

Mr. ABDULLA-AL MAHMOOD: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state as to when this committee was formed and whether it ever sat?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: Yes, Sir, the committee had one or two meetings, and it was formed in last September so far I remember.

Mr. NISHITHA NATH KUNDU: Was any direction given to the committee for gathering statistics regarding enhancement of rents from different classes of non-agriculturist tenants?

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise. The committee has been appointed under a notification in the *Gazette*, and as such the terms of reference have been published in the *Gazette*.

Mr. NISHITHA NATH KUNDU: In question (*a*) I enquired if Government were aware of the hardship caused to the non-agriculturist tenants residing in certain areas.

Mr. SPEAKER: That has been answered, I believe.

Mr. NISHITHA NATH KUNDU: I submit, Sir, that it has not been answered. The last two sentences of my question have not been answered.

Mr. SPEAKER: What do you want to know?

Mr. NISHITHA NATH KUNDU: I want to know whether the committee has anything to do with regard to enhancement of rents?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: The terms of reference are very wide and it is not possible for me to reproduce them from memory.

Mr. NISHITHA NATH KUNDU: Sir, I only want to know whether the terms of reference include restriction of enhancement of rent?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: I ask for notice.

Statistics of invalid, infirm and deformed persons in Bengal.

*29. **Mr. SASANKA SEKHAR SANYAL:** Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Home (Political) Department aware—

(*i*) of the existence of a large number of invalid, infirm and deformed persons in this province of various degrees and descriptions;

(*ii*) whether Government have any statistics or method of obtaining statistics of such persons in each district;

(*iii*) whether a portion of such persons can be usefully employed in different kinds of productive and other occuptions;

(*iv*) whether Government have in contemplation any scheme for dealing with such persons;

(*v*) if so, what; and

(*vi*) if not, why not?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: The statistical information is not available and there is no machinery for the compulsory registration of invalids, infirm, and deformed persons. Their employment is primarily a matter for private and local enterprise and Government have no proposal before them for legislation on the subject.

Representation regarding Ishurdi-Pabna-Sadhuganj Railway Project.

*30. **Maulvi AZHAR ALI:** Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Communications and Works Department be pleased to state—

(*i*) the number of representations received by the Department of Communications and Works, regarding Ishurdi-Pabna-Sadhuganj Railway Project, since the 1st September, 1938;

(*ii*) how many of them were—

(*a*) in favour of, and

(*b*) against the construction of the abovenoted line;

(*iii*) whether the department has received a note regarding the said project from Mr. Ashutosh Lahiri, B.C.E., retired District Engineer of Rangpur, challenging the Railway Board and

the Eastern Bengal Railway Administration to take up contract of the line at Rs. 40,00,000 in place of Rs. 59,00,000 estimated by the Eastern Bengal Railway Administration, as capital outlay for the project;

(iv) whether according to Mr. A. T. Lahiri's note, the return on the capital expenditure would come up to nearly 7 per cent. in place of 4·25 per cent. as estimated by the Eastern Bengal Railway authorities; and

(v) whether it has been worked out on Mr. Lahiri's estimate that the project would be a remunerative one?

MINISTER in charge of the COMMUNICATIONS and WORKS DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Maharaja Srischandra Nandy, of Cossimbazar): (i) Two, besides the addresses presented to me during my visit to Pabna on the 16th January, 1939.

(ii) All were in favour of the construction of the railway line.

(iii), (iv) and (v) I received a note by Mr Lahiri in which he estimated the cost at Rs. 40 lakhs and the return on the capital expenditure at 6 per cent but I should not advise any person who wants such a return on his money to invest it in a project which the Railway Administration is unwilling to consider.

Babu NARENDRA NARAYAN CHAKRABARTY: মাননীয় মন্ত্রী মহাশয়ের ২নং উত্তরের প্রসঙ্গে আমি তাঁকে বিনীত ভাবে জিজ্ঞাসা কোরছি যে এই ঈশ্বরদি-পাবনা Railway পরিকল্পনা কার্য্যকরী করবার জন্য একটা সঠিক সময় নির্দ্ধারণ কোরতে পারেন কি না?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: That is a matter for the Government of India and the Railway Board to take into consideration.

Non-Bengalis in menial services of Government.

***31. Mr. AHMED HOSAIN:** (a) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Finance Department be pleased to state the reason for the paucity of the Bengalis and the preponderance of the Non-Bengalis in the menial services (i.e., those of the *chaprasis* and peons) in the various offices of the Government and other offices in Calcutta?

(b) Are the Government considering the desirability of taking any steps to provide the Bengalis in these services in future as a step towards relief and unemployment?

MINISTER in charge of the FINANCE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Mr. Nalini Ranjan Sarker): (a) I am informed that the

reason in Government offices is the general paucity of Bengali applicants. These posts apparently have more attraction for non-Bengalis than they have for Bengalis. I have no information as regards non-Government offices.

(*b*) A circular will be issued drawing attention to the desirability of employing more Bengalis in the menial services of Government, and the question whether recruitment should be confined to Bengalis will be considered.

Mr. RASIK LAL BISWAS: মন্ত্রী মহাশয় দয়া কোরে জানাবেন কি যে যখন এই পোষ্ট খালি হয় তখন তার জন্য কোন য়্যাড্‌ভারটাইজ্‌মেণ্ট দেওয়া হয় নাই?

The Hon'ble Mr. NALINI RANJAN SARKER: না।

Mr. RASIK LAL BISWAS: এখন থেকে কি য়্যাড্‌ভারটাইজ্‌মেণ্টের বন্দোবস্ত হবে?

The Hon'ble Mr. NALINI RANJAN SARKER: বিবেচনা করে দেখ্‌বো।

Resuscitation of the Nabaganga.

***32. Mr. ATUL KRISHNA CHOSE:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Communications and Works (Irrigation) Department be pleased to state what expert opinion, if any, has been gathered to resuscitate the river Nabaganga which is being silted up more and more?

(*b*) Have the Government received any instruction that if the Muchikhali canal is properly maintained the current of the Nabaganga may be in a better condition?

(*c*) Have the Government received any expert opinion to join the Nabaganga and the Madhumati by some canal?

(*d*) If the answer to (*c*) is in the affirmative, wherefrom will it begin?

(*e*) Have the Government received any expert opinion that if the mouth of the Halifax Channel at Bardia is controlled, the current of the Nabaganga may be increased?

(*f*) Have the Government received any expert opinion that if the canal at Lohagara, which is in touch with the Madhumati is properly maintained, the current of the river Nabaganga may increase?

(*g*) Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what the Government have decided for resuscitating the river Nabaganga?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: (*a*) An investigation is being made by the local officers

(*b*) and (*c*) No such advice has been received by Government.

(*d*) Does not arise

(*e*) and (*f*) No.

(*g*) Government are awaiting the result of the investigation referred to in the reply to (*a*).

Mr. ATUL KRISHNA GHOSE: With reference to (*a*), is the Hon'ble Minister aware of the fact that the very same question was raised in the last session and will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state who is that investigating officer and when has he been instructed to submit his report?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: I believe after the honourable member asked the question in the last session.

Mr. ATUL KRISHNA GHOSE: My question has not been replied to.

Mr. SPEAKER: What is your question?

Mr. ATUL KRISHNA GHOSE: My question is who is the officer in charge to investigate the matter and when that gentleman will submit his report regarding the resuscitation of the river Nabaganga.

Mr. SPEAKER: Is there any officer in charge of that investigation?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: Not for that particular area.

Mr. ATUL KRISHNA GHOSE: With reference to (*b*) and (*c*), will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether Government invited any expert opinion or sought any advice from any quarter whatsoever?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: Certainly. As I have already said, we have asked our local officers to examine the matter and submit a report.

Mr. RASIK LAL BISWAS: মন্ত্রী মহাশয় দয়া কোরে জানাবেন কি এই নবগঙ্গা পুনরুদ্ধারের জন্য সত্যই কি গভর্ণমেণ্টের কিছু করবার ইচ্ছা আছে, না লোক দেখাবার জন্য একটা ইনভেষ্টিগেশনের কথা বোলছেন?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: It is very difficult to say whether any project can actually be formulated without getting expert advice.

Mr. ATUL KRISHNA GHOSE: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state when the investigation will be complete?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: I am sorry it is not possible to give an idea of time.

Enquiry into accident in Santahar yard of Eastern Bengal Railway.

***33. Mr. J. N. GUPTA:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Home (Police) Department be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the District Magistrate, Bogra, ordered the Government Railway Police, Santahar, to hold an enquiry into the accident which took place in the Santahar yard of the Eastern Bengal Railway in the month of December, 1938, causing injury to a shunting porter who died in the hospital?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state—

(*i*) what is the result of the enquiry;

(*ii*) whether there was any protest from the worker's side against the system of engaging men accustomed with broad gauge-working to work in meter gauge and *vice versa;*

(*iii*) whether it is a fact that this system has been found responsible for the injury to the shunting staff;

(*iv*) whether it is a fact that one shunting porter's right hand had to be amputated as a result of the injury; and

(*v*) whether the Government contemplate taking any action for the safety of such workers?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) (*i*) The case is still under investigation by the police

(*ii*) and (*iii*) I have no information.

(*iv*) The question is so vague that I am unable to give any information.

(*v*) As the matter is not within my special cognisance, I am unable to give any reply.

Mr. J. N. GUPTA: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state how long it will take to complete the investigation?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: It is difficult to give any definite date.

Mr. J. N. GUPTA: With reference to reply to (*b*) (*iv*), will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if he is aware that there is a provision in the Railway Act that railway authorities are bound to send information to the District Magistrate in case of an accident resulting in injury to or death of any person?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: Question (*iv*) is so vague—it gives no time, date or occasion when the accident took place; so it is very difficult to reply to this question.

Mr. SYED JALALUDDIN HASHEMY: On a point of order, Sir. The Hon'ble Minister has, in reply to (*b*) (*i*), said that the case is still under investigation by the police. Therefore, he is supposed to know the date, time and place of occurrence of the accident.

Mr. SPEAKER: No reply is necessary.

System of ballot voting by symbols in Municipal and Union Board Elections.

*34. **Rai HARENDRA NATH CHAUDHURI:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Local Self-Government and Industries Department be pleased to state what has been the result of consideration by Government of the question of introducing the system of ballot voting by symbols so far as elections to—

(*i*) the municipalities; and

(*ii*) the union boards

are concerned?

(*b*) With reference to the reply to the supplementary question put by Mr. Syed Jalaluddin Hashemy to question No. 13 of the 3rd August, 1938, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what are the difficulties therein referred to?

MINISTER in charge of the LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT and INDUSTRIES DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Nawab Khwaja Habibullah Bahadur, of Dacca): (*a*) and (*b*) The Honourable member is referred to paragraph 3 of Government Circular No. 2581-85-M., dated the 9th August, 1938, and paragraphs 2 and 3 of Government Circular No. 2108-12-L.S.-G., dated the 9th August, 1938, copies of which are laid on the Library table.

It will be seen that Government have already invited the views of the local officers and selected local bodies in regard to this matter. Reports from the local officers have already been coming in. In the meantime Government are having the matter thoroughly examined in order to come to an early decision in regard to it.

Rai HARENDRA NATH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what is the necessity of consulting the opinion of local officers and selected local bodies in this matter, viz., in the matter of the introduction of the system of ballot voting by symbols in Municipal and Union Board elections, when the system has been found to be workable in the matter of legislative elections?

Mr. SPEAKER: The latter part of the question does not arise. As regards the first part, do you ask, what is the necessity of consulting local officers?

Rai HARENDRA NATH CHAUDHURI: I ask, what is the necessity of consulting the opinion of local officers and local bodies in this matter when the system has been found to be workable in legislative elections.

Mr. SPEAKER: What has been found workable elsewhere might not be found suitable for Municipal and Local Board elections. So you cannot place an argument like that

Rai HARENDRA NATH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state by which date Government expect to come to a decision in this matter?

The Hon'ble Nawab Khwaja HABIBULLAH Bahadur, of Dacca: At a very early date.

Rai HARENDRA NATH CHAUDHURI: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if Government can give an idea as to date?

The Hon'ble Nawab Khwaja HABIBULLAH Bahadur, of Dacca: No.

Khan Bahadur MOHAMMED ALI: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if this matter was discussed at the Conference of the Chairmen of District Boards and if Government propose to give effect to the decision of this Conference?

The Hon'ble Nawab Khwaja HABIBULLAH Bahadur, of Dacca: This matter was discussed at the Conference of the Chairmen of District

Boards but as the honourable member is aware, this department has been transferred to me only recently and so I have not had the time to go through the matter.

Mr. RASIK LAL BISWAS: With reference to the last part of the reply, namely, that Government are having the matter thoroughly examined, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the names of the persons who are enquiring into the matter and in what manner?

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise

Ad valorem court-fees for the awards of Debt Settlement Boards.

***35. Mr. MD. ABUL FAZL:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Co-operative Credit and Rural Indebtedness Department aware that *ad valorem* court-fees are being realised by certificate officers in realising the awarded debts (under Bengal Agricultural Debtors Act) by certificate procedure?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of stopping this double realisation of *ad valorem* fees?

(*c*) If the answer to (*b*) is in the negative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what other steps, if any, do the Government intend to take in this respect?

MINISTER in charge of the CO-OPERATIVE CREDIT and RURAL INDEBTEDNESS DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Mr. Mukunda Behary Mullick): (*a*) Yes

(*b*) No.

(*c*) None.

Mr. DHIRENDRA NATH DATTA: With reference to answer (*b*), will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the reasons for realising the court-fees twice, once at the time of the award and again at the time of realisation of the award?

The Hon'ble Mr. MUKUNDA BEHARY MULLICK: Because the law provides for it.

Mr. SURENDRA MOHAN MAITRA: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether he is going to revise the law?

The Hon'ble Mr. MUKUNDA BEHARY MULLICK: If it is so desired, I may examine the question.

Baby Show at Dinajpur.

*36. **Mr. NISHITHA NATH KUNDU:** With reference to answer to question No. 7 in the statement laid on the table on the 29th July, 1938, will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Home Department be pleased to state—

(a) why the accounts though completed have not yet been audited and published for the examination of the public;

(b) why the best method of using the fund collected during the Baby Show has not yet been settled;

(c) where and with whom is the surplus fund lying;

(d) what was the amount, if any, spent for engaging Professor Mani Burdhan and his party, including expenses incurred for their travelling, fooding and lodging;

(e) (i) whether any special charge was made or tickets sold for attending performance given by Professor Mani Burdhan and his party; and

(ii) if so, what was the amount collected?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: (a) The honourable member has been misinformed, the audit was completed and the accounts made available for public inspection at the end of October.

(b) It is understood that the Committee have decided to use the surplus to finance similar exhibitions in the interest of public health.

(c) It is on deposit in the name of the Vice-President (Subdivisional Officer, Sadar) in a local Co-operative Bank.

(d) Rs. 477-9.

(e) (i) Yes, admittance was by ticket.

(ii) Rs. 132-4.

Mr. NISHITHA NATH KUNDU: With reference to answer (a), will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state "October" of what year?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: I ask for notice.

Mr. NISHITHA NATH KUNDU: Sir, oftentimes the Hon'ble Ministers do not come prepared with their complete answers. In the Assembly Rules and Standing Orders there is a rule (section 36) to which I would like to draw your attention and beg of you to direct the Ministers to answer those questions for which they ask for notice.

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: As far as this question is concerned, I can give the answer now—October, 1938.

Babu PREMHARI BARMA: With reference to answer (*c*), will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the date of the deposit in the local Co-operative Bank?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: I ask for notice.

Cinemas in Bengal excluding Calcutta.

***37. Mr. AHMED HOSAIN:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Home (Political) Department be pleased to state the number of cinemas at present existing in Bengal except in the towns of Calcutta, Dacca, and Darjeeling?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble Minister aware—

(*i*) that many moneyed men are at present taking to this business of cinema running;

(*ii*) that they are trying to introduce them even in villages;

(*iii*) that these entertainments cause a regular drainage of the resources of the poor people;

(*iv*) that it causes a certain amount of moral depravity especially in the minds of the youths; and

(*v*) that a feeling exists amongst the public over the introduction of cinemas in *mufassal*?

(*c*) If answers to (*b*) are in the affirmative, are the Government considering the desirability of issuing instructions—

(*i*) to the District Officers to stop granting of licences for cinemas in small towns and villages; and

(*ii*) to withdraw licences wherever they have been granted in small towns and villages?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: (*a*) A statement is laid on the table.

(*b*) (*i*) This business is attracting a large number of people.

(*ii*) and (*iv*) No.

(*iii*) No more than any other form of entertainment.

(*v*) No general feeling.

(*c*) No.

Statement referred to in the answer to clause (a) to starred Question No. 37.

LIST OF CINEMA HOUSES IN BENGAL.

District.	Name.	Place.
Bakarganj ..	Dipali .	Barisal.
	Jagadish Theatre .	Ditto.
Bankura ..	Basanti Cinema House ..	Bankura.
	Binapani Picture Place ..	Ditto.
Bogra ..	Uttra Cinema Co. ..	Bogra.
	Maya Talkies ..	Santahar.
Burdwan ..	Burdwan Cinema ..	Burdwan.
	Bichitra House ..	Raniganj Bazar.
	E. I. R. European Institute ..	Asansol.
	New Cinema ..	Ditto.
	New Empire ..	Ditto.
	Kulti Club Cinema ..	Kulti.
	Ondal E. I. R. Indian Institute	Ondal.
Chittagong ..	Cinema Palace ..	Chittagong.
	Jubilee ..	Ditto.
	Lion Cinema .	Ditto.
Narayanganj ..	Diamond Talkie ..	Narayanganj.
	Hansa Theatre ..	Ditto.
Dinajpur ..	Lily Talkies ..	Dinajpur.
Hooghly ..	Koiri Talkies ..	Chinsura.
	Rupah ..	Ditto.
	Annapurna Talkie House ..	Bhadreswar.
	Gouri Talkie House ..	Uttarpara.
	Cinema de France ..	Chandernagore.
	Sri Durga Chhabighar ..	Ditto.
Howrah ..	Bangabashi ..	Howrah.
	Nav Bharat Cinema ..	Ditto.
	Amiya Talkies ..	Chengail.
	Mayapuri ..	Shibpur.
	Natyapeeth ..	Salkia.
	Srie Rupa ..	Kadamtola.
Jalpaiguri ..	New Chitrali ..	Jalpaiguri.

District.	Name.	Place.
Khulna ..	Ulasini ..	Khulna.
Malda ..	Lachmighar ..	Malda.
Midnapore ..	Aurora Cinema ..	Kharagpur.
	Bombay Cinema ..	Ditto.
	European Institute ..	Ditto.
Murshidabad ..	Mira Talkie House ..	Berhampore.
Mymensingh ..	Chayabani ..	Mymensingh.
	Mymensingh Talkie House ..	Ditto.
Nadia ..	Chitra Mandir ..	Krishnagar
	Kalyani Cinema ..	Kushtia.
	Mahamaya Talkies ..	Santipur.
	Nadia Talkies ..	Nabadwip
	Sahajahan Talkies .	Ranaghat
Pabna ..	Aurora Cinema Co ..	Pabna.
Rajshahi ..	Aloka Cinema House ..	Rajshahi
	Purnima Talkies .	Ranibazar
Rangpur ..	Rupali Cinema ..	Rangpur.
	Maya Talkies ..	Gaibandha.
Tippera ..	Chitra Katha ..	Comilla.
	Chitra Lekha ..	Chandpur.
24-Parganas ..	Barrackpore New Cinema ..	Tittaghar.
	Bata Cinema ..	Batanagore, Budge-Budge.
	Queen Cinema ..	Budge Budge
	Calcutta Talkies ..	Kankinara, Jagatdal.
	Sun Show House ..	Ditto.
	Ram Krishna Talkies ..	Naihati.
	Suchitra ..	Behala.
	Chhabighar ..	Bhatpara.
	Tarun Talkie Public Cinema House.	Baranagore.

Bongaon Local Board, Jessore.

*38. **Mr. SERAJUL ISLAM:** (a) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Local Self-Government and Industries Department be pleased to state whether it is in the contemplation of Government to abolish the Bongaon Local Board in the district of Jessore?

(b) If so, when?

(c) If not, why not?

The Hon'ble Nawab Khwaja HABIBULLAH Bahadur, of Dacca: (a) No.

(b) Does not arise.

(c) Under section 36A of the Local Self-Government Act, the consent of the District Board is necessary to the abolition of Local Boards under it. As no proposal for the abolition of the Bongaon Local Board has been made by the District Board of Jessore, Government have not taken any action in the matter.

District Board of Dinajpur.

*39. **Babu SHYAMA PROSAD BARMAN:** (a) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Local Self-Government and Industries Department be pleased to state—

(i) the year and month, when the term of the existing District Board of Dinajpur was due to expire;

(ii) the date of the last election of the present Local Boards of Dinajpur; and

(iii) the date of election of members to the District Board by the Local Boards?

(b) Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that the District Board has not yet been reconstituted?

(c) If the answer to (b) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the reason for the delay in the constitution of the District Board?

The Hon'ble Nawab Khwaja HABIBULLAH Bahadur, of Dacca: (a)(i) The four-year term of the existing Board expired in January, 1936.

(ii) 6th to 12th February, 1937.

(iii) Sadar Local Board—17th February, 1938.

Balurghat Local Board—17th February, 1938.

Thakurgaon Local Board—16th February, 1938.

(*b*) and (*c*) The reconstitution of the District Board had to be deferred pending the decision of Government on certain points raised in connection with a dispute relating to the election of members of the District Board by the Thakurgaon Local Board. The matter has since been examined by Government and necessary orders for the reconstitution of the District Board will be issued as early as possible.

Temporary posts in Eastern Circle.

*40. **Mr. ABDUL WAHAB KHAN:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Communications and Works Department be pleased to state—

(*i*) that there are a good many temporary posts in the Eastern Circle which are in continuous existence from long before 1927; and

(*ii*) that the retention of these posts was found unavoidable by the Retrenchment Committee of 1932?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble Minister considering the desirability of making those temporary posts permanent?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: (*a*)(*i*) There are several such posts

(*ii*) and (*b*) No

Mr. ABDUL WAHAB KHAN: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the reasons for not making these posts permanent for the last 12 years?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: The reason possibly is that when the posts were created, there was no certainty of their being retained for more than a specified period.

Mr. ABDUL WAHAB KHAN: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what are the recommendations of the Retrenchment Committee with regard to these temporary posts?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: As far as the posts in the Irrigation Department are concerned they were in favour of their retention.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if he is aware that a certain number of Accounts Clerks under the Irrigation Department are holding temporarily posts which are marked permanent and they have been there for more than 10 years?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: I ask for notice.

Health Officer for Maternity Home, Suri, Birbhum.

***41. Dr. SANAULLAH:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Medical and Public Health Department be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the post of Medical Officer of Health for the Maternity Home at Suri was advertised by the Public Service Commission, Bengal, in August, 1938?

(*b*) How many (1) Muslim, (2) Hindu and (3) other candidates applied for the said post?

(*c*) What were their respective qualifications?

(*d*) Was any interview granted at all?

(*e*) If so, how many of them were called for interview?

(*f*) What is the name and qualification of the person appointed?

MINISTER in charge of the MEDICAL and PUBLIC HEALTH DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Mr. Tamizuddin Khan): (*a*) The post of the Medical Officer of Health which was advertised was for the Model Health Unit at Singur in the district of Hooghly and not for a maternity home at Suri.

(*b*) Three Muslims, 15 Caste Hindus and 2 Scheduled Castes Hindus applied for the post.

(*c*) The information is not in the possession of Government.

(*d*) and (*e*) Twelve candidates were called for interview by the Public Service Commission.

(*f*) Dr. Jayanta Kumar Bhattacharya, B.SC., M.B., D.P.H.

Silting up of the Bishkhali Done, Bakarganj.

***42. Mr. SADARUDDIN AHMEL:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Communications and Works (Irrigation) Department aware that the Bishkhali *Done* in the district of Bakarganj has already been silted up?

(*b*) Have the Government taken any action on the proposal of the Bakarganj District Board for re-excavation of the *Dona* by Government?

(*c*) If no action has been taken as yet, are the Government considering the desirability of expediting the matter?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) and (*c*) A proposal for the improvement of the Bishkhali *Dona* is now under examination.

Complaints against Debt Settlement Boards.

*43. **Mr. DHIRENDRA NATH DATTA:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Co-operative Credit and Rural Indebtedness Department aware—

(*i*) of a feeling that exists in the province against the Debt Settlement Boards that have been established throughout Bengal;

(*ii*) of the absence of any rule as to how the consent of the creditor is to be obtained to an amicable settlement; and

(*iii*) that various complaints have arisen regarding amicable settlements?

(*b*) Do the Government consider the desirability of immediately framing a rule for obtaining the consent in writing?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of transferring the power of the Boards to the Stipendiary Judiciary constituted for the purpose?

The Hon'ble Mr. MUKUNDA BEHARY MULLICK: (*a*) (*i*) and (*iii*) No.

(*ii*) Yes.

(*b*) Yes.

(*c*) No.

Mr. DHIRENDRA NATH DATTA: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if he is aware of the fact that there is a widespread complaint in the Province that the Debt Settlement Boards that have been established are most incompetent and corrupt?

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise.

Mr. PROMATHA RANJAN THAKUR: With reference to answer (*c*), will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the reasons why Government do not consider it desirable to transfer the power of the Boards to the Stipendiary Judiciary constituted for the purpose?

The Hon'ble Mr. MUKUNDA BEHARY MULLICK: I would refer the honourable member to the provisions of the Act and the rules thereunder.

Membership of the Debt Settlement Board.

***44. Mr. MD. ABUL FAZL:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Co-operative Credit and Rural Indebtedness Department aware that majority of members of Debt Settlement Boards formed to date are without adequate educational qualifications?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, are the Government considering the desirability of amending the Bengal Agricultural Debtors Act abolishing the Debt Settlement Boards and vesting powers of those Boards in the Munsifs or other judicial authorities?

The Hon'ble Mr. MUKUNDA BEHARY MULLICK: (*a*) No.

(*b*) Does not arise.

Mr. PROMATHA RANJAN THAKUR: With reference to answer (*b*), will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if Government think it necessary to amend this pernicious law?

The Hon'ble Mr. MUKUNDA BEHARY MULLICK: I do not agree with the honourable member in the assumption that he has made.

Ad valorem court-fees for the awards of Debt Settlement Boards.

***45. Babu SHYAMA PROSAD BARMAN:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Co-operative Credit and Rural Indebtedness Department aware that *ad valorem* court-fees are charged from the parties in certificate cases filed for the realisation of the dues, under the awards of the Debt Settlement Boards in settlement of the decretal amount or claims of suits of civil courts, for which *ad valorem* court-fees have already been paid?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the reason why court-fees are twice realised?

The Hon'ble Mr. MUKUNDA BEHARY MULLICK: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) Because the law provides for it

Mr. NISHITHA NATH KUNDU: In view of the hardship that is being caused by the realisation of court-fees twice and in view of its inequitable nature, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if Government think it desirable to amend the law?

The Hon'ble Mr. MUKUNDA BEHARY MULLICK: As I have already said it it is considered desirable, I will have the matter examined.

Hardship to the debtors and creditors for fees under Bengal Agricultural Debtors Act.

*46. **Mr. DHIRENDRA NATH DATTA:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Co-operative Credit and Rural Indebtedness Department aware—

(*i*) that there is a hardship caused to the debtors as well as to the creditors in matters of the realisation of the fees under the Bengal Agricultural Debtors Act;

(*ii*) that the fees are realised in respect of a debt both at the time of the award as well as at the time of the recovery of the amount under an award under section 28 of the Bengal Agricultural Debtors Act; and

(*iii*) that such fees are realised even in respect of amount decreed by the Civil Court for which *ad valorem* court-fees had been realised already?

(*b*) Do the Government consider the desirability of amending the rules regarding the payment of the court-fees under the Bengal Agricultural Debtors Act?

The Hon'ble Mr. MUKUNDA BEHARY MULLICK: (*a*) (*i*) I am not aware of any such hardship.

(*ii*) and (*iii*) Yes.

(*b*) Not at present.

Gratuitous relief and agricultural loan to flood-affected people of Tippera.

*47. **Mr. MAQBUL HOSAIN:** Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Revenue Department be pleased to state what amount did the

Government distribute to the agriculturists of the area affected by the last flood, thana by thana separately in the district of Tippera—

(*a*) by way of gratuitous relief; and

(*b*) by way of agricultural loan?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: (*a*) Nil. A sum of Rs. 155 was however distributed through the Subdivisional Officer from private charitable funds in thanas Brahmanbaria, Sarail and Nasirnagar affected by the floods.

(*b*) The following amounts have been distributed—

		Rs.
Thana Sarail	...	42,750
Thana Nasirnagar	...	28,320
Thana Nabinagar	...	7,699
Thana Banchharampur	...	4,140
Thana Brahmanbaria	...	360
Thana Daudkandi	...	13,501
Thana Homna	..	1,181
Thana Burichang	...	1,183
Thana Muradnagar	...	974
Total	...	1,00,108

I may add that this is the amount actually distributed, but Government have placed at the disposal of the Collector altogether Rs. 1,84,000 for this district up-till-now.

Mr. DHIRENDRA NATH DATTA: Is it a fact that the residents of the Konda and Gokarna unions (thana Nasirnagar) have submitted a petition to Government asking for gratuitous relief?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: Such petitions have to be submitted to the Collector and not to Government, and Government have not received any such petition so far as my information goes.

UNSTARRED QUESTIONS

(to which answers were laid on the table)

Influx of foreigners into Bengal.

19. Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Home (Political) Department aware—

(*i*) that recently there has been an influx of a number of foreigners, mostly Jews, into this province, who are engaging themselves in various callings and professions, specially in the medical profession;

(*ii*) that such influx has been causing great alarm in the public mind both for economic as well as for political reasons; and

(*iii*) that many of these foreigners do not possess requisite professional qualifications?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what steps do the Government propose to take to ensure that such immigration may not act detrimental to the interests of this province and its children?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: (*a*) The honourable member will appreciate that in the Seventh Schedule to the Government of India Act "Admission into India" is a List I subject. I am aware that there has been a tendency for applications from foreigners of the professional classes for permission to land in Calcutta to increase. I have no information, however, to indicate either that there is alarm in this matter, or that the products of our Universities have any reason to fear competition from this quarter.

(*b*) The eligibility of doctors for registration in Bengal is scrutinised by the Bengal Council of Medical Registration.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if he is aware that two months ago an editorial note appeared in the "Statesman" drawing attention to the question of influx of Jews?

Mr. SPEAKER: The question does not arise.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: It does.

Mr. SPEAKER: Dr. Sanyal, I will again say that when I decide that the question does not arise, it is not for you to answer "It does".

You can certainly submit what you have to say, but an immediate reply saying that "It does" takes away my function as Speaker to control the debate. I quite understand you said it off-hand.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: It is a matter of language. I only submit that it does arise in this sense that there is this sentence in the reply "I have no information however to indicate either that there is alarm in this matter....." I am drawing the attention of the Hon'ble Minister to find out whether Government's attention has been drawn to the editorial note in the "Statesman."

Mr. SPEAKER: Is there any law by which the Hon'ble the Minister is bound to read editorial notes? That question does not arise.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that in the Indian Medical Association they had discussed the desirability of restricting medical practice by unqualified Jews in the city?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: I am not aware of it.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Do Government consider the desirability of investigating into the effects of such influx of Jews on the medical profession in this province?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: Sir, as far as my information goes, there is no large influx; secondly, I am not prepared to accept that they could have a better practice than the graduates of our Universities and thirdly, there is the Medical Council to look after these matters.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Is the Hon'ble Minister considering the desirability of taking steps to see that the Jews do not create another minority problem in Bengal so far as the political sphere is concerned?

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise.

Babu NARENDRA NARAYAN CHAKRABARTY: মাননীয় মন্ত্রী মহাশয় কি জানাবেন জার্ম্মেনীর হিট্‌লারের কাছে থেকে এরকম অনুরোধ এসেছে কিনা যে জুদের তাড়িয়ে দেওয়া হোক।

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise.

Transfer of clerks in Mymensingh district.

20. Mr. FAZLUR RAHMAN (Mymensingh): (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Revenue Department aware—

(*i*) that there are some clerks in the Mymensingh district offices who have been serving at Sadar ever since their appointments or for more than 15 years and are not being transferred to *mufassal*; and

(*ii*) that there are some clerks who have long been serving in the *mufassal* offices and are being transferred from one subdivision to another and not posted at Sadar?

(*b*) How are the names of the clerks written in the gradation list, whether in order of seniority?

(*c*) Whether the said list is confidential?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: (*a*) (*i*) Yes, because it was not possible in the interest of the public service to transfer all the Sadar clerks to subdivisions.

(*ii*) Such cases are very few indeed. In some cases it was made at the request of the clerks concerned. The cost of living at Sadar being high, clerks generally prefer to stay in subdivisions.

(*b*) In order of seniority.

(*c*) No.

Rent clerk in Dacca Collectorate.

21. Mr. S. A. SALIM: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Revenue Department be pleased to state whether the *kist* clerks who had been serving for many years in the Dacca Collectorate were discharged in April, 1937, and replaced by new candidates?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what arrangements, if any, have been made for their provision?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of providing them in the Copying Departments?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: (*a*) There is no clerk designated as *kist* clerk in the Collectorate. The practice till the

end of June was to appoint a few temporary hands for a short period during the *kist* time and any outsider available was taken in as there was no restriction in the choice. But since then selections for appointments in the Collectorate were made from the approved list of candidates prepared on the basis of the results of examination. It may however be noted that such temporary appointments during the *kist* period have become unnecessary since the acceptance of the suggestions in Mr. Chapman's report.

(*b*) The temporary clerks were allowed to appear at the examination on the results of which the approved list was prepared and vacancies in the Collectorate are now filled up from this list subject to usual conditions.

(*c*) They will be absorbed as opportunity offers in any vacancies for which they are suitable.

Distress due to floods in Serajganj subdivision.

22. Mr. ABDULLA-AL MAHMOOD: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Revenue Department aware—

(*i*) that the last flood has caused acute distress to the people of the Serajganj subdivision;

(*ii*) that the *aman* paddy harvested by the agriculturist-cultivators after the flood is not adequate for their subsistence till the next harvest; and

(*iii*) that want of food is likely to be felt after the month of *Magh*?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what steps, if any, the Government contemplate taking to save the people from starvation?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: (*a*) (*i*) and (*ii*) Yes.

(*iii*) Some scarcity is apprehended from the beginning of *Baisakh* to the middle of *Asarh*.

(*b*) Government have already distributed Rs. 3,62,000 as agricultural loans and Rs. 47,837 as gratuitous relief and the District Board has distributed Rs. 10,000 as gratuitous relief. A further sum of Rs. 54,000 is also being distributed as agricultural loans for *aus* and jute seeds. Test relief works are in progress in six centres. Such further relief as is necessary will be given.

Subidpur Debt Settlement Board, Bakarganj.

23. Mr. SADARUDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Co-operative Credit and Rural Indebtedness Department be pleased to state—

(*i*) why the Subidpur Debt Settlement Board in police-station Nalchity in the district of Bakarganj has not as yet been established; and

(*ii*) whether it is a fact that there were several representations from three M.L.A.'s and the residents of the Unions to establish the said Board with a proposed gentleman for Chairmanship?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of forming the said Board in near future?

The Hon'ble Mr. MUKUNDA BEHARY MULLICK: (*a*) (*i*) Owing to the difficulty of finding suitable personnel which will command public confidence.

(*ii*) and (*b*) Yes.

Establishment of Debt Settlement Board at Niamatty, Bakarganj.

24. Mr. SADARUDDIN AHMED: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Co-operative Credit and Rural Indebtedness Department be pleased to state the reason why the Niamatty Debt Settlement Board within police-station and district Bakarganj has not been established?

(*b*) Is it a fact that the personnel of the Board was selected by the local officers about five months ago?

(*c*) Will the Honble Minister be pleased to state whether the name of Munshi Montaz Uddin Howlader was selected in the personnel of the proposed Board either as chairman or member?

The Hon'ble Mr. MUKUNDA BEHARY MULLICK: (*a*) Difficulty in finding suitable personnel has prevented the establishment of this Board.

(*b*) No.

(*c*) Does not arise.

Bhagirathi embankment at Haridasmati, Berhampore, Murshidabad.

25. Mr. SASANKA SEKHAR SANYAL: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Irrigation Department aware that the Bhagirathi

embankment at Haridasmati to the south of the town of Berhampore in the district of Murshidabad was in danger during the last flood?

(*b*) How much help from non-officials were required to avert the catastrophe?

(*c*)(*i*) When was the *bund* declared perilous and beyond protection during the said flood?

(*ii*) When did the flood actually reach the danger level?

(*d*)(*i*) When was the weakness of the *bund* at the said place, viz., Haridasmati, discovered by and known to the Irrigation Department?

(*ii*) What steps after that were taken for remedying the weakness?

(*e*) How much money had the Government to spend for preventing the collapse of the *bund* at the said place during the last flood?

(*f*)(*i*) What steps are being taken to prevent a recurrence of similar panic at the said place in the future?

(*ii*) How much time will it take to complete the precautions?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) A few batches of volunteers worked for some time on the 19th August, 1938.

(*c*)(*i*) No such declaration was made but the position was exceedingly critical from the 19th to the 26th August.

(*ii*) The danger level was reached by the Bhagirathi at Berhampore on the 25th July, but at Haridasmati the threat to the embankment was due to undercutting and erosion and not to the high level of the flood.

(*d*) Between 1922 when some protective work was done which stopped erosion, and 1938, no weakness was discovered. Last year active erosion began on the 18th August and protective works were taken up at once and continued day and night until the danger was over.

(*e*) Rs. 5,829.

(*f*) The construction of a retired line at a cost of Rs. 13,523 has recently been sanctioned, and I trust that the work will be completed before the flood season of 1939.

Disallowance of plying motor buses and taxis from Raghunathganj to Daffarpur by Subdivisional Officer of Jangipur.

26. Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Home (Police) Department aware that the plying

of motor buses from Raghunathganj to Daffarpur in the Murshidabad district, at the time when the District Political Conference was held on the 26th and 27th December last, was disallowed by the Subdivisional Officer, Jangipur, under a written order, and the plying of taxis was prohibited through verbal order?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the circumstances under which and the authority by virtue of which these orders were passed?

(*c*) Is it a fact that motor buses and taxis had, in the past, been usually allowed to ply for public or private service between different points in the subdivision for temporary period on occasions of *melas*, fairs, religious festivities, marriage ceremonies, etc., provided the public service on the sanctioned routes did not suffer?

(*d*) Is it a fact that the District Board of Murshidabad took up the repairs of the Raghunathganj-Daffarpur Road a few weeks before the date of the conference and that the overseer in charge had stated in his progress report that the road had been duly repaired and made fit for motor traffic?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: (*a*) An order was passed prohibiting the plying of omnibuses on the road in question, but it is not a fact that the plying of taxis was prohibited through verbal order.

(*b*) Action was taken in accordance with the Bengal Motor Vehicles Rules, 1935. The road was reported to be unsafe for the passage of omnibuses.

(*c*) No.

(*d*) Test work was continuing on the road and the overseer in charge never reported that the road was fit for omnibus traffic.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if he is aware that in Memorandum No. 7479, dated the 25th December, 1938, the Subdivisional Officer of Jangipur ordered that public services cannot be allowed in the lines as the roads are not good and this order is not in accordance with the requirements of the Motor Vehicles Rules, 1935?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: That is a legal question; I will look into it.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that with reference to a letter from me, dated the 26th December 1938,

the Subdivisional Officer sent me a reply stating that public conveyance has not been allowed for the safety of human lives and for preventing dislocation of service between Jangipur Road Station and Rakhunathganj indicating thereby——

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: He says that——

Mr. SPEAKER: You should try to elicit information whereas you have got all the information yourself.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Are Government aware that a few weeks ago the Subdivisional Officer of Jangipur as well as the District Magistrate of Murshidabad commandeered most of the motor buses in the district including the buses in Jangipur for conveying troops to the area and they did go over all these roads?

Mr. SPEAKER: How does that question arise?

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Out of answer "no".

Mr. SPEAKER: How?

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: My question is "(c) Is it a fact that motor buses and taxis had in the past been usually allowed to ply for public or private service between different points in the subdivision for temporary periods on occasions of *melas*, fairs, religious festivities, marriage ceremonies, etc., provided the public service on the sanctioned routes did not suffer"? The answer is "No".

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: This is about the past.

Mr. SPEAKER: How does the question regarding troops arise?

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: The District Magistrate and the Subdivisional Officer themselves took these buses along these routes a few weeks ago for a specific purpose.

Mr. SPEAKER: How?

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: On special occasions like *melas*, fairs, etc.——

Mr. SPEAKER: I think the question does not arise. You may ask Mr. Banerjee by your side.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that the plying of motor buses and taxis on this Raghunathganj-Daffarpur Road was prohibited by the Subdivisional Officer to satisfy some of his friends who are members of a club where gambling is indulged in?

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise.

Message Conveying wishes for His Excellency's speedy recovery.

Mr. SPEAKER: Ladies and gentlemen, before we commence to-day's proceedings I would like to have your permission to send a message in your name conveying our anxious concern in His Excellency Lord Brabourne's illness and our sincere wishes for His Excellency's speedy recovery. I shall be grateful if you will signify your assent by rising in your seats.

(All the members then stood up.)

Mr. SPEAKER: Thank you, gentlemen. Secretary will take the necessary steps.

Question of Privilege.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Mr. Speaker, Sir, may I draw your attention to a question of privilege? On the last occasion when we met the Select Committee Report on the Bengal Money-lenders' Bill was distributed and presented to the House. I was surprised to note that from that report as printed, certain sentences of mine in the note of dissent submitted by me have been expunged. I submit, Sir, that there is——

Mr. SPEAKER: Will you point out what those sentences are?

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: My sentences read thus—

Mr. SPEAKER: It is not necessary to read them. What is your point?

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: My point is that under the rules so long as I am within the rules, neither the Hon'ble Minister nor the department over which you preside, Sir, has the right to expunge any portion or portions of my note of dissent. If there has been any portion or portions found objectionable, it is only fair that I should be given a chance to either correct them and make them according with

the rules or to try and convince you that they are entirely within the rules. And I further submit, Sir, that by thus expunging a sentence in one paragraph the whole meaning of the whole paragraph has been mutilated. In one paragraph I said——

Mr. SPEAKER: I have seen it. I cannot allow the thing which has been disallowed to be read out by you. You can state the grounds on which you base your objection. On what grounds do you say that it is a question of privilege? I do not want you to read out.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: May I submit that there is no authority which can expunge any portion or portions—even a single word—out of my note of dissent and I request you, if you kindly agree with me in this submission, to refer the matter to the Privileges Committee and to postpone discussion on the Money-lenders' Bill so long as those words are not restored.

Mr. SPEAKER: Dr. Sanyal, I am absolutely clear on this point. What I did is in consonance with Parliamentary practice and convention So far as the Legislature of Bengal is concerned, for many years past, in connection with the report of a Select Committee a member could not go beyond the jurisdiction of the requirements of the particular Bill concerned, though unfortunately there have been occasions when members have gone much beyond and have tried to utilise them as an opportunity to state things which are not strictly relevant for the purpose of a report.

To take this particular instance, I think Dr. Sanyal will be pleased to hear why I have expunged certain words from his note of dissent I think that even Dr. Sanyal will admit that he has no right to utilise the Select Committee report as an opportunity to say that members of this House or the members of the Select Committee were utterly ignorant of the matter at issue——

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will you kindly read out the portions expunged, Sir?

Mr. SPEAKER: It is not your business, Dr. Sanyal, as to what I should do. After I have finished, I am quite prepared to hear what you have got to say.

As a matter of fact, the advice, which the legal officers of our department tendered, was to the effect that the whole sentence should be completely expunged. But I thought it was my duty to see that as far as possible his intention is kept intact. The expression was—"this

is evidence of the utter lack of knowledge of the majority of members regarding the multifarious functions of such credit institutions". I consider this as a reflection on the members of the Select Committee and, as such, I am perfectly entitled, as Speaker, to see that nothing which is not cast in a proper form and which contains any reflection on any person is allowed to be published through an official report for which I am responsible. What I did was to expunge the words "this is evidence of utter lack of knowledge of the majority of members regarding multifarious functions of such credit institutions". I think that was not an occasion on which he could say so, even though any member puts in his knowledge of economic theories and speaks of all others as ignorant of political economy or things like that. I am quite willing, however, to accept any decision the House may take in this matter.

Then, there is the question of convention. Dr. Sanyal himself knows that on more occasions than one we have followed the Parliamentary practice and convention. Erskine May has been quoted more by himself than anybody else I feel we should also try to build a sound tradition. What Dr Sanyal did was to write out the following sentences: "I place on record my emphatic protest against the form in which the Select Committee's report has been provided whereby certain supposed convention has been invoked to hide the truth regarding the real character of the report. I sign the report subject to this note of dissent". It would have been perfectly right to exclude the whole of that sentence. I did not, however, exclude the entire portion but have allowed Dr. Sanyal's statement to remain with the exception of the words "the truth regarding". I consider these words not proper.

Then, there is just one thing more that I should like to raise. It is not the usual course and is against all Parliamentary conventions for the Speaker to give any reason as to his action But I consider that, with a view to give an opportunity to members as to how the conventions are being developed, this is an occasion when I welcome Dr. Sanyal to raise this question of privilege and should in reply state the reasons why in dealing with Select Committee reports I have tried to make them strictly in consonance with healthy Parliamentary conventions. But I must also state that I am entirely at the disposal of the House, and if members desire that whatever is written by a member must be incorporated in a Select Committee report without any editing, I would be quite prepared to do so. But for the time being, in the absence of any such mandate from the Legislature, I am perfectly within my rights to adopt the course I have taken.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: I do not want to challenge your ruling, Sir. I have carefully seen the rules regarding Select Committee, and especially rule 61. I have followed every bit of that rule, and all that I have submitted to you is that if you thought it necessary to expunge any word, it was only fair that I should be given a hearing,

because without giving me a hearing, however much intelligent your department may be, any deletion might result in the mutilation——

Mr. SPEAKER: Yes, I quite appreciate your point.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: That is why, Sir, I wanted that the matter should be referred to the Privileges Committee. I did not take it as a motion of no-confidence in the Speaker. It is a matter of serious concern, and I submit that so long as I am not making a personal reflection on any member or group of members, I feel I am within my rights. I had my objection to the convention under which the report was drawn up. We, some members of the Select Committee, agreed to this, and my friend, Mr. Morgan, who was also a member of that committee, agreed with me when we submitted that the report might be drafted in the indirect narration not directly involving us in a statement which at the next moment we were bound to oppose. We submitted that instead of saying, "We agree to do this or that," the report might state: "The Committee agreed to, etc." or "It has been agreed, etc." But your department insisted on maintaining that there was only one and one form in which the Select Committee report should be submitted, and that was in the direct narration. That is also the reason why I want also to refer the matter to the Privileges Committee, so that the form in which Select Committee reports may be submitted may also be gone into.

Mr. SPEAKER: I shall close this debate for the time being by saying that that point, which Dr. Sanyal has raised, I am certainly quite prepared to consider, viz., that before a particular portion is expunged the member concerned should have an opportunity to know that. I quite appreciate that this request of Dr. Sanyal is reasonable. But so far as the question whether this particular matter is a question of privilege or not, I rule that it is not; the House, however, can at any time frame a rule preventing any alteration in a Select Committee report, but until that is done, I will have to go by convention. I can, however, assure Dr. Sanyal that in human life strict observance of regulations is not everything; they may be perfectly all right, but they may be abused, for legal principles are not always kept in view, and are still more so abused in Parliamentary practice, where we have to deal with human institutions. In human institutions, there are many things which may be taken for granted, and conventions are the best precedents to adopt.

So far as giving an opportunity to members to retain in full any statements made by them in Select Committee reports is concerned, I shall certainly consider this point and can say that that would fully satisfy Dr. Sanyal, if and when he will write another note of dissent.

Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed's Statement.

Mr. SPEAKER: I understand Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed desires to make a statement. Under the rules, it has to be taken immediately after the questions.

Mr. SHAMSUDDIN AHMED: It is no use narrating the events prior to the times when the general elections were fought in the years 1936-37, how the United Muslim Party was formed and dissolved and the very same persons under the leadership of Mr. Jinnah formed the Bengal League Parliamentary Board for the purpose of driving Mr. A. K. Fazlul Huq out of Bengal politics. The Krishak Proja movement was inaugurated long before the elections were fought and finally the Krishak Proja Samity drew up a programme in consonance with its principles and fought the general elections. The first item in that programme was the abolition of Permanent Settlement, and that is a matter of history now. The public of Bengal are well aware of the circumstances under which the elections were fought and the activities of the Krishak Proja Samity in that behalf. On challenges from both sides, the Patuakhali election was fought, and Mr. A. K. Fazlul Huq, the then President of the Nikhil Banga Krishak Proja Samity, fought Sir Nazimuddin, the representative of the League and the then Government nominee for Premiership. That fight was a fight for principle between the Krishak Proja Samity and the League. The result was that Mr. Fazlul Huq defeated Sir Nazimuddin, the Government nominee for Premiership, and the Krishak Proja cause was vindicated.

After the election it was found that 40 to 45 candidates were returned on the Krishak Proja ticket and about the same number was returned on the League ticket. Coalition was formed between the Krishak Proja Samity and the League Parliamentary Board, with Mr. Fazlul Huq as the leader, on a definite programme on behalf of the Coalition which included among others the replacement of Permanent Settlement by a more equitable system and laws suitable to the needs and requirements of the people, reduction of cost of administration, immediate introduction of free, compulsory primary education without taxing those unable to bear the burden, repeal of repressive laws, amendment of the Public Demands Recovery Act especially to mitigate the rigours of certificate procedure, release of political prisoners, etc.

It was found that when Mr. Fazlul Huq formed the Cabinet the quota of three members to represent the Krishak Proja Samity on the Cabinet, according to the terms of the settlement, was not filled. The result was a split in the then Krishak Proja Samity with the result that at the general meeting of the Nikhil Banga Krishak Proja Samity,

held at Gaibandha in September, 1937, Mr. Fazlul Huq was removed from the presidentship of the Samity and Maulana Abdullahil Baqi was elected president and the Samity directed myself to organise the Krishak Proja Assembly Party with me as its leader. According to that direction the Krishak Proja Assembly Party was formed and I was elected leader of the Party. We began working both inside and outside the Legislature. A few months later, Maulvi Tamizuddin Khan seceded from the Coalition and issued a statement in which among others he criticised the policy of the Government for not having implemented their promises, for not having raised the price of jute, and for not making provision for rural water-supply or the establishment of village dispensaries. The statement continued; "Instead of making the slightest attempt to implement their promise of effecting economy the cost of administration is being wantonly increased. Officers who have been content with a few hundred rupees per month have been lifted almost overnight to princely salaries hitherto reserved for the I.C.S. and new officers have been created with reckless disregard of economy." Elsewhere, in the same statement, he stated: "As members of the Coalition group, we continued to give our uniform support to Government as long as we entertained the hope that we might induce the Ministers to redeem at least some of their election pledges. Having been in close touch with the Government, we have had opportunities of watching their activities for one full year and we are now convinced that nothing that we can do as members of the Coalition group, will overcome the reactionary forces that are constantly working from within and without." This statement issued on 15th of March, 1938, holds good to-day even though its sponsor, Mr. Tamizuddin Khan is shining as a member of the Cabinet.

Now, myself and Mr. Tamizuddin began working together. Meanwhile, the question of the resignation of Mr. Nausher Ali was in the air. The rumour became a fact and in no time Mr. Nausher Ali was a victim of the clique of the zamindar-ridden Cabinet dominated by a capitalist, Mr. Nalini Ranjan Sarker. Mr. Nausher Ali was practically forced out of the Cabinet, and he is with us to-day.

Thereafter, the no-confidence motions were moved with what result the public are well aware. Afterwards, since September last, negotiations went on between myself and Mr. Fazlul Huq. Prior to that also negotiations were held between myself and Mr. Tamizuddin Khan and Mr. Jinnah, but without any success. The first attempt at negotiations between myself and Mr. Fazlul Huq proved abortive as the public are well aware. Thereafter a settlement was arrived at between myself as leader of the Krishak Proja Party and Mr. Tamizuddin Khan as leader of the Independent Proja Party with the Cabinet on certain terms and conditions; and a good deal of correspondence followed. With me a settlement was arrived at on November 16th,

1938. I am placing here the conditions that were put forward on behalf of the Krishak Proja Party and the modified terms which Mr. Fazlul Huq accepted on behalf of the Cabinet. These are the conditions that the Krishak Proja Party put forward:—

(1) The Krishak Proja Party will maintain its separate entity within the Legislature and shall be under the control of the Nikhil Banga Krishak Proja Samity in which Mr. Fazlul Huq's Samity will merge.

(2) The Cabinet to be constituted so that the majority of both Hindu and Muslim Ministers should be non-capitalists and non-zamindars

(3) The salary of the Ministers shall be Rs. 1,000 per month *plus* an additional allowance of Rs 500 each. In the case of the Chief Minister, however, an additional allowance of Rs 500 was agreed upon.

(4) Immediate announcement of Government's intention to reduce the rate of rent by legislative or other methods. The question of giving further rights to under-*raiyats* and *bargadars* should be examined.

(5) Primary Education Act—repealing tax on cultivators, extending it to municipal areas including Calcutta and steps to be taken to introduce primary education throughout the province in three years

(6) Immediate steps for devising means to fix minimum price of jute.

(7) Immediate notice of a Bill to abolish nominations, introduce adult male franchise, and secret ballot in all local bodies with proper reservation for local minorities.

(8) Announcing Government's policy liberating 50 per cent. of chaukidari and union rates for rural reconstruction.

(9) Release of political prisoners within a specified time.

(10) Steps to be taken to implement the resolutions of the Assembly and the Council about the proportion of ratio of services, retirement, and additional grant for education.

(11) Reduction of the cost of administration.

(12) Revenue Commission—to devise means for the replacement of the present land revenue system by a juster one; preferably with an Indian Chairman and in any case, with a majority of persons acceptable to the Krishak Proja Samity.

Sir, thereafter a good deal of correspondence followed. Then Mr. Fazlul Huq put down in one letter his personal views accepting the majority of the terms. Afterwards when the first negotiations terminated, Mr. Fazlul Huq wrote me a letter saying that this was the view of the Cabinet, so far as the terms were concerned.

"My dear Shamsuddin,

It appears that you are under a misapprehension as regards the unsigned note which is alleged to have been given to you on the night of 31st October, 1938. I hasten to correct this impression and say that the 'note' in question did not represent the final decision of the Cabinet as a whole. In these circumstances it is hoped that you would be able to give your support to us on the basis of a programme enclosed herewith."

Then, Sir, the programme is this:—

(1) The idea of having one Nikhil Banga Krishak Proja Samity in Bengal and one Assembly Proja Party is approved. As regards a separate block for them in the Assembly, this will be settled later by personal discussion.

(2) With regard to the size of the Cabinet the two Muslim Ministers representing the Proja Parties, hitherto in opposition, and also a scheduled caste Minister enjoying the confidence of these parties will be taken in. It is also hoped that it will be realised that this is the only possible arrangement in the present circumstances.

(3) As regards the salary of the Ministers, at the present moment, it will not be possible to agree to what is proposed, but it is agreed that the Ministers should draw a salary of Rs. 1,000 each, plus a sumptuary allowance of Rs. 500 per month and also Rs. 500 on account of house and car allowance, the Chief Minister getting an extra allowance of Rs. 500, such allowances being charged on the provincial revenues under section 78(3) (*g*), if legal opinion shows that they are not covered by section 78(3) (*c*) of the Government of India Act, 1935.

(4) Government have already accepted the principle of reduction of rent on equitable basis and a committee has been appointed in this connection. Government agree to add some more members from the said Proja Parties.

(5) Government will accept the principle of free and compulsory primary education throughout the province In matters of taxation in this connection, relief will be given to the poor classes of the people —*raiyats* and others. A committee, on which representation will be given to the said Proja Parties, will immediately be set up to investigate the question specially with reference to the question of financing the scheme and of amending the present Act.

(6) As regards the price of jute, Government have already appointed a committee and they agree to include in it some members of the said Proja Party or Parties.

(7) As regards the abolition of nomination of non-officials to all local bodies, e.g., District and Union Boards and the question of the extension of franchise, vote by ballot, Government will have the

question considered from all points of view and come to a decision. Almost all the Ministers are personally in favour and it is expected that there will be no difficulty. When a decision is arrived at, a Bill will be introduced with a view to implementing these reforms.

(8) A committee has already been appointed to investigate into the whole question in relation to the chaukidary system and Government will extend the scope of the enquiry by adding to the terms of reference already published, the following:—

"Whether, and if so to what extent, the cost of maintaining dafadars and chaukidars can and should be reduced" Government will appoint some members of the said Proja Party on the said committee.

(9) As regards the political prisoners, Government's position has already been made clear. Government maintain that they have been very liberal and that policy will be continued so long as the justification for this policy continues. Their cases will be examined by a committee on which the said Proja Party will be represented

(10) With reference to the question of giving effect to the resolution of the Assembly regarding ratio in the public services, Government is holding a conference of the leaders of the communities concerned with a view to arrive at a harmonious decision, failing which Government will take their own decision. With reference to the question of giving effect to the resolution relating to the age of retirement from public services, as also relating to the Council Resolution regarding additional educational grant for Muslims and scheduled castes, Government agree to appoint a committee to investigate the question. The said Proja Party or Parties will be represented on the committee set up for the purpose.

(11) Government agree to this principle and have already undertaken a fuller enquiry about this, and will set up a Parliamentary Committee, in which the said Proja Party or Parties will be represented, to examine amongst others, proposals that may be made in this regard by the Finance Department.

(12) Government agree to appoint 3 persons on the Revenue Commission having confidence of the said Proja Party. Government will make these appointments in consultation with the two leaders of the said Proja Party or Parties."

Not a single member has up till now been appointed on the Revenue Commission.

The modified terms offered by Mr. Fazlul Huq on behalf of the Cabinet were placed before the Executive Committee of the Nikhil Banga Krishak Praja Samity——

Mr. SPEAKER: You have already exceeded 15 minutes.

Mr. SHAMSUDDIN AHMED: Sir, it is a very important matter.

Mr. SPEAKER: All I say is that there should be a little difference between a statement and a speech in the House of the nature of an explanation.

Mr. SHAMSUDDIN AHMED: Then there was a resolution of the Executive Committee of the Nikhil Banga Krishak-Proja Samity to the following effect:—

It has transpired from a letter of the Hon'ble the Chief Minister that the basis on which the Executive Committee of the Nikhil Banga Krishak Proja Samity terminated its negotiations with the Hon'ble the Chief Minister by their resolution of 31st October 1938 was groundless. The Krishak-Proja Samity has reconsidered its previous resolution in the light of the letter of the Chief Minister mentioned above and this meeting of the Executive Committee, Nikhil Banga Krishak-Proja Samity, after careful consideration and due deliberation, resolves that the programme which was forwarded with the aforesaid letter of the Chief Minister is one which is acceptable to the Nikhil Banga Krishak-Proja Samity. This meeting resolves, therefore, that after a careful study of the present political situation of the country and having in view the future welfare of the Nikhil Banga Krishak-Proja Samity and its organisation and in the vital interests of the Projas in general, the members of the Krishak-Proja Assembly Party should act in co-operation with the present Ministerial Party on the basis of the attached programme which has been agreed upon.

Then there was difference in my party. A requisition was sent to me asking me to convene a meeting of the general Samity to discuss the whole question. I convened a meeting accordingly on 23rd December 1938, and the meeting held its deliberations for three days, on the last day of which the Premier attended, he made a statement that if the Samity would ask Mr. Shamsuddin to persuade the Cabinet in introducing Bills providing reduced salaries of Ministers according to the terms of settlement, free compulsory primary education without taxation on those who could not bear the burden, abolition of the system of nomination to local bodies and introduction of secret ballot system within a fixed date, Mr. Fazlul Huq assured the members of the Samity that it would be possible for Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed to do it and the Cabinet would certainly do it according to the terms of settlement and if this was not done not only Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed would walk out, but "I would also walk out." On this assurance given by the Hon'ble Mr. Fazlul Huq, the meeting most enthusiastically passed an agreed resolution giving support to Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed

in his acceptance of Ministry on condition that the above mentioned Bills should be gazetted before the next session of the Legislature. The requisitionists unconditionally withdrew their requisition. After that I have tried my level best to get this settlement implemented and specially the promises made by the Premier fulfilled, but all in vain.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Sir, what makes the Hon'ble Ministers chuckle?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: May I make one suggestion, Sir, in order to ensure despatch of business will you very kindly arrange to provide a seat for Dr. Sanyal near you so that you may pull him up when necessary?

Mr. SHAMSUDDIN AHMED: During my short term of office which extended from 17th November 1938 to 17th February 1939 I have tried my level best to act according to my ability to do honour to the high office to which I was called to serve I undertook tours to several districts in order to acquaint myself with the wishes of the people specially in my department in respect of the jute problem I went to Chittagong with the Premier and addressed several meetings there I began my tour from Kushtia, my own constituency, where I had to address about 10,000 people. During my tours I travelled ordinarily in third class and asked the people to support Coalition Government and organise the Krishak-Proja Samities. During my tours there were two meetings in the mufassil of Dacca My entrance as a Plebian in the Nawab of Dacca's territory was too much to bear - the last straw on the camel's back and Mr Abdul Latif Biswas, M.L.A., Mr. Syed Abdus Salim, M.L.A., and Mr Fazlur Rahman, M.L.A., possibly under the inspiration and the guidance of the Nawab family of Dacca deeply resented my entry to that district. But nowhere have I uttered a single word against the League. Probably this travelling in third class and speaking something in the cause of Krishak-Proja Samities was too much for the League lords to bear. Mr. Abdul Latif Biswas, M.L.A., tabled a resolution to this effect in the Coalition Party after my Dacca tour.

"This meeting disapproves the action of the Hon'ble Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed for visiting the different parts of Bengal and holding meetings there without consulting and informing the local members of the Legislature supporting the Ministry, and in many cases identified himself with the Opposition party of the local members and taking parts in the activities against the local member in his own constituency."

The allegation made in the resolution is wholly untrue.

Another incident happened just after my acceptance of the Ministry. Some of the members of the Coalition Party at its meeting in December disapproved the action of Mr. Fazlul Huq in coming to an agreement with myself and Mr. Tamizuddin Khan on the basis of the facts I have already enumerated. Heated discussion took place in the Coalition Party meeting for two days. In the meeting the Chief Minister read out the terms of settlement that were arrived at, and the members deliberated on these terms. The meeting terminated its proceedings with passing a vote of confidence in the Hon'ble Mr. Fazlul Huq after inclusion of myself and Mr. Tamizuddin Khan as members of the Cabinet on the basis of those terms and conditions.

Even after the expiration of full three months' time, not a single item, each one of them solemn as it is, was implemented. I submitted my resignation letter to the Chief Minister on the 16th February at 5-30 p.m. I know nothing of what happened about the letter but at 11 a.m. next day, Mr. Pinnell, Private Secretary to His Excellency the Governor of Bengal, rang me up and told me——.

Mr. SPEAKER: Order, order. You cannot divulge anything that took place between you and the Government House. How long will you take to finish your speech?

Mr. SHAMSUDDIN AHMED: In about five minutes.

Mr. SPEAKER: All right, you will be given five minutes after the adjournment. I must adjourn the House now for prayer.

The House was adjourned for 10 minutes for prayer.

(*After adjournment*)

Mr. SHAMSUDDIN AHMED: A statement has been issued under the signatures of certain gentlemen of the Ministerialist Coalition Party. They have referred to certain misstatements of facts which it is my duty to controvert. At one place they have said "we emphatically deny that Mr. Shamsuddin's resignation has anything to do with the cause of the Proja." In view of the statement that I have already made, the public will judge whether it is for the cause of the Proja or for any other cause that I resigned.

So far as regards other points, the reduction of salary of the Ministers and the abolition of the nomination to the local bodies, I have already stated that it was on the basis of the settlement between the Cabinet and myself I entered the Cabinet. There is one point I have got to answer wherein the members referred to the resolution passed in the Krishak-Proja Party wherein they say that the so-called Krishak-Proja

Party met some time in the middle of December. I must remind my friends that it was not a Party meeting, but a meeting of the General Samity, that in this "so-called Krishak Party" the Chief Minister was present. Now whether it is "so-called", "imaginary" or real it is for them to decide. That was a meeting of the general Samity wherein Mr. Fazlul Huq came to give his assurance in most solemn terms to the conditions to which I have already referred. The meeting might have been held a month after my assumption of office but members should know that it requires time to call a general meeting. So far as the date or time-limit was concerned it is certainly not merely a matter between myself and my party, for the terms of settlement were presented to the Premier, and it was as Premier that he came to our meeting and solemnly promised that he and his Cabinet would honour the terms. Can Mr. Huq deny that his solemn promise was a great factor in the determination of members of the Samity to agree to a settlement with the Cabinet? In the time-limit that was fixed the Samity mentioned the 7th of February as the time limit 7th February passed away. Even after the expiry of the time-limit I tried to persuade the Chief Minister and his colleagues on the Cabinet to honour at least one of the terms in the settlement. But nothing was done. I had no alternative but to resign from the Cabinet, the leader and members of which did not agree to honour the terms of the settlement which the Premier had accepted on their behalf. I, a humble servant of the nation which I have faithfully served, could not but choose the only honourable course left to me, that is, resignation of my seat in the Cabinet. I had the last lingering hope that according to the terms of settlement, Mr. Fazlul Huq would try his level best to bring about a fusion of the two Samities, both of which are now functioning as the Nikhil Banga Krishak-Praja Samities over one of which he presides and over the other Maulana Abdulla-hil-Baki presides. But this was also not done. Mr. Fazlul Huq might remember that at the time of the laying of the foundation stone ceremony of the Agriculture Institute at Dacca on the 17th of December, 1938, last, incidentally I made an impassioned appeal to him to take the leadership of the Krishak-Proja movement again according to the promise he held out at the time of election in 1936-37, kindling thereby new hopes and aspirations in the minds of the cultivators of Bengal. I said there that there might have been a split, a short rift in the lute. I appealed to him to mobilise all the forces of the Krishak-Projas of Bengal and become its accredited leader. But all my hopes in him have been dashed to pieces. I find he has failed. By his taking up the leadership of the Proja movement I did not mean that he would oppose the League propaganda. I am told that Mr. Fazlul Huq has in the meantime signed the League pledge. The necessary conclusion is that the Coalition Government has ceased to exist and if it is any Government it is the League Government dominated by a capitalist

Mr. Nalini Ranjan Sarkar.

Before I conclude I would speak one word in reply to one sentence which the signatories of the Coalition Party has said about me "Under these circumstances Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed must have thought that unless he makes a quick exit he was sure to be faced with an unhappy situation. So his hasty retreat under the smoke screen of Proja interest can easily be seen through". In reply to the statement I can say that "a jaundiced eye sees everything yellow". Mention has also been made about my signing the pledge of the Coalition Party by members of the Sub-Committee. I have been yet unable to pursuade myself to believe how a member of one political party functioning in the legislature can sign the pledge of another party in the same legislature. And it is a miracle to me as to how two or three political parties can form themselves into another party known as the Coalition Party.

Now, in conclusion, I must say that the Bengal Government if it is to function as a government, it must be a government in which Proja representatives should be in the majority and even if it be a government predominantly Muslim government, it must be run strictly on non-communal basis, that is the dream of the future of my country. The province where teeming millions steeped in abject poverty cannot have two full meals a day, cannot think of having as its administrators, Knights, Nawabs and Rajas, who have nothing to their credit so far as the service of the nation is concerned.

Maulvi ABDUL LATIF BISWAS: May I rise on a point of explanation?

Mr. SPEAKER: Only a Minister can make a statement at this stage.

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: During the last 23 months that we have been in office there have appeared in the columns of the press no less than nearly twice 23 statements against me and my Cabinet full of misrepresentations, insinuations, distortions of facts, half-truths, couched in languages which in many instances have exceeded the bounds of decorum and decency. Many a time I was goaded to reply, but I restrained myself, because I felt it to be my solemn duty to reconcile conflicting forces and co-ordinate all the available resources at our disposal for the good of the province as a whole.

I know, Sir, that it is impossible to make a statement without wounding anybody's feelings, and the wisest man is he who remains tongue-tied even under the greatest of provocations. To-day I have been forced by my esteemed friend, Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed, to make a statement, and although I shall try to spare his feelings as much as I

can, I believe I owe it to myself, to the Coalition Party, to the community to which I belong, and to the country in which I live, to state certain facts in order that the whole position might be made clear.

In the first place, my friend Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed has been talking of his party, his group and his followers. I was at one time under a delusion when I thought that Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed was really the leader of a party. That question was put to test when he came and joined the Cabinet and for three or four days during the negotiation preceding his inclusion, there was a definite statement made by him that if he were included in the Cabinet, he would be able to bring his whole group into the Coalition Party or at any rate for the support of the present Ministry. I told him at that time that I never expected that the 19 or 20 members who sat with him in Opposition could be induced to come over to support the Ministry. I made it quite clear to him that I never expected him to attain the impossible. I made it quite clear that I would be quite satisfied if he could come in with one or two followers who might come willingly and without compulsion and would be prepared to follow him as obediently and as loyally as the followers have got to obey their leaders. Now, Sir, throughout the long hours during which the negotiation lasted he could not get the signature to any document of more than two members. On the day when the final decision was taken, and I was to have gone to see His Excellency the Governor with my final proposal to get Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed and Mr. Tamizuddin Khan included in the Cabinet, I was told by Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed that he would be able to bring five followers with him. I said that that was more than I expected and I would be perfectly satisfied if he could do that. I went further and said that he need not trouble himself about followers. I asked him to come and join me and help me in carrying out the programme which was chalked out between ourselves during the election times—a programme on which he insisted so much and a programme of which so much was heard in this country ever since I took office. At about 3 o'clock, Sir, I found only two signatures and on my enquiry as to what had happened to the others of the group he mentioned the names of some friends—Mr. Jalaluddin Hashemy is one, Kazi Emdadul Haque is another, and two others who were not in Calcutta. I was told they would signify their assent by telegram. When I sent word to Mr. Jalaluddin Hashemy who was in Calcutta he sent word back that he was in the midst of a committee meeting and that he would come and see me as soon as the committee meeting was over. I was to have seen His Excellency the Governor at 6 p.m. and I waited and waited and sent my Private Secretary, my Assistant Secretary, and a number of persons, but they found Mr. Jalaluddin Hashemy so deeply engaged in municipal affairs that he could not spare even a single minute to come and talk to the gentlemen whom I had sent to him. At 6 p.m. I gave up all hope and telephoned to the

Private Secretary to His Excellency the Governor saying that the document was not yet complete and that I wanted 3 hours' time. That time was granted and at about 9 o'clock no more signatures were forthcoming. Sir Nazimuddin and other members of the Cabinet who were at my house objected to Mr. Shamsuddin being taken without the condition being fully acted upon and implemented. I on behalf of Mr. Shamsuddin gave the assurance that between ourselves we would be able to bring two more members and upon that I was authorised by my colleagues to close the negotiations, and, with their consent, I went to His Excellency the Governor and placed the new names for inclusion in the Cabinet.

Now, Sir, as regards the agreement which has been read out, I may tell the House that that agreement was never signed by Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed because he had not the permission or the cognizance of his party to do so. The only document which he signed was a short statement which was released to the Press, but as regards the agreement giving out the terms, it was Mr. Tamizuddin Khan, the Nawab Bahadur of Dacca and myself who signed but not Mr. Shamsuddin. May I also mention in this connection that as regards the fulfilment of the terms, no time-limit was given in the agreement that was drawn up when Mr Shamsuddin Ahmed and Mr. Tamizuddin Khan were included in the Cabinet; nor was there any specific mention of the three other matters about which so much has been made and to which I am presently going to refer.

Then, Sir, after Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed's inclusion I did my level best to induce him to give up all vain attempts of bringing what he called his followers and to be content with coming into the Cabinet and to give us the benefit of his help and his experience and his immense knowledge of Proja affairs. Now, Sir, there was a reason why I said so. I have been in politics now for more than 30 years, and experience has told me that Bengal politics has got certain peculiarities for which it is impossible to find a parallel in other provinces and other countries Sir, nearly 14 years ago when I was a Minister the late Deshbandhu C. R. Das induced about 22 Muslim members of the Council to join the Swaraj Party and to do their very best to throw me out of office. It was on the strength of the support given by those Muslim members that the late Mr. C. R. Das was successful in wrecking my ministry. After 14 years, Sir, I am faced with a spectacle of a number of Muslim members of this House joining hands with the Congress in order to wreck this ministry, and to throw me out of power again. Now, Sir, I recognise in this House Congress Opposition of two kinds. The Congress Opposition on my left is No. I. And the Congress Opposition No. II is the opposition of all my friends who constitute the Proja Party. Now, knowing them as I do, I decline to believe that they are real Krishak Proja workers; they are Congressmen in disguise and I say it

here and now that they are sailing under false colours; they are throwing dust into the eyes of the people saying that they are Krishak Proja workers; they are no less than Congress workers. They have been so all their lives. That may be right or wrong but it is more honest to come out with their true colours and not to take shelter under a false flag. That is the point I want to stress. Knowing that, I am convinced that these gentlemen whom Mr. Shamsuddin believes to be his followers could never have come and supported this Ministry and it was a vain hope on his part that they would do so. I tried to dissuade him from losing time, wasting time and energy, in trying to attempt the impossible.

Now, Sir, as regards the three matters of which so much has been said and to which Mr. Shamsuddin has referred more than once in the course of his statement, one day Mr Shamsuddin came to me and said that there were only three things which would bring all the 21 members to the support of the ministry and those were a Bill to reduce the salaries of Ministers, a Bill to amend the Primary Education Act, and a Bill to abolish nomination and introduce ballot system. He asked me to go and meet the members of the Krishak Proja Party of which he was the leader and to give them an assurance that these would be done. I told him that it was impossible for me to give the assurance on behalf of the Cabinet, but personally I was prepared to go and meet those gentlemen —many of whom were my friends and with whom I had worked for years—and explain the whole situation to them I went and explained the situation. I said that "as regards the amendment of the Primary Education Act it is a matter which is already engaging my attention; I am personally in favour of it and I shall certainly do my best; and I have no doubt that I would be able to satisfy the demands of the Krishak Proja Party in that respect". As regards the question of the reduction of salaries I said that "we are committed to it by the terms of the agreement; it is a matter of ways and means; and I will press this matter on my Cabinet and have it done as quickly as possible".

As regards the question of nomination, I explained to them that I was personally in favour of abolition and many of the Ministers I knew were in favour of abolition and therefore I said that on this point also there would hardly be any difference of opinion. But I deny that I gave any time limit. It was impossible for me to give any time limit, although I certainly said that, as things stood, I believed that it would not take more than a couple of months in order to implement those changes by means of Bills and to place them before the Legislature.

Now, Sir, Mr. Shamsuddin knows very well that I have done my best in order to satisfy the requirements of his friends in this respect. As regards amendments to the Primary Education Act, practical experience has shown that it is not such a simple matter as it appears

at first sight, but nevertheless we have held conferences and only the other day I had a conference with the Hon'ble Minister in charge of Revenue, the Member of the Board of Revenue, the Secretary to the Board of Revenue, the Secretary to the Education Department and the Director of Land Records and we have arrived at a tentative solution of the difficulties and we have asked the Legislative Department to draft a Bill and to place it before the House. I fail to see how in this matter I have not acted up to any assurance, if assurance it can be called, which I may have given to Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed.

As regards the abolition of nomination, I have found that there was such a divergence of view on this point that it was impossible to draft a Bill without setting up a Committee in order to arrive at a formula which would be least open to objection. That Committee has been set up and it has enquired into the question and I expect that there will be a decision—a definite decision—one way or the other which will be before the members of this House in some shape or other in order that they may see that we have not at all tried to shirk our responsibility. As regards the Bill for the reduction of Ministers' salaries, it has been pointed out to us that the agreement that the Ministers ought to receive a salary of Rs. 1,000 *plus* allowance No. 1, *plus* allowance No. 2, *plus* allowance No. 3 of Rs. 500 each was something so absurd and incongruous that we would be making ourselves a laughing stock before the world, if we accepted a proposition like that. And it was suggested to us that the best course would be to be honest, fair and frank and to say that we are going to take a salary of Rs 2,000. It has been pointed out to us that there are legal difficulties in the way and I can tell the House that our legal advisers have pointed out that there cannot be a Bill to change our salary without a termination of our present term of office. The Government of India Act lays down that once Ministers' salaries are fixed by the Legislative Assembly, the salaries cannot be changed during the term of office of those Ministers——

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: They are entirely wrong.

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: Will you please stop and keep quiet?

Mr. SPEAKER: Order, order, please.

The Hon'ble Nawab Khwaja HABIBULLAH Bahadur, of Dacca: On a point of order, Sir. Is the honourable member entitled to interrupt the Leader of the House when you have ruled that no member should interrupt when either the Leader of the House or the Leader of the Opposition is on his legs?

Mr. SPEAKER: Unless some electric device is found by means of which members can be compelled not to rise up, it is difficult for me to stop them. I would, however, remind Dr. Sanyal that statements made by the Leader of the House as well as the Leader of the Opposition command a much wider audience than the narrow limits of this House, and that, therefore, they should not be disturbed and hope Dr. Sanyal will refrain from doing so again.

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: Now, Sir, as regards the legal point, it may be right or it may be wrong, but that is the opinion of our legal advisers If it is possible to do anything in that direction we have got to take our party into confidence. We will place the suggestion before the Coalition Party, before the Scheduled Caste members who have been supporting us, the European Group, and the Nationalist Hindu Group, and if it is their decision and their desire that a Bill, if any, can be introduced, we will not on our part raise any objection.

Now, Sir, that being the position, I fail to see how Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed can say that we have not tried to implement any assurances we may have given. On the contrary, Sir, many of the terms given by Mr. Shamsuddin could not be fulfilled because he could not make good his assurance that he would be able to bring with him any members of his group. The House will perhaps remember that on the day when the Assembly met the whole of his group sat in Opposition Benches although their leader was sitting with the Cabinet Ministers. Now, Sir, that was proof positive that they were not going to cross the floor with their so-called leader. And I fail to see how Mr Shamsuddin can say that the terms given by him should have been implemented, while he or his party could not fulfil the pledge as a condition precedent for his joining the Cabinet.

Now, Sir, he has referred to the fact that no member of his party has been appointed to the Land Revenue Commission. I submit, Sir, he is himself responsible for that. Before we could make any appointments to the Land Revenue Commission, it would be necessary that his group, according to the terms he had given, should have come over, if not joined the Coalition Party, at any rate had consented to support the Ministry. We are not going to take any more members from the Opposition because we have already taken members from the Congress Group. We wanted to take members from the genuine Krishak Party and not members who belong to that party in name only but are really Opposition members carrying the Congress Flag.

Then, Sir, as regards the appointment of members of his group to the various committees the same thing applies. They did not sign the pledge of the Coalition Party, they never joined that party, they never gave the slightest indication that they were going to work with us,

together, they did not even attend the meetings of the Coalition Party after Mr. Shamsuddin became a Minister. I fail to see how Mr. Shamsuddin can complain that we have treated his party as a party in opposition and that we have not extended to them that courtesy which we have extended to the members of Mr. Tamizuddin's Group. I may mention that Mr. Tamizuddin has implemented to the full the terms when he became a Minister. All those members who have been following him have joined the Coalition Party and are helping us; they are working with us and they are as much members of the Coalition Party as those who have been supporting us from the very beginning. Therefore, Sir, I submit that the complaint that we have not been able to implement the terms given by Mr. Shamsuddin, does not bear scrutiny, because of the failure, if any, on their part to carry out their part of the agreement.

Now, Sir, Mr. Shamsuddin has referred to the fact that the present Cabinet is a Cabinet dominated by Mr. Nalini Ranjan Sarker. I admit I am a very weak man and I am dominated by strong personalities; and knowing Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed, as I do, I thought that he with his powerful personality, his past experience, his transparent honesty, his great driving power would be able to overshadow Mr. Nalini Ranjan Sarker and dominate the Cabinet so that the Cabinet might be known as Shamsuddin Cabinet instead of as Nalini Cabinet. When I brought him into the Cabinet, I thought he would alone be able to overshadow the other ten members of the Cabinet. But unfortunately he thought otherwise. I know, and I say without any fear of contradiction and I am prepared to be the subject of as much abuses as possible in the columns of the press when I make the statement, that Mr. Shamsuddin has been forced by his so-called followers to leave the Cabinet and that he was too weak to resist the pressure that was put upon him. That is a very very patent fact. Mr. Abu Hossain Sarkar came to me on that fateful afternoon of Thursday last when I was sitting here and delivered to me an envelope saying that his leader had asked him to deliver that letter to me. I was surprised that Mr. Shamsuddin has become a leader after his resignation. Mr. Shamsuddin was no leader so long as he was a Minister. The moment he signed the document, sealed and delivered it, Mr. Abu Hossain Sarkar had the goodness to admit that Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed was his leader.

Now, Sir, a good deal has been said about non-adherence to programmes and assurances. May I point out that in politics it is not always possible to adhere to programmes made during the turmoil of a general election? A glaring instance is to be found in the case of the Congress Ministries. At the time of the election the Congress definitely said that they were going to get themselves elected with a view to wrecking the Constitution. That was their firm determination even up to March, 1937. But when the *ad interim* ministries were

set up and some unpleasant events took place which placed many people in power which the Congress could not tolerate, they suddenly came to this decision that it would be wise to accept ministry and work the Constitution. Therefore, Sir, if such a great organisation like the Congress can go back upon its solemn pledges and say one thing at one moment and do something else at another when the general elections are over, what are we poor frail mortals to do but to make changes here and there and get on in order to carry out the objects which we have all in view, viz., the good of the masses which is our sole charge and for which we have spent so much of our time and energy and for which we are accountable to God and man?

Now, Sir, I shall conclude with an earnest appeal to my friend Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed not to be any more misled by the assurances or the advices given by friends and pseudo-friends but to ask his conscience if really the things on which he had set his heart are things which are necessary for the advancement of the Proja cause. What is it, Sir, that the Projas want? Do they care a brass farthing how much the Ministers draw as their salary, do they care a brass farthing whether the other conditions to which my friend Mr. Shamsuddin has referred are implemented or not? All that they are concerned with is, as I have already said, whether provision has been made for their *dal-bhat* (Laughter from the Opposition benches.) Have any of my friends over there done anything for providing *dal-bhat* for the people? Have they done anything so as to make it possible to grow two blades of grass where one grew before? They have done nothing of the kind, but here they are asking Government to do this and do that. I submit, Sir, that they have not been able to put forward any constructive programme.

Sir, I shall finish in two minutes, but before I do so, I must make it clear that the claim that is made either by the Congress or by the pseudo-Congress—the Congress in disguise—viz., the so-called Krishak Proja Group sitting in opposition, that whatever good the present Government have done has been done under pressure brought to bear upon them by the latter, is absolutely unfounded and must be contradicted with all the strength that I can command. The position is this. There can be no pressure brought to bear upon the Government by the minority which is in opposition. After all, what pressure can the Congress bring to bear upon the Government? They can ask us to do something and in the alternative, they can only threaten us that they will vote against us. I never expected that they would ever vote for us. It is the Coalition Party which can bring pressure upon us. They can say "We have supported you through thick and thin. We have stood loyally by you. Do this; otherwise we shall withdraw our support". That would be pressure, and that is the pressure which as my friends of the Coalition Party and the Scheduled Castes who vote

with us know very well has always sustained us. And it is on account of that pressure that whatever little has been done regarding the amendment of the Bengal Tenancy Act and other measures has been accomplished. The claim that has been made by the Congress, and the Congress in disguise, viz., the so-called Krishak Proja Group is, I repeat, absolutely unfounded. We don't care a brass farthing for them. They have always been against us, and they will ever remain against us. We will fight them and make them fight us.

Mr. Abu Hossain Sarkar, you were not a born politician! 'Don't dabble in it. (Laughter from Opposition benches.)

I conclude with the remarks that, so far as the Coalition Party is concerned, they could never tolerate the idea that I should bring in Mr. Shamsuddin to the Cabinet without his being a member of the Coalition Party first. Indeed I was severely taken to task for doing so. I now find that I was in the wrong and that the Coalition Party was right. I am here, Sir, to vindicate the honour of the Coalition Party which for the last 23 months has been working day and night for the good of the masses, for the good of the Projas (cries of "Hear, hear" from the Coalition Party benches), although they did not go on trumpeting their desire to do good for the masses. Although they have not like the Opposition, carried aloft the Proja flag for cheap popularity, yet they have been working so very hard that they have done more for the good of the masses than any other party existing at the present moment in Bengal

Sir, we have heard much of the zemindar element in the Cabinet. May I tell the House without divulging a Cabinet secret that these so-called zemindar members have been more insistent on granting concessions than even the Proja representatives? I know it, Sir, and with a clear conscience I can bear testimony to this that I have found zemindar members of the Cabinet pleading the cause of the Projas with a fervour we have seldom found in those who masquerade as the champions of the Krishak Projas and who want to capture the imagination of the Projas by false pretence of what they are not doing. (Maulvi ABU HOSSAIN SARKAR: But you ignore the Europeans!)

Mr. SPEAKER: Order, order. I have already warned you once, Mr. Sarkar. Even though the Chief Minister may like to answer your question, I am not going to allow you to disturb the proceedings by such interruptions.

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: Now, Sir, an appeal has been made by my friend Mr. Shamsuddin to bring about a union between the two Krishak Proja Samitis. Whatever the people may say, I do not believe that there are two Krishak Proja Samitis. The Krishak Proja Samiti with which Mr. Shamsuddin has now allied

himself is not a Krishak Proja Samiti at all. It is a Congress Samiti masquerading under the name of Krishak Proja Samiti. Between that and the real Krishak Proja Samiti, there can be no alliance. The real Krishak Proja Samiti will go on working for the good of the masses and not pander to the requirements of any political party for the sake of any political advancement. Therefore, it is a mistake to suppose that there are two Krishak Proja Samitis. I emphatically repeat that there is only one Krishak Proja Samiti. Every other Samiti, whether of peasants, kisans, or krishaks, who are really socialists or communists in disguise, can never expect that the real Krishak Proja Samiti will ever join hands with them and disturb the normal strength of the samiti by activities which have got to be checked if the peace of the country is to be preserved and the country allowed to progress on normal lines.

I believe, Sir, that I have taken too much time of the House. I have been obliged to speak rather at random because I have spoken from notes hurriedly taken. I only hope that the statement which I have now made will make some points clear, namely, that there has been no desire on our part to compel Mr. Shamsuddin to resign and that we could not help Mr. Shamsuddin for the simple reason that he could not bring his followers to come and join us and that he did not sign our agreement. He could not point out to anything which was said at the time he became a member of the Cabinet and which we did not try to implement. That would have been a good cause, but an excuse has been made of something which happened after the event and that cannot be said to be the basis of a grievance. Secondly, I may point out that although my friends over there claim to be Krishak Projas I have every reason to suppose that they are not so: they are Congressmen—they are Congressmen in disguise and, as they cannot have the courage to stand up as Congressmen, because they know that in that case they will be thrown out by the Muslim community the moment they say they are Congressmen, they have taken shelter under the guise of Krishak Projas. But I can tell them here and now that if they cast their votes in this House against the Ministry, they would be going against the mandate of their own constituency, they would not be true to their own constituency: therefore I say they are false to their constituency and it does not lie in their mouth to ask Government to explain why certain conditions have not been implemented, and I say Mr. Shamsuddin could not carry out his part of the agreement. (Cheers from Coalition Benches.)

GENERAL DISCUSSION OF THE BUDGET.

Mr. SPEAKER: We will now begin the general discussion of the budget.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: May I enquire how long you propose to sit this evening?

Mr. SPEAKER: Up to 8 o'clock, unless the House desires otherwise.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: May I submit that in that case we may begin to-morrow at 11 o'clock because discussion of the budget will necessarily require longer hours.

Mr. SPEAKER: You will get as much time as you want. I want to know Dr. Sanyal whether it is the unanimous opinion of your group that the House will sit to-morrow at 11 o'clock.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: It is my personal opinion.

Mr. SPEAKER: Your Leader himself and most of the important members of your party and other parties cannot possibly attend at 11 o'clock. I must look to the convenience of every section of the House.

On the last occasion I asked that on the first day of the general discussion of the budget I should like to have a list of names of speakers from every group of this House whom they want to put up. I have got some lists but I have not got others. I hope they will be given as soon as possible. It will give me an idea as to how many speakers will speak. What I propose to do is that when I have got all the lists giving order of the speakers I will follow exactly that list. But where it has not been given according to order I will have a ballot before me and I will call according to that ballot. Now I propose that the debate should be initiated by the Congress Party, and I would ask Mr. Pramatha Nath Banerjee to speak.

Mr. PRAMATHA NATH BANERJEE: I rise to-night to initiate on behalf of the Congress Party the discussion on the budget presented by the Hon'ble the Finance Minister. I hope, Sir, that the tension, the excitement and the confusion in the House caused by Ministerial squabbles have ceased. To the unreality of the situation if I were to add the futility of the criticisms—may not be intelligent criticisms—which I propose to level against the budget, then, Sir, I am afraid I have to begin by making a complaint against the allotment of the time of the House. The Hon'ble the Finance Minister took about an hour and 45 minutes to deliver his printed speech before this House. We on the Opposition side are called upon to criticise that speech in less than 15 minutes and circular notices have been sent round to us to remind us of the rule that Hon'ble Ministers are entitled to speak for 30 minutes. To-night I find there are 11 Hon'ble Ministers on the

Treasury Benches. If in the course of the budget discussion, the number swells then the whole of the time allotted to the discussion of the budget may be very usefully employed by the Hon'ble Ministers themselves. Fifteen minutes' time, Sir, to discuss 15 crores of rupees! I never realised before I was a member of this House that my time was so very valuable. One crore to a minute! What a vista in front of me!

Mr. Speaker, it is often said that the roots of the present lie deep in the past. Therefore in order to begin my criticisms against the receipts side and the expenditure side of the present budget and in order to offer my opposition to the proposal for the imposition of additional taxation and to threats of further taxation may I start from that auspicious day according to the English calendar, viz., the 1st April, 1937, when Provincial Autonomy was ushered into existence. On that date the liabilities of the province to the extent of Rs. 8,41,00,000 were wiped out including interest charges to the extent of Rs. 23 lakhs: on that date the Government of India gave to the Government of Bengal a working surplus of Rs 98 lakhs in order to carry on the administration Further we obtained Bengal's share in two very important taxes, namely, the jute tax to the extent of 62½ per cent. and income-tax to the extent of 20 per cent. were made over. These taxes have been described in the Red Book as "customs". I believe the gentleman who coined this expression must have been familiar with the ancient prises and customs of England. Be that as it may, this is how we got started on the 1st April, 1937. During the working of the first year, according to the financial statement of the Hon'ble the Finance Minister this province had a surplus revenue of one crore 18 lakhs During the second year the anticipated receipts fell off, according to him by 42 lakhs due to causes which he says are partly due to world conditions and causes and partly due to domestic reasons. I am not concerned with any factor in international high politics or in international high finance. Whether or not Mr. Chamberlain succeeded at the Munich Conference or Signor Mussolini yielded fruitful results in his conversations with Mr. Chamberlain in Rome are questions I shall leave to the Hon'ble the Finance Minister. He hears whispers: we read speeches in the press. The position this year is that on the receipt side the Finance Minister has made a serious contraction. In fact due to flood, due, according to him to the suspension of the certificate procedure in the khas mahals, due to the abolition of landlord's fees and due to a variety of other complex reasons, as I was pointing out to you just now, Mr Speaker, the year opens with a balance of Rs. 78 lakhs instead of Rs. 1,20,00,000 the estimated balance. Yet the Hon'ble the Finance Minister in the next year's budget estimates the receipts, the anticipated receipts, at only Rs. 13 lakhs over the drooping and dropping figures of the current year. He himself admits in the White Paper that this is due to his conservatism. I shall say over-caution, and this over-caution has been imported in order to

justify additional taxation and the raising of the proposed loan of one crore of rupees. Mr. Speaker, in the Budget the Hon'ble the Finance Minister states that "to-day we are at the end of our tether". I would not have liked the expression myself had it not been for the fact that the Government this year is preparing a cattle census and that a very large provision has been made in the Budget for the service of stud bulls, the introduction of Harina bulls and possibly the conservation of John bulls.

Mr. Speaker, the Hon'ble the Finance Minister in the course of three years of "stewardship"—I am quoting his words—has reduced the financial position of this province. It is once more a deficit province. We have eaten up the 98 lakhs of surplus. We have eaten up rupees 5 crores and 85 lakhs of receipts from additional taxation to the extent of about 60 lakhs from the stabilisation of the few emergency taxes characterised as "Modern Taxes" in the Red Book and from contribution from the Government of India from the jute tax and the income-tax. The financial position of the province is so desperate, that the Finance Minister proposes the raising of a loan of one crore and imposition of two taxes—one is the tax on dog racing. The introduction of dog racing will, I am sure, stand indelibly to the credit of this Government. I heard in this Assembly impassionate appeals made by the Hon'ble the Home Minister in cassocks and in sleeves that the introduction of lottery system in this country for the purpose of raising funds for benefiting eleemosynary and charitable institutions like hospitals, etc., would constitute a premium upon speculation and that speculation was laid at rest when the dog racing was introduced. The Hon'ble the Finance Minister has chosen the dog. Has he chosen the dog as a faithful animal? Has he chosen it to perpetuate the expiring license? Why did he not choose a nobler animal than the dog—the horse? The horse has to its credit many virtues including the virtues of potential additional taxation.

Then, Mr. Speaker, the Hon'ble the Finance Minister is imposing a poll tax upon all professions, upon all callings, upon all trades and lastly upon all employments. Ever since the date when Willian Pitt under the stress of circumstances and smarting under the lapse of an empire first introduced the income-tax, the income-tax, I am sure, has all along been levied in a graduated scale and not in a flat scale. The method chosen for the imposition is unjust and unfair. It dares not to an appreciable extent touch British business. It hits hard the middle classes in Bengal particularly the Hindus. The Finance Minister threatens us yet with further additional taxation in the Monsoon session. The Red Book tells me a comforting tale that due to the non-summoning of the Legislative Assembly in November last year Rs. 2,50,000 of the poor tax-payers' money was saved. After all, the vote of no-confidence yielded some tangible results. Let us repeat

the lessons this year, so that all this money may be saved and we may not be compelled to concur in additional imposition in the Monsoon session.

Coming to the expenditure side, I see at a time when the country is passing through a great economic depression, the Finance Minister proposes to increase the expenditure by about Rs. 78 lakhs more than the revised estimates and by Rs. 87 lakhs over the estimated budget receipts for the next year. I have not the time to deal with the various items of expenditure. That task will be more efficiently and more ably fulfilled by all my fellow members over here. But let me emphasize with the emphasis that I can command that most of the schemes of expenditure are of an absolutely unproductive character, that many of the items of expenditure do not redound to the credit of any Government in any part of the civilised world and that all the dreams which the Hon'ble the Finance Minister dreamt in his first speech in the Legislative Assembly, have melted away. Free and compulsory primary education supposed to be the birthright of every citizen is yet far off and notwithstanding the speech of the Chief Minister to-night will never materialise unless according to the Finance Minister additional taxation to the extent of 4 crores and 50 lakhs of rupees is levied upon the country. The middle-class unemployed still continue to remain unemployed. Agriculture, Industry and Commerce have in this plethora of distribution received only about an additional sum of 6 lakhs of rupees from the generous hands of the Hon'ble the Finance Minister.

The Finance Minister in his first budget speech showed great concern for the man behind the plough. That man behind the plough, lives in thriftlessness,—I am quoting his classical words—and in fatalism with rusted implements and crusted traditions. I will invite the Finance Minister to state, apart from the abolition of the landlords' fees and apart from the very doubtful suspension of the certificate procedure which he threatens to revive in the khas mahal, what has been done for the man behind the plough? To-night as in untold centuries past, the plough-man plods his weary way and leaves the world to darkness and to the Finance Minister.

I notice my friend the Hon'ble the Home Minister is absent. In 1936-37 the old Government was saddled with an expenditure of Rs. 58 lakhs on account of terrorism. All the detenus, I am told, have been released. I am told that the obligation of the Bengal Government so far as terrorism is concerned has been liquidated and yet we find but only the Police budget standing at the old figure but the Home Minister is asking for a small addition of roughly about Rs. 15 lakhs out of 67 lakhs for very many laudable objects including the demand for passage money

to Sergeants. He is not here, or I would have said that like a true custodian of law and order, he is the type of the wise who soars but never roams true to the kindred points of Police and Home.

The net result of this Budget which has been presented by the Hon'ble the Finance Minister is this—unemployment is unsolved; the claims of trade and commerce and industry have only just been recognised but not appreciated. The Government are satisfied with the appointment of a number of committees including the Agricultural Commission and the Economic Survey Committee. They are primordial methods known to Obstruction: Men may come and men may go but they go on forever. The man behind the plough is still clamouring for his daily *dal* and *bhat*. He cannot understand high politics as the Hon'ble the Chief Minister told us to-night but he realises to the full, the pangs of hunger. All public utility works like Irrigation for West Bengal, navigation for Eastern Bengal foreshadowed in the first speech of the Hon'ble the Finance Minister are not yet in the horizon and yet Civil Works claim from this Government an additional expenditure of 24 lakhs. We are told that a special officer has been appointed. The evidence of the existence of that special officer we have all received in the shape of big bulky volumes which have been issued from the Secretariat from time to time, but we are told also by the Finance Minister that 10 lakhs of rupees could not be spent last year due to lack of schemes. Not only that, Mr. Speaker, but the position is this that out of this amount we are having a number of buildings for not only Subdivisional Magistrates, Superintendents of Police, Deputy Superintendents of Police with whom we are familiar, but now we are going to have a number of buildings for Munsifs—rather uncommon in the old days—and for Sub-Registrars as well. As we have been reminded to-night when advertisements are put in the press next inviting applications for appointment to the Lower Subordinate Service like peons, etc., the Hon'ble the Finance Minister will also make provision for their quarters out of the public revenues of the province. Amidst squalid poverty and in the midst of bamboo huts and thatched mud walls will nestle snow white bulidings shining with electric lights for which provision to the extent of nearly two lakhs has been made in the budget. Happy are the contractors, happy will they be. Every man in arms should like to be.

I shall not say anything about the Department administered by the Hon'ble the Nawab Sahib. Sir, so far as the Forest receipts are concerned the gentleman who has drafted the report has stated that the forest income is not an instance of stability. Well, if there is anything stable in this world, it is the primeaval and the eternal forests. The Hon'ble the Nawab Sahib is more stable, more solid than even the Forest Department of the Government of Bengal.

So far as General Administration is concerned, two very important items of expenditure require some comment. One is the contribution of 30,000 rupees to the newspaper "Azad". I heard the Hon'ble the Chief Minister say in this House months ago that the "Azad" is not a newspaper or a news sheet; it is an instance of a journal. Well, Sir, we have heard about subventions given by Government to journals secretly but this is the first time that notwithstanding the establishment of the Publicity Department of the Government, notwithstanding the appointment of the Director of Public Information we are having an open avowed subvention granted to a newspaper. With all due respect to all journals of this type I may say it does not represent the views of the entire community. I find, Mr. Speaker, provision has been made for strengthening the Gurkha Rifles at Dacca. For what purpose? Law and order is there maintained by my friends Sir Nazimuddin, the Nawab of Dacca and Mr. Shahabuddin, but the Government of Bengal are not satisfied with that. They have made provision of tear gas. Mr Speaker, much of your task will be lightened—and your task is indeed very heavy—much of your time will be saved if the Government of Bengal made use of the tear gases in the Legislative Assembly. Then there will be no occasion for speeches but only tears, idle tears I know not what they mean, tears from the depth of some divine despair. These, Sir, are my observations on the Budget. (Applause from the Congress benches.)

Mr. SPEAKER: I would like to inform the other groups that though I have got a list I do not know yet who will speak on their behalf. So far as the Congress Group is concerned they have put up two or three speakers as a party. The others are there and I would like to know if the other groups also will put up any speakers representing their particular parties I know it is not possible to-day but to-morrow if the different parties can conveniently give me the names of one or two speakers from each party or group I will try that at least so far as those who speak on behalf of the party are concerned they are given as much facilities as possible. It is only with a view to help them that I am suggesting this course. As honourable members will realise it is not possible for me to give the same facilities to everybody, I have got the names of 56 members. So, if all the parties put up one or two persons who will speak on their behalf I will try to accommodate them. In the meantime Mr. Abu Hossain Sarkar——.

Mr. SARAT CHANDRA BOSE: Mr. Speaker, Sir, before the discussion proceeds further may I suggest that during the days allotted for general discussion the House should sit at least till 9 p.m.?

Mr. SPEAKER: I have no objection.

Maulvi ABU HOSSAIN SARKAR: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I have read and re-read the third Budget Estimate of the present Government of Bengal and I rubbed my eyes in amazement in not finding the rosy picture with fine ideas outlined in the previous two years brought into being. The man behind the plough of the Hon'ble Mr. N. R. Sarker has vanished behind the horizon and the refined sensibilities for prohibition are gone. The idea of economic planning is nowhere found. The promise of giving employment to the thousands of hungry-looking unemployed young men and women is forgotten and in their places are introduced the impious and misleading arguments of the landlords and the capitalist exploiters like, man-power and wealth, conflicting demands, limitations of revenue, voluntary efforts and united action. Where is the bold policy of removing the universal illiteracy, the chronic poverty of the masses, the deterioration of the productivity of the soil and human health, or where is the bold lead given for the industrialization of the province which is so very badly needed, or where is the attempt to curtail the general expenditure for saving money for the welfare of the nation? What has been done instead is rather shocking. The cost of General Administration and Police has been increased by 10 lakhs on each count over last year's expenditure, but all the Nation Building Departments like Public Health, Agriculture, Industrial Education have been neglected. Some welfare works only are attempted. On the 30,000 police force in Bengal we spend Rs. 734 per head annually whereas under the present dispensation only annas 4-6 pies for Education, anna 1-6 pies for Public Health, 2 pice for Industry and 2 pice for Agriculture per head of the population are allotted. Of all the wonderful performances the greatest one is a grant of Rs. 30,000 to Moulana Akram Khan either as a subsidy, or what I do not know, for conducting his Daily "Azad". He is made practically a Minister without a portfolio. Last year's extraordinary performance was to grant Rs. 10,000 for treatment of venereal diseases of the police officers or rather the seniors among them, but still it was a bit better; it was for stopping one kind of virus; whereas this year Rs. 30,000 has been allotted for injecting a particular noxious virus of communalism that infects the innocent also and yet a deficit budget of Rs. 1 crore is presented before us. We spend 70 lakhs of rupees for arming a single battalion but only 1½ crores for the mental equipment of 5 crores of unfortunate beings. The Finance Minister extracts 13 crores of revenue from us but when we make a demand he tries to call it incongruous—a fine police conception of Government. He wants the peace of the grave and not the cry of the people. And yet there is a cry of Huq Ministry Zindabad: strange irony of fate! It is possible only because the country is inhabited by some millions of ignorant people. The Finance Minister deplores that he got only 7 lakhs more than last year's receipt from Excise and also sighs for the lot of the legal profession which he bases on the ignorance of

people. But he does not feel for the lot of 4½ crores of agriculturists who are selling gold and silver ornaments in open market in lump just like potato and other agricultural produce. He does not show a bit of sympathy for them. But be that as it may, the caravan must pass on. Very few governments begin their career at such auspicious times. There was a surplus budget; there was peace in the country; the political sky was serene; what good things for the country could not have been done? But we get a deficit budget instead. If things go on like this, perhaps at the end of this Government we shall get only gambling with public money with the teeming hungry millions in the countryside. But yet there is somebody in our country to cry Huq Ministry Zindabad!

Babu NARENDA NARAYAN CHAKRABARTY: আমাদের বাংলা আলোচনা সেটা মাঠে মারা গেল। এবং যাদের কথা বলবার সবচেয়ে প্রয়োজনীয়তা বেশী আজকের ব্যবস্থা পরিষদের অবস্থাও প্রায় তাই হয়েছে। একজন মন্ত্রী এবং আর একজন ভূতপূর্ব মন্ত্রীর মধ্যে যে লড়াই হলো তাতেকোরে মধ্যে থেকে আমাদের বাংলাদেশের অর্থনৈতিক সমস্যার যে আলোচনা সেটা মাঠে মারা গেল। এবং যাদের কথা বলবার সবচেয়ে প্রয়োজনীয়তা বেশী আজকের এই হিসাব নিকাশের এই আলোচনা সভায় তাদের কথা বলবার আর প্রয়োজন রইলো না, কারণ এ আশ্বাস পাওয়াই গেছে যে, তারা ডালভাত প্রচুর পরিমাণেই পাবে, এবং মন্ত্রীরা বর্তমান থাকতেই পাবে।

এবারকার যে বাজেট আনা হয়েছে এটা এদেশের শতকরা ৯০ জনের বাজেট নয় একথা খুব বেশী আলোচনা না কোরেও বলা যেতে পারে। সেই নিঃস্ব, নিরন্ন, স্বাস্থ্যহীন, গৃহহীন শ্রমিক ও কৃষক-প্রজা, রাজকোষের বেশীর ভাগ অর্থই নাকি যারা নিজেদের বঞ্চিত কোরে যুগিয়ে আসছে, তাদের জন্য এ বাজেট নয়, এটা ধনিক এবং তাদের আশ্রিত পরিশ্রমজীবীদের বাজেট; যারা জানে, বিনা পরিশ্রমে অপরের পকেট থেকে নিজের পকেটে কি কোরে টাকা আনতে হয়। ১৪ কোটি টাকা মোট ব্যয় দেখানো হয়েছে। তার মধ্য থেকে ৬॥৹ কোটি টাকাই যাবে কর্মচারীদের পারিশ্রমিকের বাবদে। বাকি যা রৈলো, তার মধ্য থেকে Civil Works Department এর দরুণ ২৪ লক্ষ টাকা বেশী ব্যয়ের বরাদ্দ দেখানো হয়েছে। এই Civil Works মানে শ্রমজীবিদের জন্য কুটির তৈরী নয়, বা গরীব চাসী প্রজাদের, যাদের ডালভাতের ব্যবস্থার জন্য আমাদের মহামান্য প্রধান মন্ত্রী মহাশয় একান্ত উৎসুক, তাদের জন্যও কোন কিছু ব্যবস্থা করা নয়; এই অতিরিক্ত টাকায় হয়েছে—থানায় কতকগুলি বাড়ী, কতকগুলি ডাক বাংলো, আদালতের জন্য বড় বড় বাড়ী, সরকারী ইমারতের জন্য বিজলি বাতির বন্দোবস্ত আর বর্তমান মন্ত্রীমণ্ডলের অপূর্ব কীর্ত্তি পর্দা কলেজের গৃহ। সরকারী প্রচার পত্রের মহিমায় হয়তো অচিরাৎ আমরা শুনতে পাবো যে, বাংলার সুদূর পল্লী হতে দলে দলে নিরন্ন কৃষক কন্যারা এসে এই পর্দা কলেজে পড়ছে!! অতএব এ সমস্ত ব্যবস্থা নিছক কৃষকদেরই কল্যানের জন্য অর্থাৎ বাংলা দেশের অধিবাসীদের মধ্যে শতকরা ৯০ জন যারা, তাদেরই উন্নতির জন্য যে হয়েছে একথা আমরা মেনে নিতে বাধ্য। তারপর প্রীমতি লিখিত সুসমাচারে আমরা জানছি যে, বাংলার রাস্তা-ঘাট নির্ম্মানের পরিকল্পনা (Road Development projects) সত্বর কার্য্যকরী করবার জন্য মস্ত বড় একজন Special officer. নিযুক্ত করা হয়েছে এবং তাঁরই কৃপায় বাংলার রাস্তা-ঘাটগুলির, কমিটি আর স্কীমের দপ্তর বিদীর্ণ কোরে মূর্ত্ত হোয়ে দেখা দেবার সম্ভাবনা কতকটা আছে না আছে শীঘ্রই জানা যাবে। ও দিকে ততক্ষণ অসহায় কৃষক-প্রজা বাংলার ঘাটে বাটে ধুলো কাদায় পচে পচে জাহান্নমে যেতে থাকুক। আর আমরা বাংলার কৃষক-প্রজার প্রতিনিধিরা বলতে থাকি,—জীবন্তু,—জীবন্তু সরকার এবং সরকারী গভর্ণমেন্ট!

এবার শিক্ষা। আমরা অনেক শিক্ষা পেয়েছি—গত দুবছরে শিক্ষা দেবার আর কিছু বাকী নেই। পদে পদে আমাদের কানে ঘোরে শিখিয়ে দেওয়া হয়েছে যে আমাদের কল্যাণ ওঁরা কোরবেনই কোরবেন। শিক্ষার বাবদে খরচ দেখানো হয়েছে প্রায় দেড় কোটি। এই নূতন বছরে যে প্রায় ১২ লক্ষ টাকা শিক্ষার জন্য অতিরিক্ত খরচ দেখানো হয়েছে তার ভিতর থেকে পল্লী অঞ্চলের ভাগে কম বেশী ২॥৹ লক্ষ টাকার বরাদ্দ দেখা যায়। মূর্খ পাড়াগেঁয়েদের জন্য এত বড় দানের বহরে পৃথিবী শুদ্ধ লোককে চমক লাগিয়ে দেবে নিশ্চয়ই! অর্থ সচীব মহোদয়ের অর্থ বিতরণের লম্বা ফিরিস্তি তন্ন তন্ন কোরে খুঁজেছি, তার ভিতর বাংলার নিরন্ন কৃষকের নিরক্ষরতা দূর করার ব্যবস্থা বিন্দু মাত্রও নেই। তাঁর মন্ত্রীত্ব গ্রহণের আড়ম্বরের পর দুবছর কেটে গেল, কিন্তু জাতির পরম আকাঙ্খার বিষয় যে প্রাথমিক শিক্ষা, তা' আজো কল্পনার অসীম আকাশে অদৃশ্যই থাকল, মর্ত্তলোকে মূর্ত্ত হয়ে দেখা দিলো না। এবারকার বাজেটের যা কিছু বরাদ্দ সে শুধু একটী শ্রেণীর জন্যই প্রাচুর্য্য বহন করে দেখা দিয়েছে। সে হচ্ছে—অর্থ সচীব মহাশয় যাদের নিয়ে বাংলা গভর্ণমেণ্টের তরী পারে পৌঁছাবেন বোলে স্থির প্রতিজ্ঞ হয়ে বোসে আছেন সেই শ্রেণী, অর্থাৎ তিনি নিজে যে শ্রেণীর লোক সেই শ্রেণীর জন্য। ধনী ও পরিশ্রমজীবীদের বাঁচাবার জন্য তিনি বদ্ধপরিকর। তিনি নিজে ধনী, ধনীদেরই তিনি বাঁচাতে চান। তিনি যদি গরীব হতেন গরীবদের বাঁচাবার দিকেও মন দিতেন। দরিদ্রের উন্নতি, গরীবের বেঁচে থাকবার অধিকার তাঁর ও তাঁর শ্রেণীর সর্ব্ব স্বার্থের পরিপন্থী তাই——

Mr. DEPUTY SPEAKER: I think you will not enter into personalities.

Babu NARENDRA NARAYAN CHAKRABARTY: সভাপতি মহাশয়, অর্থ সচীব মহাশয়কে আমি ব্যক্তিগতভাবে একটি কথাও বলতে চাইছিনা—আমি তাঁর শ্রেণী সম্বন্ধেই বলতে চাচ্ছি। সভাপতি মহাশয়, এবারকার শিক্ষাবিষয়ক বাজেটে গরীব কৃষক প্রজা এবং শ্রমজীবিদের জন্য ব্যবস্থার কোনো অভাব ও ত্রুটী নেই! একটা পর্দা কলেজ হয়েছে, সেখানে, আমি তো আগেই বোলেছি, যে শ্রমিক আর কৃষকের মেয়েরা দলে দলে সেখানে গিয়ে ভর্ত্তী হবে; বর্দ্ধমানের মহারাজার কলেজ, কাশিমবাজারের মহারাজার কলেজ সরকারের দানে পুষ্ট হোক, করটিয়ার জমিদারের কলেজ চিরস্থায়ী হোক, গভর্ণমেণ্টের অর্থের সদ্ব্যবহারে ঢাকার নবাব বংশের রাজধানী স্কুল কলেজ সমৃদ্ধ হোক, আপত্তি নেই। সর্ব্বোপরি বিদেশী পরিচালিত St. Xavier's College-যা নাকি আমাদের দেশের স্বার্থের জন্যই পরিচালিত এবং আমাদেরি পুত্র-কন্যাদের মঙ্গলের জন্য প্রতিষ্ঠিত, তাকে সাহায্য না কোরলে দেশের শতকরা ৯০ জন কৃষক প্রজার প্রতি বর্ত্তমান মন্ত্রীমণ্ডলীর দরদের বিপুলপ্রকাশ দেখাবার উপযুক্ত সুযোগ কখনো মিলতো না। অতএব, এরা সবাই বেঁচে থাক, বাংলার কৃষকশ্রমিকের নিরক্ষরতা হটাৎ একদিন আলাদিনের প্রদীপের মতো দুনিয়াকে চমক লাগিয়ে নিজে থেকেই লুপ্ত হয়ে যাবে।

এর পরে আছে স্বাস্থ্য। এ বিষয়টীর সম্বন্ধে বাজেটের বরাদ দেখে মনে হয় পল্লীবাসীর চিকিৎসার আবশ্যকতা একেবারেই নেই। অথবা অর্থ সচীব ধরে নিয়েছেন যে কৃষক আর শ্রমিকদের স্বাস্থ্য বোলে কোন বস্তুর বালাই নাই। সরকারী বাজেটে স্বাস্থ্যের জন্য সংক্ষিপ্ত খরচ যা কিছু ধরা হয়েছে তা শুধু সহরের হাসপাতালের জন্য। শিক্ষাক্ষেত্রেও যেমন, স্বাস্থ্যের বেলাতেও তেম্নি। এই সহরের হাসপাতালগুলিতে দেশী চিকিৎসক রাখা মহা পাপ, সেই জন্য য়ুরোপ থেকে বিশিষ্ট ও বিশেষজ্ঞ চিকিৎসকদের অনেক বেশী পারিশ্রমিক দিয়ে আমদানী করা হয়েছে। এবং বাংলার কৃষকেরা নিরন্তর সেই সব চিকিৎসালয়ে চিকিৎসিত হয়ে দীর্ঘ পরমায়ু ভোগ কোরছে। সুতরাং কৃষক প্রজাদের বাঁচিয়ে রাখবার ঐ হচ্ছে প্রকৃষ্ট পন্থা।

তারপর জলসেচ এবং কৃষি। আমরা শুনেছি যে, মন্ত্রী মহাশয়েরা ১৯৪০ সনের মধ্যেই কতকগুলি পরিকল্পনা শেষ কোরবেন। এই পরিকল্পনার কথা শুনলেই তাঁরা ভেবেছেন যে কৃষকদের আর অভাবের তাড়নায় মোরতে হবে না। তাই তাঁরা গম্ভীরভাবে জানিয়েছেন জলসে

দিয়ে যে, কৃষকদের জন্য কিছু একটা পরিকল্পনা কোরবেনই কোরবেন। ইতিমধ্যে বহু কষ্ট কোরে তুলোর চাষ সুরু করা হয়েছে মাত্র মেদিনীপুরের দুই একটি স্থানে। আমরা জানি, বাংলার মিল মালিকেরা সেজন্য হাজার হাজার টাকা দিয়েছেন। তবুও ব্যাপকভাবে তুলোর চাষ চালাবার ব্যবস্থার কথা কৃষি মন্ত্রীর মাথায় ঢোকে নাই। এদেশের প্রত্যেকটী লোকে জানে যে পাটের দর কোমে যাওয়ায় অর্থ-নীতির আর কোন রকম উন্নতির ব্যবস্থা বাংলায় হওয়া সম্ভব নয়। পাটের পরিবর্ত্তে কি জিনিষ উৎপাদন করলে কৃষকদের ঘরে পর্য্যাপ্ত অর্থ আসতে পারে তার কোন পন্থা নির্দ্দেশের নামগন্ধও না কোরে তাদের দেওয়া হচ্ছে কিনা stud bull । এক দিকে বাংলার কৃষককুল বন্যার জলে ভেসে যায়, আবার জলের অভাবেও তাদের ছাতি ফাটে। নিরুপায় হয়ে তারা কেবল বলে—"বলমা তারা দাঁড়াই কোথা"। ডাঙ্গায় বাঘ আর জলে কুমীর।* এই উভয় সঙ্কটের মধ্যে পড়ে ইতিমধ্যে বাংলার নরনারী ডালভাতের পরিবর্ত্তে "খাবি খেতে থাকুক"।

উপসংহারে অর্থসচিব মহাশয় বিশ্বের রাজনৈতিক পরিস্থিতি সামাজিক ও অর্থনীতি সম্বন্ধে যে সব গুরুগম্ভীর বিষয়ের অবতারণা করেছেন সে সমস্ত বিষয়ের মাঝখান থেকে আমরা অনেক শেখবার এবং জানবার অবকাশ পেয়েছি। তিনি কৃপা কোরে কংগ্রেস পার্টিকে নিমন্ত্রণ পাঠিয়েছেন তাঁদের সঙ্গে সহযোগীতা কোরতে। মাননীয় মন্ত্রী মহাশয় দীর্ঘ দিন কংগ্রেসে ছিলেন,—শুনেছি। (from the Coalition Group শুনেছেন নাকি?) তিনি অবশ্যই অবগত আছেন, এবং খুব ভাল কোরেই, অবগত আছেন যে কংগ্রেসের সঙ্গে আর তার দলের সঙ্গে পার্থক্য কোথায়! দীর্ঘ দিন কংগ্রেসের সঙ্গে কাজ করার ফলে আশা করি অর্থসচিব কংগ্রেসের আদর্শ আজও একেবারে ভুলে যেতে পারেন নাই। তবুও তাঁরা কথায় কথায় কংগ্রেস মন্ত্রীমণ্ডলের কর্ম্ম প্রণালীর সঙ্গে নিজেদের কার্য্যকলাপের তুলনামূলক আলোচনা এই পরিষদের কক্ষে দাঁড়িয়ে কোরতে কুণ্ঠিত হন না। শুনে হাসিই পায়, চারপেয়ে ব্যাঙও বলে আমিও হাতির মতোই চতুষ্পদ। কংগ্রেসের মন্ত্রীদের সাথে এই প্রতিক্রিয়াশীল বাংলাদেশের মন্ত্রীদের তুলনা! অন্য প্রদেশে কাল যাঁরা ছিলেন বন্দী, আজ তাঁরাই হোয়েছেন মন্ত্রী; আবার আসছে কালই তাঁরাই জেলে যাবার জন্য তৈরী হচ্ছেন। স্বাধীনতার অগ্রদূত—স্বাধীনতার পরম উপাসক যাঁরা, স্বদেশের শৃঙ্খল মুক্তির জন্য কোন ত্যাগকেই যাঁরা পর্য্যাপ্ত মনে করেন না, তাঁদের সঙ্গে পার্থক্য শুধু—কুইনাইনের বড়ি, টিউব ওয়েলের সংখ্যা, আর মুষ্টি ভিক্ষার পরিমাণের পার্থক্য নয়;—পার্থক্য দূর প্রসারী কল্পনার, আদর্শের ব্যাপকতার ও গভীরতার এবং সর্ব্বোপরি চরম ত্যাগের জন্য উন্মুখতার। একথার সাক্ষ্য বর্ত্তমান মন্ত্রীমণ্ডলীর বিগত জীবনী এবং কংগ্রেসের মন্ত্রীবর্গের জীবনেতিহাস। ছোট খাট সুখ দুঃখের হিসাব যারা রাখে না মৃত্যু যাদের পণ, জীবনের প্রতিমুহূর্ত্তে যারা নিত্য উচ্চারণ করে—অন্তরের অন্তস্থল হতে—"মরিব তোমারি কাজে, বাঁচিব তোমারি তরে, নহিলে বিষাদময় এ জীবন কেবা ধরে; যতদিন না ঘুচিবে তোমার কলঙ্ক ভার, থাক প্রাণ, যাক প্রাণ, মা আমার, মা আমার"—সেই সব কর্ম্মবীরদের সঙ্গে আজ বাংলা গভর্ণমেণ্টের অর্থসচীব শ্রীমাণ নলিনী রঞ্জন সরকার কুইনাইনের বড়ি, টিউব ওয়েল, আর মুষ্টিভিক্ষা নিয়ে প্রতিযোগিতা করতে চান! স্পর্দ্ধা ও রুচির তারিফ না ক'রে উপায় নাই!!

Mr. UPENDRANATH EDBAR: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I rise to speak a few words on the general discussion of the budget, which the Hon'ble the Finance Minister presented to this House the other day. I frankly confess that I cannot congratulate the Hon'ble the Finance Minister on his achievements. For he has failed, and utterly failed to help the average man—I mean the cultivator—for whom the Government have shown so much concern and for whose resurrection the Hon'ble the Finance Minister has spent so many anxious but sleepless nights, fruitlessly in the preparation of this budget.

Now, coming to the budget itself we find that the budget has been criticised, and criticised bitterly, by some of the honourable members of this House. It ought to be criticised, and we welcome criticism like that. I must frankly admit here that the budget estimate for the coming year is a modified and improved one and not a stereotyped budget as in the past, because we find herein mention of lakhs of rupees as provision for improvement of agriculture, for improvement of industries, for improvement of education, for improvement of public health, and for improvement of sanitation. Of course, I do not say that that is enough. It is not enough; it is too small, but it only shows that a current, although not very strong, has been made to flow for the uplift of degenerated Bengal, and I am sure that if things like this be allowed to continue for a number of years together, then certainly within a few years, we shall find our mother country in a better and luckier position than what we find it to-day.

Then, Sir, with respect to the release of the detenus, we congratulate the Ministers that they have been able to release a large number of detenus and have made it possible to reduce the extent of abnormal expenditure by no less than Rs. 22 lakhs and further economies to the extent of about Rs. 3 lakhs have been proposed by the Hon'ble the Finance Minister in the next year's budget. But we must also demand at the same time that the detenus, who are still rotting in the cells behind the prison-bars should be released at an early date for the sake of humanity, and for economy as well. Further, I beg to add here that it has also been stated times without number by the Cabinet that their policy is to release the detenus. If they can reduce the amount of abnormal expenditure by simply releasing the detenus, I do not know why should they not do it?

We know that the peasantry of Bengal is labouring under various kinds of affliction and miseries, and we find that the peasantry of Bengal is almost on the verge of starvation and ruin. The sooner the economic condition of the country is improved, the better for the nation. I think the Hon'ble the Finance Minister has forgotten the true services which the cultivators of this country, who are mostly Mussalmans and people belonging to the scheduled castes, render to the society. Sir, we find in the cultivator the nation itself. I make bold to say that my honourable friends of the Opposition will also bear me out on this point. It is the cultivator who is supplying the food materials to this country; it is he who is supplying raw materials for the improvement of industry in this country; it is he who is supplying money for the maintenance of the members of the learned professions; and it is he who is directly or indirectly responsible for the better administration of the country. To be brief, I may say that he is the backbone of the society, and if this cultivator dies, then who lives and who dies does not matter.

Sir, we all know that during the recent floods the peasantry of Bengal suffered much and they had to part with most of their things—in some cases all their belongings—for their sustenance, and they have nothing to support them.

Under these circumstances, they are now groping in darkness for money to purchase bullocks, seeds, etc., because they are not getting any loans from the *mahajans* for this purpose after the setting up of debt conciliation boards in Bengal. So, Government should advance agricultural loans to the cultivators in a greater degree than ever and make provision for this in the budget. We very much expected in this year's budget that the Hon'ble the Finance Minister would provide adequate sums for advancing short-period loans, with or without interest, to the peasants of Bengal during their cultivation seasons. But, alas, he has not done so! We expected that the Hon'ble the Finance Minister would utilize every pie that he could get for the amelioration of the condition of his average man. But we are disappointed now. We find that, in spite of his excellent budget speech, things like town and city hospitals, such as the Chittaranjan Seva Sadan, the Universities, and the Colleges and such other things, which exclusively concern the upper and middle classes, are uppermost in his mind.

Then, Sir, with respect to the scholarships and special stipends, I should like to draw the attention of the Cabinet, especially of the Hon'ble the Finance Minister, to the fact that out of the additional provision of one lakh for awarding scholarships, simply Rs. 20,000 have been budgeted for the scheduled castes, which are as many as 77 in number, while a similar sum has been provided for a handful of backward communities in the budget. Such is the case with regard to the special stipends as well!

I have found in the budget statement that the Hon'ble the Finance Minister has no sufficient means to take up comprehensive schemes for the uplift of the country and is going to saddle this country with fresh taxation. But I am greatly astonished to find that he has provided a big sum of money for awarding two State scholarships to Indian women for the purpose of studying abroad. I cannot resist here the temptation of citing the well-known maxim which runs as follows:—"Charity begins at home". The province of Bihar is thinking of Biharees alone, the province of Orissa is thinking of Orias and all other provinces are thinking like that, while we Bengalees are thinking of Indians. If our Hon'ble Minister be lavish like that in expenditure, then the Bengal Treasury will soon be exhausted.

If we turn to the Red Book for the Explanatory Memorandum on the Budget of the Government of Bengal, we find that a very scanty sum of money, i.e., Rs. 1,000, has been provided for grants-in-aid to Sanskrit Tols. Unless the tols run by the Brahmins for the spread of

Sanskrit learning among the Hindus are sufficiently helped by Government, they will be effaced from the face of Bengal to-day or to-morrow. There are some tols managed by the Scheduled Caste Brahmins in the district of Bakarganj—the district I come from. It is a custom with those tol-adhyapakas from time immemorial that they give free board and lodging to some of their pupils. Although this latter class of tols can compete with all other tols in all respects and their work is satisfactory, they can hardly expect any Government grant-in-aid for their upkeep. So I request the kind Government to pass necessary orders to the authorities concerned to take special care of these tols.

For promoting maternity and child welfare activities, provision has been made for a grant of Rs. 2½ lakhs to the Chittaranjan Seva Sadan which in the opinion of the Hon'ble the Finance Minister is the premier maternity hospital in the province. It is patronised by almost all the leading and public-spirited men of Calcutta. So it hardly needs any Government aid. I think this sum of money would have been best utilized had it been set apart for making primary education in the province free and compulsory or making the maternity benefit easily available to the rural areas.

I have already mentioned during the course of my budget speech that the Hon'ble the Finance Minister is going to saddle the country with fresh taxation for meeting the cost of budget estimates. But I am sure that the cost of budget estimates can be met in the following ways:—either by retrenchment in expenditure or by fresh taxation or by both. I think it would be better for poor Bengal to meet the estimated cost by retrenchment in expenditure, specially by cut in the salaries of Government officers. With these few words, I resume my seat.

Mrs. HASINA MURSHED: Sir, it is not out of deference to the expenditure and the authorities find it extremely difficult to balance temptation of offering criticism for the sake of criticism that I rise to join the ranks of those who constitute the critics of the budget to-day. ("Hear, hear" from Opposition Benches.) I rise to draw the attention of the House to the inadequacy of funds in respect of a medical institution which is doing so much to relieve the sufferings of the womenfolk of the province in general and of this city in particular. I refer to the Lady Dufferin Victoria Hospital of Calcutta. As a woman, it is only natural that I should feel very strongly about an institution which has been rendering excellent work in relieving the sufferings of *pardahnashin* women. I am sure that everyone in this House will readily agree with me when I say that it is here that hundreds of *pardahnashin* women get medical assistance from competent lady doctors and it is here that they get that relief which they would have otherwise been denied. I

have had an opportunity of paying a visit to this institution and I am convinced, even after a cursory visit, that this institution deserves more generous treatment at the hands of Government than at present it receives. This hospital receives a Government subvention the amount of which has undergone a series of fluctuations with the result that the amount has come down from Rs. 15,000 to only Rs. 10,000 a year. I have been informed that there is a large deficit between the receipt and their budget. I understand that an application for an increased grant is pending with Government. It would indeed be a great pity if either the stubbornness of the Finance Department or want of sympathy of the Medical Department or both were to stand in the way of this application being granted. I was hoping to find a liberal provision in this budget in respect of this institution, but I was greatly disappointed when I found that Government did not propose to spend as much money as they should. May we entertain the hope, Sir, that it will still be possible for Government to give an adequate grant to this very, very deserving institution?

Mr. SASANKA SEKHAR SANYAL: Coming as I do from a district which is notorious as an annual victim of the floods, I naturally cast a very hungry look round the present budget in search of a silver lining round the dark horizon of misery that has enveloped the major portion of rural Bengal. I will not do this injustice to myself and to my constituents and even to the Hon'ble the Finance Minister by concealing my utter disappointment in this matter. I do not go the length of saying that the Hon'ble Minister's budget speech is very uninteresting. Indeed, there has been an attempt at originality and an otherwise dark and dismal budget with nothing progressive or prosperous in it has been sought to be placed over a background of perplexing international complexities. Theories and political philosophies might amuse or even interest a student and a theorist, but to the vast millons living in abject poverty, these are jokes not very kind. It does not really very much matter whether a budget is a prosperity budget or a deficit budget. It may be the former owing to the inability to carry on and initiate beneficent projects just as it may be the latter on account of such things, but here in the case of our Government, Sir, it is a bankruptcy budget and this budget is conceived in a spirit of placating patronage. Doles have been given here and there, tinkering measures have been sought to be made, but what strikes, even after a cursory glance, is the absence of any comprehensive plan to give a bold lead to the future and this dole system of budget ventures to receive the sanction from this House by proposals for fresh taxation. It is a well-known principle of legislation that taxation is justified only when there are bold projects and the resources at the disposal of Government prove inadequate, but that is neither here nor there. In these circumstances, when the Ministry has failed to carry

out previous promises of projects, and is asking for fresh taxation, it is insult added to injury. The three major problems that confront the countryside to-day—the countryside which I have the honour and privilege to represent—are the problem of floods, the problem of rural indebtedness and the problem of primary education, and I submit in all humility that the present budget has cruelly neglected each of these things.

Sir, flood has become an annual phenomenon and a firm stand has got to be taken against it. The Hon'ble Minister has based his estimate upon the assumption that there will be no flood in future. I submit this is a very wrong calculation fraught with dangerous possibilities arising out of idle wish being father to lazy thoughts leading to faulty action. Sir, our previous Government also worked along a similar line and the result has been endless misery and unrelieved helplessness. We are anxiously waiting for some beginning in the matter. I would refer particularly to my friend, the Minister for Irrigation, to the matter of Irrigation; and what have we got? We have always been treated to a promise of projects, a contour survey or a waterways board, and all that. May I ask in all humility "will this successful operation begin after the peasant is dead"? I pause for a reply.

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: Do you want that to be done overnight?

Mr. SASANKA SEKHAR SANYAL: Not overnight; by the time you will leave us or your Ministry will leave.

Sir, the next question is an allied one, viz., the tenant's liability to continue to pay his rent in spite of the devastation that has taken place in the flood-stricken areas. My friend, Mr. Wordsworth, is not here. The other day he propounded a very interesting point that rent is equivalent to premium. I agree with him and ask Government "will the premium continue to be a liability even when the premium-bearer is dead and destroyed"? Cannot the tenant claim the full value of the crops which are sown and destroyed before rents are claimed? The time has come for Government seriously to think as to whether or not the present system of uninsured provision should forthwith be terminated and replaced by one that will give not only the greater stability to rent but security to the producer. While on this point I would hasten to correct my learned friend the Hon'ble the Finance Minister on the dangerously wrong point to which I shall invite his particular attention. He has made a wrong statement. The Finance Minister has said that there has been no death from floods. I say he is wrong. Because if he has read the papers he must have seen that I have on my own authority circulated through the press at least report of 13 deaths in two thanas and these deaths have not been contradicted either by

Government Press or by the Government benches. Of these 13 deaths only one was contradicted. It was a case of suicide by hanging due to starvation. Contradiction was not clear. Apart from many other cases which resulted in consequential deaths, I place these 13 deaths only for the purview of the Hon'ble Minister and I should be glad if he cares to have an enquiry made by his department or any other department. I have on my own authority known on an enquiry that these deaths are true and are the results of starvation. There must be a remedy to such recurrence in future and capital must be found for stopping such scourges. It is no use setting apart 2½ lakhs of rupees for a Muslim Hall to please the Muslim vanity. It is no use giving Rs. 30,000 to a Muslim paper to feed the Muslims with hatred for the Hindus. These Rs. 2½ lakhs could save as many as millions of Muslim families and this Rs. 30,000 could give relief to at least 30,000 Muslim families. The need for protecting the fields against the onslaught of nature and protection of the life and property of the people ought to be the primary aim and ambition of even the most despotic Government.

The next point is the question of rural indebtedness. We all know——.

Mr. SPEAKER: I find there is no quorum in this House.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Quorum has just been made.

Mr. SPEAKER: (After counting the number of members present) Yes; there is just the requisite number to form a quorum.

(Here the member reached his time-limit.)

Kazi EMDADUL HAQUE: Before offering any comment on the budget provisions I must thank the Finance Minister for his clear confession that he is not a true prophet and that his prophecies never come to be fulfilled. His prophecy is certainly based upon miscalculation and cannot come within the domain of truth. He said that flood also paved the way for the non-fulfilment of his promises. I will, however, advise him how to redeem his promise. I have found a booklet issued by a certain gentleman hailing from Serajganj who claims to be a true prophet. He says in his book that all his prophecies in the past came true and his prophecies as regards the future will also come to pass. He says that he predicted about the recent flood and he also says that the augury of the future is that there will be more serious floods. So he asked Government to make provision in the budget for flood.

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: How?

Kazi EMDADUL HAQUE: How, it is for you gentlemen to answer and not for me. I ask the Finance Minister to approach that gentleman to clear his doubts.

Coming to the budget itself I may tell him without fear of contradiction that Government have made their position clear, at least the Chief Minister has done so. He said that Government won't look to the condition of suffering millions outside, who have no right to claim anything from Government and that all that they can claim is *dal* and *bhat* and not curry or anything else. He went so far as to say that Government do not care if people say anything when they take Rs. 2,000 or for the matter of that Rs. 4,000 or Rs. 5,000; people have no right to say anything against them. The Chief Minister is a very intelligent person and he did not commit himself to anything for which he may be questioned later. He gave out at the time of election and in his election pledge that he would make provision for the *dal* and *bhat* of the people in the country. So the peasants cannot ask for anything more than *dal* and *bhat* and the rest of the money will go to the Ministers and their families.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Their pockets are very long.

Kazi EMDADUL HAQUE: This Government have no concern for the hungry millions; they do not like to make any provision for the poor peasants. They were not born with silver spoons in their mouths and it is their lot to live amidst sufferings

(At this stage it was found that there was no quorum in the House.)

Adjournment.

The House was then adjourned till 4-45 p.m., on Tuesday, the 21st February, 1939, at the Assembly House, Calcutta.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Assembly assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act, 1935.

THE ASSEMBLY met in the Assembly House, Calcutta, on Tuesday, the 21st February, 1939, at 4-45 p.m.

Present:

Mr. Speaker (the Hon'ble Khan Bahadur M. AZIZUL HAQUE, C.I.E.) in the Chair, 11 Hon'ble Ministers and 215 members.

STARRED QUESTIONS
(to which oral answers were given)

Suppression of Bengal Provincial Students' Federation.

*48. **Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL:** Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Education Department be pleased to state—

(a) if he is aware that attempts are being made by the heads of several Government and Government-aided institutions (schools and colleges) to suppress the organisation of the Bengal Provincial Students' Federation;

(b) whether it is a fact that the Head Master, Malda Zilla School, has informed several students that it will not be possible for them to continue as students of that school if they join the "Students' Federation";

(c) whether it is a fact that the Principal, Rajshahi College, has recently issued orders of expulsion or removal of names from the rolls of the college on a number of students, who have been members of the Students' Federation, and has declined to give any reasons for such action;

(d) if the answers to (b) and (c) are in the affirmative, the circumstances under which the steps referred to have been taken;

(e) whether the Government have determined any policy in this connection; and

(f) if so, whether any instructions have been issued by any officer or department on the above?

MINISTER in charge of the EDUCATION DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Mr. A. K. Fazlul Huq): (a) No. As far as I am aware, no

attempts have been made by heads of Government institutions to suppress the Bengal Provincial Students' Federation, but attempts were made to prevent the students of one institution from joining the organisation. The Principals of colleges and the heads of schools have been informed that membership of this body is not of itself sufficient reason for taking disciplinary action against students.

(*b*) Yes, but it is presumed that the order has since been cancelled.

(*c*) No. Certain students were required to take transfer certificates. These students were members of the Students' Federation, but this was not the reason for their being required to take transfer certificates.

(*d*) The member is referred to the replies to questions (*a*) and (*b*) above.

(*e*) Government's policy is to ensure such discipline in their educational institutions as will enable students to pursue their courses of study.

(*f*) The member is referred to the reply to question (*a*).

Mr. DHIRENDRA NATH DATTA: With reference to answer (*c*), will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what are the reasons requiring the students to take transfer certificates?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: I cannot give any more facts than have been given in the reply.

Mr. SURENDRA MOHAN MAITRA: Is it a fact that the Director of Public Instruction was deputed by the Hon'ble Minister to enquire into this matter?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: I deputed the Director of Public Instruction to enquire into certain incidents in the Rajshahi College.

Mr. SURENDRA MOHAN MAITRA: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether this subject was also one of the subjects which the Director of Public Instruction was asked to enquire into?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: The Director of Public Instruction was asked to enquire generally into the various incidents that had happened in the Rajshahi College during the last few months.

Mr. SURENDRA MOHAN MAITRA: My question was whether this was one of the subjects which the Director of Public Instruction was asked to enquire into?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: I did not give any definite directions.

Mr. SURENDRA MOHAN MAITRA: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether he is willing to disclose the report of the Director of Public Instruction regarding this incident?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: I am willing to disclose facts but not to make a statement to suit the requirements of the honourable member.

Mr. SURENDRA MOHAN MAITRA: May I know what are the facts reported by the Director of Public Instruction regarding the transfer of these students?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: If I get notice I will look into the report and those portions of the report which I can disclose without detriment to the public interests will be laid on the table.

Mr. SURENDRA MOHAN MAITRA: What public interests are involved in this matter?

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise.

Mr. SURENDRA NATH BISWAS: With reference to answer (*b*), will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether he has made further enquiries to know that the order has been cancelled?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: I believe it has been cancelled.

Mr. SURENDRA NATH BISWAS: He has already answered saying "I presume" and now he says "I believe". I want to know if he has made any enquiry to find out whether the order has been cancelled?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: The Director of Public Instruction is now on tour. Before he left on tour he said that very likely the order had been cancelled. After that I have no information.

Mr. SURENDRA NATH BISWAS: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether he will make further enquiries to know for himself that the order has been cancelled?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: Yes, I believe that the order has been cancelled because the boys are there and they are allowed to sit for the examination.

Mr. SURENDRA MOHAN MAITRA: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the order regarding all the boys has not been cancelled and as a matter of fact, one of the boys has been forced to take a transfer certificate from Rajshahi?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: I don't think that is a fact.

Improvement of lands within Hijole area in Murshidabad.

*49. **Mr. SASANKA SEKHAR SANYAL:** Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Communications and Works Department be pleased to state—

(a) whether Government are aware of a vast area known as Hijole which is partly under Kandi subdivision and partly under Sadar subdivision of the district of Murshidabad;

(b) whether Government are aware—

(i) that this area is one of the chronic annual victims of flood in this district, and

(ii) that lakhs and lakhs of rupees of the investments of tenants have been washed away during the last few years;

(c) whether Government have taken any steps either for protecting the crops from floods or for ameliorating the tenants who have suffered; and

(d) whether Government have any scheme for protecting this area from frequent floods?

MINISTER in charge of the COMMUNICATIONS and WORKS DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Maharaja Srischandra Nandy, of Cossimbazar): (a) and (b) (i) Yes.

(ii) I am aware that much damage has been done.

(c) and (d) This is an area in which the conditions referred to in parts (a) and (b) are the consequence of the erection during the last few decades of several circuit embankments intended to make the land fit for cultivation. Certain rivers which used to discharge freely into the Hijole have now to pass through restricted channels embanked on both sides with the result that the flood level has risen and the rivers inundate the Hijole area and affect also higher ground. In the circumstances no remedy is possible at present.

Mr. SASANKA SEKHAR SANYAL: Have the Government considered the question of removing the embankments?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: The Government are following the policy of removing the embankments gradually. It is very difficult to say off-hand if we can remove these particular embankments all at once without causing any hardship to the local people.

Mr. SASANKA SEKHAR SANYAL: The Hon'ble Minister in his answer says, "In the circumstances no remedy is possible at present". Is there any possibility of it in the near future?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: I am afraid, not.

Appointment of Muhammadans as Sub-Registrars for last two years.

***50. Mr. ABDULLA-AL MAHMOOD:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Education (Registration) Department be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing for the last 2 years ending 1938—

(*i*) the number of Sub-Registrars appointed?

(*ii*) how many of them are (1) Muhammadans and (2) Hindus;

(*iii*) how many of them have been appointed from each district;

(*iv*) what are their qualifications;

(*v*) how many of them have been appointed from the district of Pabna;

(*vi*) how many candidates applied for the post from the district of Pabna;

(*vii*) what is their qualification;

(*viii*) how many of them are (1) Hindus and (2) Muhammadans;

(*ix*) whether any Muhammadan has been appointed from the district of Pabna; and

(*x*) if no Muhammadan has been appointed from the district, what is the reason?

(*b*) If the number appointed from the several districts is not proportionate, what are the reasons for differential treatment?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: (*i*) 16 in 1937 and 22 in 1938.

(*ii*) 19 Muhammadans, 18 Hindus and 1 Anglo-Indian.

(*iii*) Calcutta 1, Midnapore 2, Hooghly 2, 24-Parganas 2, Jessore 1, Nadia 1, Murshidabad 3, Dacca 5, Faridpur 6, Barisal 3, Chittagong 2, Tippera 2, Noakhali 3, Rangpur 1, Dinajpur 1 and Pabna 3.

(*iv*) The statement placed on the table furnishes the information.

(*v*) Three.

(*vi*) to (*viii*) Applications were made to the District Magistrates, Inspector-General of Registration and Government from all districts. The information cannot be compiled without reference to the districts and is therefore not readily available.

(*ix*) Yes.

(*x*) Does not arise.

(*b*) The appointments are made on the recommendations of the Commissioners of Divisions, and not on a consideration of the claims of candidates from particular districts.

Statement referred to in answer to clause (a) (iv) to starred question No. 50.

Babu Birendra Kumar Bhowmik, B.A.
Maulvi Abu Isa Md. Mustafa, B.A.
Babu Sudhir Kumar Basu, B.A.
Babu Kedareswar Banerji, B.SC.
Maulvi Kazi Abu Taleb Md. Imam Hossain, B.A.
Babu Tarak Das Ray, M.A.
Maulvi Muhammad Jamaluddin, M.A.
Maulvi Abdul Matin, M.A.
Maulvi A. R. M. Motiur Rahman, B.A.
Maulvi Mansur Ahmad, B.A.
Maulvi Saiyid Hossainuddin Ahmad, B.A.
Babu Khagendra Nath Baidya, B.A.
Maulvi M. Ashraful Haque, Matriculate.
Babu Gobinda Lall Sinha Ray, Matriculate.
Babu Nikhil Ranjan Sanyal, read up to B.A.
Babu Harendra Nath Biswas, B.L.
Maulvi Mosahibuddin Ahmad, read up to B.A.
Babu Manoranjan Sarkar, I.A.
Maulvi Khondkar Abdul Khaleq, B.A.
Maulvi Sarwar Kamal, B.A.
Babu Santimay Ghosh, M.A.
Babu Nalini Kanta Haldar, B.A.
Maulvi Abdul Jabbar, B.A.
Babu Atindra Kumar Mitra, B.A.
Maulvi Md. Wais, B.A.

Babu Phanindra Chandra Guha, I.SC.

Babu Subodh Chandra Putatunda, B.L.

Maulvi A. Q. Shamsuddin Md. Mahmud, read up to B.A.

Maulvi Enamul Mowla, I.SC.

Babu Dhirendra Kumar Ray, read up to I.Sc.

Maulvi Badiuzzaman Chaudhuri, B.A.

Maulvi Selahuddin Ahmad Choudhuri, read up to B.A.

Babu Sidhartha Prasad Barua, read up to B.A.

Maulvi A. Q. Mokaramul Basit, B.A.

Mr. R. E. Martin, B.A.

Babu Pabitra Hari Sen Gupta, B.A.

Maulvi Fakhrul Alam Chowdhuri, I.A.

Babu Nagendra Nath Biswas, B.A.

Mr. AHMED HOSAIN: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether the Commissioner of the Dacca Division recommended candidates from Mymensingh?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: Yes, some candidates were.

Condition of the Nabaganga between Naldi and Lohagara.

*51. **Mr. ATUL KRISHNA GHOSE:** (*a*) With reference to the reply to clause (*b*) of starred question No. 225 of the 25th August, 1938, will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Communications and Works (Irrigation) Department be pleased to state—

(*i*) whether the assured inquiry into the condition of the river Nabaganga in the area between Naldi and Lohagara has been made; and

(*ii*) if so, the result of the enquiry?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble Minister aware—

(*i*) that due to stagnation of water no steamer can pass through that area;

(*ii*) that at Naldi, Chandibarpur, Kalagachi, Kashipore and at two more places the river is almost silted up; and

(*iii*) that the people are crossing the river on foot in these days?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of opening these six affected centres towards prevention of further deterioration pending a better chance for a comprehensive scheme and its execution by the Government?

(*d*) Does the Hon'ble Minister consider the desirability of taking up the matter immediately in view of the fact that the attention of Government to the condition of the river in the said area is being repeatedly drawn?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: (*a*) (*i*) Yes.

(*ii*) No scheme for improving the Nabaganga river from Naldi to Lohagara is feasible at a reasonable cost.

(*b*) (*i*) The question is not understood. Stagnation by itself cannot stop navigation.

(*ii*) and (*iii*) At some places between Naldi and Lohagara the river becomes fordable during the dry season in consequence of siltation during floods.

(*c*) No, any such action would be futile.

(*d*) No, for the reason stated in the reply to part (*a*) (*ii*).

Mr. ATUL KRISHNA GHOSE: With reference to answer (*ii*), where the Hon'ble Minister says "No scheme for improving the Nabaganga river from Naldi to Lohagara is feasible at a reasonable cost", is there any such report from the officials lying with the Hon'ble Minister?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: None with me here.

Mr. ATUL KRISHNA GHOSE: Is it the opinion of the Hon'ble Minister himself or is it the opinion of one of the officials of that locality?

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise.

Mr. ATUL KRISHNA GHOSE: I beg to submit that formerly when I raised the question, the Hon'ble Minister gave me an assurance in the last session that proper enquiry would be made and in reference to that I am now putting a supplementary question.

Mr. SPEAKER: You cannot ask whether it is his own view or the view of anybody else. You may take it that any answer given represents the view of the Hon'ble Minister.

Mr. ATUL KRISHNA GHOSE: Thank you, Sir. Will the Hon'ble Minister please enquire into the matter through the District Magistrate whether the river Nabaganga, particularly in the area between Naldi and Lohagara, is badly in need of having the silt removed if it is to become navigable?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: Sir, there is no difference of opinion about the condition of the river mentioned being very bad.

Revision of text-books at Government's direction.

*52. **Miss MIRA DUTTA GUPTA:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Education Department be pleased to state whether it is a fact that for the approval of the Text-Book Committee, directions are sometimes given to authors and publishers by the Education Department or by the Text-Book Committee to get their books revised as desired by Government?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what are the principles followed for the issue of such directions?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: The Provincial Text-Book Committee sometimes recommend text-books for approval by the Director of Public Instruction, Bengal, subject to removal of certain minor defects noticed by the reviewers in course of examination. These defects, after due scrutiny, are communicated to authors and publishers for correction.

Breaches in the Gumti embankment.

*53. **Mr. DHIRENDRA NATH DATTA:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Communications and Works (Irrigation) Department aware—

(*i*) that the breaches in the Gumti embankment near Baherchar and Mithilapur within police-station Burichang, district Tippera, caused by flood last year have not yet been filled up;

(*ii*) that no crop can be grown in that locality;

(*iii*) that the embankment tax is realised from the talukdars of that locality; and

(*iv*) that this area is included in the benefited area?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of immediately filling up those breaches and of taking steps to prevent the annual breaches of the Gumti embankment in that locality?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: I am informed that the breaches mentioned are in a portion of the embankment for the maintenance of which Government are not responsible. I am, however, making further inquiries.

Mr. DHIRENDRA NATH DATTA: Is the Hon'ble Minister aware of the fact that the embankment tax has been realised from the *talukdars* of that locality?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: Yes.

Mr. DHIRENDRA NATH DATTA: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to say whether this area is included in the benefited area?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: I want notice.

Cattle-protection scheme.

*54. **Mr. SERAJUL ISLAM:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Agriculture Department aware that the cattle-protection and their fodder are long-felt problems of this province?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what steps, if any, do the Government propose to take in the matter?

MINISTER in charge of the AGRICULTURE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Mr. Tamizuddin Khan): (*a*) I am not clear as to what the member means by "cattle-protection". If he means prevention of cruelty to cattle, the matter concerns the Home (Police) Department. The problem of fodder is one that concerns the Agriculture Department and it may be characterised as "long-felt".

(*b*) The department is trying to solve the problem of fodder by popularising the cultivation of Napier grass and other fodder crops by intensive demonstration and propaganda and by the distribution of seeds and cuttings of such fodder crops. It is also encouraging other forms of fodder such as silage-making, etc. On account of the pressure of population on land suitable for habitation or cultivation, it is no longer possible to provide sufficient pasture-lands in the province. Besides it has been found on experience that an acre of pasture-land is not enough for keeping a single animal in good condition whereas the

same area of Napier grass maintains ten Bengal animals in excellent condition. If the cultivators accept the advice of the department, it will be enough to grow Napier grass on the little fallow land attached to each homestead without converting valuable arable lands into pastures.

Damage of kalai crops in Murshidabad.

*55. **Maulvi ABDUL BARI:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Agriculture Department aware that the *kalai* crops this year have been entirely damaged by insects in the district of Murshidabad?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether any report to this effect, either through representation or newspapers, has been received?

(*c*) What steps, if any, did the Government take to cure the insect pest at the time it was prevalent?

(*d*) Did the District Agricultural Officer go to the locality at any time and advise the cultivators regarding the remedies to be adopted?

The Hon'ble Mr. TAMIZUDDIN KHAN: (*a*) Yes, in certain localities.

(*b*) to (*d*) The District Agricultural Officer got the information and promptly visited the areas affected and gave necessary advice to the cultivators about remedial and preventive measures to be taken against the insect pest.

Maulvi ABDUL BARI: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what were the areas visited by the Agricultural Officers?

The Hon'ble Mr. TAMIZUDDIN KHAN: I ask for notice.

UNSTARRED QUESTIONS

(answers to which were laid on the table)

Repair of the Grand Trunk Road.

27. **Mr. HEM CHANDRA NASKER:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Communications and Works Department aware that at the time of the repair of the asphaltum portion of the Grand Trunk Road the entire width of the asphaltum portion is picked up at a time instead of picking up half of the asphaltum portion at a time?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, what are the reasons for following that principle?

(c) Are the Government aware—

(i) that owing to the recent train accident on the East Indian Railway motor traffic has increased on the said road; and

(ii) that owing to the said principle being followed in making repair of the said road motorists are suffering inconvenience?

(d) Are the Government aware that the width of the asphaltum portion of the Grand Trunk Road from Howrah to Asansol is not sufficient enough to allow two motor cars to pass in the same direction at a time.

(e) If the answer to (d) is in the affirmative, do the Government consider it desirable to sufficiently widen the said road?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: (a), (b), (c) (ii) and (d) As the greater length of the Grank Trunk Road is only 8 feet wide, which is enough for only one line of traffic, it is not possible to pass traffic on half the width of the road. It is therefore, quicker to repair the complete width in one operation and so cause less inconvenience in the long run to the users of the road.

(c) (i) Statistics are not available to confirm the suggestion of the honourable member.

(e) Government are not at present considering any proposal to widen the road throughout. Widening has however been done in many places where urgently necessary, and the road is being gradually improved.

GENERAL DISCUSSION ON THE BUDGET.

The general discussion on the Budget was resumed.

Maulvi ABDUL BARI: Mr. Speaker, Sir, let me begin by saying that I shall try to occupy the 15 minutes allotted to me by offering some suggestive, constructive, defective and formative remarks on the budget. The budget, Sir, to my mind represents in its varied aspects the condition of the country; it is like a mirror, that which one can see reflected the prosperity or the adversity of a country in its manifold character. It does not require press propaganda or distribution of leaflets or pamphlets to tell the people inhabiting the land what the condition of the country is in its educational, social, agricultural, industrial and all other spheres. Sir, to my mind, if a copy of the budget be sent to each of the District Boards, to each of the Municipalities, to each of the Bar Associations, to each of the Union Boards and, if necessary, to each of the sister provinces and further, to foreign

countries who, if any, seem to be interested in the province of Bengal, they themselves of their own accord will see what the Government of this province is doing to ameliorate the condition of its people.

Sir, turning to the receipts side of the budget one is staggered to find the surrender of huge sums of money for non-utilisation thereof on account of want of any programme or scheme. This is certainly astonishing; this is really a sad commentary on the working of the departments concerned. I think, my colleagues will be surprised to find that 14 lakhs has been surrendered as not being spent this year under the head "Civil Works". Are we to take it that there was no need for it, or are we to say that there was no programme? The Hon'ble the Ministers in charge of Irrigation, Public Health and to some extent, Education, were responsible for it. Sir, we hear from everybody that for want of funds certain projects could not be given effect to, but we have never heard of superfluity of funds anywhere that could not be spent for want of any definite programme before the Minister or the department to which the money has been allotted for expenditure. What does it speak of? It speaks either of a lack of desire to work, or the lack of imagination or foresight, or depth of vision.

Sir, turning to the expenditure side of the budget, I have read the speech of the Hon'ble the Finance Minister through and through. I have ransacked the blue book page by page. I have scrutinised the red book line by line, I have gone through the brown and pink book, but to my utter surprise I have not found any definite programme or policy which is calculated to promote the best interests of the country. They did not catch my imagination at all.

So far as the civil side of the expenditure is concerned, the Hon'ble the Finance Minister has presented us with a deficit budget to the extent of Rs. 1,70,00,000 and has further proposed the imposition of new taxation, presenting not only before the House but also before the public outside the cringing face of a tax-gatherer. Apart from that, though the budget is a deficit one and it is proposed that this deficit will be made up by imposing new taxation, still there is a provision of Rs. 18 lakhs for the construction of new buildings. Will anybody say that in a year of deficit budget, in a year when there is a cry for new taxation, it is absolutely necessary that Rs. 5½ lakhs should be spent on the erection of police buildings? Was it necessary that Rs. 2 lakhs should be spent for the reformatory school? Was it necessary that a further sum of Rs. 2 lakhs should be spent on civil court buildings in Howrah and to erect quarters for munsiffs, constables, sub-registrars, and so on and so forth? I also submit to the Hon'ble Minister that Government could have avoided this expenditure and waited for a prosperous and better year.

Then, Sir, if we turn to the other questions regarding this budget, we find it has been stated in the budget by the Hon'ble the Finance Minister that several lakhs of rupees was spent by Government on relief work in the districts due to flood. That was very good. But can Government really assure us that there will be no recurrence of such floods? Have any steps been taken by Government to see that no such things happen in future? Has there been any provision in the budget to stem out floods that have been devastating the countryside for the last few years? It would be prudent and wise for any Government to take remedial measures instead of spending lakhs and lakhs on relief work. Not only that; the last flood made many people homeless, and their cattle were washed away by it. That is the situation.

As regards the Department of Education, it is the admitted policy of Government that free primary education should be given to the people of the province. It has been so said many a time by the Hon'ble the Chief Minister and many of my colleagues here. But to my utter surprise I find that there is no provision anywhere which might indicate that this problem has been seriously taken up as yet. There is a provision of Rs. 5 lakhs only and that too is contributed to some extent by the surrender of money given last year. On the other hand, we find that Rs. 18 lakhs has been earmarked for the construction of new buildings. I submit that this Rs. 18 lakhs might well have been spent on free primary education. It might have benefited some of the districts, if not all. And, so far as this expenditure of Rs. 18 lakhs is concerned, I find that most of the projects are centred in Calcutta, and unfortunately, if I may say so, my West Bengal has not got a single pie of that amount. That is the saddest thing which I am bringing not only to the notice of the Hon'ble Minister but also to the notice of this House. Sir, coming to Public Health what we find is that there is a remarkable provision, viz., a provision of 2 lakhs and 50 thousand of rupees for the Chittaranjan Seva Sadan for benefiting the people of Calcutta only. But is there any provision anywhere to show that Government are doing something for the rural population of the province? Sir, there is only a provision of 50 thousand rupees for maternity centres and health units, but in a province where seven crores of people are living, is 50 thousand rupees sufficient? It is only a mockery and nothing more than that.

Turning to the agricultural side, it is known to every one that the province of Bengal is being visited with famines and epidemic diseases, due almost always either to floods or droughts. It has been suggested many a time that in order to solve this problem deep tube-wells should be sunk in the fields on the lines adopted by the United Provinces Government. But, unfortunately, Sir, no tube-wells have been sunk to enable the people to save their paddy and other crops from devastation. I submit, Sir, that, so far as that is concerned, there is only one

provision, and that is a remarkable provision of Rs. 58,000 for the opening of an agricultural farm at Chittagong. Sir, there is at present only one farm in each district headquarters, but may I ask my honourable colleagues if the people in the muffasil have heard anything about the utility of these farms? Do the agricultural officers connected with those farms go out to the villages and tell the people that there is such a farm which serves to benefit the people. I submit, Sir, that it is the imperative duty of every Government to start one farm in each Union not only for supplying seeds to the people, but also for supplying a market for the sale of the produce thereof, and also for supplying the other necessaries of the people, but, Sir, there is, in fact, nothing like that. The Hon'ble the Finance Minister has very candidly admitted in his budget speech that, so far as the Department of Industries is concerned, there is no new provision. That is a candid statement, but in fact there is nothing new in the budget. He said that there is an attempt to improve the existing institutions, and the department is content with providing Rs. 50,000 for two Calcutta institutions. Now, is this really a happy sign for the future? Can we rest ourselves content with seeing Calcutta being supplied with certain schools which do not benefit the muffasil people at all? Industry is really the thing which can go to benefit the people at least to some extent. So far as cottage industries are concerned, we do not find any indication in the budget relating to the improvement thereof. Of course, the favoured people of Calcutta are going to get something. We understand that some department has been started in the name of industries in Calcutta, but, of course, it is so only to give employment to the favoured unemployed. (Cries of "Hear, hear" from Opposition benches).

Now, Sir, this is a matter for serious consideration, and it is not only a formality with which we should rest ourselves content. I would, therefore, request the Hon'ble the Finance Minister to see that these things are remedied. The Hon'ble the Revenue Minister was pleased to interrupt me when I said that the budget was defective. I don't understand what he meant by that. On account of the defects which I have pointed out and which have got to be remedied at once, I said that the budget was defective.

Sir, there is a provision of Rs. 58,000 for the purchase of Hariana bulls, but is there any provision anywhere for the maintenance of the Hariana bulls and their progeny in future? Is there any provision for grazing fields, because, Sir, grazing fields are a condition precedent to the supply of good milk and good bulls. We have to settle this point at once. In the last budget, Sir, I pointed out that want of grazing fields was one of the reasons for the downfall of the cattle race as well as want of good milk.

Sir, so far as the question of imposing new taxes is concerned, I may say that the proposal to levy tax on dog-racing is a good one. I want to do away with dog-racing altogether. (Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: What a shame!) If it is allowed to continue, there is likely to be a volume of criticism against the introduction of progressive——

(At this stage the member having reached his time-limit resumed his seat.)

Rai HARENDRA NATH CHAUDHURY. Mr. Speaker, Sir, our Finance Minister (the Hon'ble Mr. Nalini Ranjan Sarker) is nothing if not world-minded. The more exeperience he is gaining, the more miscalculation in our Receipts he is making, the more international he is becoming in his out-look. It is a pity, Sir, that his lot has been cast with a poor provincial Government and neither with the Central Government nor with the British Exchequer. It is a greater pity, Sir, that there is none among his colleagues who suffer directly from his mistakes and none among his supporters who have got to stand by his false prophecies to suggest it to him that for the custodian of a small provincial fund of a few crores of rupees to speak in the strain of a Chancellor of the British Exchequer or a rich Minister of Finance is not to invite applause but something other than that. To Hon'ble Mr. Nalini Ranjan Sarker, Sir, belongs the unique distinction of thrice miscalculating our Receipts in two years. He miscalculated the Receipts for 1937-38 even on revision to the extent of 42 lakhs of rupees, and he has tried to explain the reasons for his miscalculations thus: "I provided for an increase of 88 lakhs in revenue receipts in view of the improvements in the jute trade and in railway finance, but as I have already indicated this hope was not realised. Mainly owing to a declension in world trade conditions, but also to some domestic causes, the revenue actuals for the year were lower by 42 lakhs than the Revised." I do not know, Sir, whether the year 1937 in which more than one million hundredweights of jute sacks and bags were exported from India to Great Britain was a year of severe deterioration in jute trade or not, I do not claim to know whether the Sino-Japanese war, continuing to hit the Indian export trade of cotton in 1937-38 in which Bengal had of course to play very little part, is a relevant argument or not, but the fact remains that, so far as the Railway Finance is concerned, it looked up in the year 1937-38 to the utter futility of our Finance Minister's arguments. Sir, I hope I may be permitted to refer here to the statements that were made almost on the eve of the budget speech of our Finance Minister, by Sir Thomas Stewart relating to the Railway Finance in 1937-38. He said—"When I presented the current year's budget, I expected that the surplus for the year 1937-38 would be 2;83 crores. This estimate of the net position proved almost exactly correct, the actual

surplus being 2·76 crores. But the estimates we made then of receipts and working expenses were both exceeded almost to an equal extent (about ¾ crore). Goods earnings mainly accounted for the improvement in receipts". So there was improvement in receipts and notwithstanding improvement of receipts in our Railway budget, the Bengal account for 1937-38 failed heavily to reach the revised estimates.

Then, Sir, the Hon'ble Mr. Nalini Ranjan Sarker has referred to other factors which, in his estimate, caused the deterioration in our receipts in 1937-38. He referred to the dwindling of India's balance of trade, to the closure of the Bombay Stock Exchange, *etcetra*, but, Sir, in spite of the closure of the Bombay Stock Exchange, the Finance Minister of Bombay actually got more than he estimated for 1937-38. The other day, in presenting the budget for 1939-40 he expressed himself thus:—

"The Finance Accounts for 1937-38 disclose a revenue surplus of 29½ lakhs. This is accounted for by an improvement of 19 lakhs under the Revenue Section to which I have already referred, the rest of the improvement being the Capital and Debt Section. The free balance, which was estimated to be 73·76 lakhs, turned out to be 94·44 lakhs, the improvement being mostly due to the revenue surplus mentioned above and to a small extent to a surplus in the Provincial Loans and Advance Account".

Then, Sir, notwithstanding all the causes to which reference has been made by the Hon'ble the Finance Minister of Bengal, other Provinces improved their actuals for 1937-38. If we could not gather so much as we anticipated even on revision, it was not so much due to the dullness of trade as to the dullness of brain in those who are in charge of Bengal Finance.

Now, passing on to the year 1938-39, and to the revised estimates for the year, what do we see? We see another appalling miscalculation of Rs. 80 lakhs, only under three heads of revenue, viz., 9 lakhs under Jute Duty, 32 lakhs under Land Revenue and 39 lakhs under Stamps—all told 80 lakhs under these three heads. Again, the Hon'ble the Finance Minister resorted to his favourite explanation, namely, to world causes. He said: "About half of this drop is due to world causes and the rest to a mixture of economic and political causes much nearer home". Now, Sir, what were the world causes which could affect land revenue and stamps so seriously and jute so little? There has been deterioration of only 9 lakhs under the head "Jute", 32 lakhs under "Land Revenue" and 39 lakhs under "Stamps". This may be partly due to domestic causes—to floods and to the operation of Debt Settlement Boards, but forgetting for the moment all these causes the Hon'ble the Finance Minister attributed much of the deterioration to world causes which are of course incalculable to some extent. But, Sir, despite the alleged world causes, what is strange, is that no other

revised budget, Railway or provincial, published up-to-date shows such deterioration. Again, Sir, I may be permitted to quote a few lines from the budget of the Finance Minister of Bombay. The Hon'ble Mr. Lathe says:

"* *we see that the revised estimates show a revenue deficit of 6¾ lakhs, in other words, there is an improvement to the extent of 37¼ lakhs in the revised estimates compared with the budget estimates".

So there was improvement upon revised estimates in the Bombay budget for 1938-39, and even in the budget speech of Hon'ble Mr. A. N. Sing, which has been published in the papers to-day, we find that the Bihar budget for the current year has a surplus of 21 lakhs of revenue and there is, therefore, none too poor to do our Finance Minister reverence.

Coming to the budget before us, we see that it presents certain peculiar features. In the first place, receipts have been to a certain extent under-estimated. If, Sir, over-estimation is a vice, certainly under-estimation is no virtue in finance. For example, the Hon'ble the Finance Minister has expected only Rs. 1½ lakhs better under income-tax. I believe he is mistaken and he has not taken into account the revenue surplus in the Railway budgets for 1938-39 and 1939-40. There was nearly Rs. 40 lakhs of better revenue in 1938-39 and there is an estimated surplus of 213 lakhs in the Railway budget for the coming year. If he had taken that into account he would not have expected only Rs. 1½ lakhs better under income-tax. He also expects modestly only Rs. 8 lakhs more under Land Revenue. I hope when he has begun to issue threats that the certificate procedure may again be resorted to he will not have reasons to regret for any drop under that head.

Again, Sir, coming to the expenditure side what do we see? We see that in spite of the advertised increased expenditure of 79 lakhs over the revised estimate, the budget under the Nation-building Departments has progressed very little. We see that the extra expenditure of Rs. 79 lakhs proposed in the budget come under the following heads:—

Firstly, Civil Works—24 lakhs. These 24 lakhs are going to be spent on bricks and mortar, when we are faced with loans and deficits! Then Rs. 20 lakhs of extra expenditure have been provided for under "General Administration", while under "Education" the extra expenditure budgetted is a little over 12 lakhs. Thirdly, under head "Police" Rs. 9½ lakhs of extra expenditure has been proposed, while "Medical and Public Health" combined do not get more than that. "Justice" also gets one lakh more. Thus all told under these heads Rs. 54½ lakhs of additional expenditure is proposed, when the Nation-building Departments, namely, Education, Medical, Public Health, Agriculture,

Veterinary, and Co-operation together get only Rs. 27½ lakhs. This is how the present Ministry is out to promote nation-building in the province in all its spheres, physical, moral, mental, economic, etc.

Now, if we compare the budget that has been framed now with the budget for 1929-30, that is with the budget of a decade ago, what do we see? Certainly we expect progress! When our revenue has progressed from near about 12 crores to 14½ crores we are legitimately entitled to expect that there should be substantial improvement in expenditure under the Nation-building Departments. But what do we see instead? In 1929-30 when the total expenditure of the province was nearly about 12 crores, "Education" expenditure covered 12·60 per cent. of our budget and now when our total expenditure is proposed to be 14·65 crores, "Education" is going to get only 11·5 per cent. This is certainly a progress in the wrong direction and in a vital matter to the nation.

Then in respect of heads "Medical and Public Health": in the budget for 1929-30, medical and public health covered as much as 8·52 per cent. of total expenditure but in the present budget they together cover only 7·32 per cent.

Under Agriculture, Veterinary and Co-operation the budget for 1929-30 covered 2·30 per cent. while the present budget covers only 2·63 per cent.

With Industry the same is the case. It was 1·22 per cent. in 1929-30, but it is going to be only 1·45 per cent. (including cinchona) in 1939-40. This is the progress that has been made in a decade and with so much tall talk from the Ministry.

Coming to the particular provisions in the budget, let me take for instance the provisions made under the head "Education."

(Here the member reached his time-limit.)

Mr. ABDULLA-AL MAHMOOD: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I do not know, as we are occupying a very delicate position and that is constitutional, whether to congratulate the Hon'ble the Finance Minister or to criticise his budget as presented this session. I do not like to make such criticism as might be interpreted as destructive one. I only like to point out to this House that the major portion of the money is being distributed, just like doles to several institutions, especially in Calcutta, ignoring the legitimate claims of the peasantry. I may in this connection just mention some of the figures before the House.

To start with, under "Education" we see that Rs. 1,50,000 has been allotted for the St. Xavier's College, Rs. 1,25,000 for the Burdwan College, Rs. 50,000 for the City College, Rs. 50,000 for the Gokhale Memorial, Rs. 25,000 for the Polytechnic Institution, Rs. 5,000 for

Bangiya Sahitya Parisad and another Rs. 5,000 as capital grant for the same institution, Rs. 35,000 for the Victoria Institution and Rs. 24,000 for Sarojnalini Institution.

Now with regard to the Nation-building Departments, the first and a movement, namely, the youth welfare work under physical instruction. There under the head "Director" Rs. 2,29,000, and "Directress" Rs. 23,000 have been provided.

Now with regard to the Nation-building Departments, the first and foremost is the Education Department. Those who essentially require this and whom we represent here, what money has been allotted for their education? There is a scheme or should I say there is an allotment of Rs. 2,50,000 for rural reconstruction, but the House will be very much astonished to know that the scheme is still in embryo. Now you can easily imagine what step the Government are going to take with regard to rural reconstruction. I may, in this connection, tell this House that a Director of Rural Reconstruction has been appointed for the last two years, but still there is no scheme although we understand that he has submitted a scheme more than a year hence, I put a question to the Minister in charge of Rural Reconstruction enquiring whether he had got any scheme to work out and Dr. Sanyal also put some supplementary questions, but the answer was a vague and evasive one. So we can easily imagine that no scheme is ripe yet to give effect to, but that a sum of Rs. 2,50,000 has been provided for it all the same. There is also the provision of Rs. 1,92,000 for the office organisation. I think, by office organisation is meant that some appointments will be made and money will be wasted.

With regard to primary education from the last year's budget we see that there is an increased provision of Rs. 1 lakh only. I ask the House, if they consider the sum that has been provided by the Finance Minister to be enough, and to be of any help or serve any useful purpose.

With regard to Police, as my friend Mr. Bari has already said, a sum of Rs. 18 lakhs is going to be spent for the construction of buildings. Of this item Rs. 6 lakhs and several thousands is going to be spent for the construction of new buildings for the police officers and constables.

I may tell the Finance Minister and his hon'ble colleagues that this budget will not satisfy the peasantry of Bengal. They must try their best to meet the demands of the people adequately.

In villages there are practically no dispensaries. There were programmes as we have seen in many election manifestoes that charitable dispensaries will be established in every union or at least in a unit of two or three unions. We find that under "Medical" only Rs. 2,83,000 has been provided more than what was in the last year.

With regard to Public Health we find that there is an increase of Rs. 1,16,000. Now I ask the Finance Minister: Is this the sum that will provide for proper treatment at the time when people will fall ill?

Under Medical we find that a sum of Rs. 2,50,000 has been granted to Chittaranjan Seva Sadan. I ask the House how many patients coming from the mufassil will be benefited by this grant. Why was not the sum reserved for only those people who have got their larger share in it?

Now I would like to finish with a request that the Finance Minister and his hon'ble colleagues do kindly see that the money that is being distributed as doles in this budget is not distributed in this way.

Mr. NISHITHA NATH KUNDU: We do take part in the discussion as we owe it our duty to do so but frankly speaking, we do not feel encouraged to take part, as our suggestions are never accepted. I feel more so because of the remark that was made last night by the Hon'ble the Chief Minister that we have lost all claims of making suggestions and our suggestions being accepted for the simple reason that we belong to the opposition group. We apprehend that time may come when the Hon'ble the Chief Minister may be pleased to declare that we have no right even to enter the threshold of the Assembly Chamber. He has, indeed, propounded a new and strange theory that Opposition has no place in a Parliament and in parliamentary matters though there are countries where Opposition Leaders, in recognition of the importance of opposition, are paid salaries often higher than the Ministers. In speaking about the merits of the budget, I endorse what have been said by my previous speakers of the opposition groups and particularly by my friend Mr. Abdul Bari of the Coalition Group. I think I cannot improve upon the remarks he has made in criticising the budget but I must say that the budget has hopelessly failed to make adequate provision for the departments connected with rural uplift works and with health, happiness and prosperity of the people. I do not also hesitate to say that there has been no change in the policy and outlook of the budget. As before, the ratios of allotments under different heads of expenditure have not been appreciably changed. I state some of them for reference. The Hon'ble the Finance Minister in following his predecessors has allotted ·5 per cent of the income to commutations of pensions financed from ordinary revenues, 7 per cent. to Superannuation Allowances and Pensions, 16·7 per cent. to Police—the highest allotment that has been made in the budget, 2·5 per cent. to Jails and Convict Settlements, 7·4 per cent to Administration of Justice, 12·2 per cent. to General Administration including Debt Conciliation,—all told nearly 50 per cent. of the income he has allotted for these heads. But on the other hand he has been pleased to allot

·2 per cent. to Famine Relief, 1·3 per cent. to Industry including Cinchona Industry, 1·6 per cent. to Agriculture and Veterinary, 1 per cent. to Co-operation, 3·5 per cent. to Public Health, 4·2 per cent. to Medical Department, 12·2 per cent. to Education (including the Education of Anglo-Indians and Europeans) and 2·2 per cent. to Irrigation. All told he has allotted about 25 per cent. of the income to these departments. These allotments of about 25 per cent. towards nation-building departments include expenses for staff and establishments which carry a very large share of the net allotments for those departments. On a reading of the Budget statement again, it will be clear that much of these paltry allotments may be left unspent for want of time to carry out the projects and so-called schemes. At page 23 of the Budget statement we find that 60,000 rupees have been allotted as special stipends; out of this amount Rs. 50,000 will go to Muslim students; Rs. 5,000 to Scheduled Castes and Rs. 5,000 to others. This distribution seems to me to be unjust and inequitable. I have no time to go into details of the Budget. Two items in the expenditure strike me most. The discretionary grants under head "Supplementary Discretionary Grant by the District Officers" have been raised by about 2 lakhs, *i.e.*, from Rs. 99,000 to Rs. 2,95,000. No definite or well-defined schemes or projects have been formulated for this. We expect the Hon'ble the Finance Minister will please clear the position. The second is the allotment of Rs. 30,000 for the "Azad". Members of the Legislative Council should no more grudge their absence of any position in the Cabinet about which Dr Mukherjee referred in his debate regarding Select Committee matters only the other day for a fortunate colleague of theirs has been amply rewarded for his services rendered through his newspaper to the Government. The next year's Budget has practically made a provision for the 13th Minister by granting Rs. 30,000 to the "Azad". My friend Mr. Abu Hossain Sarkar regretted in his speech last night that a Ministership had been created without a portfolio. I respectfully differ from him and say that an extra-Cabinet Minister, if I am permitted to express myself in that way, has been created with a very important portfolio of Publicity. Unlike other Ministers the extra-Cabinet Minister's functions are not limited within the Assembly and the Council Chamber but wide enough to embrace the entire outside world. In reply to my question in the last session we found that the amount of all sorts of judicial works in the Hon'ble the High Court was gradually going down but still we have provided in the next year's Budget for two additional Judges like that in the current year's Budget with a huge cost of Rs. 48,000. The Hon'ble the Finance Minister regretfully stated that he was expected to create marvels out of nothing. He was afraid that even Aladdin's treasure would soon be exhausted with the ever increasing variety of the demands of modern democracy. We do not expect him to work out marvels and we know that he possesses

no Aladdin's lamp and treasure. But what we expect of him is that he should evoke in him that urgency in matters of nation-building departments as he feels the urgency for the Police and the akin departments. And I have a firm belief that he will not lack in funds to achieve his objects. Though he admits of limitation of resources he had no difficulty in adding 10 lakhs more to Police grant which sum is quite enough to do a lot for the real benefit of the people. By enacting the Agricultural Debtors' Act which is in some cases an exact and verbatim copy of the provisions of the Provincial Insolvency Act, the Government have in a way admitted that the whole of the province and the entire tenant community are in insolvency. But the Hon'ble the Finance Minister forgets about the inability of the people to pay taxes and for resources he at once suggests the imposition of fresh taxes and he says he will not spare himself in any way in imposing taxes. This iron determination may be praiseworthy. But may we expect of him that he would with similar iron hand and iron determination try to introduce further, immediate and substantial reduction in the maximum limit of the salary of the highly paid posts that are within his jurisdiction? If he can do so, he will not have to impose fresh taxation on the already exhausted people of Bengal. He has begged for the support of the various parties in the Assembly on the ground that the objectives of those parties do not run counter to that of the Government. But I beg to point out that the above fact regarding reduction of the maximum limit of salary is one of the many fundamentals in which we differ from the Government. The Hon'ble the Finance Minister has also neglected the problems regarding irrigation, and embankments, and public health that exist in mufassil and in North Bengal districts and demand urgent and immediate attention.

With these words, Sir, I conclude that the budget has been a total failure.

Maulvi ABDUL LATIF BISWAS: Sir, the budget presented on the floor of this House by the Hon'ble the Finance Minister has been the target of attack from all quarters I do not and cannot say that the budget is without imperfections, and I do not say that it is a model budget. It has got its defects, and the defects are no doubt serious. But at the same time it must be admitted that the framers of the budget kept the interests of the people in the forefront. There may be mistakes, but these mistakes, I cannot and do not say, are intentional.

First of all, I take up the subject of education. I do not see eye to eye with the Government that the liberal grants made to non-Government colleges, schools and other institutions are justifiable. We know that generosity is a great virtue. But at the same time we also know that generosity shown to a person less deserving in utter disregard and neglect of the worthier ones is a crime. We all know that primary education is a crying need of the province, and an unavoidable

necessity. The country is dying for it. But we also know that Government are not in a position to give effect to the scheme of free and compulsory primary education owing to want of funds. Taking this fact into consideration we cannot justify the action of Government in making grants to non-Government institutions. But I hold that the mistakes are *bona fide* and not intentional. In this connection I submit that it would have been proper if Government had set apart for the cause of primary education Rs. 6 lakhs which has been given to non-Government institutions together with the large amount which is going to be spent on the construction of new buildings. That is why I say that Government have made a mistake, a lamentable mistake.

Now, Sir, I agree with my friend Mr. Bari that so far as Agriculture is concerned, the action of Government is not praiseworthy. When the budget was framed Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed, the great protagonist for the fixation of the price of jute, was in charge of the department. When we read his speech at Munshiganj indicating that the fixation of the price of jute was not possible, we still hoped that as an advocate for the fixation of the price of jute he would be able to do something notable in this respect. But alas, when a budget was presented to us, to our utter surprise we found that his great interest in the matter was of no avail. Not only that, Sir, we understand that when the conference of Ministers of several provinces met, it was remarked by the Hon'ble Dr. Mahmud that the then Minister of Agriculture in Bengal could not give any definite scheme and was lacking in imagination——

Mr. SHAMSUDDIN AHMED: Where did the honourable member hear it from? Did he hear it in connection with the resolution that he tabled at the Coalition Party meeting?

Maulvi ABDUL LATIF BISWAS: As a Cabinet Minister my friend Mr. Shamsuddin shared with his colleagues the responsibility for the Agriculture Department and if he failed in the matter of the fixation of the price of jute, and I should say that he failed lamentably, it does not behove him to say that he resigned because his policy was not given effect to.

Now, Sir, we find that a large amount has been provided in the budget for propaganda work for voluntary restriction of the cultivation of jute. I have heard many a time on the floor of the House from my friends on this side as also on the other side including Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed, that voluntary restriction is of no use and that compulsory restriction is the remedy. I am at a loss to find, Sir, that nothing has been done by Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed towards compulsory restriction.

Now, I come to the policy of Government so far as Irrigation is concerned. I have already stated that if any mistake has been made, it has not been made intentionally. One thing must be defended, and it is this that Government have done a valuable service by the proposal

for the establishment of a Waterways Board. If the scheme is given effect to, I may say that a great deal will be done towards resuscitating the dead and dying rivers of Bengal, and I submit, Sir, that it should be supported by all concerned. But so far as the Irrigation Department is concerned, I do not see eye to eye with the Hon'ble Minister-in-charge. A great deal of money is being given for road development, but I cannot understand, Sir, why that money is not utilised and spent to the farthing.

Mr. SURENDRA NATH BISWAS: For want of projects.

Maulvi ABDUL LATIF BISWAS: I admit that it is so. But the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of Communications and Works lacks in imagination, for otherwise the money would have been spent. There are many projects which are being delayed days after days. In this connection I may bring to the notice of the House one particular instance. Sir, the Dacca-Aricha project is one of the most important ones. Immediately after the inauguration of the Provincial Autonomy the members of the Legislature from Dacca and several other districts took up the matter very urgently in a party meeting and represented it to the Hon'ble the Minister-in-charge. The Hon'ble Minister went to Dacca and made a tour from Manikganj to Aricha in the month of January, 1938. At that time we were assured by him that he would do his level best to fulfil the promise which had been held out by Government days in and days out. But now we find that nothing has been done. A false bogey has been raised day after day that the public health of the locality will be affected. But, Sir, I can assure this House that if the Hon'ble Minister would call a conference consisting of his experts—I mean the Director of Public Health and the Chief Engineer and others—and other experts who do not belong to Government, I think that non-official gentlemen would be able to satisfy him that this cry is a false cry, and it will not be able to stand scrutiny. Sir, in that year when we pressed the matter again, the Hon'ble Minister assured us that a survey would be made very soon and after that the matter would be considered very seriously, but, Sir, the year 1938 has already passed, and we are in the year 1939, and some time later 1940 will be on us. So, we do not know when that project would be considered and when the Government would give its attention to it. In this respect, Sir, I accuse the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of Communications and Works that he has failed in his duty very lamentably. I accuse him again that he has not done his duty to the province of Bengal and that he cannot give proper thought to it, and I further state that he is not fit to hold charge of the departments entrusted to his care. (Cries of "Hear, hear" from Congress members.) I again draw his attention to the fact that he be pleased to call a conference consisting of experts and non-official

gentlemen, and again I tell him that the scheme is one which cannot but be approved after careful scrutiny without any delay and as such the effect might be given to it at a very early date.

Next comes the policy of the Government so far as the police budget is concerned. Here, again, some increased provision has been made, and I do not see why this provision should be criticised mercilessly. We all know that radical communism is making tremendous strides in the country, and it is the duty of the Government to see that nothing untoward happens which may sap the very foundations of society. It is the bounden duty of the Government to be prepared with all its machinery to avert that. From that point of view we must support all actions of the Government for making increased provision for the police.

Now, Sir, the provision for tear gas has been mercilessly criticised by my esteemed friend Mr. Pramatha Nath Banerjee.

Mr. PRAMATHA NATH BANERJEE: I never criticised the provision for tear gas. All that I said was that let tear gas be reserved for this side, and laughing gas for the other side. (Laughter.)

Maulvi ABDUL LATIF BISWAS: As far as I can understand, Sir, the provision for tear gas will do a great deal of good to this country. We know that at present workers are excited and incited to strikes, and it so happens that sometimes the interference of the Government is called for, and the Government send armed police and military for that purpose. If tear gas becomes successful, I think lamentable happenings will be averted.

Now, Sir, I do not like to take up much time of the House. In the end I may say that this is a budget which cannot be supported. This is a budget which cannot also be wholly condemned. It has got its blemishes; it has also got its merits. We may say that if there is any mistake in the budget, the mistake is not intentional but a *bona fide* mistake. The Government should be given credit for the good things in the budget.

Mr. SPEAKER: I shall now adjourn the House for 15 minutes.

The House was then adjourned for 15 minutes.

(*After adjournment.*)

Mr. SHAHEDALI: Sir, I congratulate the Hon'ble Mr. Sarker for his omission of the slogan "Bande Mataram" which he usually used towards the close of his speech. The origin of the slogan "Bande Mataram" was communal and anti-Muslim and as such, it cannot have any place in the budget speech.

As regards the contents of the budget, there is nothing new except bestowing new and uncalled for patronages here and there. It appears that he has written what he was ordered to write. He has admitted in his speech that he had no scheme to spend the money. A Finance Minister is not a mere clerk—he is much above a clerk.

There is a Publicity Department under the direct control of the Director of Public Information. He has two papers—"Bengal Weekly" and "Banglar Katha". This department is ever vigilant to safeguard the interests of the Cabinet and issue contradictions regarding the alleged statements of Ministers, when necessary, and what it considers the good deeds of Ministery. In spite of that, we fail to understand why the Hon'ble the Finance Minister should be gracious enough to grant Rs. 30,000 to our "old" and "genuine Muslim" Maulana Akram Khan who knows nothing except "Tanzim" and "Azad". He has given no reason for this chivalrous act. If preaching of communalism is the standard of grant, I cannot understand why the "Ananda Bazar" and the "Basumati" should escape the notice of the Hon'ble the Finance Minister.

It is also rumoured that Maulana Akram Khan, the editor of "Azad", owes a huge sum to a member of the Cabinet. Is this grant then a chance to the Maulana to liquidate his debt?

Sir, the Bengal Government has run the risk of borrowing money and taken recourse to fresh taxation for the stabilization of the budget. To my mind, it is absolutely unnecessary and dangerous precedent. We should cut our coat according to our cloth and we should live within our means. We could very easily get this money by retrenchment of officers and by a cut in the salary of the officers. Now although there are assurances after assurances for the retrenchment yet in the budget speech we fail to get any light. Compulsory retirement after 25 years' service was passed by this House, yet our Hon'ble the Finance Minister is not going to give effect to it and he is thereby flouting the opinion of the House. If the Government want to introduce fresh taxation, it should have been on the line suggested by Mr. Jalaluddin Hashemy in a speech on the floor of this House.

The Hon'ble the Finance Minister was absolutely right when he made provisions for stipends for poor boys for their study in Bengal and outside Bengal. More money, however, should have been earmarked for this purpose.

The Hon'ble the Finance Minister has stated that there was much saving as there was a short session in July and no session in November, 1938. The Hon'ble Minister did not enlighten us why the July session was short and why there was no session in November. There were further savings from Youth Welfare Work, provision for the training of teachers for primary schools, provision for appointment of Assistant Physical Directress of Schools, and like other

sources. We fail to understand why the money, provided for, was not utilized. Money is meant for spending and not for saving. Non-utilisation of the money does not go to the credit of the Hon'ble the Finance Minister. This means want of scheme and want of foresight. We want schemes to be worked out and the money spent. We do not want any saving during the next year. The attention of the Hon'ble the Finance Minister is drawn to this.

Babu KSHETRA NATH SINGHA: Sir, I rise to speak something about the condition of the schedule castes community. I am here not to criticise the policy of the Government but I would like to state the grievances of the scheduled castes. We do not grudge the grant of Rs. 1½ lakhs to the Maharaja of Burdwan's College, we do not object to the grant of Rs. 1½ lakhs to the richest College of Bengal, namely, the St. Xavier's College, we do not object to the grant of nearly Rs. 75,000 to the Karatia College and Hostel, we do not complain against the granting of Rs. 30,000 to "Azad" of which so much has been made by Congress friends. We are here to speak about our own grievances and we would not have cared about anything had the grievances of our community been met by Government. We are a half-famished and half-naked people and we want a little food and a little clothing. Crores and crores of rupees are being spent every year by this Government for many things, but we scheduled castes—what have we got? We have got practically nothing. If you compare the amount allotted for the scheduled castes numbering about a crore, it is nothing—it is merely a drop in the ocean. We are suffering from all sorts of disadvantages and we expected better conditions under the present Ministry which contained our own countrymen. We want the present Government to show us some kindness. Amongst other things, I would like to stress upon one thing and that is "Education". Education we must have. The former Government showed us no pity in this respect and we thought that under the new reforms, our own countrymen would be kind to us and provide us with better facilities for education, but we are still groaning under the same disadvantages under which we have been groaning for hundreds of years. What Government have given us? Government have given 30, 20 and 5 thousands of rupees for this one crore of people. This 55 thousands of rupees is a mere drop in the ocean. Rs. 5 lakhs was given to us—I shall say most reluctantly given under some pressure. It will appear from the budget that only Rs. 2 lakhs are going to be spent in the present year, though a year is going to be passed since the grant was sanctioned. We wanted that these Rs. 5 lakhs should have been spent in the past year and Government, if not in so many words, but impliedly assented to the spending of the whole of these Rs. 5 lakhs during the year but these Rs. 5 lakhs have not been spent up to this time. That is the position and that is our grievance. We do not mind if thousands are spent on other subjects, provided our community is shown a little more

consideration. 'I ask the Hon'ble the Finance Minister why he could not spend this Rs. 5 lakhs within the year? Why could not he prepare a scheme to facilitate the education of the classes for which we are so much earnestly asking the Government? We did not want Rs. 5 lakhs for a year. Our intention was to get some help from Government which would enable us to rise to the standard of humanity. We did not want some crumbs from the table. We want that something should be given to us for our permanent benefit. But, Sir, Government are quite unwilling to help those who require it most.

Under the circumstances, though we are not satisfied with the budget, still we put our grievances before the House, so that Government may in future be kind to us. Government cannot punish an entire community for the fault of some of its members in going against it on one or two occasions. It is not our fault that we represent a weak community for which we are clamouring for some help. Government are not at all attempting to meet the demands of the community. If the Government go on in this way how are the people who want most help going to get it. I do not want to say anything more. It is our general complaint that much injustice has been done to our community. We should not have been treated in the way the present budget has done. We make our vehement protest against the present budget estimate.

Dr. SURESH CHANDRA BANERJI: Mr. Speaker, Sir, হিন্দুস্থান ষ্ট্যান্ডার্ড বর্ত্তমান বাজেটকে rake's বাজেট বোলে বর্ণনা কোরেছে। Rake মানে উচ্ছৃঙ্খল, অমিতব্যয়ী; অর্থাৎ যে তার টাকা কেবল খরচ কোরতে থাকে, আয়ের দিকে তাকায় না, শেষটায় যাকে ঋণের জালে জড়িত হোয়ে পোড়তে হয়। আমাদের বর্ত্তমান গভর্ণমেন্টও ঠিক সে রকম। গভর্ণমেন্টের আয় যতই বেড়ে চোলেছে তার খরচও তত বেশী হয়ে দাড়াচ্ছে। এবং এভাবে বেড়ে চোলেছে যে খরচ কুলিয়ে উঠানো আর সম্ভব হয়ে উঠছে না। সাধারণতঃ মানুষ খরচ করে কেন? নিত্য-নৈমিত্তিক অভাব মেটাবার জন্য। কিন্তু আমাদের গভর্ণমেন্ট খরচ করেন নিত্যনৈমিত্তিক অভাবের জন্য নয়;—আমাদের ঘাড়ে যে top-heavy administration চাপান আছে সেটার খরচ যোগাতেই আমাদের বর্ত্তমান গভর্ণমেন্ট আরো অধিক ঋণজালে জড়াচ্ছেন। অমৃতবাজার পত্রিকা সত্যই বোলেছে যে বর্ত্তমান বাজেট জনগণের বাজেট নয়। আমাদের মাননীয় প্রধান মন্ত্রীমহাশয় প্রায়ই বড়াই করে বলেন যে বর্ত্তমান মন্ত্রীমণ্ডলী জনসাধারণকে ডাল ভাত দেবার জন্যই মন্ত্রীত্ব কোরছেন। বাংলার জনগণ—নিম্ন মধ্যবিত্ত শ্রেণীর লোকেরা, কৃষক ও শ্রমিক সম্প্রদায়,—বর্ত্তমানে ডাল ভাত ছাড়া আর কিছুই চলে না। কিন্তু এই বাজেটে—যেই ডাল ভাত বাংলার জনগণের প্রধানতম সমস্যা, সেই ডালভাত সম্বন্ধে কোন উল্লেখ নাই। এই বাজেটে—বর্ত্তমান বাংলার জনগণের পড়ে মাসিক আয় যে দেড় টাকা মাত্র সেকথার উল্লেখ আছে কি? এবং সেই সামান্য আয়ের দ্বারা তাদের পক্ষে আবশ্যকীয় জিনিষপত্র কেনা যে অসম্ভব তার কোন আলোচনা আছে কি? আমি কিছুদিন পূর্ব্বে গ্রামে ঘুরে ঘুরে গ্রামের জনগণ কি ভাবে দিন চালায়, তাদের জীবন যাত্রা কি ভাবে নির্ব্বাহ হয়, সে বিষয়ে প্রত্যক্ষ অনুসন্ধান কোরেছি। আমি দেখেছি—যে পরিবারের গড়পড়তা লোক সংখ্যা ৫ জন, সে পরিবারের মাসিক আয় সাড়ে সাত টাকার বেশী নয়। এখন সেই সাড়ে সাত টাকা বাড়িয়ে যদি কোন ও প্রকারে ১৫৲ টাকা করা সম্ভব হয় তবেই গ্রামের জনসাধারণ কোন মতে ডালভাত খেয়ে থাকতে পারে। সুতরাং আমাদের সম্মুখে বর্ত্তমানে প্রধান সমস্যা হচ্ছে—কি কোরে বাড়িয়ে তাদের

আয়কে ১॥৹ টাকা থেকে ৩৲ টাকা করা যায়। আমি একথা socialist হিসাবে বোলছি না। আমাদের সাম্নে প্রতিনিয়ত যে দুর্দ্দশা প্রত্যক্ষ কোরছি সেই দুর্দ্দশার দিকে তাকিয়ে একথা বোলছি। আমি যে সমস্যার কথা বোলছি সে বিষয়ে কোন গভর্ণমেণ্ট এখন চিন্তা না কোরে থাকতে পারে না। যে গভর্ণমেণ্ট বর্ত্তমানে ১॥৹ টাকা আয় বাড়িয়ে ৩৲ টাকা না কোরতে পারবেন সে গভর্ণমেণ্টের বলা উচিত যে "আমরা পারলেম না, ছেড়ে চল্লেম, যে পারে সেই এসে গভর্ণমেণ্ট গঠন করুক"। আমি যদি দিব্য চক্ষে সে পথ না দেখতে পেতাম যে পথে দেড় টাকা হোতে বাড়িয়া আয় তিন টাকা করা সম্ভব, সে পথের স্পষ্ট ধারণা যদি আমার না থাকতো তবে আজ আমি এ বক্তৃতা দিতে খাড়া হোতাম না।

কিছুদিন পূর্ব্বে আমি ঢাকেশ্বরী কটন মিলে গিয়েছিলাম, সেখানে প্রায় ৭ হাজার মজুর কাজ করে। আমি দেখেছি হিসাব কোরে,—তাদের গড়-পড়তা মাসিক আয় ১৫৲ টাকা। তাতে এই মিলের ঐ ৭ হাজার লোকের বেকার সমস্যাই শুধু সমাধান হয় নাই, সেই ৭ হাজার লোকের উপার্জ্জনের অর্থে যে ৩৫ হাজার লোক প্রতিপালিত হচ্ছে তাদেরও অন্ন-বস্ত্রের সমস্যার সমাধান হয়েছে। আমার মনে পড়ে অর্থসচিব মাননীয় নলিনী রঞ্জন সরকার মহাশয় প্রথম বাজেট পেশের সময় বলেছিলেন যে কারখানা শিল্পওয়ালা বাংলার বেকার সমস্যা মিটানো অসম্ভব; কারণ বাংলার কারখানায় যে সব মজুর কাজ করে তাদের বেশীর ভাগ বাঙ্গালী নহে, অবাঙ্গালী। সেজন্য এই ঢাকেশ্বরী মিলের ব্যাপার থেকে আমাদের অনেক কিছু শোনবার আছে।

আপনারা জানেন ঢাকেশ্বরী মিল start করবার সময় প্রায় বিশ লক্ষ টাকা খরচ হয়েছিল। যদি দুকোটি টাকা খরচ কোরে বাংলা দেশে ১০টা মিল প্রতিবৎসর প্রতিষ্ঠিত করা যায় তাহলে প্রতি মিলে ৩৫ হাজার কোরে মোট প্রায় সাড়ে তিন লক্ষ লোকের অন্ন-সমস্যার সমাধান হ'তে পারে। এভাবে ১০ বছর চল্লে বাংলার বেকার সমস্যার অনেকটা নিরাকরণ সম্ভব। এভাবে বস্ত্র-শিল্প বাংলায় বাড়ানো যে খুবই সম্ভব—কিছুদিন পূর্ব্বে কলিকাতা বিশ্ববিদ্যালয়ে বস্ত্র-শিল্প সম্বন্ধে মিঃ গুহ যে বক্তৃতা দিয়েছেন তাতে তা স্পষ্ট হয়ে ফুটে উঠেছে।

এখন প্রশ্ন এই দুকোটি টাকা আসবে কোথা থেকে? আমাদের বর্ত্তমান বাজেটে প্রায় ১৪ কোটি টাকা খরচ দেখানো হয়েছে। তা থেকে দুকোটি টাকা বাঁচানো মোটেই কঠিন নয়। আমার সময় নাই, সময় থাকলে দেখিয়ে দিতাম যে কি করে, তা বাঁচানো সম্ভব। তবু আমি মোটামুটি কয়েকটি উপায় দেখাবো। আমাদের মন্ত্রীমহোদয়দের এবং পরিষদ ও কাউন্সিলের সভ্যদের মাইনে ও ভাতার পরিমাণ অর্দ্ধেক করা হলে এবং Divisional Commissioners দের পদ উঠিয়ে দেওয়া গেলে বছরে প্রায় ১৫ লক্ষ টাকা বাঁচে। আর সরকারী কর্ম্মচারীদের মধ্যে যাদের মাইনে মাসে ১০০৲ টাকা হতে ২০০৲ টাকা পায় তাদের মাইনে শতকরা ৫৲ এবং যাদের মাইনে দুইশত টাকার উপর তাদের ১০৲ টাকা কোরে কমান হলে বৎসরে প্রায় ১৫ লক্ষ টাকা বাঁচে। তাছাড়া জেলে যখন প্রায় ১২ হাজার সুস্থ সবল লোক পরিশ্রম করে, তখন জেলখানা কেন নিজের পায়ে দাঁড়াতে পারে না, আমি তো তার কোন কারণ খুঁজে পাই না। আমি যখন জেলে ছিলাম, তখন সেখানকার লোকদের সঙ্গে মিশে হিসাব কোরে দেখেছি যে জেল কেবল যে স্বাবলম্বী হতে পারে তাই নয় তা আয় পর্য্যন্ত কোরতে পারে। তারপর পুলিশ-বিভাগের কথা। এবিভাগেও ২৫ লক্ষ টাকা বাঁচানো অতি সোজা। এইভাবে প্রত্যেক জায়গাতেই অন্ততঃ ৪।৫ লক্ষ বাঁচানো কিছুই অসম্ভব নয়। সুতরাং নানা বিভাগ থেকে দুকোটি টাকা বাঁচানো বাংলা গভর্ণমেণ্টের পক্ষে মোটেই কঠিন নয়। এই দুকোটি টাকা খরচ কোরে যদি কটন মিল-সমূহ বিভিন্ন জেলায় স্থাপন করা যায় তাহলে বাংলার বেকার সমস্যা ও অন্ন-বস্ত্রের সমস্যা সমাধান হোতে পারে। এভাবে এগিয়ে চললে জনগণের অবস্থার উন্নতি হওয়ার ফলে তাদের ট্যাক্স দিবার ক্ষমতা বাড়বে এবং সেই ক্রমবর্দ্ধমাণ ট্যাক্সের সাহায্যে আমাদের পক্ষে দেশে শিল্প-বাণিজ্যের উন্নতি, শিক্ষার প্রসার এবং ডাক্তারখানা, হাসপাতাল প্রভৃতির স্থাপন সহজ হতে পারে। তাই আমি আজ এখানে কংগ্রেসী হিসাবে বা বিরুদ্ধ-দলীয় হিসাবে কিছু বোলছি না। বাংলার দুর্দ্দশা দেখে প্রাণ কেঁদে ওঠে বলেই এসব কথা আপনা আপনি বেরিয়ে আসছে। মাননীয় মন্ত্রীমহোদয়দের

কাছে আমার সানুনয় নিবেদন এই তাহারা যেন এই industrialisation এর দিকে সক্রিয় দৃষ্টি দেন। এজন্য কোন planning commission কিংবা ব্যাপক সার্ভের প্রয়োজন নাই। একাজ এখনি আরম্ভ করা যেতে পারে।

Mr. MONMOHAN DAS: On the eve of the Budget discussion, I desire to discuss the policy of the Government regarding the protection of the minority communities, depressed classes and scheduled castes. Sir, if the policy of the Government is that adequate facilities should be given to these communities, I am sure it would be a matter of surprise to the Hon'ble the Chief Minister to know that the District School Boards, which are responsible bodies, have failed to protect the interests of minority communities and scheduled castes. The scheduled castes are a part and parcel of the body politic and though they have their separate entity in the country, they have every right to get their due share in the administration. In my own constituency (Mymensingh district) the scheduled castes in spite of their repeated demands are still waiting in the hope that their claims to proper representation on local bodies and District School Boards and many other claims would be recognised. The scheduled castes of Mymensingh district are the most backward in education; they are the poorest of the poor; still they are deprived of all facilities in the matter of education. Sir, on the last occasion when the Hon'ble the Chief Minister paid a visit to Kishoreganj, I had the privilege of discussing with him the case of the scheduled castes and the Hon'ble the Chief Minister was kind enough to ask me to submit a note embodying our grievances in respect of education and the conduct of the District School Boards. These people have been suffering from the time of the introduction of the Primary Education Act in the district of Mymensingh. Sir, I regret to say that they are still so unfortunate as not to be able to enlist the sympathy of the School Board. Their case has been ignored whereas other communities have been successful. This is the situation.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: On a point of order, Sir. May I know whether the Hon'ble the Finance Minister has deputed the Hon'ble Mr. Raikut to act in his stead when he is absent, or may I know if he has taken your leave? Otherwise, the budget discussion cannot proceed.

The Hon'ble Mr. PRASANNA DEB RAIKUT: I am taking notes on behalf of the Hon'ble the Finance Minister.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Good, good!

Mr. SPEAKER: Dr. Sanyal, you are also subject to human limitations.

Mr. MONMOHAN DAS: Sir, the primary object of my life is to give some education at least to the poor and backward people not only of my constituency but also of the province as a whole. With this object in view, I have devoted my whole time and energy to maintain as many as 20 special primary schools in Mymensingh, all of which have been refused by the District School Board. These observations are not only applicable to Mymensingh, but also to some parts of Dacca. I do not wish to add anything more about the School Board.

Now, coming to the Budget I find that a provision of Rs. 55,000 has been made under three items for the people of the scheduled castes. The money budgeted for the scheduled castes is nothing but a game played by the Hon'ble the Finance Minister I should say, because last year a capital grant of Rs. 5 lakhs was provided for the scheduled castes by the Hon'ble the Finance Minister, and now it has been shown as the unspent balance. I submit that if this policy of Government, showing the amount granted as unspent balance, is to continue year after year, it will be a mere eye-wash to show the sum as the scheduled castes grant. I am sorry to say that though provision was made to spend more than 5 lakhs last year, Government did not get any scope for spending that. As many as 500 students of the scheduled castes are getting collegiate education in the current year and more than 2,000 students are prosecuting their studies in schools. So far as primary education is concerned, we lag far behind others but the Government do not think it necessary to establish primary schools in areas populated by the scheduled castes. I understand that no less than 500 primary schools are required to give primary education to the poor scheduled castes in the whole province, but the Government have not taken any steps in that direction. It looks as if it is nothing but a game played by the Hon'ble the Chief Minister and the Hon'ble the Finance Minister, because the money budgeted for last year has now been shown as the unspent balance. If this is going to be their policy, they can as well put a stop to the practice of making any yearly provision for the scheduled castes. Government are contemplating to spend Rs. 30,000 for the purpose of building structure in the district of the Hon'ble the Chief Minister and Rs. 20,000 in the district of the Special Officer who has been appointed for the scheduled castes, *i.e.*, in the Tippera district, and Rs. 1,50,000 for permanent structures in Calcutta, whereas the students belonging to the scheduled castes are feeling the necessity for hostels not only in the districts but also in the subdivisional headquarters. Sir, my idea was that according to the same consideration not less than 20 separate hostels should be started in district headquarters and not less than 75 hostels in subdivisional towns. I was under the impression that this sum would be spent in the course of the year. But I now understand that the money has been shown as unspent. Is it not a game played with the scheduled castes? My submission is that the Hon'ble the Finance Minister has already shown

that only by taxing the poor tenants he will make primary education successful. In this connection I cannot but refer to a demi-official letter of the District Magistrate of Mymensingh, written in his capacity as President of the District School Board——

(At this stage the member reached his time-limit but was allowed to conclude his speech in a minute.)

In this letter the District Magistrate addressing the respective members of the District School Board said,—"As you are an elected representative of the district and as the responsibility for safeguarding the interest of the people devolves upon you, I would venture to request you to be so good as to move Government at the ensuing budget session to augment our income by an adequate annual recurring contribution and also to make provision for a suitable capital grant for school building." The fact is that the scheme provides for the establishment of 2,634 primary schools, although up to the present day 2,408 schools have been started, for which a sum of Rs. 9,59,942 will be required annually for the pay of teachers, although the assumption of the District School Board was that about Rs. 8,50,000 is to be collected out of the education cess. But the result up to the month of October last is that only Rs. 2,80,000 has been realised. It was for this reason that the District Magistrate issued the demi-official letter from which I have just quoted.

In conclusion, I should like to saw a word about the position of the school buildings. I think, about Rs. 1,500 is required for building a school hut with corrugated iron roof and pucca plinth. I submit, Sir, primary education will never be successful if it is proposed to introduce it by imposing fresh taxation on the poor tenants.

(At this stage Mr. Speaker called upon Mr. Idris Ahmed Mia to speak, in the absence of Mr. Iswar Das Jalan whose name was first called, when Dr. Sanyal made the following interruption.)

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: I submit, Sir, Mr. Rasik Lal Biswas has been selected as substitute in the place of Mr. Jalan from our party. I think, he may be allowed to speak now.

Mr. SPEAKER: I did not get any notice of that. I will, however, call him next.

Maulvi IDRIS AHMED MIA: আজ বাংলার গরীবের এবং দেশের ভাগ্য নির্ণয় কোরতে ব'সে যে জমা খরচ আমরা দেখ্‌ছি, তাতে আমাদের প্রাণ ঠাণ্ডা হয়ে গেছে। (Some Members from the Congress Group: ঠাণ্ডা না শীতল?) ঠাণ্ডাই হয়েছে, আমি বোল্‌বো। বাংলা দেশের প্রত্যেক দল আজ প্রাথমিক শিক্ষার আবশ্যকতা উপলব্ধি কোরছে। কিন্তু আমাদের মাননীয় অর্থসচিব মহোদয় যেন একটা পণ কোরে বোসেছেন যে এ দিকে তিনি একটা পয়সাও ব্যয় কোরবেন না। গত বছর তিনি দয়া কোরে পাঁচ লক্ষ টাকা প্রাথমিক শিক্ষার জন্য বরাদ্দ কোরে রেখেছিলেন, এবং জোর গলায় বোলেছিলেন "এবার প্রাথমিক শিক্ষার জন্য ৫ লক্ষ

টাকা ধরা হয়েছে।" তখন আমরা আশা কোরেছিলাম যে এ পাঁচ লক্ষ টাকা খরচ তো হবেই তাছাড়া আরো টাকা হয়তো দেওয়া হবে এবং পরবৎসর কোটি টাকার চেয়েও বেশী দেওয়া হবে। কিন্তু এখন কার্য্যক্ষেত্রে দেখা যাচ্ছে সেই ৫ লক্ষ টাকা খরচ তো হয়ই নাই—শুনেছি তা থেকে পাঁচটা পয়সাও খরচ করা হয় নাই, (From Congress side: সাধু, সাধু) তার উপর এবৎসর দয়া কোরে সেই টাকাই আবার একটা অভিনয়ের মতন কোরে দেখানো হয়েছে যে এত টাকা বরাদ্দ করা হলো। অর্থসচিব মহোদয় বেশ সুন্দর কোরে একটা কথা বোলেছেন যে আমাদের গভর্ণমেন্টের হাতে টাকা নাই, বড় লাটের দপ্তর থেকে টাকা আনতে হবে। তাঁর সে মন্তব্য শুনে গ্রাম্য এক বুড়ির মন্তরের কেরামতির কথাই মনে পড়ে। সে পাঁচ পয়সা নিয়ে গাছের একটু জড় দিয়ে লোকদের বলতো (laughter) "মাঘ মাসের দুপহরে রাতে মরা পোড়ার ঘাটে এই জড় নিয়ে নদীতে ডুব দিয়ে এক নিশ্বাসে একশো বার হরি নাম কোরলে যা চাইবে তাই পাবে।" বাংলা গভর্ণমেন্টের হাতে যদি কোটি কোটি টাকাও থাকে তাতেও তারা এ দিকে খরচ কোরতে চান না, খরচের ইচ্ছা নাই এবং খরচের প্রবৃত্তি আছে বোলেও আমাদের মনে হয় না। আমরা আজ দুই বৎসর ধোরে গভর্ণমেন্ট পক্ষের লোক—যা তাঁরা বোলছেন তাই সমর্থন কোরেছি। গত দুবার জমা খরচের সময় কিছুই বলিনি। কিন্তু প্রত্যেক জিনিষেরই একটা সীমা আছে, একটা শেষ আছে। (From Congress side: আশা করি এবারেই সে শেষ হবে।) কাল আমাদের প্রধান মন্ত্রী মহাশয় অপরদিকে লোকদের লক্ষ্য করে বোলেছেন—"আমরা তো নিজেরা কিছুই করি না, আমাদের সংযুক্ত পার্টি যা করান তাই আমরা কোরে থাকি"। সেই উক্তিদ্বারা আমরা মোটামুটি এই বুঝতে পেরেছি যে আমরা অর্থাৎ আমরা এবং আমাদের বন্ধুদের দলই গভর্ণমেন্টকে পরিচালিত কোরছি। যদিও মোটামুটি ভাবে বুঝা গেল বটে যে আমরাই গভর্ণমেন্টকে পরিচালিত কোরছি কিন্তু আসলে তাঁরাই আমাদের পরিচালনা কোরছেন না আমরাই তাঁদের পরিচালনা কোরছি— এবিষয়ের নির্ণয় করার একমাত্র উপায় হচ্ছে এই জমা খরচের দিকে দৃষ্টিপাত করা। বাংলাদেশে সত্যই আমরা গরীবের জন্য কিছু কোরতে চাই কি না এবং করবার জন্য আমাদের ইচ্ছা কিছু আছে কি না, যদি এবিষয়ে আমাদের, ইচ্ছা বাস্তবিকই থেকে থাকে তাহলে সেটার কিছু কিছু ক্রিয়া এই জমা খরচেই দেখা যাবে। আমরা বাংলা গভর্ণমেন্টকে পরিচালিত কোরছি, একথা বক্তৃতার মুখে বেশ ভালো শোনা যায়, বটে, কিন্তু প্রকৃত কর্ম্মক্ষেত্রে এসে মাননীয় মন্ত্রী মহাশয়গণ যখন যা বোলবেন তাই বেদবাক্য বোলে মেনে নিতে হবে,—ইহার নাম কি পরিচালনা? বোধ হয় সে অবস্থা দুবৎসর পার হওয়ার পর আমাদের দলের আর নাই। (Hear, hear.)

আর একটা কথা হচ্ছে এই যে আমাদের বন্ধুগণের মধ্যে যারা গভর্ণমেন্টকে সমর্থন করেন তার ভিতর অনেক ধর্ম্মভিরু মুসলমান আছেন। তাঁরা প্রত্যেকেই ভালোভাবে নামাজ রোজা কোরে থাকেন; ধর্ম্মগ্রন্থ পাঠ কোরে থাকেন। কিন্তু কোরাণের সর্ব্বপ্রথম কথাই হোচ্ছে "একরা" লেখাপড়া শিখ তুমি, পড় তুমি, বিদ্যান হও তুমি, পণ্ডিত হও তুমি, এটা যদি কোরাণের ফরজ হয় এবং হজরৎ মহম্মদের সেই উপদেশ বানী যে প্রত্যেক নর-নারীরই পক্ষে লেখা পড়া জানা হচ্ছে ফরজ, অর্থাৎ বাধ্যতামূলক তাহ'লে আমাদেরি দায়িত্ব আছে, প্রাথমিক শিক্ষার জন্য টাকার বরাদ্দ করা এবং যেরূপেই হোক তার ব্যবস্থা আমাদেরই কোরতেই হবে। আমরা যদি তা না করি, তাহলে আমার বিশ্বাস পরকালে এরজন্য আমাদের সকলকেই জবাবদিহি দিতে হবে। এরজন্য আমার মনে হয় মাননীয় প্রধান মন্ত্রী মহাশয়কেই জিজ্ঞাসা করা হবে সর্ব্বপ্রথম "বাংলায় তুমি কেন প্রাথমিক শিক্ষা প্রবর্ত্তন করো নাই?"

তবে একটা বাহাদুরির জন্য আমাদের অর্থসচিব মহোদয়কে ধন্যবাদ না দিয়ে পারা যায় না। তিনি পাকাঘর প্রস্তুতের কাজে খুব মজবুত লোক। তিনি যেমন নিজের বাড়ীটী কোরেছেন হিন্দুস্থান বিল্ডিং কোরেছেন, তেম্নিকোরে বোধকরি বাংলা দেশের জায়গায় জায়গায় তার রাজত্বের কীর্ত্তি রেখে যেতে চান, তিনি পুলিশের জন্য বড় বড় বাড়ীঘর ও আদালতের জন্য বড় বড় ঠিকাদারের পকেট ভর্ত্তির আফিসান কারখানা, প্রকাণ্ড প্রকাণ্ড জেলখানা এমন কি হাইকোর্টের পায়খানা প্রভৃতি কোরে এমন একটা কীর্ত্তি রাখতে চান যাতে নাকি ভবিষ্যৎ বংশধরেরা এই

কীর্ত্তির জন্য তাঁকে স্মরণ রাখবে। আর একটা তাজ্জবের কথা এই যে তিনি একটা নূতন জিনিষের সন্ধান দিয়েছেন। সেটা হচ্ছে কোটি খানেক টাকা ধার কোরে বাংলাকে উদ্ধার করা। এর শেষ কোথায় দাঁড়াবে আমি তো জানি না। কিন্তু আমার মনে হয় যেভাবে আমরা তাঁকে সমর্থণ কোরে আসছি, এইভাবে আরো তাঁকে সমর্থণ কোরে যদি যাই তাহলে এবছরে এক কোটি, আসছে বছরে তিন কোটি, তারপরে হবে ৬ কোটি, এই সব দেনা রেখে আমরা তো যাবো সরে, কিন্তু পরে যারা আসছে, তাদের দিয়ে যাবে সেই ধার—যে ধার মিরজাফর এক দিনের উত্তেজনায় কোরেছিলো, এবং যা শোধ কোরতে বাংলা দেশের দুশো বছর লাগছে। অন্ততঃ বাংলা দেশ আর ধার কোরবে না এই প্রতিজ্ঞা করা উচিত। আমরা দেখেছি ভারত গভর্ণমেণ্ট বাংলা গভর্ণমেণ্টকে পাটের ট্যাক্স বাবদ পৌনে দুকোটি থেকে দুকোটি টাকা দান কোরেছেন। কিন্তু সে সমস্ত টাকা খরচ কোরেও গভর্ণমেণ্টের আবার ধার কোরে খরচ করার প্রবৃত্তি কোমলো না? এও যদি সমর্থণ করা হয় তাহলে বুঝবো যে বাংলাদেশের বর্ত্তমান গভর্ণমেণ্টের মালিকদের ভালমন্দ বুঝবার ক্ষমতা লোপ পেয়েছে। এ দুবছর আমাদের শিশুপাঠের কথা শোনানো হয়েছে—"গোপাল বড় সুবোধ বালক, চুপ কোরে বোসে বোসে পড়াশোনা করে, বাপ-মা যা বলে তাই শোনে"। এই বোলে আমাদের চুপ করিয়ে রাখা হয়েছে। চুপ কোরে থাক, কোন কথা বোল্লে বাজেটের সময় কোন আপত্তি তুললে আমাদের মন্ত্রীত্ব ভেঙ্গে যাবে। কিন্তু মন্ত্রীত্ব রেখে গরীবের ভাগ্যে কি দেখছি? সেদিন আমরা গড়ের মাঠে মোহামেডান স্পোর্টিংএ যুব আন্দোলনের জন্য কয়েক লাখ টাকার বরাদ্দের ব্যবস্থা দেখলাম কিন্তু বাংলার আধমরা গরীব শিশুদের শিক্ষা আন্দোলনের বরাদ্দ কোথায়? যুব আন্দোলন সম্বন্ধে গত বৎসর দার্জ্জিলিং সহরে আমার কিছু কিছু জানবার সুযোগ ঘটেছিল।

(Here the member having reached the time-limit resumed his seat.)

Mr RASIK LAL BISWAS: মাননীয় সভাপতি মহাশয়, আমাদের মাননীয় অর্থসচিব মহাশয় যে বাজেট প্রস্তুত কোরেছেন তাতে নানাবিধ উপভোগ্য বিষয় আছে। এবং তদ্দ্বারা আমাদের গভর্ণমেণ্ট কোন প্রণালীতে এদেশ শাসন করেন তাও বেশ বিশিষ্টভাবে সন্নিবেশিত কোরে দেখান হয়েছে। কাজেই তিনি যে গভর্ণমেণ্টের মুখোস খুলে ফেলেছেন জনসাধারণের কাছে এজন্য তাঁকে আমি কিঞ্চিৎ ধন্যবাদ দিতে কার্পণ্য কোরবো না।

আমাদের এই গভর্ণমেণ্ট যে একটা মাথাভারি গভর্ণমেণ্ট সে কথা আমরা অনেক দিন থেকেই বোলে আসছি। এবং মাথাটা তার এত ভারি হয়েছে যে খানিকটা ছেটে কেটে না ফেল্লে আর চলছে না। এ জিনিষটা সম্বন্ধে অনেকেই আমাদের গভর্ণমেণ্টকে বোঝাতে চেষ্টা কোরেছেন, কিন্তু বোঝাতে সক্ষম হন নাই। তবু আমি একটু চেষ্টা কোরবো। আমাদের দেশের জনসাধারণের গড় আয় মাসিক মাত্র ৯৷৷৹ টাকা। একথা অন্য বক্তা আগেও বোলেছেন। কিন্তু আমাদের যারা গভর্ণমেণ্ট কর্ম্মচারী, অর্থাৎ সেই ৯৷৷৹ টাকা আয়ের জনসাধারণের দ্বারা সেবক,—সেই জনসাধারণের সেবা করার জন্য নাকি যারা আছেন তারা সেই অর্দ্ধ-নগ্ন অনশনক্লিষ্ট জনসাধারণকে শোষন কোরে বহু টাকা নিয়ে চর্ব্ব্য, চোষ্য, লেহ্য, পেয় উপভোগ না কোরলে তারা সেবা করতে পারেন না। সেই সেবা দ্বারা কখনো যে জনসাধারণের সঙ্গে এই শাসক-সম্প্রদায় বা তথাকথিত সেবক-সম্প্রদায়ের একটা যোগাযোগ থাকে না সে আমরা সর্ব্বদাই বেশ স্পষ্টরূপেই দেখতে পাই। শাসক-সম্প্রদায় বা তথাকথিত সেবক-সম্প্রদায়ের মনে এই রকম একটা উচ্চতার ভাব থাকে যে তাদের মনে স্বতঃই একটা ধারণা হয় যে তাহারা বুঝি জনসাধারণের প্রভু। জনসাধারণ তাহাদের প্রভু নয়। জনসাধারণকে অত্যাচার করবার জন্য, শাসন করবার জন্য, এবং তাদের ভয় দেখিয়ে আমাদের পদদলিত কোরে রাখবার জন্যই আমরা নিযুক্ত, এই ভাবটাই সব সময় দেখাতে তারা ইচ্ছা করেন এবং কার্য্যত দেখিয়ে থাকেন। এর ফলে আমাদের দেশে শাসন অত্যাচার হয়ে দাঁড়িয়েছে। এর একটা প্রতিকার হওয়া অত্যন্ত প্রয়োজন। এতদিন আমাদের

দেশে আমলাতন্ত্র ছিলো, দেশ শাসনের নীতিপদ্ধতিও চাবি-কাঠি পশ্চিম থেকে আমদানি হতো এবং তারাই শাসন-যন্ত্রকে চালিত কোরতো। কিন্তু এখন শাসনভার আমাদের দেশের লোকের হাতে এসেছে, জনসাধারণের প্রতিনিধিদের দ্বারা গভর্ণমেণ্ট পরিচালিত হচ্ছে, এখনো যদি সব সেই আগেকার মতনই চোলতে থাকে তাহলে আমাদের বুঝতে হবে যে আমরা অতিবড় অপদার্থ এবং জীবনে আমরা দেশ শাসনের পক্ষে যে কত অসমর্থ ও অক্ষম সেইটা বেশ উপলব্ধি হয়। আজ গভর্ণমেণ্ট [illegible] উচ্চ বেতনের জন্য জনসাধারণের মধ্যে দরিদ্রশ্রেণী এবং মধ্যবিত্ত ও উচ্চ শ্রেণী যেভাবে গড়ে উঠেছে এবং তদ্দ্বারা পরস্পরের মধ্যে যে তীব্র ব্যবধানের সৃষ্টি হয়েছে তার ফলে আমাদের দেশে বিপ্লব আসন্ন। দেশের মধ্যে যারা Communism আসার ভয়ে আতঙ্কিত আমি তাদের বোলছি যে গভর্ণমেণ্টের বর্ত্তমান policy সেই Communism সৃষ্টি কোরছে। কারণ এখন যেভাবে দরিদ্র জনসাধারণকে অত্যাচারিত ও প্রতারিত করা হচ্ছে তার ফল Communism ছাড়া আর কিছুই নয়। যেদিন দেশের জাগ্রত জনসাধারণ নিজের পায়ে দাঁড়িয়ে এই গভর্ণমেণ্টকে টুটি চেপে ধোরে দূরে ফেলে দিয়ে, নিজেদের বুদ্ধি বিবেচনা মতন, ও নিজেদের প্রয়োজন মতন গভর্ণমেণ্ট form কোরবে এদেশের সত্যিকারের শাসন সেই দিন প্রতিষ্ঠিত হবে। আজ এই গভর্ণমেণ্ট নিজের মৃত্যুপথে পরিচালিত হবার জন্য জনসাধারণকে যে নানাবিধ উৎপীড়ন কোরছে আমি এটা শুভ লক্ষণ মনে করি। কারণ তারা যদি জনসাধারণকে সুশাসনদ্বারা শান্ত রাখতো দেশের দরিদ্র জনসাধারণ নিজেদের বর্ত্তমান অবস্থায় সন্তুষ্ট থেকে ভাল হবার জন্য প্রাণপণ চেষ্টা করতে উদ্বুদ্ধ হতো না এবং তাহাদের মনে এই দারুণ অসন্তোষের সৃষ্টি হতো না। সেজন্য আমি গভর্ণমেণ্টকে ভালো বলি এবং তাঁদের ধন্যবাদ দি। তাঁরা দেশের লোকের উপর আরো অত্যাচার করুন,—দেশে বিপ্লববহ্নি জ্বলে উঠুক, দেশের স্বাধীনতার পথ—দরিদ্রের মুক্তির পথ উন্মুক্ত হোক। গভর্ণমেণ্টের কার্য্যাবলী আজ সেই পথ পরিষ্কার কোরে দিচ্ছেন বোলে জনসাধারণের পক্ষ থেকে আমি আবার তাদের ধন্যবাদ দিচ্ছি।

আমি এখন তাঁদের দু একটা department এর বিষয় বোলবো। প্রথমে রাজস্বসচিব মহাশয়ের department ই ধরা যাক। জনসাধারণের উপর খাজনার চাপ যেরূপে বেড়ে চোলে আসছিল সেই খাজনা বৃদ্ধি সম্বন্ধে বহু আলোচনা করা সত্ত্বেও দেখছি খাজনা ক্রমশঃ বেড়েই চোলেছে। অনেক আন্দোলনের পর গভর্ণমেণ্ট দয়ালু হোয়ে,—না বাধ্য হোয়ে, একটা Revenue Enquiry Committee বসিয়েছেন এবং সে কমিটির কার্য্যাবলি এখনো চোলছে। আমাকেও তার একজন member নিযুক্ত করা হোয়েছে; কিন্তু সে কমিটির কাজ যে ভাবে চোলেছে তাতে খাজনা কমার সম্ভাবনা অত্যন্ত কম। তার আশায় বোসে থাকলে আর চোলবে না। আপনারা জানেন যে খাজনা বেড়েই চোলেছে এবং গণআন্দোলন ছাড়া আর অন্য উপায় নাই ইহা কমাবার, এখনে সেই উপায় অবলম্বন করুন। (From coalition side: সে movement এর আপনিই লিডারি করুন না?) আমি প্রস্তুত আছি।

তার পর একটা ভূমি রাজস্ব কমিশন বোসেছে। তাদের কার্য্যকলাপ থেকে যতটা বুঝতে পারছি—তাতে আমার বিশ্বাস হচ্ছে যে চিরস্থায়ী বন্দোবস্তের কিছু নড়চড়ই হবে না। সেই কমিশনের সুপারিশের উপর যদি নির্ভর কোরে থাকতে হয় তাহলে এই ভাবেই আমাদের দিন চোলবে। তার পরে আর একটা ব্যাপার সম্বন্ধে বোলছি। সে হচ্ছে আমাদের দেশের দুর্ভিক্ষ। দুর্ভিক্ষ—অজন্মাবন এবং অন্যান্য কারণে আমাদের দেশে হচ্ছে। দুর্ভিক্ষের জন্য গভর্ণমেণ্ট কিঞ্চিৎ টাকা ব্যবস্থা কোরেছিলেন কিন্তু এখনো দেশে দুর্ভিক্ষ আছে পূর্ণমাত্রায় অথচ গভর্ণমেণ্ট সাহায্যের টাকা বন্ধ কোরেছেন। দুর্ভিক্ষ দেশে থাকবে তত দিন—যত দিন গভর্ণমেণ্ট দুর্ভিক্ষ বিতাড়নের জন্য একটা কিছু স্থায়ী পরিকল্পনা অনুসারে কার্য্য না করবেন। দুর্ভিক্ষের দরুণ সেখানকার লোকের অভাব এত বেশী যে সেটা যারা এখানে উজ্জ্বল চেহারা নিয়ে বোসে আছেন তারা উহা ধারণাই কোরতে পারবেন না। আমরা এখানে যারা আছি অরা প্রায় সকলেই নাদুস নুদুস চেহারার লোক, কিন্তু গ্রামের লোকের

ক্ষেত্রারা যে কঙ্কালসার সে বিষয়ে আমরা সকলে কি চিন্তা করি? যদি চিন্তাই করতাম তাহলে গভর্ণমেন্টকে আমরা দুর্ভিক্ষের উপযুক্ত সহায়তার জন্য চাপ দিতাম। যাদের টাকা নিয়ে আমরা আজ সুন্দররূপে আছি তারা সেখানে অনাহারে, অর্দ্ধাহারে মরে যাচ্ছে, কত লোক জ্বরার তাড়নায় আত্মহত্যা কোরছে, মরে যাচ্ছে—এবং গভর্ণমেন্ট কর্ম্মচারীরা মিথ্যা কোরে অন্য ভাবে রিপোর্ট দিয়ে আপনাদের mislead কোরছে। আমি গভর্ণমেন্টকে এদিকে দৃষ্টি দিতে বোলছি। হোতে পারে তাঁরা machine, হতে পারে তাঁরা যন্ত্রস্বরূপ হওয়ার দরুণ দয়া ধর্ম্ম ভুলে গেছেন, কিন্তু তাঁরা মানুষ ছিলেন, মানুষ হিসাবে একটু চিন্তা তাদের কোরতে বোলছি—যাতে আমাদের যারা প্রকৃত প্রভু তাদের বাঁচিয়ে ব্যবস্থা করা যায়——

(Here the member having reached the time-limit resumed his seat.)

Maulvi RAHIBUDDIN TARFDAR: সভাপতি মহাশয়, বাজেট নিয়ে অনেক আলোচনা হোয়ে গেছে অনেকে এসম্বন্ধে অনেক সমালোচনা কোরেছেন। বাজেট বোলতে গেলে বছরের কতটাকা আয় আর কত টাকা ব্যয় হবে শুধু তাই নয়। গভর্ণমেন্টের এই আয়-ব্যয়ের অঙ্কের মধ্যে দেখলেই গভর্ণমেন্টের চেহারা ও ছবি ধরা পড়ে। যদি স্বাভাবিক নিয়মে বাজেটের আয়ের ব্যবস্থা হোয়ে থাকে তাহলে বুঝতে হবে যে গভর্ণমেন্ট প্রশংসার যোগ্য, আর যদি অস্বাভাবিক নিয়মে আয়ের ব্যবস্থা করা হোয়ে থাকে তাহলে বুঝতে হবে যে গভর্ণমেন্ট খারাপ ব্যয় সম্বন্ধেও ঠিক তাই, যদি উপযুক্ত পাত্র এবং স্থান প্রভৃতি বিবেচনা কোরে ব্যয়ের বরাদ্দ করা হোয়ে থাকে তাহলে বুঝতে হবে যে গভর্ণমেন্ট নিশ্চয়ই পাকা, আর যদি তার ব্যতিক্রম ঘটে তাহলে সে গভর্ণমেন্টকে নিন্দা করা ছাড়া আর কোন গত্যন্তর থাকে না। এবারের বাজেট আমি যখনই দেখেছি, তখনই আমার মনে ধারণা হোয়েছে যে এ গভর্ণমেন্টের মনোভাবের কোন পরিবর্ত্তন হয় নাই। গভর্ণমেন্ট এখন দেশের প্রতি দরদ দেখাচ্ছেন এসব কথা একরকম ভুয়ো বোল্লেই চলে। কারণ বাংলার যেটা মজ্জাগত অভাব, প্রাথমিক শিক্ষা, সে শিক্ষার জন্য বর্ত্তমান বাজেটে বিশেষ কিছু ধরা হয় নাই। অথচ আমাদের Chief Minister হচ্ছেন Education Minister আমাদের এই গভর্ণমেন্টের গোড়ায় আমাদের একটা ভরসা হয়েছিল যে এতদিন যাই ঘটে থাকুক, এখন হতে দিন দিন আমাদের দেশের অবস্থা ভালো হবে। আমাদের দেশের ছেলেরা লেখা-পড়া শিখবে, এবং দেশের চেহারা বোদলে যাবে। কিন্তু বহু যুগ ধরে' প্রাইমারী শিক্ষা নিয়ে টালবাহাল করা হচ্ছে, দেশের লোককে নানা রকমে ভুলিয়ে ভালিয়ে যে তিমিরে সেই তিমিরেই রাখা হচ্ছে ইহা কোন রকমেই ভাল লক্ষণ বলা চলে না। আমার বন্ধু ইদ্রিস আহম্মদ সাহেব অবশ্য Finance Minister কে অনেক মন্দ কথা বোলেছেন। আমি বোলবো যে, Finance Minister এর কোন দোষ নাই। দোষ হচ্ছে কাঠামের, যে কাঠামে তিনি বোসেছেন, সেই কাঠাম পরিবর্ত্তন না করা পর্য্যন্ত যিনি তাতে বোসেছেন, তাকে কোন দোষ দেওয়া চলে না। বরং তিনি যে তাঁর জ্ঞান গরীমা দ্বারা ভাঙ্গা নায়ে সমুদ্র পার করার তিনি এ বাজেট, যেভাবে চেষ্টা কোরেছেন তাতে বাংলার প্রত্যেক লোকেই স্বীকার কোরবে যে তাঁর বাহাদুরি যথেষ্ট আছে। বাজেটের source of income এর সন্ধান নিলে দেখা যাবে, জমিদারেরা মাত্র সাড়ে তিন কোটি দিচ্ছেন, আর বক্রী সাড়ে এগাড় কোটি জোর জুলুমে দেশের পরিবদের নিকট হইতে আদায় করার ব্যবস্থা বাজেটে আছে। বাংলার মাটী হইতে যত টাকা উৎপন্ন হয় তাহা প্রায় সম্পূর্ণই কয়েকজন জমিদারের পকেটে যায়, অবশেষে গভর্ণমেন্ট পরিবদের নিকট টাকা আদায় করিয়া বাজেটের সমতা রক্ষা করেন এটা কি Finance Minister এর দোষ? যতদিন পর্য্যন্ত চিরস্থায়ী বন্দোবস্তকে সমূলে বিনষ্ট না করা যায় ততদিন আমাদের Minister Hon'ble Mr. Sarker কেন তাঁর চেয়ে অসীম ক্ষমতা নিয়েও যদি কেউ এসে এই আসনে বসেন, তিনিও কিছু কোরতে পারবেন না। বাংলাদেশের সমস্ত প্রজাবর্গ যে দিন তাদের সত্যিকার প্রতিনিধি এখানে পাঠাতে পারবেন এবং তাঁরাই Minister choice কোরতে পারবেন সেই দিন যদি চিরস্থায়ী বন্দোবস্তের জগদ্দল পাথর বাংলার বুক থেকে অপসারিত হয়, তার আগে নয়। দুঃখের বিষয় সে লক্ষণ তো বড় একটা দেখা যাইতেছে না। এই যে Floud

Commission বোসেছে এটা কি বিলাত থেকে দিয়েছে না কংগ্রেস থেকে দিয়েছে? এটা গঠন কোরেছে আমাদেরই Cabinet থেকে এবং আমাদেরই Coalition দলের সাহায্যে কিন্তু দুঃখের বিষয় আজ পর্য্যন্ত একটী মেম্বর ছাড়া বড় জোর দুজন, বাংলার প্রজাগণের ভাগ্য নিয়ন্ত্রণ করার জন্য Commission appoint করা হয়েছে দুই জনও বলি না মাত্র দেড় জনও বলিতে পারি। এই হলো অবস্থা, অন্ততঃ পক্ষে ৬ জনও যদি প্রজাদের মধ্যে থেকে নেওয়া হতো তাহলে কিছু লাভ হতো। আমার মনে হয় গভর্ণমেণ্ট থেকে যত কথাই বলুক না কেন আমি এই Floud Commission সম্বন্ধে ভবিষ্যৎ বানী করিতে পারি (House হইতে "বলুন!! বলুন!!")

Floud Commission সম্বন্ধে আমি আজ ভবিষ্যৎ বাণী কোরে বোলছি যে এটা আর কিছুই নয় কেবল একটা বহ্বারম্ভে লঘু ক্রিয়া। তারপর প্রজাদিগকে শিশুদের মত ভুলিয়ে রাখার ফন্দি মাত্র। অযথা Finance Minister কে attack করিয়া লাভ নাই, তাঁকে মন্দ না বলিয়া জমিদারদের চিরস্থায়ী বন্দোবস্ত ধ্বংস করার চেষ্টা করা উচিত। জমিদাররা মাত্র ৩॥৹ কোটি টাকা দেবে আর আদায় কোরে নেবে সাড়ে সতেরো কোটি টাকা। আবার বাজেটের ঘাটতি, টাকার অভাব, বলিয়া চিৎকার করিব ইহা কখনই শোভনীয় নহে। সময় অল্প বেশী আর কিছু বোলতে চাই না সভাপতি মহাশয় বোলতেও দিবেন না, আর একটী কথা বলিয়াই শেষ করিব। যে জমিদারদিগকে রক্ষা করার জন্য এত চেষ্টা চলিতেছে তাঁহাদের ব্যবহারের কথা বলিলে আপনারা অবাক্ হবেন আইনে বাজে কর ও অত্যাচার তুলিয়া দেওয়া স্বত্বেও এখন পর্য্যন্ত বগুড়া জেলায় জমিদারদের অত্যাচার কমে নাই। আমি জানি বগুড়া জেলার কোন জমিদার কাছারিতে খাজনা দিতে একজন বৃদ্ধ প্রজাকে খাজনার জন্য তাকে সুপারি গাছে তুলিয়া আবার নামাইয়া ভয় দেখাইয়াছে। এই সব জমিদারেরা যে নীতি অবলম্বন করিয়া আছে আমরা তাহা সমর্থন করিতে পারি না।

(Here the member having reached the time-limit resumed his seat)

Mr. ASIMUDDIN AHMED : মাননীয় সভাপতি সাহেব, এপর্য্যন্ত অনেক বক্তৃতা হয়ে গেছে। ১৯২৪ সাল থেকে এই সব বাজেট এবং তার সমালোচনা আমি দেখে আস্‌ছি, কিন্তু reform introduce হওয়ার সঙ্গে সঙ্গে আমরা আশা কোরেছিলাম যে নূতন গভর্ণমেণ্টের আমলে শাসন-তন্ত্রের আমূল পরিবর্ত্তন অবশ্যই আমরা দেখতে পাব। কিন্তু ১৯২৪ সনে, ১৯২৮ সনে ও ১৯৩০ সনে যে রকম বাজেট হয়েছিল এখনো ঠিক তেম্নি ভাবেই চোলেছে। বিশেষ কোরে আমাদের মাননীয় অর্থ-সচিব শ্রীযুত নলিনীরঞ্জন সরকার মহোদয় যখন বর্ত্তমানে সেই Finance এর গোড়ায় রয়েছেন তখন দেশবাসী মনে করতেন কিছু পরিবর্ত্তন হবেই হবে। তিনি যখন এই পদ গ্রহণ করেন তখন আমরা মনে কোরেছিলাম যে তিনি যখন একজন nationalist নেতা এবং Progressive দলের একজন বিশিষ্ট লোক ছিলেন এবং দেশের ভালো মন্দর সঙ্গে জড়িত ছিলেন,—অর্থ-সচিব হোয়ে তিনি নিশ্চয়ই দেশের কতকটা দরদ বুঝবেন, এবং তাঁর দ্বারা গরীবের নিশ্চয়ই অনেক উপকার হবে। কিন্তু আমরা তার বিপরীতটাই দেখ্‌ছি। প্রথম বৎসর আমরা মনে করেছিলাম যে তিনি সময় পান নাই, দ্বিতীয় বৎসর মনে কোরেছিলাম, এবারে যদিও বিশেষ কিছু কোরতে পারেন নাই নিশ্চয়ই আগামী বারে কোরবেন। কিন্তু এই তৃতীয় সনে কি মনে কোরবো— তাঁর কিছু কোরবার ইচ্ছাই নাই, না, কোরবার মতন শক্তি নাই। এখন আমরা বেশ বুঝতে পারছি যে তিনি ইচ্ছা কোরেই কিছু করেন না। যদি ইচ্ছা থাক্‌তো করবার, তাহলে তিনি বাস্তবিক এর চেয়ে অনেক বেশী কোরতে পারতেন। তিনি এই পদ গ্রহণ করায় লাভবান কিছু তো হন নাই বরং ক্ষতিগ্রস্ত হয়েছেন। যদি কোন কাজই তিনি কোরতে পারবেন না তবে কি স্বার্থে নিজেকে কলঙ্কিত কোরে ওখানে রয়েছেন বোঝা যায় না (From Congress side "সে বড় গুহ্য কথা।") বাংলার রাজনীতির সঙ্গে Finance Minister এর যথেষ্ট সম্পর্ক ছিলো, মিনিষ্ট্রি লাভের পূর্ব্বের নীতি ও পন্থা আজ কি কোরে তিনি ভুলে গেলেন? তারপর আমাদের প্রধান মন্ত্রী সাহেব তিনি ছিলেন প্রজা বন্ধু। প্রজার দরদে সারা বাংলাদেশকে কোলে নিয়েছিলেন। প্রজাদিগকে উদ্ধার কোরে দেবেন, কৃষকের উন্নতি কোরে তাহাদিগকে

উপর নিয়ে দেবেন, তাঁদের ডাল-ভাতের সুব্যবস্থা কোরবেন, সব কিছু কোরবেন। কিন্তু দুই বৎসর গত তিন বৎসর সমাগত, পাঁচ বৎসর এই ভাবেই কেটে যাবে দেশ যে তিমিরে সেই তিমিরে। তিনি একটা কথা বোলেছেন যে আমরা তো যথেষ্ট কোরেছি landlord's fee উঠিয়ে দিয়েছি। কিন্তু ১৯২৮ সালের আগে তো landlord's fee ছিলো না মাঝখানে কয়েক বছরের জন্য হয়েছিলো, এখন সেটা উঠিয়ে দেওয়া হয়েছে, কৃষকের নূতন কি কোরে দেওয়া হয়েছে বুঝি না। আমরা বোলছি primary education টা কার্য্যকরী করবার জন্য আর একদিনও দেরি করা উচিত নয়। এবং শুধু সেই ফ্রি primary education ই নয় free compulsory primary education কোরে দাও প্রত্যেক জেলায় তাছাড়া কৃষি-ঋণের কোন সুব্যবস্থা নাই। কৃষকদের ঋণ পরিশোধের কোন নূতন ব্যবস্থা করা হয় নাই। কৃষকদের খাজনা যে বৃদ্ধি হয়েছে তা কমাবার কোন ব্যবস্থা নাই। কে শুনেছে যে একটা কমিটি কোরেছেন, তাদ্বারা যে দেশের কোন কার্য্য হবে দেশবাসী তা বিশ্বাস করে না। কারণ কমিটির যে সব মেম্বার নিযুক্ত হয়েছেন তাঁদের উপর দেশের লোকের আদৌ আস্থা নাই। সুতরাং এসব কমিটি কোরে কেন যে গভর্ণমেন্ট কতকগুলি অর্থের অপব্যয় কোরেছেন তার অর্থ আমরা কিছুই বুঝি না। হাতের কঙ্কন আয়না দিয়ে দেখার কোন দরকার হয় না। এই গভর্ণমেন্টে যাঁরা আছেন তাঁরা বাংলার কৃষকদের প্রাণের কথা, মনের অবস্থা জানেন তবু মিথ্যা ব্যবহারে তাদিগকে ঠকাচ্ছেন কেন? বাস্তবিক যদি গভর্ণমেন্টের কোন সদিচ্ছা না থাকে যদি তাঁদের দ্বারা দেশবাসীর কোন উপকারের সম্ভাবনা না থাকে তাহলে মিথ্যা আশা দিয়ে এতদিন তাদের ঠকিয়ে কি লাভ হলো ? আমরা আশা কোরেছিলাম নূতন constitution এর সঙ্গে সঙ্গে department গুলির সম্পূর্ণ বদল হবে। আমরা মনে কোরেছিলাম যে গভর্ণমেন্ট থাকবে দেশের লোকের সেবা করবার জন্য। মানুষকে শাসন করবার বা দমন করবার জন্যই যদি কামনা হয়ে থাকে মন্ত্রীমহোদয়দের, তাহলে এ অতি নিন্দনীয় সংকল্প। এই রকম সংকল্প নিয়ে Office গ্রহণ করা কোন লোকের পক্ষেই উচিত নয়। বাস্তবিক এখন এই গভর্ণমেন্টদ্বারা লোকের উপকার হবে কি না হবে সেটা একটা চিন্তার বিষয়। আমরা তো কোন উপকারের সম্ভাবনা দেখছি না। Debt Settlement Board এর দ্বারা কি উপকার হোয়েছে? এ দেশের Conference ও সভাসমিতি হতে বার বার বলা হয়েছে নিলামী সম্পত্তি ফেরৎ দিবার একটা ব্যবস্থা করা হোক, কিন্তু তার কোন ব্যবস্থাই করা হচ্ছে না। গভর্ণমেন্ট দেশের মানুষকে দরিদ্র কোরে বিপ্লবের দিকে অগ্রসর করাচ্ছেন। গভর্ণমেন্ট আমাদের বলেন যে আমরাই বিপ্লব সৃষ্টি কোরছি। কিন্তু আমরা গভর্ণমেন্টকেই এজন্য বেশী দায়ী কোরছি। কারণ গভর্ণমেন্টই আমাদের Landless কোরে Industry র কোন উন্নতি না কোরে, বেকার সমস্যার সমাধান না কোরে বিপ্লবের পথে দেশের লোককে বেশী কোরে অগ্রসর করিয়া দিচ্ছেন। কেবল মিঃ জিন্না জিন্দাবাদ অথবা গান্ধি জিন্দাবাদ কোরে দেশ রক্ষা হবে না। মানুষ যে বিদ্রোহী হয় তার জন্য বাস্তবিক গভর্ণমেন্টই দায়ী। গভর্ণমেন্টের যে Co-operative Department আছে তাদ্বারা কতকগুলি আশ্রিত কর্ম্মচারী ভরণ-পোষণ ছাড়া কৃষকদের কোন উপকারই হচ্ছে না। Agriculture Department দ্বারাও কৃষকদের কোন লাভ এপর্য্যন্ত হয় নাই। ঠেকা সময় কোন loan পাওয়া যায় না, জায়গায় জায়গায় ধার দেওয়া হয় demonstration দেওয়া হয়। এছাড়া আর কোন কাজই হয় না। একমাত্র demonstration ছাড়া এসব দিয়ে আর কিছুই হয় না। আরো অনেক Department আছে সেগুলি দ্বারা উপকারের চেয়ে অপকারই হচ্ছে।' Finance Minister এর দ্বারা সে সব Department সম্বন্ধে এবারও যখন কোন প্রতিকার হলো না ভবিষ্যতে যে হবে—সে সুদূরপরাহত। তিনি দেখছি পুলিশের অনেক সুবিধা কোরেছেন।' তিনি জেলের জন্যও নাকি স্থায়ী সুপারিনটেন্ডেন্টের ব্যবস্থা কোরেছেন। আমরা তো জেলে অনেকবার রয়েছি।

(As the member was still going on with his speech after his time-limit was over Mr. Speaker remarked as follows.)

Mr. SPEAKER: I hope you will continue your speech in your dream.

Mr. AHMED HOSAIN: Mr. Speaker, Sir, the first thing that strikes me in the budget is its urban character. Vast sums have been provided to educational and other institutions, but most of these institutions are situated in towns and are unlikely to serve the rural people directly and in a manner which is required. It seems on the whole that the present Government machinery has become so rusted and clogged that it has become impossible for any benefits under it to permeate to the lowest strata of the society, i.e., the people in far off rural areas. Lakhs of rupees have been provided for the so-called nation-building activities. But in what way? The Government have relieved themselves by scattering sums among those only who are strong and boisterous enough—to elbow their way to it and to mob it. Sir, the result to my mind has been that those who are mute and weak and most in need, who are hungry, nude and bereft of all amenities of life have been kept out of the reach of the arms of Government. The one measure which could give benefit to the rural people universally, i.e., free primary education has been given a decent burial beneath the prevarication of the Ministry and mischievous propaganda of some so-called Krishak Proja people. Sir, so far as I know, no Krishak given fully to understand the implications of the working of the Free Primary Education Act is unamenable to pay his education cess. Indeed we cannot hope to gain such an advantage without a supreme sacrifice from the side of the whole nation. In my own district the working of the Act has been stopped on the plea of flood. But as we know, flood or no flood, people want primary education even by paying education cess. They did not even move the Government to stop the working of the Act. The Government have made a lean provision of Rs. 5 lakhs for this all-important subject of free primary education for the whole of Bengal. The hesitation of the Ministry is quite unintelligible in this matter unless they have something ready up their sleeves by which they can provide free primary education without touching the pockets of the agriculturists. So far they have given no indication of possessing any such Aladdin's lamp. Agriculture, industry, water-supply and public health—matters which concern the rural people vitally—have been in my estimation most shabbily treated.

One thing in the budget which has struck me most and shocked my moral sense is that the Government are going to perpetuate the dog racing at Behala. We have from the side of our party urged often to do away with this immoral practice of dog racing and so far as I remember, Government promised us that they would abolish the thing as soon as the period of the contract with the company was over, but to our utter astonishment we now find that the Government are going to perpetuate the thing and encourage many more such things by legislation.

Sir, as it is heinous for an individual to earn money by such questionable means, so it is also for the Government. I remember, the Hon'ble the Home Minister said at the time of the Sweepstake Bill of a non-official member that in England and Ireland most of the people who earn large sums of money by recourse to those lotteries and sweepstakes have had to end their lives in misery. I think the very same thing is bound to happen to this Government also unless they mend their ways. This Government will have to end their days in misery if they stick to these immoral practices. I hope Government will yet desist from this act. The other day I learnt with astonishment from the Hon'ble the Home Minister in an answer to a question of mine that Government are not going to stop the spread of cinema shows, even in distant and far off villages. This attitude of Government are to be lamented by all and especially by this party which is preponderatingly Muslim.

Another thing which strikes me is the building project; large sums of money are going to be invested on these building projects. I remember an act of my Prophet that he refused to shake hands with one of his followers who built a stately building, because the Prophet's idea was that that man, to the exclusion of all others, enjoyed money most selfishly. From that point of view we discourage these building projects. We are sorry to find that some members, though not all, of our Ministry have stately buildings and they are going to resort to the same practice of having vast and stately buildings for their officers in mufassil. If smaller sums are spent on these projects and something saved, that can easily be employed for the benefit of the poor.

Yet another thing, Sir, which strikes me is the grant to a daily paper, viz., the *Azad*. Some of my friends yesterday discussed this thing from one angle of vision, and I am going to discuss it from another. By this grant of Rs. 30,000 Government are going to do a great harm to the Muslim community of Bengal. The paper *Azad* has served the Muslims very usefully. We knew the paper to be a nationalist one and hoped to see it continue in the same line. But by giving subsidy to that paper Government are going to stop it from making legitimate criticisms of Government. So I oppose this measure. Government should not pay subsidy to any paper, particularly to this only paper of the Muslim community.

(At this stage the member having reached his time-limit, resumed his seat.)

Mr. DHIRENDRA NATH DATTA: Mr. Speaker, Sir, the first thing that strikes me most in the budget is that this Government has committed itself to the spread of communalism. *Azad* which has acquired a notoriety for spreading communalism in the province and for carrying on false propaganda in favour of the Muslim League, has been

granted a subsidy of Rs. 30,000 as a reward therefor. I do not know whether Government are fully aware of what has been happening in Eastern Bengal districts, especially in the districts of Noakhali and Tippera, on account of the spread of communalism and false propaganda carried on by *Azad*, days in and days out. But Government are certainly aware of the fact that as a result of this false propaganda, disturbances have been created, Hindu houses have been looted and temples have been desecrated by Muslim hooligans on the Bakr-Id day, and sometime thereafter on the 8th February there was incendiarism in Lengua Bazar in Noakhali, because of the false rumour that on the Bakr-Id day Hindus would prevent the slaughter of cows by importing Hindu goondas from outside Bengal. This is the result of spreading communalism and carrying on false propaganda every day, and a Government which are responsible for it forfeit their right to be called a civilised Government. You probably do not know, Sir, but Government are certainly aware that in the district of Tippera, Krishak and Congress meetings cannot be held on account of false propaganda and spread of communalism.

Muhammadan police and Circle Officers think that they are servants of the Muslim League and not of Government. You will be astonished to hear that at a meeting in village Bangora, in Moradnagar thana, a sub-inspector of police was heard to say publicly that he was not only a servant of the Government but of the Muslim League too. A Muhammadan Circle Officer, his name I need not mention here, was present when a meeting of the Krishak Party was announced by beat of drums and leaflets distributed. That was some time in December 1938. And what did this Circle Officer do? He snatched away the leaflets from the hands of volunteers of the Krishak Party. As soon as this fact was reported to a member of this House, he sent a wire to the District Magistrate who, however, did not take any action in the matter. The whole service appears to have been demoralised (Cries of "Shame, shame" from the Opposition Benches).

Then, Sir, I want to say something about Public Health. We are all aware that as a matter of fact there is only one tuberculosis sanatorium at Jadavpur. But this time the Finance Minister has refused the financial help asked for by the Jadavpur Hospital authorities for reasons best known to Government.

Now, Sir, I come to Irrigation. There is absolutely no comprehensive scheme for resuscitating the dead and dying rivers of Bengal. There is no scheme for preventing breaches in embankments. In the district of Tippera there have been annual breaches in the embankment of river Gumti, causing destruction of crops over large tracts of land. Last year when this question was discussed, the Hon'ble Minister in charge was pleased to say that there would be a provision for opening an escape in Gumti river, in order to prevent breaches in its embankments, but no provision has been made.

When we come to Agriculture, which Government call the most important department, we find that no provision has been made for the improvement of agriculture. We expected that provision would be made for opening agricultural farms in every union. But no attempt seems to have been made in that direction.

Then I want to say something about the debt conciliation boards. Questions were put regarding the debt conciliation boards, and there is a widespread complaint that these boards are incompetent and most of them, I must say, are corrupt. I make this statement knowing fully the implications of it, and I wish that Government should make an enquiry into the matter as regards the incompetence and corruption of the debt conciliation boards. As I have said, there was a widespread complaint about these boards, and there was a general demand that the functions of these boards should be transferred to the judiciary constituted for the purpose. Nobody denies, nobody questions, that there is necessity for giving relief to the agriculturists just as there is a necessity of giving relief to all classes of debtors, but, as a matter of fact, by the establishment of the debt conciliation boards no relief has actually been given to the agriculturist debtors. There are a large number of cases still pending before these boards, and the boards cannot decide because they are not vested with power under section 7 of the Act. From the past history of this Government it seems that the Money-lenders Bill is going to be shelved. The Money-lenders Bill was first of all introduced by a private member of this House and, as a matter of fact, Government came forward with a proposal that they would bring forward a comprehensive Bill with the object of giving relief to all classes of debtors. This Bill was introduced in the last session of the Assembly, and it was referred to a Select Committee which could not conclude its sittings in time. This year also. I am afraid an attempt is being made to shelve the Money-lenders Bill. I want to impress upon the Government the necessity of giving relief to all classes of debtors, including debtors belonging to classes other than agriculturists.

Then, Sir, Government are fully aware—in fact I brought it to the notice of the Government—that there is corruption in all departments. Government is fully aware of this corruption and is still not taking any steps to remove corruption. We have got a good many committees appointed by Government. For example, we have got the Paddy and Rice Enquiry Committees. What it is, I don't know. We have got all sorts of committees, but there is no anti-corruption committee. The Government do not seek to remove corruption from all departments because, as my friend says, it is full of corruption. In the provinces of Bihar and the United Provinces, there were anti-corruption committees and they have submitted recommendations, and the Governments there are acting on those recommendations, so that corruption

might be removed from all departments of those Governments. It is absolutely necessary, Sir, that Government should understand that unless corruption is stamped out, no scheme for the welfare of the people can be successful.

(At this stage the member having reached his time-limit resumed his seat.)

Mr. MAQBUL HOSSAIN: মাননীয় সভাপতিসাহেব, অর্থসচিব মহাশয় আজাদের স্বত্বাধিকারী মৌলানা আক্রাম খাঁর জন্য যে ত্রিশ হাজার টাকার বরাদ্দ কোরেছেন তা দেখে আমি অত্যন্ত আশ্চর্য্যান্বিত হয়েছি। বন্যা পীড়িত অঞ্চলে টাকার অভাবে সাহায্য দেওয়া যাইতেছে না, বাধ্যতামূলক অবৈতনিক প্রাথমিক শিক্ষার ব্যবস্থা করা হচ্ছে না।এবং আগামী বর্ষাকালীন অধিবেশনে নূতন ট্যাক্স ধরবার বন্দোবস্ত করা হবে বোলে অর্থসচিব মহাশয় তাঁহা বক্তৃতায় আভাস দিয়াছেন; এরকম অবস্থায় আজাদের জন্য কেন যে ত্রিশ হাজার টাকার ব্যবস্থা করা হয়েছে আমরা তা বুঝতে পারছি নে। আমরা জানি আজাদের স্বত্বাধিকারী আক্রাম খাঁ সুবিধাবাদী লোক। কিছুদিন পূর্বে এবং দেশবন্ধু দাসের জীবদ্দশায় তিনি কংগ্রেসের ঢক্কা বাজিয়ে বিভিন্ন প্রতিষ্টানের নামে টাকা অর্জ্জন কোরতেন। এখন আবার বাংলার মন্ত্রীমণ্ডলীর ঢক্কা বাজিয়ে টাকা উপার্জ্জন কোরছেন। (From Congress side "চালাক লোক,") আজাদের সত্বাধিকারীকে সরকারী তহবিল হোতে যখন সাহায্য দেবার ব্যবস্থা করা হোয়েছে তখন আমি এই House এর নিকট নিবেদন কোরবো—যে আজাদ পত্রিকা যেন প্রত্যেক লোকের নিকট বিনা পয়সায় বিতরিত হয়।

Mr. AHMED HOSAIN: On a point of order, Sir. The honourable member opposite has indulged in a personal attack on the editor of the *Azad* by calling him a *subidhabadi*, which means an opportunist. Is he entitled to do so?

Mr. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Mr. Hossain, you will please refrain from making personal attacks on any member of the Legislature.

Mr. MAQBUL HOSSAIN: বাংলার বর্ত্তমান মন্ত্রীমণ্ডলীদ্বারা দেশের যে কোন উপকার হবে আমরা সে ভরসা পাচ্ছি না। কারণ আমরা যদি বর্ত্তমানে বাজেটের আলোচনা করি তাহা হইলে দেখতে পাই যে বর্ত্তমান বৎসরের বাজেটে নূতন নূতন পদের সৃষ্টি করে সরকারী কর্ম্মচারী বৃদ্ধির ব্যবস্থা করা হয়েছে। Debt Settlement Board এর জন্য ৪র্থ ডেপুটী ডিরেক্টার পদের সৃষ্টি করা হয়েছে এবং তার আফিস খরচের জন্য বার্ষিক ৯ লক্ষ টাকা ব্যয়-বরাদ্দ করা হোয়েছে। এই ভাবে আরো কত অসংখ্য টাকা অন্যান্য বাহুল্যকল্পে ও অন্যান্য কর্ম্মচারী নিয়োগের ব্যাপারে বরাদ্দ করা হয়েছে। এ সমস্তের যে কি দরকার আছে আমরা তা বুঝতে পারি না। অর্থসচিব মহাশয় গরীব কৃষক প্রজার ভালভাতের জন্য কিছুই করেন নাই। (From Congress side "তিনি তো বাবুর্চি নন,") গরীব কৃষকের আয় যাতে বৃদ্ধি হয় তার জন্য কোন ব্যবস্থাই এই বাজেটে নাই। এই মন্ত্রীমণ্ডল সম্বন্ধে যখনই কোন কথা উঠে তখনই প্রধান মন্ত্রীসাহেব দাবী করেন যে "তাঁহারা জনসাধারণের মন্ত্রী"; এবং গরীবদের উপকার করার বড়াই তিনি সর্ব্বদাই কোরে থাকেন। কিন্তু এই বাজেটে তো তার কোন চিহ্নই দেখা যাচ্ছে না। মন্ত্রীমণ্ডল গরীবের লক্ষ লক্ষ টাকা ব্যয় কোরে Revenue Enquiry Commission বসিয়েছেন, আমরা এই Commission এর প্রতিবাদ এই House এ কোরেছি। Commission এর উপর আমাদের কোন আস্থা নাই। কারণ যে সমস্ত লোকদ্বারা Commission গঠিত হোয়েছে, তারা বাংলার কৃষক প্রজার কোন সংবাদ রাখেন না, বরং তারা কৃষক প্রজার উন্নতির বিরোধী। অতএব এই Commission বসিয়ে কেবল বাংলার গরীব কৃষক প্রজাদের অর্থ অনর্থকে নষ্ট করা ছাড়া আর কোন লাভ দেখি না।

Mr. MIRZA ABDUL HAFIZ: Mr. Speaker, Sir, we have been presented by the Hon'ble the Finance Minister with a deficit budget, deficit by 87 lakhs of rupees and the Hon'ble Minister has proposed for taxing betting on dog-racing which should be abolished altogether and for an ungraduated tax of Rs. 30 per annum on professions, trades, employments and callings exempting those who do not pay income-tax though pitiful is the condition of the honourable professions. Further, he has proposed to raise one crore as a long-term loan.

Sir, I have gone through the budget carefully and have been disappointed to a great extent. Of course there are provisions satisfactory to some extent with regard to the departments of Education, Medical and Public Health, but it strikes any inquisitive eye that the man behind the plough has been very little benefited therefrom. There are some grants which appear to be so exorbitant or superfluous that any loan or taxation seems unjustifiable. The same view occurs in mind when we find that in spite of the reduced expenses owing to the release of detenus by some lakhs of rupees, for the year 1939-40, Rs. 5,87,000 has been budgeted more than the revised estimate of the current year in the Police Department, 11 lakhs more in the General Administration and Rs. 23,66,000 more in the Civil Works Departments.

Some people say that it is a communal budget as much favour has been shown to the Muslims while others hold quite the contrary view. Neither do I subscribe nor do I give importance to any of those views. I do not share the view that because Purdah College has been given Rs. 2 lakhs so Eden Girls' High School of Dacca must be given Rs. 2 lakhs; because grant has been made for the additional Muslim Hall to the extent of Rs. 1,00,000 so the Burdwan Raj College must be given Rs. 1¼ lakhs. If it is framed with such a spirit there is nothing worse than that. I am sure the Hon'ble the Finance Minister out of necessity in accordance with his view has made each of these grants without being influenced by such idea. I have already said that there are some disappointing aspects of the budget but there are some also for which the Hon'ble the Finance Minister is to be congratulated.

In this connection I may refer to Karatia College, Adult Education scheme and provision for free primary education for boys and girls amongst others.

We have been trying heart and soul for this Karatia College for the last two years. Many motions and resolutions were submitted, many times we approached the Hon'ble the Finance Minister, the Hon'ble the Chief Minister and other members of the Cabinet. I do also remember that on one occasion we approached the Hon'ble the Chief Minister and the Hon'ble Mr. Suhrawardy on deputation last year at Gouripur with our several professor friends of the College.

So far as I know the estimate was submitted for Rs. 1,35,000 for this college of which only half the amount has been sanctioned. With

heart-felt congratulations to the Hon'ble the Chief Minister (who happens to be also the Education Minister) and the Finance Minister I beg to press them to raise this amount to one lakh of rupees or to supply later on the amount necessary and help this most useful institution which has got its brilliant record of success and has been immensely doing service not only to Bengal but also to Assam and some other provinces too.

Regarding the Free Primary Education scheme a paltry sum of Rs. 5 lakhs has been budgeted for as was done in the last year, and last year nothing was spent for the scheme which was introduced in the district of Mymensingh. In consequence and owing to the unsatisfactory realisation of cess out of the minimum possible number of 2,634 schools, in only 1,746 schools with a strength of almost over hundred students in each, conducted mostly by two teachers this scheme was given effect to from January 1938 and in 662 schools from last October only. The remaining 226 schools and 2,000 girls' schools in the district have not yet been touched. Now, may I ask you, Sir, why nothing was contributed from that amount to Mymensingh Free Primary School scheme this year besides the usual grant of Rs. 1,82,000. The cess proceeds were about 3 lakhs only, while the whole scheme in the district demanded Rs. 10 lakhs and odd and that was the difficulty. Now, if a sufficiently large amount is not contributed to Mymensingh, then I fear the whole scheme would undoubtedly fail.

Regarding adult education, I am glad that the attention of the Government has been drawn to it though with a very meagre amount. Last year we cried hoarse for it in vain. In my opinion instead of spending money in a piecemeal way under thousand heads and sub-heads, it is better to adopt this adult education scheme and introduce it gradually district by district. Adult education should not, cannot, nay, must not be ignored and neglected and the sooner this scheme is given effect to on a comprehensive scale the better. Because if this system begins to-day, people would derive benefit thereby from to-morrow. So it is far better to spend a few lakhs of rupees, however small it may be, for building the body and soul of the ignorant and indigent people, the epitome of God than to spend it for the construction of the Eden High School, Reformatory School, and Police buildings, additional Muslim Hall and for thousand other things. I see no life behind the *Hajar Dari* building of Murshidabad and of its owner while millions upon millions of people, the God-gifted souls wallow in the quagmire of ignorance, illiteracy, poverty and disease——

(At this stage it was found that there was no quorum and the House was adjourned.)

Adjournment.

The House was adjourned till 4-45 p.m., on Wednesday, the 22nd February, 1939, at the Assembly House, Calcutta.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Assembly assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act, 1935.

THE ASSEMBLY met in the Assembly House, Calcutta, on Wednesday, the 22nd February 1939, at 4-45 p.m.

Present:

MR. Speaker (the Hon'ble Khan Bahadur M. AZIZUL HAQUE, C.I.E.) in the Chair, 11 Hon'ble Ministers and 215 members.

STARRED QUESTIONS

(to which oral answers were given)

Muslim percentage in clerical and subordinate services in Communications and Works Department.

*58. **Mr. ABDUL WAHAB KHAN:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Communications and Works Department be pleased to state—

(*i*) that a quarterly statement showing the progress of Muhammadan employment in the clerical and subordinate services is prepared in this department; and

(*ii*) that in that statement only 33 per cent. of the total appointments are shown as the due share of Muslims?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) (*ii*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister consider the desirability of increasing the percentage of Muslim appointment in this department?

(*c*) Is it a fact that in the Eastern Circle not a single post of the 9 Upper Division clerical posts has ever gone to a Muslim?

(*d*) If the answer to (*c*) is in the affirmative, will the Government be pleased to state the reasons thereof?

(*e*) Will the Government consider the desirability of appointing some qualified Muslims to the higher grade?

MINISTER in charge of the COMMUNICATIONS AND WORKS DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Maharaja Srischandra Nandy, of Cossimbazar): (*a*) (*i*) and (*c*) Yes.

(*ii*) and (*b*) The proportion is the minimum and was fixed by the former Government and nothing can be done in respect of this department until the present Government as a whole come to a decision in the matter.

(*d*) and (*e*) When vacancies occur in the upper grades, appointments are made by promotion. Under the existing orders promotion depends on merit alone or on merit combined with seniority.

Mr. M. ASHRAFALI: With reference to answer (*a*) (*ii*), will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what is the maximum?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: I think it is 33 per cent., but I am not quite sure.

Confirmation of one Muslim temporary clerk.

***57. Mr. ABDUL WAHAB KHAN:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Communications and Works Department be pleased to state—

(*i*) that one Muslim temporary clerk (born in 1899) of the office of the Executive Engineer, Chittagong Division, has been told by the Superintending Engineer, Eastern Circle, that as he was over 25 years he would never be made permanent; and

(*ii*) that another Hindu temporary draftsman of the same office (born in 1892) has been made permanent last year when he was 46 years old?

(*b*) If the reply to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the reason of such differential treatment?

(*c*) Is it a fact that one Satis Chakravarty (born in 1902) and another Bhuvijoy Chakravarty (born in 1909) were appointed for the first time as clerks in the office of the Executive Engineer, Bakarganj Division, in 1938?

(*d*) If so, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the reason for appointing these men at an age exceeding 25 years?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) The Muslim temporary clerk was admitted to Government service for the first time at the age of 31 years, whereas the Hindu

temporary draftsman in question joined Government service at the age of 22 years and served for 24 years in a temporary capacity before being made permanent.

(c) Yes, in temporary capacities.

(d) The age-limit of 25 years does not apply to temporary appointments.

Appointments in different grades of services.

*58. **Mr. SERAJUL ISLAM:** Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Finance Department be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing for the years 1937 and 1938—

(a) how many appointments have been made by Government in the different departments in different grades of services on salaries of Rs. 30 per mensem and upwards;

(b) how many of these are direct recruitments;

(c) how many are by promotions;

(d) how many of the direct appointments have gone to the inhabitants of the different districts of the province (to be shown separately, district by district); and

(e) how many of such appointments have gone to caste Hindus, Scheduled Castes and Muslims, respectively?

MINISTER in charge of the FINANCE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Mr. Nalini Ranjan Sarker): The information is not readily available. It will take a very long time and involve much labour to collect information with regard to Government offices all over the province. I have, however, instructed my department to collect information with regard to the various Secretariat Departments and other attached offices in Calcutta. I shall place the information before the House as early as I can. I am also hoping to place before the House the results of the census of Government employees of all descriptions conducted by the Public Service Commission which is being compiled.

Bongaon-Kamdevpur Road in Jessore district.

*59. **Mr. SERAJUL ISLAM:** (a) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Communications and Works Department be pleased to state whether the Bongaon-Kamdevpur Road in Bongaon subdivision of Jessore district is in the Road Development Project?

(b) If so, when will the work be actually taken up by Government?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) There are many projects of much greater importance to the province as a whole than the one mentioned by the honourable member. It is therefore unlikely that work on the road will be financed from the Road Development Fund. Government will however have no objection if the District Board desire to meet expenditure on the project from their share of the proceeds of the Motor Vehicles Tax Fund.

Release of political prisoners.

***60. RAI HARENDRA NATH CHAUDHURI:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Home Department be pleased to state what progress has been made up till now in the matter of the release of political prisoners?

(*b*) With reference to the answer given to starred question No. 168 at the meeting of the 25th August, 1938, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state—

(*i*) how many of the 27 prisoners suffering from protracted illness have been released giving their names;

(*ii*) whether any of the political prisoners other than the 27 aforesaid have been released on medical grounds;

(*iii*) if so, how many and what are their names;

(*iv*) whether any of the political prisoners suffering from dementia or melancholia have been released or sent to mental hospital for treatment; and

(*v*) if so, the names of such prisoners?

MINISTER in charge of the HOME DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Khwaja Sir Nazimuddin): (*a*) The Advisory Committee has been appointed and is in session. Clemency has been exercised in 170 cases, of which 33 were released wholly or partially on medical grounds.

(*b*) (*i*) to (*iii*) I regret that I have been unable to identify any answer in which it was stated that 27 prisoners were suffering from protracted illness.

(*iv*) and (*v*) There has been no case for such action.

Poor Fund.

***61. Mr. SYED JALALUDDIN HASHEMY:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Home (Police) Department aware that in certain cases of which cognizance is taken by the police in Calcutta the offenders are let off by the Deputy Commissioner on payment of a sum as subscription to a fund known as "Poor Fund"?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state—

(*i*) what is this "Poor Fund"; and

(*ii*) how is the amount in the fund utilised?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) It is a fund maintained by the Commissioner of Police, Calcutta, out of which assistance is given to destitute persons and to charitable institutions.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the amount on an average collected in this fund and whether any account or audited account is kept of this fund?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: An account is kept and the amount is audited. I ask for notice as regards the actual amount.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if it is a fact that in a number of cases withdrawn from the trying Magistrate's Court, parties are required to deposit sums for this Poor Fund?

Mr. SPEAKER: It has been answered.

Mr. ATUL KRISHNA GHOSE: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the names of a few institutions which have received help, so that we can understand the nature of the help given to them?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: I ask for notice.

Khan Bahadur MOHAMMED ALI: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if it is a fact that disbursements are made only to the police-officers?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: No; that is not correct.

Khan Bahadur MOHAMMED ALI: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if it is a fact that a member of this House sent a complaint to the Hon'ble Minister with regard to the harassment of parties and if so, what step has been taken?

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: With regard to the previous question which I asked relating to the withdrawal of cases from the trying Magistrate's court, I submit that that has not been answered.

Mr. SPEAKER: That was answered.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: With reference to the cases recognised by the Police themselves, may I enquire if there has been any withdrawal?

Mr. SPEAKER: Strictly speaking, that does not arise.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to let us know whether from the file of the trying Magistrate cases are withdrawn and parties are made to contribute to the Poor Fund?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: As far as I know it is not correct, but it may be. I will enquire and let the honourable member know later if he so desires.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if he is aware that out of this Fund certain sergeants and their families are paid or have been paid sums of money to help them to go to Darjeeling?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: I do not think it is correct, but it may be that in cases under medical advice where it was absolutely essential for the preservation of health and life, assistance had been given.

Khan Bahadur MOHAMMED ALI: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the names of the charitable institutions that have received help from this fund?

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir NAZIMUDDIN: I would like to make a statement in this connection. The assistance so far has gone mostly to the European and Anglo-Indian communities. I will look into the question and will see that the fund is distributed equitably amongst all communities.

Scholarship to a relation of Hon'ble Minister, Co-operative Credit and Rural Indebtedness.

*62. **Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Education Department aware that a stipend or a scholarship has been awarded recently to a youth said to be related to the Hon'ble Minister in charge of Co-operative Credit and Rural Indebtedness?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state—

(*i*) what is that relationship; and

(*ii*) what are the considerations for which he has been selected for the scholarship?

(*c*) (*i*) What is the amount of the scholarship or stipend, and (*ii*) for what course of study has this been awarded?

(*d*) (*i*) Whether any advertisement was issued inviting applications for the above, and (*ii*) if so, how many replies were received?

(*e*) Whether the scholarship has been awarded on the results of any general or special examination?

MINISTER in charge of the EDUCATION DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Mr. A. K. Fazlul Huq): (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) (*i*) Nephew (brother's son)

(*ii*) He was one of the two candidates nominated by the Selection Board.

(*c*) (*i*) Originally the value of the scholarship was not more than £335 per annum with cost of passage each way. On the recommendation of the Selection Board however it was decided to pay each scholar £150 per annum as scholarship and £23 as cost of passage each way. As, however, Bibhutiranjan Mondal, the other nominee of the Board, could not avail of the scholarship owing to illness, it has been decided to restore the scholarship to its original value (viz., not exceeding £335 per annum).

(*c*) (*ii*) Teachers' Training Course.

(*d*) (*i*) Yes.

(*ii*) 17.

(*e*) On the nomination of a Selection Board which interviewed the candidates.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the educational qualification of this candidate as well as of the next best candidate who was on the list of approved candidates?

Mr. SPEAKER: I cannot understand your question. There is nothing in the answer to show that there was an approved list. It only says that there were two candidates. You can ask for the qualification of those two candidates.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: All right, Sir.

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: The honourable member is absolutely under a misapprehension and I am grateful to him that he has given me this opportunity of explaining a matter which might create misapprehension in the public mind.

There were 17 candidates and a Selection Committee consisting of Dr. Jenkins, Mr. A. K. Chanda and the Additional Director of Public Instruction, Khan Bahadur F. Ahmed considered the applications and interviewed the candidates. Mr. Mullick, the nephew of the Hon'ble Minister, was unanimously selected to be the best among the candidates and when the case came to me I asked the Director of Public Instruction to let me have the papers. I was convinced that Mr. Mullick was the best candidate: Yet I asked the Director of Public Instruction to readvertise in order to find out if we could find out a better candidate from the Scheduled Castes. On the second occasion 19 candidates applied (15 among those previous 17, and 4 new ones) and the Selection Committee consisting of the Director of Public Instruction (Mr. Bottomley), Dr. Jenkins, Mr. A. K. Chanda and the Additional Director of Public Instruction for Muhammadan Education interviewed the candidates and they again recommended Mr. Mullick. I then found that there was one Scheduled Caste candidate in England named Bibhutiranjan Mondal, who was in sore straits and needed financial help and I suggested to the Director of Public Instruction to divide this scholarship between these two candidates. It so happened, as I have stated in the answer, that Bibhutiranjan Mondal could not or would not take the scholarship and therefore the scholarship has now been given to the nephew of the Hon'ble Mr. Mullick.

Mr. RASIK LAL BISWAS: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether this candidate at the first interview was found to be disqualified or not up to the mark?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: He was the best candidate.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the educational qualifications of this candidate?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: The candidate, Mr. Mullick, is a B.A. Honours man. He was reading for the M.A. and had to give up his studies as he had to go to England. He passed

the Matriculation Examination of the Calcutta University in the I Division with a scholarship; I.A. Examination in the I Division from the Presidency College, Calcutta, with a scholarship and in the B.A. he got II Class Honors in History, standing very high in II Class. He is an athlete, a tennis champion and a Blue.

Khan Bahadur MOHAMMED ALI: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether it is a disqualification to be a relation of an Hon'ble Minister if he is otherwise qualified?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: As regards this I think a candidate should not be disqualified merely because he is a relation of an Hon'ble Minister as some of the relations of the Ministers are very brilliant boys.

Buchanan trained persons as District Organisers.

*63. **Maulvi ABDUL LATIF BISWAS:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Education Department be pleased to state—

(*i*) how many Buchanan trained persons were appointed as District Organisers in the year 1938, and of those, how many are Hindus and how many Mussalmans; and

(*ii*) how many Buchanan trained men were appointed as Physical Instructors in 1938, and of those, how many are Hindus and how many Mussalmans?

(*b*) Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether at the time of the appointments of those District Organisers and Physical Instructors there were other Buchanan trained Muslim candidates?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: (*a*) (*i*) 26 persons were appointed as District Organisers of Physical Education, viz.—

Non-Muslim	...	18
Muslim	...	8
Total	...	26

(*ii*) 24 persons were appointed as Physical Instructors in Government Institutions, viz.—

Non-Muslim	...	17
Muslim	...	7
Total	...	24

(*b*) One Muslim candidate was interviewed by a Departmental Selection Committee but was not considered fit for appointment. Another Muslim candidate was not considered good enough for interview.

Maulvi ABDUL LATIF BISWAS: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state why these two Muslim candidates who were duly qualified were not taken in?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: Which two? Do you mean the two mentioned in (*b*)?

Maulvi ABDUL LATIF BISWAS: With reference to (*b*), why these two qualified Muslim candidates were not taken in?

Mr. SPEAKER: That question has been answered.

Maulvi ABDUL LATIF BISWAS: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether besides these two candidates there were other Muslim Buchanan-trained applicants at the time?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: I want notice, Sir.

Mr. BIRAT CHANDRA MANDAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether any educated and qualified Scheduled Caste candidate applied and whether his application received any consideration?

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise.

Mr. FAZLUR RAHMAN: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether he proposes to take any steps in the matter of having more Muslim candidates trained at the Buchanan Institute?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: I am having daily talks with Mr. Buchanan and have been successful in persuading him to take in more Muslim candidates. I cannot change his mentality but I am trying my best. He has a very high standard. I hope the number of Muslim candidates will be greater than before and the Selection Board will have a wider field of choice.

Maulvi ABDUL LATIF BISWAS: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether at the time of these appointments other Muslim qualified candidates approached personally the Hon'ble the Chief Minister and he did not do anything in view of the fact that Mr. Buchanan took their cases into consideration?

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise.

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: I would rather answer the question.

Mr. SPEAKER: Hon'ble members will kindly exercise judgment and discretion in putting supplementary questions. I cannot allow any question regarding personal approach to any of the Hon'ble Ministers, because I consider it fundamentally wrong to bring this to the notice of the House.

Maulvi ABDUL BARI: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state who were the members of the Selection Committee at the time of selecting these candidates?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: I do not remember exactly, but I think that it consisted of the Director of Public Instruction, Dr. Jenkins, and two others whose names I cannot recollect at the moment.

Mr. BIRAT CHANDRA MANDAL: The Hon'ble Minister said just now that he repeatedly told Mr. Buchanan to consider the cases of Muhammadans. Does he remember whether he ever said anything regarding the Scheduled Caste candidates?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: Yes, I did.

Mr. SPEAKER: Order, order

Mr. BIRAT CHANDRA MANDAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether it is a fact----

Mr. SPEAKER: May I tell you this, Mr. Mandal, that if you do not know how to put a question, I would be put to the painful necessity of taking drastic steps in the matter. It is an elementary duty which even you, Mr. Mandal, ought to know that when I am rising in my seat you should not burst out with a speech on the House.

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: May I explain?

Mr. SPEAKER: I cannot allow the explanation because I consider the question is entirely out of order. Here the question is about the Hindus and Muhammadans. I cannot allow any question regarding the details of sub-castes. If Mr. Mandal wants to know about Scheduled Castes, he should have been diligent enough to put a question.

Maulvi ABDUL LATIF BISWAS: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether several applications from qualified Muslim candidates were not considered at all?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: My difficulty is that when applications are received, they are considered by a Selection Committee and the question of qualification or fitness is considered by that Committee and their opinion is final, but I am trying to induce the Committee to advertise properly and to try and get more candidates so that from a wider field the selection is made. I am myself not satisfied with the state of things and as regards the Scheduled Castes——

Mr. SPEAKER: Order, order.

Maulvi ABDUL LATIF BISWAS: In the answer given by the Hon'ble the Chief Minister he says that he is not satisfied with the number selected so far. Will the Hon'ble Minister consider the desirability of taking necessary steps to see why there have been causes of dissatisfaction with the selection?

Mr. SPEAKER: That is a request for action.

Municipality at Beldanga.

*64. **Mr. SASANKA SEKHAR SANYAL:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Local Self-Government and Industries Department be pleased to state whether a representation was made for constituting Beldanga a Municipal area?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, how the matter stands with the Government?

(*c*) Is it a fact that the Health Department of the Government of Bengal have recommended a Municipality in Beldanga?

MINISTER in charge of the LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT and INDUSTRIES DEPARTMENTS (the Hon'ble Nawab Khwaja Habibullah Bahadur, of Dacca): (*a*) and (*b*) No representation has been made to Government but it has been ascertained that a representation has been submitted to the Divisional Commissioner.

(*c*) No.

Mr. SASANKA SEKHAR SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state when the Divisional Commissioner received this representation?

The Hon'ble Nawab Khwaja HABIBULLAH Bahadur, of Dacca: I have no idea.

Maulvi ABDUL BARI: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether the Mahomedans of that particular area are opposed to the establishment of a municipality?

The Hon'ble Nawab Khwaja HABIBULLAH Bahadur, of Dacca: I believe so.

Mr. SASANKA SEKHAR SANYAL: What action has been taken by the Divisional Commissioner in this matter?

The Hon'ble Nawab Khwaja HABIBULLAH Bahadur, of Dacca: I want notice.

Maulvi ABDUL BARI: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether the Mahomedan population of this locality are mostly poor and unable to pay municipal taxes?

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise.

Extension of clerical staff of the Eastern Circle.

*65. **Mr. ABDUL WAHAB KHAN:** Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Communications and Works Department be pleased to state—

(a) how many members of the clerical staff of the Eastern Circle are on extension; and

(b) whether it is a fact that the present Head Assistant of the Eastern Circle reached 55 years of age in 1934?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: (a) No question of extending the service of a clerical officer arises until he has reached the age of 60; and my information is that there are no such officers over that age in the Circle. Possibly the honourable member desires to know the number of clerical officers over the age of 55 which is the age at which a competent authority may require such officers to retire. If that is so, the answer is seven.

(b) Yes. The present Head Assistant reached the age of 55 years on the 10th September, 1934.

Mr. MIRZA ABDUL HAFIZ: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether he is aware that a resolution was passed by this House in the last session with respect to compulsory retirement after 25 years' service?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: Sir, these cases are considered under Fundamental Rule 56(*b*) and until that rule is changed, I do not think anything can be done.

Maulvi ABDUL LATIF BISWAS: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether after the passing of the resolution he considers the desirability of seeing that no extension is granted?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: But the section referred to must be amended, first of all.

Comilla-Daudkandi Road.

***66. Mr. DHIRENDRA NATH DATTA:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Communications and Works Department aware that the delay in metalling—

(*i*) Comilla-Daudkandi Road,

(*ii*) Comilla and Chouddagram Road, and

(*iii*) Nayamati and Nabinagar Road,

in the district of Tippera, is causing inconvenience to the residents of the police-stations Daudkandi and Homna and some portions of Muradnagar, Chouddagram, Dabidwar and part of Nabinagar respectively in the district of Tippera?

(*b*) Are the Government considering the desirability of taking steps—

(*i*) for metalling those roads; and

(*ii*) for constructing a bridge on the river Gumti near Companiganj in the police-station Muradnagar in the district of Tippera?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: It is a commonplace that the lack of metalled roads causes inconvenience. The Comilla-Daudkandi Road is being metalled and surface-painted as fast as possible. The expenditure on this road during 1938-39 will be about Rs. 1,90,000. There is no proposal at present being considered by Government to metal the roads Comilla-Chouddagram and Nayamati-Nabinagar, nor to construct a bridge across the Gumti river near Companiganj.

Mr. DHIRENDRA NATH DATTA: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state when the metalling of the Comilla-Daudkandi road began?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: It is not possible to give the exact date of commencement, but it is expected that the work will be completed in 1939-40.

UNSTARRED QUESTIONS

(answers to which were laid on the table)

Construction of the Pabna-Bera Road.

28. Babu NARENDRA NARAYAN CHAKRABARTY: Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Communications and Works Department be pleased to state—

(*a*) when the construction of the Pabna-Bera Road was proposed;

(*b*) how far the proposed road was constructed;

(*c*) why the work was left unfinished during the last year;

(*d*) the period within which the proposed road is likely to be completed; and

(*e*) the amount proposed to be spent on the said road?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: (*a*) The Communications and Works Department have not under consideration any proposal to construct a road from Pabna to Bera now.

(*b*) to (*e*) Do not arise.

Babu NARENDRA NARAYAN CHAKRABARTY: মাননীয় মন্ত্রীমহাশয়ের district board রাস্তা সম্বন্ধে উত্তর দেবার অধিকার আছে কি?

Mr. SPEAKER: How does this question arise? I think, if it is a district board road, that question does not arise here. Members will perhaps realise that it is to their own interest that the question of functioning of a local body should be left out of the Assembly unless it is a matter of such grave concern that an interference is necessary.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: May I submit, Sir, in this connection that the case of district board roads financed from the Motor Vehicles Tax Fund is different in that it has got to be supervised by the Minister in charge of Communications and Works?

Mr. SPEAKER: I am not concerned with the matter regarding roads constructed out of the Motor Vehicles Tax Fund but with district board roads generally.

Babu NARENDRA NARAYAN CHAKRABARTY: সভাপতি মহাশয়, আমি একটা রাস্তা সম্বন্ধে ওঁকে জিজ্ঞাসা করেছিলাম যে রাস্তাটা কতদূর আরম্ভ করা হয়েছে, আমি এ-কথা জিজ্ঞাসা করি নাই যে রাস্তাটা উনি আরম্ভ কোরেছেন না district board আরম্ভ কোরেছে। উনি পায়ে পড়ে উত্তর দিয়েছেন যে উনি আরম্ভ করেন নাই।

Mr. SPEAKER: He cannot be expected to know anything about district board matters.

Election of Rangpur District Board.

29. Babu KSHETRA NATH SINGHA: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Local Self-Government Department be pleased to state when the term of the present District Board of Rangpur expired?

(*b*) Have the Government extended the period?

(*c*) If the answer to (*b*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state when the extended period will expire?

(*d*) When the next election will take place?

(*e*) When the next Board is expected to function?

(*f*) Are the Government considering the desirability of expediting the matters?

The Hon'ble Nawab Khwaja HABIBULLAH Bahadur, of Dacca: (*a*) The five-year term of the existing Board expired on the 10th November, 1938.

(*b*) No.

(*c*) Does not arise.

(*d*) and (*e*) In view of the abolition of the local boards in the district of Rangpur, steps are being taken to divide the district into constituencies for the election of members to the District Board and for this purpose certain revised proposals have been called for from the local officers. The next election will take place as soon as possible after the district has been divided into constituencies and the next board is expected to function after the election is over and after the required number of members of the Board has been appointed by Government.

(*f*) The matter will be dealt with as expeditiously as possible on receipt of the proposals which have been called for from the local officers.

Extension of Bhatiapara railway line up to Barisal via Madaripur.

30. Mr. SURENDRA NATH BISWAS: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Communications and Works Department be pleased to state whether he has received a copy of the resolution passed by the Muktears' Bar Association of Madaripur in their meeting held on the 7th January, 1939, requesting Government to move the Government of India for implementing the scheme pending with the latter for the extension of the Faridpur or Bhatiapara railway line up to Barisal *via* Madaripur?

(*b*) Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that similar demands are being made by the public of the districts of Faridpur and Bakarganj for a long time?

(*c*) Has the Hon'ble Minister moved the Government of India for the aforesaid purpose? If so, with what result; and if not, do Government propose to so move in the matter?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: (*a*) and (*b*) Yes.

(*c*) The project was considered by the Government of India at the instance of the Provincial Government between 1914 and 1926. It was decided not to execute the project owing to its unremunerative character and the harm that it was likely to cause to public health and agriculture. I do not propose to ask the Government of India to reconsider their decision.

Mr. SURENDRA NATH BISWAS: With reference to reply (*c*), will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether the Provincial Government recommended the project for the acceptance by the Government of India?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: I believe conditions were quite different in those years than they are now.

Mr. SURENDRA NATH BISWAS: Sir, my question is whether the Provincial Government recommended the project for the acceptance by the Government of India.

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: I want notice.

Mr. SURENDRA NATH BISWAS: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether the Government at that time considered whether the scheme was remunerative or not?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: Very likely.

Mr. SURENDRA NATH BISWAS: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether there are any special reasons that a railway in the district of Faridpur will cause injury to public health and agriculture?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: That is for the experts of Public Health Department to say.

Mr. SURENDRA NATH BISWAS: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to enquire whether the proposed railway is likely to cause injury to public health and agriculture?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: Sir, that is not a matter for my department to take up.

Mr. ABDUL WAHAB KHAN: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether the reasons which held good from 1914 to 1926 still prevail in 1939?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: Sir, it is very difficult to answer this question off-hand. But I do not think things have improved; on the other hand, they must have gone for the worse.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Is it not a fact that the east to west provincial trunk road alignment covers a portion of the road between Barisal and Madaripur so that a railway along that alignment may not be needed?

The Hon'ble Maharaja SRISCHANDRA NANDY, of Cossimbazar: Very likely, Sir.

Mr. SURENDRA NATH BISWAS: Is it not a fact that the proposed railway does not cover any portion of the alignment just referred to by Dr. Sanyal?

Mr. SPEAKER: That is a question to be settled between Dr. Sanyal and yourself.

Clerical establishment in Civil Courts of Pabna.

31. **Mr. ABDULLA-AL MAHMOOD:** Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Judicial and Legislative Department be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing for the last 2 years in respect of the district of Pabna—

(*a*) the number of ministerial officers in the Civil Courts;

(*b*) the number of new recruits;

(*c*) the number amongst the new recruits who are—

(1) Muslims, and

(2) Hindus; and

(*d*) the scale of pay of each of the posts to which new recruits have been appointed?

MINISTER in charge of the JUDICIAL and LEGISLATIVE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Nawab Musharruff Hossain, Khan Bahadur): (*a*) The total number of permanent clerks in the joint establishment of the District Judge of Pabna and Bogra was 96 in 1937 and 97 in 1938, besides the temporary establishment of 18 clerks up to the 22nd September, 1938, and thereafter up to the end of 1938, a staff of 12 temporary clerks.

(*b*) 1937—16; 1938—10.

(*c*) (1) 1937—6; 1938—4.

(2) 1937—10; 1938—6.

(*d*) In 1937 one stenographer was appointed in the scale of Rs. 70—70—4—130—5—150. All other appointments in 1937 and 1938 were in the scale of Rs. 35—35—40—4/2—68—3/2—80.

Mr. RASIK LAL BISWAS: মন্ত্রীমহাশয় দয়া করে জানাবেন কি ৩নং প্রশ্নের C তে যে উত্তর দিয়েছেন তাতে ২নং হিন্দুদের সংখ্যা দেওয়া আছে। ঐ হিন্দুদের মধ্যে তপশিলভুক্ত হিন্দুদের সংখ্যা কত?

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise.

Appointment to all grades of clerical and menial posts in Civil Courts in Bengal.

32. **Mr. DHANANJOY ROY:** Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Judicial and Legislative Department be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing for the period from 19th August, 1936, up till now—

(a) the number of office peons, orderlies and watchmen and probationers appointed in the Civil Courts of the province under the Hon'ble High Court's General letter No. 32, dated the 19th August, 1936;

(b) how many amongst them are—
(i) Muhammadans, and
(ii) Scheduled Castes men; and

(c) how far the directions of the last but one paragraph, of clause 3, of the said letter of the Hon'ble High Court have been given effect to?

The Hon'ble Nawab MUSHARRUFF HOSSAIN, Khan Bahadur: (a) and (b) A statement is laid on the Library table.

(c) High Court's directions have been given effect to in full.

Babu KSHETRA NATH SINCHA: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if the High Court disobeys the repeated circulars of the Government what is the remedy for the aggrieved parties?

Mr. SPEAKER: That question does not arise.

GENERAL DISCUSSION OF THE BUDGET.

The General discussion of the Budget was resumed.

Sir GEORGE CAMPBELL: Mr. Speaker, Sir, in rising to congratulate the Finance Minister on a clear and businesslike budget, I think we may look on ourselves in this province with a certain amount of satisfaction. I do not say we should adopt the attitude of the Pharisee in the New Testament and look around and thank God Bengal is not as other provinces, because I think the Pharisee's failing was complacency and I am sure that if we were to become complacent, the Finance Minister would quickly take us out of that attitude by imposing on us some new form of taxation. I do think, however, we have cause for satisfaction.

It must be remembered that the Niemeyer Award, although it remedied the acute stringency under which Bengal had suffered, did no more than provide us with a bare minimum of what we might legitimately claim.

The Finance Minister has had to supplement this by fresh taxation; first by renewal of emergency taxation last year and now by taxes on dog-racing and on trades, professions, occupations, and callings; and he makes no secret that he has further taxation in mind.

The trend of new taxation is such as to fall on the urban areas and the House will remember that the town are already overburdened by the weight of all-India taxation which falls heavily upon them, and most heavily on Calcutta in particular.

We recognize the need for this taxation if the province is to prosper. After years of straitened resources under the Meston Settlement there is much leeway to make up, and the Finance Minister from year to year spreads his available resources with great judgment, to stimulate progress on sound lines.

There is a tendency in the House to criticise him for not achieving miracles. It should always be remembered that no Finance Minister can do more than create conditions in which the people themselves, by their own energy and initiative, can prosper and provide the means for the benefits they wish.

Unemployment cannot be solved by Government or by the Secretariat. It can only be solved by the determined efforts of the people, in favourable conditions which Government can do something to create. And one of the first conditions is the avoidance of over-taxation. It is an old axiom, that has perhaps been overlooked in recent times, that money fructifies best in the pockets of the tax-payers: when they have a margin to work on they can develop their businesses or activities and so create employment to the ultimate benefit of the country and the Government.

I should like to make one observation regarding the tax on trades, professions, occupations, and callings. While it is an ungraduated tax, it is still based on income-tax, and may create some hardship in border-line cases of those just within the reach of income-tax. These are perhaps unavoidable defects; but they illustrate the difficulties of basing provincial taxation on all-India taxation, and this tax comes perilously near to infringing the Central prerogative.

I do feel that there will be a certain hardship on small earners, but there again arises the difficulty of ameliorating without grading which would definitely put the tax out of court as an infringement of the Central prerogative. I should like if the Finance Minister could devise some easy method of taxing those who do not pay income-tax. It would be welcomed in many quarters.

We are interested to see that the Hon'ble the Finance Minister proposes to assist his finances this year by borrowing, and, I think, he is justified in that course. The credit of the Province is good, and I hope that in the Province itself lenders will come forward to support the loan which, we are told, he is going to raise. The success of that loan and the Province's credit for future loans will depend on the stability and the good Government of the Province itself. With these words, Sir, I should like, through you, to congratulate once again the Hon'ble the Finance Minister on his clear budget and his able presentation.

Mr. ATUL KRISHNA GHOSE: Sir, when discussing the budget affairs, I do not forget the words of the Hon'ble the Finance Minister that "this is not a moment for parliamentary obstruction, this is a moment for rapid action", but may I, Sir, through you enquire where are the chances of rapid action when the Ministers themselves are callous to the vital interests of the people? The Hon'ble the Finance Minister has referred to the recent flood that has created havoc in Bengal and that has ruined the peasantry as a whole. Though it is a known fact that year after year either flood or drought is creating havoc in Bengal, have the Government taken any steps whatsoever to prevent these in future? Whenever such a calamity occurs and when reports of serious nature reach the Government, what steps do they take? Government, when they cannot turn the tide of public opinion, take some palliative measures and as soon as the flood subsides they sit tight in the arm-chair and forget the whole situation. This has been the history for the last 50 years and Bengal has suffered crores of rupees which might otherwise have done immense benefit to the province. Is this the indication of rapid action on the part of the Ministers? Had the Ministers been rapid in executing this sort of thing in building up national institutions, I can assure you, Sir, that we in the Opposition would not have been lagging behind to offer our co-operation at least in such humanitarian affairs. After the promulgation of the Provincial Autonomy, the Provincial Government have been entitled to raise loans to any extent to do any kind of humanitarian work for the people of Bengal. Has there been any such indication whatsoever on the part of the Hon'ble the Finance Minister, although he was the follower of the late Deshbandu Das who had a definite scheme in which he narrated in very clear-cut terms to raise loan of several crores for the education of Muslims, for the education of the scheduled castes and for the benefit of the nation as a whole. Has there been any such comprehensive scheme formulated by the present Cabinet? Is this the indication of rapid action? One is naturally surprised, Sir, while going through the budget estimates, to see that more than Rs. 5½ lakhs has been sanctioned to erect buildings for the Police officers. May we not

expect that had this amount been given for some embankments, for some canals, people would have been saved from the disastrous effect of floods at least to some extent?

I would like to draw your attention to the state of things in the Irrigation Department which is most pathetic and for which I myself have tried to draw the attention of the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Irrigation Department, who, unfortunately I find at the time of this discussion, is absent from this House.

Now, Sir, I would like to say a few words regarding the Irrigation Department. Even in the distant past, in 1799, Government spent a sum of Rs. 15,000 to keep in tact the embankment of the river Nabaganga in the district of Jessore. In the years 1801 and 1802 the then Government spent Rs. 28,000 and Rs. 27,287 for the embankment of the river Nabaganga. But from the beginning of this Ministry I have repeatedly drawn the attention of the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of the Irrigation Department time after time by repeated questions, through personal interviews, through newspapers and through all possible publicity departments to this matter, but I failed to induce the Hon'ble Minister to take any action in the matter. Is this the way that the Hon'ble Minister discharges his duties? The life of the river Nabaganga may be prolonged if only Rs. 50,000 to Rs. 60,000 is spent in some particular areas and some particular points, but Government will take no heed whatsoever in this matter. Is this the way that they are discharging their duties? Do they expect that people will go on tolerating this sort of things? This is not a personal issue and whatever my personal opinion may be of the Hon'ble Minister himself, I have no hesitation in saying that he has failed in discharging his duties. He has been extremely callous so far as discharging his duties with regard to the river Nabaganga.

Now, Sir, I would like to say a few words regarding the Police administration. To the masses of the people, the *lál pagri* is just like a red rag to the bull. What we find, however, is that even under these circumstances, the number of Sub-Inspectors has been increased and Government are recruiting 100 Sub-Inspectors in place of 66. Is this the way that the funds of the public will be spent in the name of the national distribution of money. Then again, Sir, I am surprised to learn that for the sake of training the Police to use tear-gas, an amount of Rs. 34,451 has been sanctioned, but what is the function of tear-gas? Tear-gas, so far as I can understand, will be used to drive us away from mass meetings. It is by our money that the Police will apply gas so that we shall shed tears and run away from the meeting. When in other civilized countries, with the cloud of war hanging, people are being trained how to put on gas masks, our Government are training the Police officers how to use tear-gas! In my opinion, the Hon'ble the Home Minister ought to be ashamed of such action.

Now, Sir, I would like to draw your attention to the administration of the Jail Department. A very meagre amount has been sanctioned for the purchase of books for the district jails. But the actual state of things in district jails is a horrible one! Whatever small amount is sanctioned for the purchase of books, we do not know how this money is spent as there is no book whatsoever. So far as the Jessore District Jail is concerned, I know personally, as I happen to be a non-official visitor there, that there are no books. They do not purchase any book. Where does the money go? Jail administration is notorious for bribery and corruption. Beginning from the jailors, contractors, warders everybody is addicted to it, and even the small amount sanctioned for the purchase of books is mis-spent or misappropriated by the officials. Is this the way of distributing the sum? Regarding jail administration, I would like to draw your attention to another factor. Of the amount of money that has been sanctioned for the expenses of the food of the prisoners I can assure you, 25 to 30 per cent. is stolen by contractors or other officials and the poor prisoners get only 70 to 75 per cent. of the money sanctioned for their food. If you cannot put a stop to this sort of corruption, there is no use spending such amount which will ultimately go to the pocket of the contractors and officers.

Now, Sir, I will protest against the idea of ungraduated new taxation of Rs. 30 a year on professions——.

(Here the member reached his time-limit and resumed his seat.)

Mr. FAZLUR RAHMAN (Mymensingh): Mr. Speaker, Sir, I should like to make a few remarks on the budget as presented by the Hon'ble the Finance Minister for the year 1939-40. Although I realise that the discussion on the budget hardly brings any change in the policy of the Government, I owe it to my constituency and to the country as well, to speak a few words on certain subjects, which, I consider to be the most important. I should like to take up, first, the question of primary education. The primary education is the crying need of the province. In fact it is the birth-right of every one, male or female in this country. Although we have been urging upon the Government from the very beginning of our career as legislators for the introduction of free and compulsory education in this province and although the Minister in charge of Education has promised us to deliver the goods and although a resolution for introduction of the free and compulsory primary education was unanimously adopted in this House, no appreciable result seems to have been attained in this direction. No scheme has yet been evolved for the solution of the problem. In fact nothing has yet been done to fulfil this urgent demand of the country. It has been said that without further taxation upon the people such a measure cannot be brought into operation. Well, we have never objected to the imposition of Education cess upon the people who are really able to pay and as a matter of fact the resolution about

which I have just now spoken, has authorised Government to levy education cess upon the people exempting the poor *raiyats* and cultivators who have no means to pay. I do not, therefore, see any reason why the Government should take such a long time in drawing up a scheme for the introduction of free and compulsory primary education in this province. We are already spending about a crore of rupees for Primary Education. If the municipalities be included in the scheme we may get about a crore more. And by savings and retrenchment under different heads we can get about ½ of a crore more. Thus we may get about three crores and for the balance, that is one crore and a half out of the total estimated cost, the Central Government may be approached to help the province with the amount as suggested by the Hon'ble the Finance Minister in his budget speech.

Now I want to say some words about the Public Health. It is well-known that owing to malaria, kala-azar and other diseases thousands and thousands of people are losing their lives every year in the countryside. They have no good water to drink and no medicine to take. There has been a persistent demand from the members of all sections of this House for making adequate provision for the supply of good drinking water and also for the establishment of charitable dispensaries throughout the province. True it is that Government are providing some money every year for the supply of drinking water; but I do not think, the money that is provided on this account can meet the great demand of the people. Besides, without any scheme for the solution of this problem, I am afraid, the money that is provided will not be well-spent. A scheme for the solution of the problem, within a definite period of time, should be drawn up and money provided, so that at the end of the period we might see that there is no further complaint about the water-supply in the countryside.

Similarly there is a crying need for the charitable dispensaries from every quarter of this country. If at least one charitable dispensary is established in every union with a recurring grant of about one thousand rupees per year, I think the cost will not exceed fifty lakhs of rupees a year. And in case one dispensary is provided for two smaller unions, the cost may be brought down to an amount of thirty lakhs or so. In the present budget, we find, provision has been made for the construction of new buildings under different heads incurring an expenditure of about eighteen lakhs or so. The construction of these works may wait for a better day but the establishment of dispensaries cannot wait. Because the necessity of dispensaries is much more important and urgent than the construction of buildings. The Government are spending about 7 to 8 lakhs a year for combating malaria, kalazar and other diseases and if the money that is provided for the construction of buildings is added to this amount and the whole amount be made available for the establishment of dispensaries throughout the province, the

problem can be very easily solved. It appears that about 12½ lakhs of rupees have been provided in the present budget for rural public health units and reorganisation of public health units. I do not know what is the scheme under which this money is going to be spent. The Government ought to have given us indication in the budget as to how such a large sum is going to be spent. I understand the money is going to be spent in some selected districts as an experimental measure. I am afraid there is hardly any time or necessity for making a further experiment in the matter of public health. If, however, this measure is experimented in some selected districts, I would suggest that the district of Mymensingh deserves first consideration. The District Board of Mymensingh is quite ready to co-operate with the Government in carrying out the scheme in all possible ways.

Lastly, as to the Communication and Works, I need only say that the whole province in suffering much, specially my district being the worst sufferer. There is practically no road between important railway stations and jute and paddy centres in the northern part of the district, specially the northern part of the Jamalpur subdivision. A survey has been made and estimate sanctioned for construction of some roads in this locality but no money has been provided. From the financial statement we find that about 42 lakhs of rupees are lying unspent for want of schemes. I do not understand why the Minister in charge could not spend this money. He has already passed two unproductive years and is again entering into another such year without making any headway in this direction. It is better for him and for all concerned that he should retire and enjoy the luxuries of the world in which he was born and brought up.

Maharajkumar UDAY CHAND MAHTAB: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I rise to congratulate the Hon'ble the Finance Minister on the lucid and businesslike budget he has placed before the House. But that does not prevent me from making a few general observations on certain sections of the budget. As I have usually done in former budget observations I would like to first take up Irrigation.

Sir, in a deltaic province like Bengal, the irrigation system is vital for the life and progress of the people. It is time that proper steps are taken to have a well-thought-out and workable irrigation scheme so that further time may not elapse in the scheme being taken in hand. It should be remembered that our health, prosperity and progress depend to a large extent upon our irrigation system being properly organised and worked.

Some schemes have already been prepared, such as the Hooghly-Howrah scheme, the More scheme and the Bankura scheme which should not be del d an opportunity of visiting the

districts of Bankura and Birbhum and I do think that it is essential that there should be proper irrigation in those districts to improve the general condition of the people at an early date.

Sir, for the contentment and prosperity of the people it is necessary that their economic condition should be sound and progressive. The work of the Agricultural Department is halting and dilatory. The questions of introduction of new crops and of suitable alternation of crops, of reduction of the cost of cultivation, are matters which require careful and immediate attention. Necessary enquiries should be made and steps taken to add to the economic asset of the people. In this connection I would also urge upon the Government the necessity of a proper enquiry into our present staple products and of finding suitable markets in India and abroad for those and other products.

In this connection I would call attention to the interference with the functioning of the necessary economic processes by arbitrary steps taken without due enquiry and without duly finding what the present circumstances are and what the future outlook should be. I refer to some of the provisions of the legislation regarding Debt Settlement which is putting a check on financial operations. These might result in a shrinkage of credit and divert credit to other channels, thus striking a serious blow to the financial strength of the province. The baneful effects already appear in the shrinkage of the land revenue and of the revenue derived from stamps and court-fees.

Sir, I think a certain amount of shrinkage of land revenue is due to the amendment of the Bengal Tenancy Act and the effects of flood in various districts of the province. I desired also to call attention to the condition of the public health of the province. Bengal has the reputation of being one of the most unhealthy provinces of India. A very considerable part of the budget allocation of expenditure should have been for measures for improvement of public health, but we are lamentably negligent in that respect. Life must be saved and health improved before expenditure is incurred for other purposes.

Sir, we find that there is a deficit of Rs. 87 lakhs in the Bengal budget which the Hon'ble the Finance Minister hopes to balance by the introduction of new taxation. He has said in his budget speech that he has every hope of meeting this deficit, but he also hopes that he will be able to embark on many new schemes which would be able to meet the needs of the province.

Sir, everybody is aware of the general condition of the people of Bengal and I only hope that the introduction of this ungraduated tax of Rs. 30 per annum on professions, trades, employments and callings on those who are already paying income-tax may not be the cause of general discontent and of privation in certain cases. But I am sure that the Government will take all these facts into consideration.

As regards the taxes on dog racing, I think it is a good measure and it ought to have been taken up earlier. I take this opportunity once again of congratulating the Hon'ble the Finance Minister and I hope he will be able to fulfil the desires expressed about the success of the budget and I also hope that the Government will come forward as soon as possible with immediate schemes for irrigation, improvement of agricultural conditions and steps for improving the health of Bengal in general.

Maulana MD. MANIRUZZAMAN ISLAMABADI: স্পীকার মহোদয়! মাননীয় অর্থ-সচিব মহোদয়ের ১৯০৯-৪০ সালের বাজেট পাঠ করিয়া প্রসিদ্ধ উর্দ্দু কবি গালেবের একটী উর্দ্দু কবিতা স্মৃতি-পথে জাগ্রত হইয়া উঠিল। কবি বলিয়াছেন,

بہت شور سنتے تھے پہلو میں دل کا * چیرا تو ایک قطرۂ خوں نہ نکلا

অর্থাৎ আমার হৃদ্‌পিণ্ডের স্পন্দনজনিত গর্জ্জন-ধ্বনি শুনিয়া মনে হইতেছিল, না জানি উহার ভিতর কত কি আছে; কিন্তু সেই হৃদ্‌পিণ্ড যখন চিরিয়া দেখিলাম, তাহাতে এক বিন্দু রক্ত ব্যতীত আর কিছুই দেখিতে পাওয়া গেল না।" আমরা ভাবিয়াছিলাম, ভারতের একজন অর্থ-নীতিক পণ্ডিত বলিয়া পরিচিত ব্যক্তি যিনি ৫০।৬০ কোটী টাকা লইয়া দুই যুগ ধরিয়া খেলা করিয়া আসিতেছেন, তিনি বাংলা সরকারের বাজেট হাতে পাইলে বাংলায় যুগান্তর উপস্থিত করিবেন। আমাদের দুঃখের অবসান ঘটিবে,—সোনার বাংলার নাম সার্থক হইবে। কিন্তু গত দুই বৎসরের বাজেট ত যেন তেন প্রকারেণ সাবেক আমলের উদ্বৃত্ত তহবিলের গোঁজামিলে কোনরূপে কাটিয়া গিয়াছে, আমরা প্রাণে বাঁচিয়াছিলাম; কিন্তু বর্ত্তমান বাজেটের এক কোটী টাকার ঘাটতি দেখিয়া আমাদের চক্ষু স্থির হইয়াছে, হরিষে বিষাদ উপস্থিত হইয়াছে। মাননীয় অর্থ-সচিব আমাদিগকে ঢেঁকি গিলাইবার ব্যবস্থা করিয়াছেন। উর্দ্দু কবি বুক চিরিয়া হৃদ্‌-পিণ্ডে এক বিন্দু রক্ত মাত্র পাইয়াছিলেন, আর আমরা বাজেট বিচারিয়া দেউলীয়া হওয়ার পথের সন্ধান পাইয়াছি। নূতন ট্যাক্‌সের কথা শুনিয়া শরীর শিহরিয়া উঠিয়াছে।

এবারকার বাজেটে অনেক খরচের নূতন নূতন দফা পরিলক্ষিত হইতেছে। General Administration ব্যয়-বরাদ্দে দেখা যায়, গত বৎসর অপেক্ষা এ বৎসর ১১ লক্ষ টাকা অধিক ব্যয়িত হইবে। Debt Conciliation দফায় ৯ লক্ষ এবং পুলিশ ব্যয়খাতে ৯ লক্ষ ৬৮ হাজার, জেল ব্যয়খাতে ১ লক্ষ অধিক টাকা ব্যয়িত হইবে। Aministration of Justice ব্যয়খাতে ১ লক্ষ অধিক ব্যয়-বরাদ্দ হইয়াছে। এই অতিরিক্ত টাকা দ্বারা কি কি মহৎ কার্য্য সুসম্পাদিত হইবে অর্থ-সচিব মহোদয় তাঁহার লাল কিতাবে (Red Book) যে লম্বা ফিরিস্তি দিয়াছেন তাহা পড়িয়া শুনাইতে গেলে আমার প্রাপ্য ১৫ মিনিট সময় তাহাতেই কাটিয়া যাইবে। ঐ সকল সৎ-কর্ম্মের তালিকায় আছে, লাট-সাহেবের বাড়ীর পরিবর্ত্তন, পরিবর্দ্ধন ও সংস্কার কার্য্য হইতে আরম্ভ করিয়া কলিকাতা ও মফঃস্বলের ম্যাজিষ্ট্রেট, মুন্সেফ, সব-রেজিষ্ট্রার, ট্রেজারী, পুলিশের আরামদায়ক ঘরবাড়ী, ডাকবাংলো ও সরকারী বিল্ডিংএ বিদ্যুতের ব্যবস্থা ইত্যাদি। এতকাল যে সরকারের "আলালের ঘরের দুলালগণের" কত দুর্দ্দশাই না গিয়াছে। আজ স্বদেশী অর্থ-সচিবের কল্যাণে সরকারী পুত্রদের বহুকালের দুঃখ-দুর্দ্দশার অবসান হইতে চলিয়াছে। অধিকন্তু কতকগুলি নূতন নূতন পদের সৃষ্টি করিয়া রাজদরবারের শ্বেত-হস্তী পোষণের ফরমাইশ করিয়াছেন। ইহাই হইল বর্ত্তমান বাজেটের বৈশিষ্ট্য।

মাননীয় অর্থ-সচিব মহোদয় বোধ হয় ইহা অস্বীকার করিতে পারিবেন না যে, সরকার বাহাদুর, জমিদারগণ ও খাস-মহাল হইতে রাজকোষে যে টাকা পান তাহার পৌনে ষোল আনাই

বাংলার গোরীসেন কৃষক প্রজার নিকট হইতেই আসিয়া থাকে। এতদ্ব্যতীত লবণ, আবগারী-ষ্ট্যাম্প, কোর্ট-ফি ও ফরেষ্টের ১৫ আনা আয় এই কৃষককুলের মধ্যস্থতায় রাজকোষে সঞ্চিত হইয়া থাকে। পাট-শুল্ক বাবদ বাংলা-গভর্ণমেণ্ট যে মোটা টাকা ভারত-সরকার হইতে পাইয়া থাকেন তৎসমস্তই মূলতঃ হতভাগ্য কৃষকগণের মাথার ঘাম পায়ে ফেলিয়া, শ্রাবণের বারিধারা পিঠে লইয়া ও ভাদ্রের রৌদ্রে পুড়িয়া উৎপন্ন পণ্যের কল্যাণে নহে কি? এখন জিজ্ঞাস্য এই যে, দেশের মেরুদণ্ডস্বরূপ এই হত-সর্ব্বস্ব, দারিদ্র্য-প্রপীড়িত, মহাজন ও জমিদার কর্তৃক শোষিত কৃষককুলের বাঁচিয়া থাকিবার জন্য তিনি বাজেটে কি ব্যবস্থা করিয়াছেন? আমরা জানি, তিনি উত্তরে বলিবেন, ১৯০৮-০৯ সনের "Revised Budget অপেক্ষা বর্ত্তমান বাজেটে প্রায় দেড় লক্ষ টাকা কৃষি-খাতে অধিক ব্যয়-বরাদ্দ করিয়াছেন। আমরা কি অর্থ-সচিব মহোদয়কে জিজ্ঞাসা করিতে পারি, এই যে কৃষি-খাতে আগামী বৎসর যে ১৬ লক্ষ ৬৯ হাজার টাকা ব্যয়-বরাদ্দ করিয়াছেন তাহাতে সাক্ষাৎভাবে কৃষকদের উপকার হইতে পারে এমন কোন টাকা তিনি নির্দ্দিষ্ট করিয়াছেন কি? আমরা তাঁহার বাজেট-বুক তন্ন তন্ন করিয়া দেখিয়াছি। মোটা বেতনের বড় বড় চাকুরিয়া হইতে আরম্ভ করিয়া চুনোপুঁটী পর্য্যন্ত কতকগুলি কর্ম্মচারী পোষণেই কৃষি-খাতের সমস্ত টাকা ব্যয়িত হইয়া যাইতেছে। কতকগুলি কর্ম্মচারী পোষণের নাম যদি কৃষকের উন্নতি হয় তাহা হইলে আর ত কোন ভাবনাই থাকে না। কিন্তু মন্ত্রীমহোদয়গণের চব্য, চোষ্য, লেহ্য, পেয় খাদ্যাহারে কি অনশনে ও অর্দ্ধাশনে কালহরণকারী দীন দরিদ্র কৃষকের ক্ষুন্নিবৃত্তি হইবে? না কৃষি-বিভাগের কর্ম্মচারীদের সুখে তাহারা সুখী হইবে? ঢাকা ফারমে ৪৮ হাজার টাকা ব্যয়ে 'হরিয়ানা-বুল' নামক প্রকাণ্ডকায় ষণ্ড খরিদ করিয়া রাখিলে কি বাংলার কৃষকগণের দুঃখের অবসান ঘটিবে, না তাহাদের কৃষির উন্নতি হইবে? ঐ জাতীয় গো-পালন করিতে যে কৃষকের সারা বৎসরের জীবন-ধারণের গোলার ধান্য সাবাড় করিতে হইবে তাহা কি মাননীয় অর্থ-সচিব কখনও চিন্তা করিয়া দেখিয়াছেন? যে বাংলাদেশে গোচারণের মাঠ বলিতে উহার কোন অস্তিত্ব নাই, বাংলার ৪ জিলায় বর্ষাকালে গরুগুলি খাড়া করিবার জন্য উচ্চ পতিত জমি নাই, গোয়াল-ঘরের ভিটাটী সাগরগর্ভে দ্বীপের ন্যায় ভাসিয়া থাকে, সেইখানে পাঞ্জাব ও সিন্ধু-দেশের গো-জাতির পালন ও প্রজনন ব্যবস্থা কি সম্ভবপর হইবে? সেই হাতীর খোরাক যোগাইবে কে? রাঁচীর ডেয়ারী ফারমে অনুসন্ধান করিয়া জানিতে পারিয়াছি, ঐজাতীয় একটী গরুর জন্য অন্ততঃ দৈনিক ২৲ (দুই) টাকা ব্যয় করিতে না পারিলে উহা রক্ষা করা যায় না। আমাদের কৃষকেরা ঐ শ্রেণীর একটী গরুর এক মাসের খোরাক পাইলে মাসিক ১০৲ হিসাবে সপরিবারে ৬ মাসের খোরাক চালাইয়া লইতে পারিবে। গত বৎসর পরিষদ-গৃহে ময়মনসিংহের একজন জমিদার মহারাজ বলিয়াছিলেন, পাঞ্জাব ও সিন্ধুর প্রকাণ্ড ষণ্ডদ্বারা উৎকৃষ্ট ও বলিষ্ঠ গোশাবক প্রজননের চেষ্টা করিলে বাংলা-দেশের গাভী বংশ ধ্বংস হইবারই আশঙ্কা। যেমন ষণ্ড, তেমনি গাভীর প্রয়োজন। বাঙ্গালী চাষী ৪।৫ শত টাকা মূল্যে ঐরূপ ষাঁড় ও গাভী ক্রয় করিয়া গো-বংশের উন্নতিসাধন করিবে এবং তদ্দ্বারা বাংলাদেশে কৃষিকার্য্য চালাইবার চেষ্টা ইহা কি আকাশ-কুসুম নহে? এই সকল অসম্ভব কল্পনা লইয়াই কি জন-ভাণ্ডারের অর্থ লইয়া ছিনি-মিনি খেলা করা হইতেছে?

বাংলার কয়েকটী জিলায় বহু টাকা ব্যয় করিয়া সরকারী কৃষি-ক্ষেত্র প্রস্তুত করা হইয়াছে ও নূতন কয়েক স্থানে কৃষি-ক্ষেত্র স্থাপনের চেষ্টা করা হইতেছে। কৃষি-কার্য্য সম্বন্ধে যাহাদের সাক্ষাৎভাবে অভিজ্ঞতা আছে এবং সরকারী কৃষি-ক্ষেত্রের খোঁজ-খবর যাহারা রাখেন তাঁহারা সমস্বরে সাক্ষ্য প্রদান করিবেন, ঐ সকল কৃষি-ক্ষেত্র দ্বারা দেশের কৃষকগণের কিছু মাত্র উপকার হইতেছে না এবং হইবারও আশা নাই। ঐ সকল কৃষি-ক্ষেত্রের সার্থকতা কতকগুলি কর্ম্মচারী পোষণ ব্যতীত আর কিছুই নাই এবং ঐ সকল কৃষি-ক্ষেত্র যে সকল লোক নিযুক্ত করা হয় তাহাদের কয়েকখানি কৃষি-সংক্রান্ত ও রাসায়নিক পুস্তক পাঠ ব্যতীত সাক্ষাৎভাবে কৃষি-বিদ্যা সম্বন্ধে কিছুমাত্র অভিজ্ঞতা নাই। প্রচুর অর্থ ব্যয় করিয়াও কৃষি-কার্য্যে তাঁহারা কোনরূপ আদর্শ দৃষ্টান্ত দেখাইতে পারেন নাই। গভর্ণমেণ্টের Agricultural Demonstrator নামে যে সকল জীব

পল্লীগ্রামে আড্ডা পাতিয়া থাকে, তাহাদের বিদ্যাবুদ্ধির পরীক্ষা দিবার যথেষ্ট সুযোগ আমাদের ঘটিয়াছে। আমাদের দেশের কৃষকেরা উপযুক্ত বীজ ও সার পাইলে এত উৎকৃষ্ট ফসল উৎপন্ন করিয়া দেখাইতে পারে যে, তাহাতে কৃষি-বিভাগের প্রদর্শকদের যথেষ্ট শিখিবার থাকিবে। আমার স্ব-জিলা চট্টগ্রাম টাউনের অনতিদূরে কাট্টলী ও খন্দকিয়া গ্রামের কৃষকেরা ১০।১৫ সের ওজনের বাঁধা-কপি, ২।৩ সের ওজনের ফুল-কপি, ১ পোয়া ওজনের বাটা-বেগুণ বা টমাটো ১ সের, ১½ সের ওজনের শালগম ও ওল-কপি সচরাচর উৎপন্ন করিয়া থাকে। ঢাকা ও কুমিল্লার কৃষকগণ আরও উন্নত-ধরণের ফসল উৎপন্ন করিতে পারদর্শী। ময়মনসিংহের ন্যায় উৎকৃষ্ট ও বৃহৎ এবং সুস্বাদু বেগুণ কোথাও উৎপন্ন হয় না, সরকারী কৃষিক্ষেত্রেও না। কিন্তু কৃষকগণের মূল অভাব হইতেছে অর্থের;—গ্রামের, বলদের,—উৎকৃষ্ট বীজ ও সারের। অর্থ-সচিব মহোদয়ের সে দিকে কিন্তু আদৌ দৃষ্টি নাই। তিনি যদি বাজেটের ১৭ লক্ষ টাকার মধ্যে অন্ততঃ ১ লক্ষ টাকা কৃষকদিগকে সাক্ষাৎভাবে সাহায্য দিবার জন্য নির্দ্দিষ্ট করিতেন, আর অবশিষ্ট টাকা ভূত-প্রেতকে খাওয়াইয়া উড়াইয়া দিতেন তাহাতেও আমাদের কোন দুঃখ ছিল না। কিন্তু যতদিন বাংলার মসনদে জমিদার ও ধনিক বণিকদের আসর জমিয়া থাকিবে ততদিন এ আশা সুদূর-পরাহত।

কৃষি ও কৃষকের উন্নতি-সাধন করিতে হইলে, সর্ব্বপ্রথম তাহাদের কৃষি-কার্য্যের প্রধান সম্বল গো-জাতি রক্ষার ব্যবস্থা করিতে হইবে।

(Here the member having reached his time-limit resumed his seat.)

(At this stage the House was adjourned for 15 minutes.)

(*After adjournment.*)

Mr. ISWAR CHANDRA MAL: Mr. Speaker Sir, মাননীয় অর্থ-সচিব মহাশয় বাংলা দেশের সরকারী বাজেট যে ধরণে আমাদের নিকট উপস্থিত করিয়াছেন ও যেভাবে তিনি বাজেট তৈয়ারী করিয়াছেন এবং যেভাবে তাঁহার Explanatory note দিয়াছেন তাহা আমার মত লোকের নিকটও সহজবোধ্য। কিন্তু দুঃখিত যে এবার তাঁহার বক্তৃতার শেষে জাতীয় জয়ধ্বনি "বন্দে-মাতরম" নাই।

আগামী বছরের বাজেটে দুইটি নূতন বিষয় রহিয়াছে। তাহার মধ্যে একটি হইতেছে যে, বর্ত্তমান বৎসর পর্য্যন্ত জেলা-বোর্ড, ইউনিয়ন বোর্ড, করপোরেশন, মিউনিসিপালিটি প্রভৃতি বাংলা দেশের স্বায়ত্তশাসনমূলক প্রতিষ্ঠানগুলির কতকগুলি প্রাদেশিক আইনের মূলে আদায়ী, সেস, জরিমানা, penalty প্রভৃতি বাবদে আদায়ী টাকা তাহাদের নিজস্ব আয় বলিয়া পাইয়া আসিতেছে কিন্তু নূতন ভারত-শাসন আইনের ১৩৬ ধারার ব্যাখ্যার মূলে স্বায়ত্তশাসন প্রতিষ্ঠানগুলি এই সমস্ত আদায়ী টাকাকে তাহাদের নিজস্ব আয় বলিয়া আর দাবী করিতে পারিবে না। উক্ত টাকাসমূহ প্রাদেশিক রাজস্বের অন্তর্ভুক্ত হইবে এবং স্বায়ত্তশাসনমূলক প্রতিষ্ঠানগুলি তাহা প্রাদেশিক রাজস্ব হইতে grant হিসাবে পাইতে থাকিবে। প্রত্যেক জেলা-বোর্ড সেই জেলার অন্তর্গত আদায়ী সমূহ টাকা grant হিসাবে প্রাদেশিক রাজস্ব হইতে পাইবে; কি প্রাদেশিক গভর্ণমেণ্ট ঐ বাবতে আদায়ী সমূহ টাকা জেলা-বোর্ড, মিউনিসিপ্যালিটি, প্রভৃতি স্বায়ত্তশাসনমূলক প্রতিষ্ঠানগুলির মধ্যে বিবেচনা মত বিভাগ করিয়া দিবেন তাহা অর্থ-সচিব মহাশয় কোথাও বলেন নাই। তাঁহার ইহা স্পষ্ট করিয়া বলা উচিত। প্রত্যেক জেলা হইতে আদায়ী টাকার উপর সেই জেলা-বোর্ডের দাবী থাকিবে—এই সম্পর্কে অর্থ-সচিব মহাশয়ের ঘোষণা আশা করি। আমার জেলা মেদিনীপুর, ও ২৪-পরগণার বহু টাকা সেস বাবদে আদায় হইয়া থাকে, সেই অনুসারে টাকা না পাইলে ভয়ানক ক্ষতি হইবে, কারণ এই দুইটী জেলা কৃষি-প্রধান দেশ, তাহারা যাহা দেয়, তাহার প্রতিদানে বিশেষ কিছু পায় না। নমুনা-স্বরূপ আমার গ্রামে খাজনা ও সেস বাবতে সহস্রাধিক টাকা দিলেও মাত্র একটী নিম্ন প্রাথমিক স্কুল মাসে মাত্র ২৷৷০ পাইয়া থাকে।

জাতির কল্যাণ জন্য যে কয়েকটি সমস্যাকে একান্ত জরুরী বা প্রয়োজনীয় বলিয়া অর্থ-সচিব মহাশয় নির্দ্ধারণ করিয়াছেন তার মধ্যে প্রথম হচ্ছে শিক্ষার ব্যবস্থা। বাংলা-দেশ পল্লী-প্রধান। প্রায় এক লক্ষ গ্রাম। তাহার ৫ কোটী লোক নিরক্ষর। আর ঐ এক লক্ষ গ্রামের মধ্যে প্রায় ৩৮ হাজার গ্রামে প্রায় ৬৪ হাজার প্রাথমিক বিদ্যালয়। আর ঐ বিদ্যালয়গুলির জন্য মাননীয় মন্ত্রীমহাশয় বরাদ্দ করিয়াছেন ৩০½ সওয়া তেত্রিশ লক্ষ টাকা। আর কয়েক শত ছাত্রের জন্য দুইটি বিশ্ববিদ্যালয়ের ১২½ লক্ষ এবং কয়েক সহস্র ছাত্রের College Education জন্য ২৫½ লক্ষ টাকা বরাদ্দ করিয়াছেন—তাহার আবার অধিকাংশই কয়েকটি গভর্ণমেণ্ট কলেজে ব্যয় হয়। জাতীয় অর্দ্ধ-কোটি বালক বালিকাকে নিরক্ষর রাখিয়া কয়েক সহস্র ছাত্রের তথাকথিত উচ্চ-শিক্ষার বিলাসের জন্য সরকারী তহবিলের এই অসামান্য অর্থ ব্যয় আমি সঙ্গত মনে করি না। তাই বলিয়া আমি উচ্চ-শিক্ষার বিরুদ্ধে নহি। উচ্চ-শিক্ষার প্রয়োজনীয়তা আছে এবং State উচ্চ-শিক্ষার জন্য অতি অবশ্য ব্যয় করিবেন। কিন্তু সকল-রকম উচ্চ-শিক্ষার আবশ্যক অনাবশ্যকভাবে State খরচ করিবেন, অথচ সারা বাংলায় নিরন্ন, স্বাস্থ্যহীন, বস্ত্র-হীন, জীবন-মৃত কৃষককুলের শিশু-পুত্র-কন্যার কোন নিরক্ষরতা দূরীকরণের কোন ব্যবস্থা হইবে না। আর সেই ব্যবস্থার কথা উঠিলে রাজ-কোষে অর্থ নাই। নিরন্ন কৃষক, রুগ্ন কৃষক, বস্ত্র-হীন কৃষক, ঋণগ্রস্ত কৃষক তোমাকে তোমার শিশু-পুত্র-কন্যার মাত্র ৪ বৎসরের শিক্ষার ব্যবস্থার জন্য তোমাকেই ট্যাক্স দিতে হইবে। ইহাই হইবে তাহার উত্তর। মাত্র ৪ বৎসরে শিশুর নিরক্ষরতা দূর হইবে কি না সেই অপুষ্ট শিশু, ২ মাইল হাটিয়া স্কুলে যাইতে পারিবে কি না, বর্ষাকালে বঙ্গ-পল্লীর সেই কর্দ্দমময় নালাপূর্ণ রাস্তা, বেরাস্তা শিশু অতিক্রম করিতে পারিবে কি না, তাহা আমি বলিতে পারিব না। তবুও তাহাকে ট্যাক্স দিতে হইবে। উচ্চ-শিক্ষার বিলাসের জন্য, সুরম্য প্রাসাদের জন্য, সম্প্রদায় হিসাবে তুলানামূলক ব্যয়ের জন্য State অর্থ ব্যয় করিবে। অথচ লক্ষ লক্ষ বালক বালিকার কেবল নিরক্ষরতা দূরের জন্য, যাহা যে কোন state এর primary duty, আবশ্যক অর্থ ব্যয় করিবে না—ইহারই আমি প্রতিবাদ করি। ৪ বৎসরের প্রাথমিক শিক্ষার ব্যবস্থা করিয়া যে পরিকল্পনা রচিত হইয়াছে তাহাতে নিরক্ষরতা দূর হইবে না। কেবল শিক্ষা-করেরই বোঝা বাড়িবে মাত্র। পুনরায় এই দরিদ্র দেশের কৃষকের উপর ট্যাক্স করিয়া প্রাথমিক শিক্ষকের বেতন ১২৲ হইতে ১৬৲ টাকা করা হইয়াছে, তাহাও কমান উচিত। অনির্দ্দিষ্ট-ভাবে উচ্চ-শিক্ষার জন্য লক্ষ লক্ষ টাকা ব্যয় করিয়া state যে বেকার সৃষ্টি করিতেছে তাদেরই voluntary service গ্রহণ করিতে হইবে। তাহাদেরই remuneration জন্য মাসিক ৬৲ হইতে ১০৲ টাকা পারিশ্রমিক মাসে মাসে দেওয়ার ব্যবস্থা করিতে হইবে। পল্লীর শিক্ষক সেই পল্লীরই অধিবাসী হইবে। তাহা হইলে সামান্য পারিশ্রমিকেই তাহার পক্ষে যথেষ্ট হইবে। শিক্ষাকাল অন্ততঃ পক্ষে ৫ বৎসর করিতে হইবে। একই বইকে অন্ততঃ পক্ষে ১৫ বৎসর শ্রেণীর পাঠ্য-পুস্তক হিসাবে ব্যবহার করিতে হইবে। নতুবা এই দরিদ্র দেশের এই ভীষণ নিরক্ষরতা নিরসনের জন্য সাহায্য করিবে না। কেবল করিবে কর বৃদ্ধি এবং অসন্তোষের সৃষ্টি। তাই আমি শিক্ষা-করের এবং শিক্ষা-আইনের গঠনতন্ত্র অনুযায়ী রাজকর্ম্মচারীবহুল শিক্ষা-বোর্ডের তীব্র প্রতিবাদ করিতেছি। এবং ২৮ লক্ষ মেদিনীপুর বাসীর পক্ষ হইতে গভর্ণমেণ্টকে সাবধান করিতেছি—তাঁরা যেন মেদিনীপুরে জেলায় শিক্ষা-কর প্রবর্ত্তন না করেন। মেদিনীপুর জেলা-বোর্ডই গ্রামে গ্রামে শিক্ষা-মন্দির প্রতিষ্ঠা করিয়া নিরক্ষরতার বিরুদ্ধে অভিযান চালাইবার উপযুক্ত ব্যবস্থা এক সময় করিয়াছিল। একদিন পুরুষ-সিংহ বীর-পুঙ্গব বীরেন্দ্র নাথের অধিনায়কত্বে মেদিনীপুর জিলা-বোর্ডে জাতীয় গঠনমূলক কার্য্য বিরাট গঠনী-শক্তি দেখাইয়াছিল। গভর্ণমেণ্ট সন্ত্রস্ত হইয়াছিল। সেই জন্যই তিনি জেলা-বোর্ড হইতে অপসৃত হইয়াছিলেন। ৫০ বৎসরে শিক্ষা-প্রতিষ্ঠান মেদিনীপুরে যাহা করিতে পারে নাই, কয়েকটি জাতীয় বিদ্যালয় কয়েক বৎসরে তাহা করিয়াছিল। বক্তৃতা, কথকতা, আলোচনা, ছায়াচিত্র, প্ল্যাকার্ড-প্রদর্শন, প্রভৃতি বিভিন্ন উপায়ে কি পূর্ণ বয়স্ক, কি বালক বালিকার সকলের শিক্ষার ব্যবস্থা করিয়াছিল।

তাহাতে দ্বিরক্ষরতা দূর হইয়াছিল, রাজনৈতিক জ্ঞানের প্রসার হইয়াছিল, কর্মী সৃষ্টি হইয়াছিল, আত্ম-সম্মান-জ্ঞান-বিশিষ্ট মানুষ তৈয়ার হইয়াছিল। লোকের মনে আনন্দ আসিয়াছিল। সজীবতা দেখা দিয়াছিল। আজ ১০ বৎসর পরে মেদিনীপুর জেলা-বোর্ডের পুনরায় নির্বাচন চলিতেছে। স্থানীয় কর্তৃপক্ষের প্রবল বাধা সত্ত্বেও মেদিনীপুর জেলা-বোর্ড কংগ্রেসের অধিকারে আসিতে পারে বিশ্বাস করি। যদি তাহা সম্ভব হয়—এবং গভর্ণমেন্ট যদি প্রয়োজনীয় অর্থ সাহায্য করেন, তবে মেদিনীপুর জেলা-বোর্ড বিনা শিক্ষা-করে নিরক্ষরতা নিরসনের দিকে প্রবল চেষ্টা করিবে। তাই আমি মেদিনীপুরে শিক্ষা-কর প্রবর্তন না করিবার জন্যই গভর্ণমেন্টকে অনুরোধ করিতেছি। যদি শিক্ষা-কর প্রবর্তিত হয়, তবে মেদিনীপুরবাসী যথাসাধ্য উহার বিরুদ্ধে চেষ্টা করিবে।

অর্থ-সচিব মহাশয়, তাঁহার বাজেট বক্তৃতায় (পরিশিষ্ট ৩) বলিয়াছেন বাংলাদেশে ৬ হইতে ৯ বৎসর বয়স পর্যন্ত বালক বালিকার সংখ্যা ৫৩ লক্ষ। বর্তমান প্রাথমিক শিক্ষার জন্য সরকারী ও জেলা-বোর্ড সাহায্য ৯০ লক্ষ টাকা। তিনি আরও বলিয়াছেন প্রতি ছাত্রের জন্য বাৎসরিক ১২৲ টাকা হিসাবে খরচ হইবে। আমার মতে বাৎসরিক ৪৲ টাকা হিসাবে খরচ করিলে দরিদ্র দেশে চলিতে পারে। প্রতি স্কুলে ৯০ জন ছাত্র ও তিন জন শিক্ষক বাবতে বাৎসরিক ৩৬০৲ টাকা ব্যয় করিলে চলিবে। স্কুল-গৃহ ও সরঞ্জাম দেশের লোক করিয়া দিবে।

Maulvi ABUL HASHIM: Sir, I am sorry I have none of my friend Mr. Abdul Bari's suggestive and constructive advice to give to the Hon'ble the Finance Minister. As to the Blue Book, I must confess that having kept myself extremely busy with the Damodar Canal affairs, I got hardly any time to admire the figures in it. In this world of ours, nothing is absolutely good or absolutely bad; so it is with our budget. The budget, as it is, does not deserve wholesale condemnation nor does it deserve unqualified praise. We human beings have a very peculiar love for our own ideas and likes and dislikes. I find in the budget some of my own ideas and in this sense I feel this time a genuine pleasure in reading it and congratulate the Hon'ble the Finance Minister for his budget for 1939-40. I am one of those who believe that with a limited revenue of Rs. 13 crores nothing appreciable can be done for this province. I am extremely glad to find that, very inadequate though, some steps have been taken to screw up the revenue of Bengal. I am glad that the Hon'ble the Finance Minister has made an official recognition of the fact that possession of wealth carries with it a social obligation. To force people to discharge this social obligation can be done only by means of taxation. I am quite conscious that the masses of Bengal have been taxed already beyond their paying capacity and there is seldom any margin there for raising fresh revenues. By this I do not however mean to condemn taxation generally. I know that there is a vast space left for us to raise a considerable revenue from those who are able to pay. The Hon'ble the Finance Minister proposes to raise Rs. 12 lakhs more by taxation and proposes to introduce some more Finance Bills in the monsoon session. I consider this Rs. 12 lakhs very insufficient and inadequate in comparison to our needs. Taxation, in my opinion, is not a curse in itself. Our grievance is

that we do not generally get the full value of the money we pay. If we get in some form or other the full value of the money we pay, taxation would become a blessing. The question of taxation is inseparable from the question of making attempts to increase the paying capacity of our people. I am glad that the Hon'ble the Finance Minister realises the utility of organising the latent man-power of Bengal. I think he means to give more work to them and in my opinion cottage industry and animal husbandry are the only two means by which we can give them more work and more money. With regard to these two things I think it is an essential perquisite that we must give them good marketing facilities. Poultry is now one of my many latest hobbies and I am naturally glad that the Finance Minister has made some provision for that. Bengal has made a beginning in export trade in eggs and if proper marketing facilities are given I have no doubt that in the near future Bengal will find an honourable place in the export market of eggs. I envy China who now control the egg trade of the world.

Now, Sir, the next thing in our programme of nation-building is the question of giving more help and more agricultural facilities to our people. These two things can be served by one single means—I mean the over-flow irrigation, so far as West Bengal is concerned, as suggested by Sir William Wilcocks By dealing with contradictory and incongruous demands the Hon'ble the Finance Minister has been pleased to make certain remarks in this respect. I have a very shrewd suspicion that he referred to the Burdwan Damodar Canal agitation. We are extremely sorry that no attempt is still being made to appreciate our case adequately and with a proper attitude. Our grievance is that we have been paying a very high revenue since the time of the great Moghul Akbar. There was a time when Burdwan was considered to be one of the richest parts of the province of Bengal. Those conditions have long disappeared but we are still continuing to pay this revenue.

The Hon'ble Khwaja Sir Nazimuddin, while replying to Mrs. Hemaprova Mazumdar during the discussion on the Damodar Canal Adjournment Motion, said that she as a mother ought to know that sometimes children needed harsh dealings. Sir Nazimuddin is now here and I can hardly resist the temptation of giving him a mild retort. In view of the fact that Burdwan has been contributing the largest revenue since time immemorial and thus feeding the entire province, Sir Nazimuddin in taking that attitude and those who feel like him, behave like ungrateful young children of an old and invalid father. Burdwan has been paying and is still paying the greatest amount of revenue in Bengal. I can very legitimately claim that either the revenue of the district should be proportionately reduced or by way of compensation be exempted from the imposition of all sorts of levy. With these words I conclude my remarks and finally congratulate the Hon'ble the Finance Minister for what he has done.

Maulvi AZHAR ALI: In discussing the budget presented by the Hon'ble the Finance Minister for the current year I will say only a few words and touch upon a few points. The budget shows that bigger amounts have been provided for civil works, that is, for erecting buildings, etc. I may say in this connection that a sum of Rs. 75,000 has been allotted for the construction of witness' sheds and witness' quarters. We do not see the urgent necessity of erecting witness' sheds. We find from that budget that under "Stamps" and "Court-fees" receipts are falling from day to day and this shows that litigation is not so much rampant in the province as it was before, and in consequence the number of witnesses which was large before has dwindled; so I do not see why any stress should be given to construct witness' sheds for the litigants. Moreover, other buildings are being constructed the necessity of which are not so urgent as the necessity of the nation-building departments, I mean the Agriculture and Industries Departments. Although the Hon'ble the Finance Minister has set apart a larger sum of money than in previous years for the Agriculture and Industries Department, I regret to find that it is being spent more on the appointment of highly paid officers of the department than on any constructive and better schemes.

With regard to irrigation, I may say that the Irrigation Department of the Government is practically confined to West Bengal. Last year in the budget speech of the Hon'ble the Finance Minister we found that North and Central Bengal are going to be depopulated for want of better irrigation, better communication and drainage.

Sir, I belong to the Pabna district. I would like to point out that this district has been pressing the Government for a very long time for the resuscitation of some of the dying rivers and for making some canals and waterways for the improvement of the district. But two years of the present Government have elapsed, and we do not find that any constructive scheme or plan has been taken up by the Government. This district and part of Bogra and Faridpur are being attacked by early flood every year and the crops, especially *aus* and jute crops are being destroyed. The reason for this as asserted by some of the experts is the silting up of the rivers, but the main cause is that water is not easily drained out when there is heavy rain on the up-land of Assam hills. Certain schemes were prepared by the District Board of Pabna for the construction of some sluice gates at one of the two main channels which drain the vast *bil* area of the district, viz., Bada, Jola, and Chitna. I put some questions last year and year before on this subject and in my budget speech last year I pointed out this matter to the Hon'ble Minister for taking measures to remedy the evil at the earliest opportunity, but I find that nothing has been done in this direction.

Regarding communication, the district of Pabna is the worst sufferer. It has got neither any railway communication nor any good roads. The only road is the Pabna-Ishurdi Road which is only 18 miles long. The major portion of the district remains eastward from the headquarters. The district extends from 30 to 40 miles towards the east and about 20 to 30 miles towards the south-east, and those portions are the most populous parts of the district, but they have got no communication to reach the headquarters. The Hon'ble Minister during his last visit to Pabna was waited upon by some of the people of the district with a request for the construction of railways or of roads from Pabna to Bera. I doubt whether the Hon'ble the Minister in charge of Communications has considered the matter seriously as I do not find any sign of it in the budget. I would draw the attention of the Hon'ble the Minister in charge to take up this measure next year.

Regarding the Public Health, I would submit that Rs. 2 lakhs has been allotted for the Sadar Hospitals. At the same time the Hon'ble Minister has pointed out that for want of schemes even that amount could not be spent. Here also I may point out that in my own district there is a scheme ready for the improvement of the Sadar Hospital building, reconstruction of which is urgently necessary as the Executive Engineer has pointed out that it may collapse during incessant heavy rain. The plan and estimate of it were submitted to Government before April last, but I do not find any provision for it in the budget.

(Here the member having reached his time-limit resumed his seat.)

Mr. PATIRAM ROY: মাননীয় সভাপতি মহাশয়, বাংলার লক্ষ লক্ষ নর-নারীর সুখ, দুঃখ, উন্নতি, অবনতির সঙ্গে বাংলার ভাগ্য-বিধাতা যে হিসাব নিকাশের বিবরণ উপস্থিত কোরেছেন সেটাকে মামুলি-ধরণের ছাড়া আর কিছুই বলা যায় না। যে বাংলা-দেশের শত-করা ৯০ জন লোক কৃষি-কার্য্য-দ্বারা জীবিকা নির্ব্বাহ করে, সেই দেশের কৃষকদের জন্য এ-বাজেটে বিশেষ কিছু বন্দোবস্ত করা হয় নাই। বাংলা-দেশের চাষের অবস্থা যদি একবার উপলব্ধি করা যায় তাহলে দেখা যায়, চাষের যে সমস্ত প্রতিবন্ধক আছে, যার জন্য চাষের সত্য সত্যই উন্নতি হচ্ছে না, যার জন্য বাংলার ভূমিতে যে পরিমাণ ফসল উৎপন্ন হতে পারে তা কিছুই হচ্ছে না, সেই অবস্থার প্রতিকারের জন্য কিছুই করা হয় নাই।

বাংলা নদী-মাতৃক দেশ। নদীর উপর বাংলার কৃষি অনেকটাই নির্ভর করে। কিন্তু আজ কালের কুটিল চক্রে, অথবা কতকগুলি লোকের স্বার্থ-সিদ্ধির জন্য বাংলার নদীগুলি আজ মোরতে বোসেছে। সেই জন্য বাংলায় আজ জল-নিকাশের অভাব। বাংলার চাষী আকাশের পানে তাকিয়ে থাকে জলের জন্য। জলের অভাবে উপযুক্ত সময়ে ফসল তৈরীর চেষ্টা তারা কোরতে পারে না। প্রত্যেক বিঘায় ২৲ টাকা কি ৪৲ টাকা খাজনা,—তা দেখবার আগে দেখা উচিত, যে ফসল উৎপন্ন হয় তার মূল্য ১০৲ টাকা কি ২০৲ টাকা। যদি চাষী বেশী ফসল পায় তাহলে এক টাকার জায়গায় দেড় টাকা খাজনা দিতে, আমার মনে হয়, চাষীর বিশেষ কিছু কষ্ট হয় না। কিন্তু এই যে হিসাব-নিকাশ এবার দেখানো হয়েছে কৃষি-খাতে যে ১৬,৬৯,০০০ টাকা ব্যয় করা হবে

তার ভিতর কৃষকের জমিতে যাতে বেশী ফসল উৎপন্ন হবে তার ব্যবস্থার বিশেষ কিছু নাই। বাংলা-দেশ তার নদীগুলিদ্বারা প্রচুর ফসল উৎপন্ন কোরতে পারে, সুতরাং আজ কৃষকদের দুরবস্থা প্রতিকারের যে বাধা তার মধ্যে আমার মনে হয় সব-চেয়ে বড় বাধা হচ্ছে জল-নিকাশ এবং সেচের অভাব। অথচ বাজেট পোড়লে দেখা যায় যে যত রকমের ব্যয়ের demand করা হয়েছে তার মধ্যে সেচের জন্য ব্যবস্থা করা হয়েছে সব চেয়ে কম। এই যে গত বন্যা, যে বন্যার দরুন বাংলা গভর্ণমেণ্ট লক্ষ লক্ষ টাকা ব্যয় কোরতে পেরেছেন, পূর্ব্ব হ'তে যদি এই বন্যার জল নিকাশের উপায় থাকতো, নদীর জল যদি উপ্‌চে উঠ্‌তে না পারতো বাধা থাকার জন্য তাহলে বাংলায় চাষের আজ যে দুর্গতি দেখ্‌ছি সেটা বোধ হয় দেখ্‌তে হতো না। বন্যার জল যদিও বা ক্ষেতে প্রবেশ ক'রতো, ফসল এমনভাবে নষ্ট কোরতে পারতো না। ফসল নষ্ট হয়ে লোকের যখন দুর্গতি হয় তখন তারা সাহায্য কোরতে পারেন কিন্তু যাতে একেবারেই তাদের দুর্গতি না হয় তার জন্য চেষ্টা কোরতে সব সময় কাতর। তাই আমার মনে হয় বাংলার মরা নদীগুলির যদি সংস্কার করা যায় তাহলে যেমন জল-নিকাশ হোতে পারে তেমনই চাষেরও সাহায্য হতে পারে। তাহলে বাংলার লক্ষ লক্ষ চাষী, যারা দিনান্তে একবার খেতে পায় না, তারা জমিতে প্রচুর ফসল উৎপন্ন কোরে সুখে জীবিকা নির্ব্বাহ কোরতে পারে। তার পর আমাদের এই যে আদর্শ কৃষি-ক্ষেত্র কতকগুলি করা হয় এবং বড় বড় ষাঁড় যে রাখা হয়,—এ-সব খালি ব্যবসাদারের ব্যবসাদারী বুদ্ধি ছাড়া আর কিছুই নয়। এটা যেন show case এ পুরে সাজিয়ে রাখা হয়েছে দেখাবার জন্য। সত্য সত্য যাদের জন্য এই আদর্শ কৃষি-ক্ষেত্র সেই সব চাষীদের মধ্যে এর সংবাদ রাখে খুব কম লোক। তাছাড়া বাজেটে দেখা যায় কতকগুলি union এ মাত্র Union farm করা হচ্ছে। জানি না কি-ভাবে এই কাজ করা হচ্ছে, শুধু কাগজে-কলমে অথবা প্রকৃত আদর্শ কৃষি-ক্ষেত্রে—

(Here the member having reached his time-limit resumed his seat.)

Mr. JOGENDRA NATH MANDAL: Mr. Speaker, Sir, in fishing for a budget in the pool of bottomless deficits the financial wizard of Bengal has neglected the most obvious expedient of throwing wider the net of taxation upon the possessing classes, both feudal and bourgeoisie. That the Hon'ble the Finance Minister has constituted himself the most assiduous defender of the *status quo* has not come upon me as a surprise, but he should have been frank enough and outspoken enough in defending the interests of the class of expropriators. For exploitation, veiled by pious platitudes and political illusions, I, for one, wanted, in order to rouse the slumbering masses of the country,—naked, shameless, direct and brutal exploitation.

The Hon'ble the Finance Minister has complained of the depleted finance in the matter of nation-building departments, but he has found an ample provision for an increased expenditure so far as the valiant myrmidons of law and order are concerned. Notwithstanding the release of political prisoners and cessation of political unrest in the country, the rising budgetary estimate for the police force is to me absolutely unaccountable. Is it calculated to protect the life and limbs of the individual Ministers against the rising tide of public opinion, or is it deliberately desired to terrorise the members of the Opposition who are unable to see eye to eye the blessed members of the happy family? Or is it intended to avert the steps of revolution

and smother discontent in the land as it has been candidly admitted by the Finance Minister himself? Evidently with the aid of the police force the Huq Ministry is preparing for a peaceful process of evolution rather than revolution. But mass discontent has never been suppressed by police methods. Even the multitudinous seas will fail to wash away the fire of disaffection among the masses. The Ministry is trying to achieve the impossible.

We on this side of the House declare with one accord that the Hon'ble the Finance Minister has failed to grapple with the problems of Agriculture and Rural Development, of national and industrial reconstruction, of irrigation and public utility. But instead money is being squandered on useless and costly buildings. If adequate provisions were made for the upliftment of the backward classes, for the national development, for the introduction of free primary education, I for one would not have grudged even the capital grant of Rs. 1¼ lakhs to the educational institutions belonging to the biggest landed magnate of Bengal. I would not have objected to the grant of 1 lakh of rupees and a half to the St. Xavier's College—the veritable den of reaction. Has the institution been rewarded for prompt disciplinary actions against some relations of the Leader of the Opposition? I would have even excused this if the Ministry found room in the budget for ameliorating the condition of the masses. The grant of 1 lakh for the purpose of constructing another Muslim Hall in the constituency of the Hon'ble Nawab Bahadur of Dacca I could have pardoned, if they had pursued beneficial measures elsewhere.

Sir, the Government, as usual, have rationed the Scheduled Castes with parsimonious hands and have completely thrown out the recommendations of the Committee appointed for the education of the Scheduled Castes. There is no additional grant for their education for the year under review. The grant of 5 lakhs that was made last year has been carried forward and no constructive scheme of expenditure is yet forthcoming. Moreover, it is astounding that the salaries of the Special Officer and his staff are to be met out of this fund. Two separate college hostels for the Scheduled Castes—one in the native district of the Hon'ble Mr. A. K. Fazlul Huq and the other in the homeland of the Special Officer have been proposed to be constructed. I protest—and protest most emphatically—against these separatist tendencies promoted by the Ministry and acquiesced in by the Hindu Ministers. I am opposed to this vivisection of the Hindu community which will promote the invidious distinction between the Scheduled Castes and the Caste Hindus instead of placing them on the footing of complete equality of treatment. This is permissible, nay indispensable and necessary, if and when the Caste Hindu students refuse to live jointly with those of the Scheduled Castes.

We on this side of the House, if the Huq Ministry will surrender the reins of power in the hands of the Opposition, are perfectly prepared to balance the budget and find adequate resources for national regeneration and reconstruction. We can demonstrate it to the country at large. Let the Ministers, if they have courage enough, accept our challenge.

It is absolutely futile to offer constructive suggestions to a body of obtuse and hidebound Ministers. Their obstinacy is unconquerable. They are incapable of adopting bold measures which may antagonise vested interests. There is enough money lying on the road, and they can easily pick it up without filching from the poor tax-payer.

A progressive taxation on agricultural income exceeding 2,000 rupees, a heavy imposition of death duties on big estates or inheritance taxes on a progressive scale, a more extended and wider application of super-tax—all these would have gone a long way towards remedying the pitiable state of deficits that the Budget has presented.

The heavy itinerary of the Ministry does not include the remotest countryside. I would ask the Hon'ble the Chief Minister to pay a visit to his native district stricken with ever-recurrent damages by flood, notably the northern area of the district. Absence of embankments and proper system of drainage has rendered the people of the *bil* area of Satla homeless and destitute. The problem of water-hyacinth of this district is insolvable without State intervention. But the Ministry has inaugurated a regime of inglorious inaction, of ignominous failure, of signal incompetence, of blatant and short-sighted policy. The ministry should perish—it does not deserve to exist for a moment.

Mr. A. M. A. ZAMAN : Mr. Speaker, Sir, বর্তমান বাজেটের discussion এ অনেক রকম কথা শুনতে পাচ্ছি। এক-দিকে শুনছি যে এটা নেহাৎ মন্দ হয়েছে আর এক-দিক থেকে শুনছি যে খুব ভালোই হয়েছে। সত্যকার হিসাবে এটা ভালোই হয়েছে। মন্দ যারা বোলছে আমার মনে হয় তারা এটাকে ঠিকমত পড়েন নাই, কিম্বা সে সম্বন্ধে কিছু ভাবেন নাই। কারণ প্রথমেই দেখতে হবে—এ বাজেট কার হাত দিয়ে এসেছে। যাঁরা বাজেটকে নিন্দা কোরছেন তারা এই point টাই লক্ষ্য করেন নাই। এই বাজেট যদি আজকে কোন কৃষক শ্রমিক কিম্বা তাদের সত্যিকারের দরদী তাদের হাত দিয়ে আসতো তাহলে বাজেটের রং বোদ্লে যেতো। আজকে যার হাত দিয়ে বাজেট এসেছে তিনি কে, কোন ঘর থেকে এসেছেন। তিনি যদি কৃষক-শ্রমিক ও জনসাধারণের স্বার্থের দিক চেয়ে বাজেট তৈরী কোরতেন, তাহলে তিনি আজ যে বড়-লোক হয়ে বড়-লোকের সমাজে রয়েছেন, তারা হয়তো কানে ধোরে গদি থেকে নামিয়ে দিতো। যাঁদের জোরে গদিতে বোসে আছেন, যাদের সমাজে বসেন, খাওয়া-দাওয়া করেন, এবং রাত-দিন যাদের সঙ্গে চলেন তাদের স্বার্থের বিরুদ্ধে অন্যের জন্য যে কিছু কোরবেন সেটা হয় না। মিঃ সরকার সাহেব শ্রমিক নন, কৃষক নন কিম্বা গ্রামে গিয়েও দেখেন না যে শীতের দিনে ভোর বেলায় লাঙ্গল নিয়ে মাঠে যেতে কি রকম কষ্ট হয়; এবং ভিটে মাটি যাদের খাজনার দায়ে নিলেম হয়ে যায় তাদের যে কি অবস্থা তা তিনি জানেন না। তাদের দুঃখ কষ্ট

উপলব্ধি করবার ক্ষমতা তাঁর এবং তার শ্রেণীর লোকের থাকতে পারে না। অতএব এ বাজেটে কৃষক আর শ্রমিকদের কষ্ট-আঘবের কথা উঠতেই পারে না। এ বাজেট হয়েছে বড় লোকদের জন্য, এবং তাদের জন্য আর কি কি করা যেতে পারে আগামী বৎসরে ঠিক করা হবে। তিনি পূর্ব্ব বাজেটে বোলেছিলেন যে next year আরো ভালো কোরবেন। ভালো কোরতে হলে সাধারণতঃ যেতে হয় নীচের দিকে, কিন্তু তিনি চলেছেন উপরের দিকে রাজা-মহারাজাদের দিকে। তার প্রমাণ Sir George Campbell বোলেছেন—এ-রকম বাজেট আর হয় না। বর্দ্ধমানের মহারাজকুমার বোলেছেন "মিঃ সরকার বেশ বাজেট এনেছেন।" Next year এঁ এদের উপরে যারা আছেন তারা বোলবেন সরকার ঠিক বাজেট কোরেছেন। কাজেই কৃষক-শ্রমিকের কথা বাজেট তৈরীর সময় এঁরা ভাবতেই পারেন না। আমি শুধু তাদের একটা কথা বোলতে চাই, বাজেটের নিন্দা করে মন্ত্রীদল হইতে যারা নাকি বোলছেন যে কৃষক আর শ্রমিকদের জন্য এ-বাজেট হয় নাই। এ-কথা কি তারা সত্য কোরেই বোলছেন না ভূতের মুখে রাম নামের মতন তাঁদের মুখ থেকে কথাটা শোনা যাচ্ছে!

আমি আর একটা কথা বোলতে চাই, বলা হচ্ছে যে পুলিশের ব্যয় বাজেটে বেশী ধরা হয়েছে। সেটা না হলে কি কোরে চোলবে। বাইরে থেকে যত সব বুভুক্ষের দল যে চিৎকার কোরছে—খেতে দাও, পোরতে দাও, তাদের যদি লাঠি দিয়ে না তাড়ানো যায় তাহলে কি কোরে চোলবে। যাদের রুটি দিতে পারে না, জল দিতে পারে না, তাদের লাঠিও যদি দিতে না পারে তাহলে দিবে কি? গায়ের জোরে তো টিকে থাকা চাই। অতএব পুলিশের জন্য ভালো ঘর চাই, পুলিশের জন্য ব্যয়-বৃদ্ধির দরকার হয়। কিন্তু শ্রমিক আর কৃষকদের বাঁচবার জন্য কি কোরেছেন? বন্যার সময় তাদের টাকা দিয়ে রক্ষা কোরছেন। সে কেমন? যেমন বড় বড় জমিদার কৃষকদের সর্ব্বনাশ করেন, তার পর যখন তাদের মরবার মতন অবস্থা হয় তখন এক মুঠো কোরে চাল দেয়, তখন কৃষক ধন্য হয় যে বড় লোকেরা দান কোরেছেন। তেমনি গভর্ণমেণ্ট কৃষকদের মোরবার মুখে ফেলে কিছু ভিক্ষা দেয়, আর তারা মনে করে গভর্ণমেণ্ট খুব ভালো। মন্ত্রীরা দেশময় ছুটা-ছুটি কোরে কি কোরছেন? দেশ যে ক্রমশঃ সর্ব্বনাশের পথে যাচ্ছে, তার জন্য কি করা হচ্ছে? যদি এই গভর্ণমেণ্ট গরীবদের গভর্ণমেণ্ট হতো, গরীবদের মন্ত্রীত্ব হতো, তাহলে যে কৃষক-কুলের অস্তিত্বের উপর,—যাদের ভোটের উপর দাঁড়িয়ে তাঁরা মন্ত্রীত্ব কোরছেন, তাদের উপকার কি কোরে হবে তারা সেই ভাবনাই প্রথমেই কোরতেন। প্রত্যেক বছরেই যে বন্যা বেড়ে যাচ্ছে, সে বন্যা কি কোরে বন্ধ করা যায় সে সমস্ত বন্দোবস্ত কোরতে হলে নিজেদের একটু কষ্ট কোরতে হয়।

আর একটা কথা আমাদের আজাদ সাহেব সম্বন্ধে (laughter) হাঁ আমরা "আজাদ" পত্রিকাকে আজাদ সাহেবই বলি। ৩০ হাজার টাকা দেওয়া হচ্ছে, তার কারণ তিনি আমাদের মুসলমানভক্ত। সেই জন্য দুটো একটা কথা না বোলে পারছিনে। আমিও কলকাতায় বহুদিন হলো এসেছি। গরীবের ছেলে খেটে খাই। যখন কলকাতায় হিন্দু-মুসলমানে riot হয়েছিলো তখন "আজাদ" বোলে কোন paper ছিলো না। "মোহাম্মদী" ছিলো। আমরা তখন বেয়ে বলেছিলাম—মৌলবী সাহেব গেল বুঝি মুসলমান সব—একখানা কাগজ না বার কোরলে আর তো চোলছে না। অনেক অনুরোধ উপরোধের ফলে তিনি যে paper একখানা বার কোরেছিলেন সে তিনি third issue বার কোরেই বন্ধ কোরেছিলেন—এবং বললেন যে আমার বন্ধুবান্ধবেরা খারাপ বোলবে—আমি আর এটা বার কোরব না। তার পরেই "ছোলতানের" জন্ম হয়। মৌলানা সাহেব দেশের মুক্তি চাইল। গভর্ণমেণ্টের দেয়া গরীবের টাকার ভিক্ষা কিছুতেই গ্রহণ করিতেন না। তার পর তার খাঁ সাহেবের নামের আগে একটা সম্মান-সূচক মৌলানা শব্দ ব্যবহৃত হয় তার উৎপত্তি হয়েছিল এই রকম কংগ্রেস আর সোসালিষ্টদের হাতে। কংগ্রেসের লোক আর সোসালিষ্টদের তিনি নাম পর্য্যন্ত শুনতে পারেন না। কিন্তু ঐ নামের আগে যে তাদের দেওয়া মৌলানা টাইটেলটা লেখেন তার মোহ আজও ছাড়তে পারেন না। যদি সত্যকারের দেশের জন্য——

(The member having reached his time-limit resumed his seat.)

Mr. SPEAKER: There are so many speakers whose names have been put up before me that if the group to my right agree to shorten the period of speeches, I shall adjust the time accordingly.

Mr. ABDUR RASCHID MAHMOOD: Mr. Speaker, Sir, the Hon'ble the Finance Minister has presented his annual budget with a deficit of about Rs. 87 lakhs. With the growing plumpness of the Ministry it is a miracle that the figure is not higher. No constructive schemes for industrialisation or for the removal of the dire poverty and unemployment of the overwhelming majority of the people of the province, yet there is the increment in taxation from year to year. These taxes are mostly for the maintenance of a top-heavy administration. This shows the character of the reforms and of the self-government that some people fancy may come through a series of such reforms. Betting on dog racing is properly taxed. But there is also a proposal to tax professions, trades, employments and callings. Though people who do not pay income-taxes are exempted, there is absolutely no justification for pampering the landed aristocracy and big business magnates at the cost of the people whose income is, say, Rs. 2,000 a year. With improvement in resources, the Hon'ble the Finance Minister holds out the hope, the Ministry will work miracles. Yes, if their outlook reaches anywhere beyond frivolous taxes, it is the various institutions of Calcutta and its suburbs for which princely sums have been provided in the budget, neglecting the legitimate claims of the illiterate masses of the rest of Bengal, especially North Bengal whose claims have been totally neglected, and the Hon'ble Ministers from North Bengal are to blame for it. These two Ministers, I am sure, have completely failed in their duties in advocating the cause of North Bengal when the budget was framed. The time will come when they will have to pay heavy penalty for this in the near future.

The Hon'ble the Finance Minister is happy that with the release of the detenus a saving of Rs. 22 lakhs could be made. But among the reasons which make larger savings impracticable at the moment are: the existence of an illiterate and uninformed labour force in the province and the release of political prisoners on a large scale which are providing a combination for the preaching of Communism. If that be such a calamity, why, instead of helping the disintegration of the nation by the maintenance of a huge number of watchers, spies, and informers, could not the Hon'ble the Finance Minister make the education side of his budget more substantial? He might make progress towards compulsory literacy as well as introduce a system of adult education. That might have cut the ground under the feet of the preacher of Communism. Why complain while the means is at

the disposal of the Hon'ble the Finance Minister and his colleagues? Do your best both ways and see if you can obstruct the onrush of ideas——

(At this stage the member having reached his time-limit resumed his seat.)

Point of Privilege.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Mr. Speaker, Sir, may I rise on a point of privilege?

Mr. SPEAKER: Yes, you can.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: I have been informed that our esteemed colleague Mr. Sibnath Banerjee has been appearing for the last few days before the Subdivisional Officer of Howrah in connection with a certain case against him. He has been insistently requesting the Subdivisional Officer to finish the case before 3 p.m. so that he might attend the Assembly session at 4-45 p.m. But in spite of repeated requests the Subdivisional Officer is not considering his prayer.

Mr. SPEAKER: Dr. Sanyal, if you give me a statement of facts of the case, I will see what I can do in the matter.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Thank you, Sir.

Khan Bahadur Maulvi MAHTABUDDIN AHMED: Mr. Speaker, Sir, the budget under discussion is the third since the Provincial Autonomy was introduced, and it was naturally expected to be a decided improvement upon its two predecessors. Instead of that we find that it has failed to satisfy our natural expectations, though it does not, on the other hand, deserve wholesale condemnation.

The proposed expenditure exceeds the proposed receipts and two new taxes are proposed to be imposed. And this it not all. It is in contemplation to bring in further taxation proposals in the monsoon session of the Assembly. Above all these, a loan of a crore of rupees is going to be incurred. We do not know where Provincial Autonomy will land us in, if taxes are imposed in quick succession like this. I must, however, confess that some of the nation-building subject have received due attention.

Of the amounts proposed to be spent on the nation-building subjects, education under the heads "collegiate" and "secondary" has been allotted what may be called its adequate share for which the

Hon'ble the Finance Minister is to be congratulated. But I am constrained to express my disappointment at the absence of any indication of provision for the introduction of free and compulsory primary education which is the crying need of the country and persistently demanded and must be delayed no longer.

The total cost of free primary education is estimated to be in the vicinity of Rs. 4½ crores. To meet this expenditure, a sum of one crore and 20 lakhs of rupees is likely to be realised from the education cess as contemplated in the Primary Education Act. So, a sum of Rs. 3 crores, in round figures, will have to be found from other sources in order to give full effect to the scheme of free and compulsory primary education. And if the Primary Education Act is so amended as to give relief to the poor cultivators, more than Rs. 3 crores will have to be found. The Hon'ble the Finance Minister proposes to turn to the Central Government for half of this sum and the other half of this huge amount will have to be found in the province and probably new sources of taxation will have to be tapped. If so, why not conserve the receipts from the proposed two new taxes for the gradual building up of a fund for free primary education?

Now about the two proposed new taxes. Betting on dog racing is going to be taxed. I fail to understand why betting on horse racing is not considered as a fit object of taxation.

Again, the flat tax of Rs. 30 per annum on profession, trade, etc., seems to be iniquitous. This flat tax would weigh heavily on the lower middle class paying income-tax. If such a tax is to be levied at all, a graduated tax would be more equitable.

The provision of additional sums for scholarships, stipends and free studentships in educational institutions for giving assistance to a wider circle of students is much appreciated and the Hon'ble the Finance Minister is to be congratulated for this.

Provision of adequate funds for certain beneficial measures under Public Health has been made, but the discontinuance of the grant for rural dispensaries has been injudicious. When in the last year's budget ten thousand rupees was provided for union board dispensaries, it was thought that though this amount in itself was a drop in the ocean, the continuance of the grant for some years would gradually give the rural population the much needed medical help.

I conclude my observations with the remark that the budget for the ensuing year has not been an all-round satisfactory one.

Maulvi MUHAMMAD ISRAIL: Mr. Speaker, Sir, our Finance Minister concluded his speech on the budget as follows: "The present conditions in our province may reasonably be described as a state of emergency, in which the ordinary rules of party government should

remain in abeyance till the crisis is over". So, let us see how far he himself has followed the dictum which he has so forcefully propounded. But a cursory glance at the budget leaves no doubt in the mind of any one that he has lamentably failed there, because, according to his own admission in page 19 of his speech, we find that the largest increase is under Civil Works, or rather the criminal waste department, as it is commonly called, due to an extensive programme of building projects belonging to various departments of Government. May I ask the Hon'ble the Finance Minister in all seriousness whether these building projects ought not to have been kept in abeyance till the crisis spoken of by him was over?

The budget estimates under Civil Works is 159 lakhs while the revised of 1938-39 is over 135 lakhs. Of this amount Rs. 42,08,000 will be spent on new buildings, the major share of which relates to Police buildings, which is Rs. 8,60,171.

We next come to General Administration, whose share is Rs. 7,56,443. Then comes Administration of Justice, for which a sum of Rs. 6,15,046 has been provided, and all the nation-building departments figure much lower in the list. Even Education, of which so much has been spoken in the budget comes next to the heads mentioned above.

Repairs alone will take up Rs. 46,20,000. I do not know what sort of repairs the Government mean and after how many years these repair works are being taken up? The Hon'ble the Finance Minister tries to justify his building projects in the following way: "What is more, in many cases the erection of buildings will be remunerative in the sense of saving money now expended on rents.". But the huge expense on repairs shown in this year's budget will go to prove that the erection of buildings, instead of being a paying proposition, will be a losing concern.

A sum of Rs. 13,89,000 has been provided for original works on Communications out of 159 lakhs. May I ask the Hon'ble the Finance Minister whether these are indications of a state of emergency in our province? So, may I request the Hon'ble the Finance Minister to see that the building projects contemplated in his budget stand over till the crisis is over?

Next I turn to Primary Education. Though this is the birthright of all nations, yet only Rs. 5 lakhs has been sanctioned for it, and the Government are not ready with any scheme, even though two years have elapsed during which period everyone expected that they would be able to prepare a scheme. Taxation or no taxation, the problem cannot wait. Even the areas where primary education cess has been imposed are not getting their due share from the provincial revenues.

More than Rs. 10 lakhs appear to have been provided for rural water-supply but for want of expedition in the Secretariat and also of those of the local officers this money could not also be utilised. Moreover, the rule of insisting on a substantial local contribution takes this beyond the reach of the poor people. Sir, this rule should be liberalised in future. The Government of Bengal makes an annual contribution of Rs. 1½ lakhs to the Calcutta Improvement Trust in addition to the jute cess which they realise on the jute imported into Calcutta. I do not find any justification for this contribution. So, this should cease and the Calcutta Improvement Trust should be asked to release a portion of the jute cess they realise at present for the benefit of the jute growers.

Mr. SHAH ABDUR RAUF: Sir, as the time is very limited, I shall make only a few observations on the budget for the year 1939-40. As I have said before, the sources of income of Bengal are inelastic whereas her items of expenditure are elastic. From the speeches we have heard it is clear that every one is coming forward with his demand for expenditure but unfortunately no one is coming forward with a suggestion as to how to increase the income to meet the growing demands of expenditure.

Sir, in the last budget session we had discussion about the excise revenue. There were demands from some quarters to do away with the excise revenue which is about 1½ crores out of a total revenue of 13 crores for the whole of Bengal. If this excise revenue is dispensed with, I fail to understand how the demands for expenditure will be met. May I ask those friends of mine who are very anxious to rid the country of the excise revenue as to where to find this 1½ crores to meet the expenditure? Sir, it is no wonder that in a budget with a deficit of Rs. 87 lakhs the Hon'ble the Finance Minister has come forward with the proposal for a loan of 1 crore of rupees. With inelastic income and elastic demands for expenditure, the Hon'ble the Finance Minister has no other alternative but to come forward with proposals for fresh taxation and fresh loans. Sir, I am not one of those who take delight in passing scathing remarks on the members of the Cabinet, but while acknowledging that they are doing their level best for doing good to the country, I feel it my painful duty to remind them that they have totally neglected one important matter.

During the election days and afterwards almost all of us cried hoarse over the necessity of primary education. It was claimed that primary education, free and compulsory education, should be brought to the door of every cottage. About a year has passed away since the new form of Government came into existence but no serious attempt has up till now been made in this direction. In his budget statement the Hon'ble the Finance Minister said that out of 12 districts in which education cess had been imposed, in 9 this cess had to be

suspended. Unfortunately, of these 9 districts 7 districts were affected by floods. So, practically, in two districts only education cess has been collected and in the rest of the districts no attempt has been made to impose the education cess. Attempts have been made by mischief-mongers in several districts to avoid this cess by putting forward the plea that the people were too poor to pay this cess. Take the case of Rangpur; this is a district in which most people can easily pay the cess——.

(Here the member having reached the time-limit resumed his seat.)

Mr. JAGAT CHANDRA MANDAL: Sir, I rise to say a few words in the discussion of the budget estimates for the year 1939-40. I hoped the Hon'ble and the learned Finance Minister would present a surplus budget on the floor of the House, but to my utter surprise, he has presented a deficit one. So, I find no way to congratulate him on his working out this aristocrat-feeding budget but to level some criticism against it.

Sir, the population of rural Bengal forms about 90 per cent. of the total population of the province, and they are poor tillers of the soil. They are the backbone of the country and they practically form the nation. So, 90 per cent. of the total receipts (that is, 13 crores) should be spent for the causes of the poor and hungry millions living in mufassil areas, and by the nation-building works are meant the works ameliorating the educational, economic, political and social conditions of these people.

Sir, the crying needs of the nation are education, i.e., free and compulsory primary education, rural sanitation and reconciliation of the debts of cultivators and, I think, the first and foremost duties of a National Government would be to fulfil these needs. Now, let us see how far our Government have fulfilled these duties.

From the budget estimates, we see that the Hon'ble the Finance Minister thought very little of these duties. His thought did not reach the poor huts of the hungry millions. He did not feel for them at all and he cannot, as a big moneyed and wealthy man, always living in a city like Calcutta, think for the poor tillers of the soil, unless and until he lives in close touch with them for some time at least, because we see that he set apart very big sums under the heads Police, Civil Works, Registration, etc., entirely neglecting the causes of the poor tenants. The money budgeted under these heads is going to be misused in erecting big buildings for the residences of fat-salaried officials living within the municipal areas.

Unfortunately for the flood and famine-stricken rural Bengal, the learned Finance Minister left a very small amount under the head "Famine Relief", "Debt Reconciliation", "Rural Reconstruction"

and "Agricultural Loans". The money budgeted under the heads "Education" and "Public Health", is also going to be mis-spent for similar purposes in erecting buildings in American style for those medical and educational institutions within the municipal areas, and nothing or very little is left for primary education and rural sanitation. The greater share of the money under the head "Education" is given for secondary and collegiate education, and the larger share of the money under the head "Public Health" too is given for the maintenance of the medical institutions in the town areas. Thus the Hon'ble the Finance Minister is serving the purpose of only 10 per cent. of the population of the province, i.e., rich people living in the towns, at the cost of the poor cultivators, for not more than 10 per cent. of the total population of the province is benefited by secondary and University education and by the medical institutions in the towns. So, I call his budget aristocratic-feeding budget——

(Here the member having reached his time-limit resumed his seat.)

Maulvi MANIRUDDIN AKHAND: Sir, I begin discussion with Industry and Irrigation, because unless these departments come to the aid of agriculture, there is absolutely no hope for material prosperity of the agriculturists of Bengal.

The Hon'ble the Finance Minister has made it clear in his statement that the budget contains no important new projects as he is awaiting the results of survey in progress under the guidance of the Director-General of Commercial Inteligence and Statistics.

The Hon'ble the Finance Minister may conveniently wait for the results of survey till the patience of the House is tired. But that is no reason why he should overlook the utility of small and cottage industries. Extra provision in the budget for Rs. 1 lakh 34 thousand seems to be nice, but if the details are examined one naturally becomes hopeless. The major portion of the money goes for the construction of buildings and office establishment and only a small portion has been provided for useful schemes. I believe, the Finance Minister will not deny the utility of small and cottage industries. There is no conflict between large-scale industries and cottage industries. In Germany and Japan, the most industrially advanced countries, there are plenty of cottage industries which are in a flourishing condition.

The department is a top-heavy department. If any real benefit is to be done, retrenchment should be made and savings utilised for the interest of the people directly. No provision has been made for fishery industry, and there is no explanation for it although some money was spent in this adventure.

As regards Irrigation, Eastern, Southern and South-Western Circles have received abnormal notice at the hands of the Government and the Northern Circle, i.e., Rajshahi Division, has been totally neglected.

The department has done nothing for the Rajshahi Division. It has not even cared to do small irrigational work for agricultural and sanitation purposes.

Government should distribute equitably its resources and in point of irrigation they should take into consideration requirements of all the Divisions.

With regard to Agriculture, this Department, like Industries, is also a top-heavy department and requires overhauling. Money should be found out anyhow by loans, curtailment of expenditure on Civil Works projects and retrenchment, for supply of scientific manures, seeds, implements of husbandry, for opening experimental demonstration farms at the important centres of the districts, and in every district the services of the agricultural officers and trained demonstrators in sufficient numbers should be made available. We have some demonstrators who have nothing to demonstrate. Their main duty is to prepare some statements and collect and prepare jute forecasts. They should have daily duties of demonstration outlined by the department.

I shall be guilty of omission if I do not give a description of the work of this department in my district of Rajshahi. Each of the three subdivisions of the district has been provided with a set of demonstrators with subdivisional towns as their headquarters and their duty is confined within a radius of five miles from the town. So, not more than one-eighth part of the subdivision gets their services if any real service is attained thereby, and the rest is left to themselves.

The great drawback of the department is that the results of experiments do not reach the public.

Like the Irrigation and Industries Department, this department also has not taken into consideration the requirements of the Rajshahi Division.

Every year we find floods and diseases destroy paddy plants leaving whole fields without a single plant to yield corn. No step has been taken to eradicate these evils.

In years of drought no help comes from the Irrigation Department to save the crops of the cultivators and no schemes have been made by the department either for tube-well irrigation or for other means for the purpose.

Allocation of funds for important departments such as Education, Irrigation, Agriculture, Public Health is lamentably short. Government have finished their duty by making provision for secondary and collegiate education. Schemes for extension of compulsory primary education have to wait another year. The Budget shows no sympathy for the dumb and illiterate masses. It is almost the same budget as its predecessors were and its consequence will be the same. After some

years we will find that the percentage of literate population has not risen higher. Government by the people and for the people would lose its meaning if there is no difference between Home and Foreign rule.

If want of fund is a handicap for the spread of compulsory primary education, I would suggest action on the line adopted by the Bihar Government for literacy movement.

There is a lack of plans with regard to prohibition programme in the budget. The Finance Minister proposes to introduce further taxation measures in the monsoon session, "if the idea of prohibition gains strength". Government have overlooked material prosperity as well as moral well-being and moral elevation of the people committed to their charge. The results of experiment of the prohibition scheme in the Noakhali district are unknown to the public. It is certainly a credit to the Bombay Government to introduce a scheme of complete prohibition in Bombay city and its suburbs. "The Bombay city and suburbs will go dry from the 1st August" announced the Finance Minister in presenting this year's budget. New taxation necessary to make good the loss will be levied on those who will be benefited by the prohibition scheme.

In conclusion, I would say that it is not a people's budget for the benefit of the people. It brings no welcome news to the tax-payers. Unwelcome news are betting tax on dog racing and ungraduated tax on professions, trades, callings and employment, excepting those who do not pay income-tax.

(Here the member having reached his time-limit resumed his seat.)

Khan Sahib HAMIDUDDIN AHMAD: Mr. Speaker, Sir, it is the view of a section in this House that supporters of the Government need not criticise the budget. I should frankly say that I cannot subscribe to this point of view inasmuch as I do not criticise the budget with the spirit of destructive opposition for the sake of opposition alone but with a spirit to help the Government in forming a more enlightened policy when making provisions for various departments under them——

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Don't be apologetic.

Khan Sahib HAMIDUDDIN AHMAD: I should at the outset congratulate the Hon'ble the Finance Minister and his colleagues for their following a progressive policy in respect of nation-building departments and for making a little more liberal grants for them than those made in previous years. But at the same time it shocks my conscience to think that provision of such grants has been possible only at the cost of fresh taxation. Nobody will grudge a taxation, when it is remunerative and falls upon those who can bear the burden of it, but

when such a tax is meant to tax people who have been facing ill and weathering a heavy storm in their economic life, it is very difficult even for the staunchest supporter of the Government to lend his support to such a scheme of taxation. The Hon'ble Minister does not propose these taxation for undertaking any new scheme for upliftment of the masses, neither does he give us any programme for development which would fire the imagination of the people.

A very minute scrutiny of the budget figures will reveal that the Hon'ble the Finance Minister has been very cautious and stingy in recommending expenditure on schemes of mass uplift and for upliftment of that class of people who in fact form the weakest link in the economic chain of the society. The few small measures are not what the country want We want economic plan which will make Bengal rich and prosperous, happy and contented. Instead of caution what we want is to muster all the courage that we are capable of, all the resources that we command and to go forward to fight out the problems that stand before us. On the other hand very liberal and lavish allotments have been made for the costs of old top-heavy administrative departments. He is, therefore, turning the whole machinery of the Government into a system of unbalanced complexity which may one day put the whole system out of gear. We have repeatedly demanded on the floor of this House that the costs of administration should be lowered down to the minimum necessity, but it is rather disheartening to find that what little has been done is nothing but an eye-wash.

The Hon'ble the Finance Minister who is reported to be a good pilot, is now encountering shoals and icebergs and in order to steer clear he proposes fresh taxations and loans. I need not say anything on the merits of the proposed taxation on amusements, but it will be committing a sheer crime if we further tax the highly taxed professions, callings and trades which are continually suffering a serious set-back on account of over-crowding and economic slump and that too in an ungraduated scale. When it is the duty of the Government to find some way of relief to these professions and callings, which most of the middle-class people are clinging to because they have no other avenues open to them, the Government are ill-advised in raising money by this questionable means.

So far as the Co-operative Credit and Rural Indebtedness Department is concerned, there are now Debt Settlement Boards set up in almost each village union. We who are in close touch with the village people and have knowledge of the working of these Debt Settlement Boards, can say without any fear of contradiction that often times suitable persons for constitution of these Boards are not available in each union resulting in establishment of inefficient Boards from which satisfactory progress cannot be expected. That question must be examined by the Government immediately. If instead of one Board

for each union Government establish a Debt Settlement Board for each thana not only the Boards will function more efficiently and make satisfactory progress but the expenditure on this head can be curtailed by one-half of the present estimates.

Sir, I do not like to go into details on any item at present. As to the grant for education of course the Finance Minister and the Education Minister as I have remarked at the outset deserve our approbation for the amount that has been allotted for the purpose, but here too I cannot but comment on the way in which the money has been distributed. Several lakhs have been provided for special grants to educational institutions other than primary, majority of which can do well without such grants. In making such allotments, in utter disregard to the claims of millions of people who are living in darkness of ignorance, the Education Department has poured bounty on smiling lands and has totally neglected the dreary ones which are more in need of succour——

(Here the member having reached his time-limit resumed his seat.)

Khan Bahadur MOHAMMED ALI: Mr. Speaker, Sir, in rising to speak on the budget the first thought that strikes me is the unfair and unwarranted criticisms that have been levelled against the Finance Minister.

Sir, it is very easy to make wanton charges and level destructive criticisms by those who want to earn cheap plaudits and it is easier still to make irresponsible utterances. Members of the Congress have criticised the budget for the mere sake of criticism. Some of them have used highsounding words of lofty idealism—they have talked of freedom even—as if freedom can be attained or achieved through drawing up of budgets. In this connection I may enquire what sort of freedom has been attained in the provinces where Congress holds sway. Sir, I would like to congratulate the present Government for the provision of substantial amounts for rural reconstruction and youth welfare movement. When the scheme or rural reconstruction is launched I feel sure substantial improvements to the village-side will be made. Nothing can be more important than a "keep fit campaign". Building up of the health of the future generation means the building up of the nation. The importance of this question cannot be too greatly exaggerated. It is therefore gratifying to note that the Government have concentrated their attention on this question. As for the budget my only regret is that sufficient provision has not been made for primary education. Government would have done better if they had abstained from making huge capital grants to institutions in the two main cities of the province and diverted the amount for the spread of primary education in the country.

Side by side with the question of primary education due stress should be laid on the question of adult education. To my mind, this is of no less importance, for if we have to reap a benefit from mass education immediately the illiterate adults of the province should be educated. In this connection I would like to request the Government to take up a scheme of adult literacy campaign throughout the province. Sir, before I conclude I would like to congratulate the Hon'ble the Finance Minister for the cautious way in which he proposes to deal with the finances of the province. Caution should be everyone's watchword and more so where public money is concerned.

Mr. SERAJUL ISLAM: Mr. Speaker, Sir, I should like to characterise this budget as neither hopeful nor hopeless. Not a hopeful budget in the sense that, after all, this is a deficit budget,—this is a budget where we do not find any provision for primary education without taxation which is the crying need of the day—here in this budget there is very little provision for doing real and substantial good to the man behind the plough of whom we talk so much in season and out of season and this is, Sir, a budget whereby we are going to incur a loan of Rs. 1 crore and also to resort to new taxation.

Sir, we were hoping against hopes that primary education without taxation would be introduced in the country, but we are now told that it is obviously not possible for the province to find such large resources and that unless the Central Government come forward to help us or unless some new taxation is imposed we cannot get primary education—so says the Finance Minister.

On the 26th August, 1937, the Hon'ble the Chief Minister was kind enough to assure us that "in places where the people are not so prepared to accept the burden of taxation he would have some alternative scheme for introducing free primary education in that place". Sir, as a matter of fact we are extremely anxious for that scheme.

Sir, this is a budget as if it were one in the hey-day of our prosperity. We are providing for construction of a number of Government buildings and quarters for Government officers at various places—we are providing for the installation of electric lights and fans in Government buildings at certain districts—we are going to buy a talkie cinema machine for a particular hospital—we are making provisions for quite a number of special committees—we are purchasing an elephant for a particular subdivisional officer—we are sending students and officers in foreign countries for special studies and diplomas—we are providing for the rearmament of Dacca Eastern Rifles Battalion with high velocity rifles and so on and so forth.

Sir, I do not mean that these are not necessary for national reconstruction, but what I mean is this that we can easily defer them

for near future and thus take up far more urgent matters of public importance just as adjournment motions are admitted by you, Sir, at the cost of other matters on the day's agenda and I also mean that coal is not carried to New Castle.

Sir, in a province like ours the Departments of Agriculture and Industry are just like the two lungs of our national organism. If we yet neglect these two main organs, the whole organism will in no time fall flat on the ground never to rise again.

As regards the hopeful side of this year's budget we must honestly admit that the angle of vision has changed though of course to a very small extent. The earnest call of the popular representatives of this House is being responded to. Substantial grants have been made to a pretty long catalogue of institutions. Educational institutions, scientific associations, literary societies, youth and labour organizations, institutions of Oriental learning, research societies, organs of public opinion, dancing associations, medical institutions, institutions of health and hygiene or in other words, every possible organization arresting at once the public eye, have been granted reasonable help from the coffers of the Crown.

Personally speaking I do not grudge these institutions getting grants, but I do grudge that these multifarious grants have been indiscriminate and uneven. Far more deserving bodies and places have been left out. Sir, my humble constituency, the poorest subdivision of Bongaon, hard-hit by the ravages of the last devastating floods cannot unfortunately feel and taste the sweetest possible gifts from the benevolent hand of our Finance Minister——.

(At this stage the member having reached the time-limit resumed his seat.)

Mr. ABDUL WAHAB KHAN: Mr. Speaker, Sir, last year the Hon'ble the Finance Minister told us in his "White Paper" "our aim was to resurrect the average man, i.e., the cultivator". Is it that the day of resurrection of the cultivator, the average man, will not come till the Doom's day or the day of judgment? Did he mean by resurrection that according to the law of Karma or belief of re-birth the cultivator must die, be buried or burnt and then and then alone he will be re-born with a gold or at least a silver spoon in the mouth, in lieu of the sufferings of this birth? This year again the White Book, page 32 says, "it is the aim of Government to improve the human material, to provide the common man with the barest minimum for a decent life." Again on page 31 the Hon'ble Minister says, "the demand for greater economic justice can no longer be left in cold storage". But Sir, when is "the greater economic justice" expected to come out of "the cold storage"? Practically 3 years have come and

gone. Can we expect, Sir, that in course of the next year or the year after all or any of our ambitions for mass unlift will be fulfilled? It is true that Rome was not built in a day but far from building have we laid any foundations for building Rome—I mean, a better Bengal, save and except that we are laying the foundations for buildings for the Police and other high salaried public servants?

The Hon'ble the Finance Minister is anxious "for finding more work and properly organising the human material". The "human material" is there. It is up to the State to supply the motive force and to captain all assaults upon the accumulated evils. But the Hon'ble the Finance Minister has rested content by uttering high-sounding shibboleths and commending the Congress for its so-called "tenets of truth and objective mass amelioration". I am afraid, the profession and practice are similarly poles asunder. But I congratulate the Hon'ble Minister and the erstwhile Agriculture Minister for the only drive in rural areas, I mean, Sir, the mock fight for a week against water-hyacinth. Is it too much to expect that the State or the Government should conceive of a bold drive against illiteracy, malaria and other major enemies of rural Bengal? A committee for primary and adult education took 4 months to issue a questionnaire, and that in the form that we all know. It will certainly not be difficult to harness the educated people of the country to such schemes if the Government only vouchsafe the initiative and a modest sum for the purpose. As regards rural credit, for reasons more than one, credit machinery in rural areas has been stunned and rural credit is completely dried up. It is high time that steps were taken to meet the situation by starting a thick net-work of small co-operative banks in rural areas which would not only finance cultivators but will also materially help and guide them to liquidate their old debts, to develop agriculture, to introduce cottage industries, and in general, to increase their earning power and raise their standard of living. Sir, the peasantry of a country cannot possibly develop without banking facilities. I know, Sir, the confidence in the present Co-operative Department of Bengal is somewhat shaken. It is not the co-operative movement which is at fault but the people who are at present at the head of it are. The White Book at page 35 laments for "the average agriculturist who spends about half the year in enforced idleness." But the need of introducing cottage industries for agricultural population as subsidiary and for others as primary occupation has not yet been paid the attention it so highly deserves. The Department of Industries is not known to rural people except in a very few selected centres. In the present budget there is no talk of retrenchment in the salary of officers but that of levying tax on people who are already hard-hit by the all-round economic depression. Primary education, tax or no tax, we must have. I strongly urge for building up of a fund

necessary for the project. The public servants should not indulge in the luxury of stately buildings in a country where people cannot provide a thatched house for them and their children.

(At this stage the member having reached his time-limit resumed his seat.)

Mr. MD. ABUL FAZL: Mr. Speaker, Sir, the budget shows a lack of foresight with reference to primary education. The budget has not foreshadowed any hope that the Government intend to take up the matter in right earnest, although promises have been given more than once in this direction.

Sir, considering the condition of Japan in 1853 which was astonishingly backward in every respect in comparison with India under the British rule of that day, its present growth is phenomenal. The secret of Japan's success lay in its mass education which it introduced as a national measure through the medium of its own language, and education was made available to every child of that country. The second factor was that in Japan every boy was taught to love and to serve his country, whereas in India such procedure was prohibited in schools. The best soldier and scholar in Japan was one who was the greatest patriot, but in India any one who was so, was considered a dangerous element.

Sir, Japan has compulsory primary education as well as compulsory military education. That is not all. Japan has planned a systematic method for development of national wealth which is never the case in India. The result is that M.Sc.'s and D.Sc.'s who spend 25 years of their life in education wil face the problem of unempolyment at the end of their academical career and find themselves unable to feed their family. Bengal being so rich in raw materials and wealth need not have been in that deplorable condition in the matter of occupation and vocation for their educated children. For solution of this state of affairs there should be proper exploitation of the resources of their country through industries developed by mass education and opening of polytechnic schools at several centres of this province.

Sir, I regret to say that in the neighbouring provinces of United Provinces and Bihar, the Governments have taken up strong measures to drive out illiteracy but no such step has been taken by the Government of this province. I am disposed to think that some of our own educated people are responsible for this miserable state of affairs as they never conceived and brought about a national policy of education for Bengal whenever an opportunity lay in their hands. They mostly

imitated their masters and took pride in furthering the foreign language and the foreign system which they never could perfectly pick up.

Sir, as money was not forthcoming for free primary and elementary education owing to the high cost of administration and the incapacity of the people to pay further tax, there is one solution of this problem, which is that every educated man, be he a judge, or a member of the Legislature, or a Minister, should devote at least three months to teaching some illiterate persons. That would go a great way to remove the present state of illiteracy. But the initiative should come from the Hon'ble the Chief Minister, as has been done in the neighbouring provinces.

Sir, turning to the present condition of primary school teachers "on whom lies the heavy responsibility of carrying the light into the darkest corners of rural areas and the responsibility of making the nation", it can be termed as nothing but tragic. The contribution of the mother and the primary school teacher to the development of the character of the child as a future man cannot be overestimated. Unless, therefore, the average Bengali mother is at least literate, the child will remain hopelessly ignorant with the exception of a fortunate few. This state of things can be remedied only by educating the girls as would-be mothers whose services are no doubt very important in the making of the future nation. I am sorry that from the little provision that has been made for the education of girls, no material benefit can accrue, and unless and until steps are taken to properly educate them, we cannot hope to function as a nation.

Mr. A. M. ABDUL HAMID: Mr. Speaker, Sir, this time I appear neither to bury nor to praise the budget, as I did last time. I am afraid, I cannot congratulate the Finance Minister. I think I will not be wanting in decorum if I say that the budget he has presented this year is devoid of that boldness and imagination which we expected of him. In the year 1936-37 our actual closing balance was Rs. 1,66,00,000. In 1938-39, we budgeted it at about Rs. 1,75,00,000 but it came to only about 78 lakhs. In the budget of 1939-40, it has been estimated at about 85 lakhs, but I do not know whether this will dwindle into insignificance.

Sir, coming to the budget itself, I find that under "Jails" the expenditure has not been reduced although there are no political prisoners now.

Mr. SPEAKER: I might inform the House that to-morrow at 4-30 p.m. a meeting has been convened by me and the Hon'ble President with a view to consider the desirability of forming a branch of the Empire Parliamentary Association.

Mr. A. M. ABDUL HAMID: I find that under the head "Police", the expenditure has increased by about Rs. 10 lakhs, and a most curious thing is that while under the head "Presidency Police", the current year's estimate stand at Rs. 43,72,000 the amount budgeted for the coming year stands at Rs. 44,45,000. At the last budget session the Hon'ble the Home Minister gave us an assurance that at least a substantial part of the cost of the Presidency Police will fall upon the shoulders of the inhabitants of Calcutta. But instead of that we find that the burden has fallen still more heavily on the tax-payer of Bengal as a whole.

Under the sub-head "Civil Works" of the same grant viz., Police as against Rs. 1,48,000 provided last year, an increased provision of Rs. 3,42,000 has been made this year. In view of the delicate financial condition of the province, this is indeed a luxury which ought to have been avoided.

Under the head "Education" a curious state of affairs is revealed. For the University, we find an increased provision of one lakh. As regards the provision for the "Grant to Art College", during the coming year, it has risen by over Rs. 4,30,000 (from 3·65 lakhs to 7·95 lakhs), and as for "Grant to Secondary Schools" it has risen from Rs. 15,57,000 to Rs. 19,00,000 this year. But under the head "Primary Education" it has risen only by about one lakh, i.e., from Rs. 32,43,000 to only Rs. 33,44,000. Our Finance Minister in his budget speech has said that he has made an extra grant of 5 lakhs this year. I am afraid this is not correct. The red book alone will prove it.

Then I come to "Medical". Under this head there has been no increase at all and it is purely urban in character. This year no provision has been made for the Pabna Sadar Hospital. For the Calcutta Chittaranjan Seva Sadan alone something like Rs. 2,50,000 has been provided.

Under the head "Public Health", there is a slight increase, but even with regard to that if the cost in connection with the Tollygunge protective embankment, Tittaghur khal, Navadwip drainage scheme and Dacca waterworks is deducted, it comes to almost nothing.

Then we come to "Agriculture". Practically, nothing has been done under this head. Of course, there is a total increased provision of Rs. 42,000 this year, of which direction and superintendence alone eat up Rs. 22,000 and experimental farm only Rs. 13,000 but the provision for agricultural experiment and education and research work has gone down by Rs. 68,000.

Then we come to "Administration of Justice". We all know that litigation has decreased appreciably of late, but we still find under the head "Administration of Justice" that this year there is an increased provision.

This shows that it is not a popular budget but a repetition of the days of old and nothing else.

(At this stage the member having reached his time-limit resumed his seat.)

Maulvi MD. AMIR ALI MIA: মাননীয় সভাপতি মহাশয়, আমরা দেশের গরীব লোকের প্রতিনিধি ও বর্ত্তমান প্রজা গভর্ণমেণ্টের পরিচালক। আমাদের লক্ষ্য রাখা উচিত যাহাতে আমদের গভর্ণমেণ্ট ঋণী না হন, কেন না ঐ ঋণ সুদে আসলে গরীব প্রজাকে শোষ করিতে হইবে। যে প্রজাদের অর্থদ্বারা আমাদের গভর্ণমেণ্টের খাজনা-খানা ভর্ত্তি হইতেছে ঐ সকল গরীব প্রজাদিগের প্রাথমিক শিক্ষার ব্যবস্থা কিছুমাত্র করা হয় নাই। এক কোটী টাকা ধারের প্রস্তাব মোটেই গ্রহণযোগ্য নহে, সুতরাং আমাদের এই বাজেট কিছুতেই সমর্থন করা উচিৎ নহে।

Mr. NIKUNJA BEHARI MAITI: Mr. Speaker, Sir, the Hon'ble the Finance Minister has stated in the course of his budget speech that the situation in Bengal is one of emergency, and he has, therefore, invited all the parties in the Assembly to co-operate with him and the Government. In these words he has said of the Congress Party, "The party which wields the largest influence in the country—I am referring to the Congress Party—there is no reason why it should not give its support to measures even though sponsored by a Government not its own, since its tenets are truth and non-violence and its objective mass amelioration."

Sir, we do not care what the personnel of the Government is—though that is a great thing, but we do care whether the measures initiated by the Government run counter to our tenets and objective. The tenets of the Congress Party as expressed by the Hon'ble the Finance Minister are truth and non-violence, and the objective is mass amelioration. Now judged by these standards, we find that the measures sponsored by the Government have failed much oftener than they have succeeded in the test. The budget looks more to the top than to the bottom; to the rich than to the poor; to the well-fed than to the hungry; to the zemindar than to the peasent and the *bhagchasi*; to the employed than to the unemployed. It takes more care for the education of the few than for the education of the many, and it takes greater interest in colleges and schools than in *pathsalas* and maktabs; and in direction and superintendence and establishment than in those for whom such direction, superintendence and establishment are meant. It is therefore difficult for the Congress Party to give its support to the measures sponsored by the Government, which could have been avoided if before the formulation of the budget the Hon'ble

the Finance Minister had cared to invite the Leader of our party and through him its members to put in their suggestions, and if those suggestions, to some extent at least, had been accepted by the Government, then there would have been some justification about this talk regarding co-operation. If the Government do it even now, the Congress Party is willing to consider the appeal for co-operation. But, then, the budget will have to be thoroughly recast.

(At this stage the member having reached his time-limit resumed his seat.)

Maulvi MOSLEM ALI MOLLAH: Mr. Speaker, Sir, the Hon'ble the Finance Minister presented his budget for 1939-40 the other day. Now, we have been holding a general discussion on it for the last few days. I had no mind to take part in the discussion, but certain items of expenditure could not withhold me from speaking a few words.

The two schemes, namely, the scheme for jute census and the jute restriction scheme, aim at the material progress and interest of the growers of jute no doubt. But what is actually coming to happen? The poor growers, far from getting any benefit, are going to have a total and progressive ruination day by day.

Sir, there will be, I think, no denying that the jute restriction scheme has been a total failure, and the scheme for jute census has been no less. But it appears from the budget that the Hon'ble the Finance Minister has again made provision for both these schemes.

Sir, the procedure adopted in taking and publishing jute census has many defects which have stood in the way of the scheme itself and thus prevented the achievement of the aim. The census is collected through union boards, but the union boards leave such an important matter safely into the hands of illiterate chowkidars who can never collect the right information nor can they form any idea as to how they should proceed. And thus the census figures are never even approximately correct, and the result is that the market fluctuates in such a manner that some non-Bengalis make money. But what about the poor growers? They watch and see the speculations and the fluctuations of the market, and, in the long run, they incur heavy losses. Again, the census report is not published on a single day. It takes more than a week to be wholly published, and only portions are published every day, and this sort of publication of the report leads people to indulge in speculations with the result that non-Bengali people make huge profits out of them, and, I may add, at the cost of the growers of jute. I would, therefore, suggest that responsible persons, other than the chowkidars or the like, may be entrusted with the business of collecting the census.

Another thing which I should like to bring to the notice of the Hon'ble Minister is this. Government are making heavy provision for contribution to the Eastern Bengal Railway for the construction of bridges, etc. But have they ever tackled the problem of providing the Eastern Bengal Railway lines with sufficient number of culverts? Sir, the main cause of the occurrence of flood and inundation in the North Bengal is the two railway lines, namely, the Eastern Bengal Railway main line and the Sara-Serajganj line. Before the construction of the latter, flood and inundation was quite unknown to the people of the North Bengal. But now flood and inundation and its aftermaths, cholera, small-pox and malaria epidemics have been an every year occurrence there——.

(Here the member having reached the time-limit resumed his seat.)

Babu MADHUSUDAN SARKER: Mr. Speaker, Sir, just at the outset——

Mr. DEPUTY SPEAKER: I am afraid, there is no quorum and I must adjourn the House now. Before I do so I may point out that——.

Mr. Khwaja SHAHABUDDIN: Sir, will you kindly let the bell ring again in order to see if a quorum can be formed?

Mr. DEPUTY SPEAKER: I have rung it twice; but if you want it done again, I shall do so.

(The bell was then rung.)

Babu MADHUSUDAN SARKER: Just at the outset I beg to offer my thanks to the Hon'ble the Finance Minister for the trouble he took to prepare the budget under review.

Sir, much has been said in his speech about amelioration of the condition of the poor people of the province, but little has been done for them in the budget.

First, I shall turn to the Education Department. Expenditure under that head estimated is above Rs. 1½ crores—it is the largest amount ever seen under "Education". For this I cannot but thank the Hon'ble Minister. But, Sir, the largest portion of the amount has been meant for the elevation of the elevated while a small amount is provided for the good of the poor of the rural Bengal. Our Hon'ble Finance Minister had the kindness to make provision for the advancement of the education of the Scheduled Caste of Bengal——

Mr. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Order, order, I have had the number of members counted: there is no quorum and I must adjourn the House now. But before doing so I will just remind the members of the House that, as the Hon'ble Speaker has announced, there would be a meeting here at 4-30 p.m. to-morrow called by the Hon'ble Speaker and the Hon'ble President, and members will kindly come and attend at 4-30 p.m. to-morrow; but the Assembly will sit as usual at 4-45 p.m.

Adjournment.

The House was adjourned till 4-45 p.m., on Thursday, the 23rd February, 1939, at the Assembly House, Calcutta.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Assembly assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act, 1935.

THE ASSEMBLY met in the Assembly House, Calcutta, on Thursday, the 23rd February, 1939, at 4-45 p.m.

Present:

Mr. Speaker (the Hon'ble Khan Bahadur M. AZIZUL HAQUE, C.I.E.) in the Chair, 11 Hon'ble Ministers and 219 members.

Mr. SPEAKER: Ladies and gentlemen, my melancholy duty is to inform you that His Excellency Lord Brabourne breathed his last this morning at 10-48 a.m. after suffering for some time with characteristic patience and courage.

Adjournment.

The House was then adjourned till 10-30 a.m. on Saturday the 25th February, 1939, at the Assembly House, Calcutta.

Proceedings of the Bengal Legislative Assembly assembled under the provisions of the Government of India Act, 1935.

THE ASSEMBLY met in the Assembly House, Calcutta on Saturday, the 25th February, 1939, at 10-30 a.m.

Present:

Mr. Deputy Speaker (Mr. M. ASHRAF ALI) in the Chair, 11 Hon'ble Ministers and 206 members.

Tribute to Late Lord Brabourne.

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: Sir, I rise in the midst of an encircling gloom of sorrow to pay our last tribute of affectionate regard to the memory of our late Chief and Governor, the late Lord Brabourne. Not to speak of Bengal or of the other provinces of India, even regions beyond the seas have been plunged into an indescribable gloom on the passing away of our beloved Governor who was distinguished for his achievements in the past and who seemed to have been marked out for still greater achievements in the future. So many and so varied have been the eloquent tributes paid to his manifold qualities of head and heart that I do not think I can add usefully to what has been said about his great personality, his intellectual achievements, his varied experience, his rare statesmanship, his unfailing courtesy and the strikingly indescribable charm of his manner which attracted people with whom he came into contact. At the present moment I will only say a few words from the point of view of the members of the Cabinet and I feel so overwhelmed with the sense of the irreparable loss we have sustained that I find it almost impossible to give expression to the grief which I and my colleagues feel at the sudden demise of one whom we had learned to look upon as our guide, philosopher and friend. Sir, there was hardly any occasion on which we had approached him and did not find in him not merely a Governor devoted to the duties of his great office but also a human personality of towering eminence who was always most anxious to lend us a helping hand in carrying on the great duties of our office There are one or two matters to which I wish to make a brief reference. Very few people know what love and affection Lord Brabourne had for the youths of our province. On many an occasion he told me that it was the ambition of his life to be able to solve even to some extent the problem of the unemployed, the finding of a career for our youths, to do something for the improvement of their health and for everything

that tended to their welfare and happiness. It was due to his inspiring guide that we were able to launch the Youth Welfare Movement, and hardly a week passed when he did not enquire of me how things were progressing. And, Sir, it is really a marvel to me how he could master the details of every item of administration and remember everything of importance which it is necessary for a Governor to know.

Then, Sir, there was the question of the Labour movement and very few people know how far he had been working in collaboration with our Minister for Labour to solve as satisfactorily as possible the great problems of labour in this province. Here again one came to find out his great sympathy for the poor and the helpless and it was Lord Brabourne who really gave us the guiding light in launching some of the schemes for the amelioration of the labourers in this province. Sir, to those in this Legislature who attached, and naturally attached, such a great importance to the amendment of the Bengal Tenancy Act I think I can now reveal what was so long a Cabinet secret, namely, the great solicitude which Lord Brabourne had always shown in bringing about this Bill which we had passed into law and put permanently on the Statute Book. It was in Darjeeling when the Upper House had passed the Bill and had sent it to the Lower House for acceptance and the final stage came for the Governor to give his assent that he used to have daily discussions with us clause by clause in order to remove the difficulties for placing the Bill permanently as an Act of the Legislature. Every day there were telegrams and cablegrams between him and the Viceroy and the Secretary of State and it was not until he had persuaded the Government of India and His Majesty's Government at Home that he would not rest content that the difficulties were removed and it is now no secret that it was owing to Lord Brabourne that we were able to get the Tenancy Act amendment passed into law.

Sir, I have been in the public life of this country for more than a quarter of a century. I have come into contact with Lieutenant Governors and Governors and officials placed in the highest position, and seen them pass away, but I do not know why at the present moment I feel so overpowered by my feelings that I cannot give expression to all that I have in my mind, and I hope this House will pardon me if I cannot proceed any further. But I cannot sit down without paying our tributes of respect to the memory of our Chief on behalf not merely of the House of which I have the privilege to be the Leader but also on behalf of the Coalition Party, each and every one of whom has expressed to me their deep grief and sorrow at the sudden calamity that has befallen this province.

Sir, to Lady Brabourne my heart goes out in indescribable sympathy and we pray to the Almighty Providence to give her patience to bear this great loss; and if sorrow shared is sorrow soothed, she can console herself by the thought that at the present moment, there are millions

who are to her unknown but who mourn the loss of Lord Brabourne not merely as a Governor but even as a friend and almost as a near and dear relative.

Sir, I am sorry I cannot say any more. He is now gone away from us. He has gone to the life eternal. May his portion be Joy that is Serene!

Mr. SARAT CHANDRA BOSE: Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, to the tributes that have come from far and near may I on behalf of the Congress Party add my humble tribute of respect to the memory of one who was loved and esteemed wherever he was known. Lord Brabourne came to this province at a time when dark clouds were still hanging over its political horizon, when trust yielded to mistrust, when hope gave way to despair, and when there was a general feeling of panic in the minds of the people. The legacy that had been bequeathed to him was one of political repression, economic depression and intellectual stagnation. He struggled hard and nobly against adverse conditions in which he had found himself. And though the time has not yet come to pass a verdict on his administration—it was only for a short space of about 18 months or less—I am free to confess that he throughout acted as a constitutional Governor and brought into the administration of this province a large measure of sympathy, good will and hope. Great and valiant as he was in the service of his country, he was even greater as a man and those of us who had opportunities of coming into close contact with him will readily testify to his nobility of character, his appreciation of realities, and his spirit of service.

Sir, in the high way of life he had not touched the stone that marks the highest point. Indeed his morning had hardly touched the noon while yet in love of life and raptured in thoughts of service he passed into silence and to the grave.

Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, I join you and the House in conveying to the noble Lady who was his worthy and untiring partner in all his public and private activities, our sincerest sympathies in her hour of sorrow and trial.

Sir GEORGE CAMPBELL: Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, may I for myself and my colleagues join in the tributes that have been paid to-day to our late beloved Governor. It is hard to find words to express the sorrow we feel and to say all that we have thought and indeed much that we have not been able to think or have not had time to think of the work that has been done for this province and the work that we had hoped he would still be able to do. There is little, Sir, that I can add to what has been said by the Leader of the House and my hon'ble friend Mr. Sarat Bose. But as it has been so forcibly brought home to us that in the midst of life we are in the imminent presence of death

what may be called our puny difficulties take their true perspective in the face of the loss which has fallen upon us; though we have suffered a terrible loss, may I say in all humility that it might be a gain to us if we could emulate the example of that sterling character and in all our dealings with each other in this House and outside exercise that strength and forbearance and that great love of humanity that was his; and so all of us, following his example, labour worthily for the good of this province and its people.

Sir, I also wish to associate myself and my colleagues with the expression of sympathy which this House is extending to the noble lady whose extraordinary fortitude and courage during the last few days will ever be present in our thoughts.

Mr. JATINDRA NATH BASU: Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, I associate myself and the group on whose behalf I speak with all that has fallen from the honourable members who have preceded me to-day. The position of a Governor of an Indian Province under the Government of India Act, 1935, is probably more difficult than the position of a Governor under the Constitution which preceded it.

The Governor no longer initiates policies or has a direct hand in carrying them out. He has to be ever watchful that the administration of the province is carried on in a just and efficient manner, with the scales held even. Lord Brabourne possessed in an eminent degree the qualities of tact, patience, and understanding to see the ship of the State pass peacefully through troublous waters. He showed us that before coming to Bengal and in the high office he held after a short term of office in Bengal he had shouldered many high and heavy responsibilities. Those he did at a comparatively early age. The manner in which he did the work that he took up showed the great achievements that could be expected of him in his maturer years. Our sorrow is the keener because death came to him so early in life. Our sympathies go out to the Lady Brabourne, who so ably and sympathetically seconded the efforts of Lord Brabourne. I trust she will have strength to bear the great loss that she has sustained.

Dr. SYAMAPRASAD MOOKERJEE: Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, may I add my humble tribute of respect to the memory of Lord Brabourne and associate the University of Calcutta with the sentiments so appropriately expressed by the previous speakers?

Sir, the sudden passing away of Lord Brabourne in the full prime of his life has cast a gloom in the minds of all people, irrespective of caste, creed, or community. This is not the time, nor the occasion, when we can dwell at length on the life and career of Lord Brabourne, but this we can say, and we must say, that within the short period

of 15 months that he had been with us he succeeded in winning the spontaneous esteem and affection of the people of Bengal, such as no other Governor had ever previously done. Called upon to occupy the exalted position of an India Governor at the age of 38 and to act as Viceroy of India when he was 42, he discharged his onerous duties with a sense of devotion and an earnestness, a charm, and a dignity which were truly characteristic of the man—indeed which marked him out as a prince among men. Our hearts go out in the deepest sympathy to Lady Brabourne. We can well realise with what feelings she will be leaving the shores of India, alone and unsupported by her life's partner. She will not only have to continue to bear the burden of a great and unforgettable personal loss but she will also have to be prepared to meet her two young sons, now six thousand miles away, who would be eagerly and expectantly awaiting her return, their great father never destined to set his foot on the land of his birth again. We can only hope and pray that Providence will endow her with courage, fortitude and patience to bear this great ordeal, and if it be any consolation for her to know, that consolation is hers, that her grief is not hers alone, her loss is not hers alone but that they are shared by the people of Bengal and the rest of India as well.

Mr. ANUKUL CHANDRA DAS: Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, on behalf of my group, may I associate myself with what has been said by my predecessors and pay my humble tribute to the memory of our beloved Governor?

Sir, a noble soul has passed away and at a time when his services are most required. Any one coming in contact with him knows full well how noble how generous he was, and we are here to mourn his loss today. Our deep sympathy goes out to that heroic lady, the Lady Brabourne. May God give her sufficient strength to bear the loss sustained by her—a loss which is a loss to the whole British Empire.

Mr. DEBI PROSAD KHAITAN: Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, as representative of the Indian Mercantile community in this House, I associate myself whole-heartedly with everything that has fallen from the previous speakers.

Sir, I can testify to the great intelligence that Lord Brabourne brought to bear upon all economic problems that affected the mercantile community. I have had frequent occasions to seek his advice and help in matters of legislation concerning trade, commerce and industry.

Sir, I am in a position to state on this occasion—this sad occasion, that whenever Lord Brabourne was approached in connection with economic problems, he showed an insight into them and was able, as

a result of his experience, to give us very valuable advice and assistance. We looked forward, Sir, that we would continue to have similar advice and assistance in future, but fate has ordained otherwise. The Indian Mercantile community is overwhelmed with sorrow and grief at the very sudden passing away of that great man. Our sympathies go out to Lady Brabourne who has been a very worthy partner in the life of Lord Brabourne. Her sweet manners, amiability, and simplicity have won for her the esteem, admiration, and affection of every section of the public in this province. As has already been said by the previous speakers, sorrow shared is sorrow soothed, and she can go away with the knowledge that her sorrow, her deep sorrow, is shared by the millions of people in this country.

Mr. SYED JALALUDDIN HASHEMY: On behalf of the Krishak Proja Party I rise to associate myself with the sentiments expressed by the Leader of the House, the Leader of the Opposition, the Leader of the European Group and other members of the House. Sir, though we had had no opportunity to come into personal contact with Lord Brabourne, our only consolation is that he helped in passing the Tenancy Bill to the great relief of the peasantry of Bengal. He realised the position of the agriculturists of Bengal and his contribution as administrator of this province will remain ever fresh in the memory of the entire agricultural population of Bengal. With these words, Sir, I pay my humble tribute to the memory of Lord Brabourne.

Mr. C. GRIFFITHS: Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, in associating myself with the sentiments expressed by the Hon'ble the Chief Minister and other leaders of this House, I can only add that the sudden death of His Excellency Lord Brabourne, our beloved Governor, has indeed cast a profound gloom over the whole city. It is too well-known that all who came in touch with him loved him for his charming personality and polished manners. That the Anglo-Indians feel his loss and are deeply grieved over his death is fully borne out by the fact that almost the entire community turned out yesterday to pay their last tribute to his great memory.

To the Lady Brabourne I respectfully offer the deepest sympathy for her great and irreparable loss on behalf of my colleagues, my community and myself.

Babu KSHETRA NATH SINGHA: Sir, on behalf of the Independent Scheduled Castes Party I associate myself with the sentiments expressed by my predecessors. Speaking on behalf of my community I may say that we were expecting at the hands of Lord Brabourne that the darkness of long long years would at last vanish from the horizon of these backward Scheduled Castes, and the day of dawn will

come on us and we shall see the light of day and prosperity in future. With the death of Lord Brabourne of revered memory our hopes are extinguished and we do not know how long we are to grope in the darkness again and see the light of day.

We convey our deepest sympathy to the Lady Brabourne on her bereavement and wish that the great departed soul may rest in peace.

Mr. FAZLUR RAHMAN: Sir, on behalf of the Dacca University I associate myself with the tributes paid to Lord Brabourne by my leader and other speakers and our sympathy goes to the Lady Brabourne.

Mr. DEPUTY SPEAKER: I may say at the outset that I have been requested by the Hon'ble Speaker to convey to you his regret that he could not attend to-day on account of his illness.

Ladies and Gentlemen, we have met here to-day under the shadow of a great calamity. The whole Empire is in mourning on account of the untimely death of His Excellency the Lord Brabourne. Born in 1895 in an aristrocratic family of England he was educated at the Wellington College and the Royal Military Academy, Woolwich. He served in the Great War in the Royal Artillery and the Royal Air Force. He was mentioned thrice in dispatches and was awarded the Military Cross for conspicuous gallantry and distinguished war services. At the end of the War he received his commission and in 1931 as Captain Knatchbull he entered Parliament to represent Ashford on behalf of Conservative interest. He was Parliamentary Private Secretary to Sir Samuel Hoare till 1933 when he succeeded his father as a Peer of the Realm. At the remarkably early age he was appointed Governor of Bombay which office he filled with great distinction and credit. He came to Bengal in November 1937 and we all know that he had succeeded to a post of grave and overwhelming responsibilities. During the absence, on leave, of His Excellency Lord Linlithgow he officiated as the Viceroy and Governor-General of India. The numerous responsible posts which he held, testify to his great administrative capacity, tactfulness and broad vision. He was the Governor of two great Presidencies at a time when the whole country was in the midst of a political turmoil, but it is to be mentioned to his everlasting credit that he discharged his obligations to the fullest satisfaction of all concerned. His tragic death has witnessed a wave of sympathy all over India and there can be no greater testimony to his greatness as a man and as a Governor than the fact that people of conflicting political opinions are unanimous in paying their homage to his memory. He was easily the Bengal's most popular man and we are very much poorer to-day by his loss. A man of great

political insight, amiability and polished manners, he was a representative English gentleman of the highest type and an Ambassador of England's goodwill towards India. Within a remarkably short period of time he captured the imagination of all classes of people. Like a gallant soldier that he was he died bravely at his post, and has left us the glorious heritage of unexampled devotion to duty. Ladies, and Gentlemen, I can pay no greater tribute to his memory than by the assertion that Lord Brabourne's name would remain written in indelible character in the history of Bengal—not only as a great ruler but also as a gallant gentleman of the highest order.

To the Lady Brabourne, to whom all consolation may be futile to-day, I would tender my deepest sympathy in her sad bereavement. Her loss is being shared by millions of Indians and let us hope that in her irreparable loss she will be sustained to some extent by that fact.

I am sure, Ladies and Gentlemen, that it is the desire of the Assembly that a message of condolence be sent to the Lady Brabourne and members would please signify their assent by rising in their seats.

(The members rose in their seats.)

Mr. DEPUTY SPEAKER: Thank you, Ladies and Gentlemen.

STARRED QUESTIONS

(to which oral answers were given)

Rabi crops in Murshidabad.

*67. **Maulvi ABDUL BARI:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Revenue Department be pleased to state the condition of the *rabi* crops in the Jangipur, Lalbagh and Sadar subdivisions of Murshidabad?

(*b*) If the prospect of *rabi* crops is not encouraging, what steps do the Government propose taking to give relief to the people who have already been suffering as a result of the last flood?

(*c*) Do the Government propose to continue test relief operation in the district till there is a good harvest next time?

(*d*) Is it a fact that famine conditions are prevailing in some areas?

(*e*) If the answer to (*d*) is in the affirmative, are the Government considering the desirability of declaring famine in that district? If not, why not?

MINISTER in charge of the REVENUE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Sir Bijoy Prasad Singh Roy): (*a*) The prospects of *rabi* crops are not normal but are not considered to be bad.

(*b*) Test works may have to be continued till the end of March next when *chaitali* crops will be harvested.

(*c*) Yes, if necessary.

(*d*) No.

(*e*) Does not arise.

Maulvi ABDUL BARI: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state under what circumstances famine may be declared in a district?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: It is all laid down in the Famine Code, and I will refer the honourable member to the provisions of that Code.

Maulvi ABDUL BARI: Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge aware how many labourers are daily attending the test work centres in the district of Murshidabad?

Mr. DEPUTY SPEAKER: How does that question arise?

Maulvi ABDUL BARI: Yes, Sir, it does arise. The answer given by the Minister goes to show that famine conditions are prevailing in the district of Murshidabad.

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: It is not so; it is not correct.

I rise on a point of order, Sir. The honourable member can put questions; but cannot start debate here.

Maulvi ABDUL BARI: I was asked by you to show as to how the question arises. Therefore I said that it arose in that way.

Agricultural loan in Tippera district:

*68. **Mr. DHIRENDRA NATH DATTA:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Revenue Department be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing, thana by thana, in the district of Tippera—

(*i*) the amount of the agricultural loan that has been advanced; and

(*ii*) the amount of gratuitous relief, if any, that has been granted?

(b) Is the Hon'ble Minister aware—

(i) that the loan that has been advanced and gratuitous relief that has been made are quite insufficient to cope with the distress due to the failure of crops; and

(ii) that the distress has been augmented by the loss of rural credit in the villages?

(c) If the answer to (b) (ii) is in the affirmative, are the Government considering the desirability of arranging for the loan in the rural area at a very low rate of interest?

(d) Is it a fact that the residents of Gokarna and Konda Unions in the police-station Nasirnagar, district Tippera, have submitted petitions to the Government for grant of gratuitous relief to cope with the distress?

(e) If the answer to (d) is in the affirmative, what steps, if any, have the Government taken to alleviate the distress?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: (a) A statement is laid on the Library table.

(b) (i) No. The sum already distributed has contributed substantially to the relief of distress.

(ii) Rural credit has been restricted and it has removed one source from which distress would otherwise have been alleviated.

(c) The rate charged for agricultural loans is 6¼ per cent.; this is not high and Government do not propose to reduce it.

(d) No.

(e) Does not arise.

Mr. DHIRENDRA NATH DATTA: Is the Hon'ble Minister aware of the fact that the residents of the Gokarna and Konda Unions in the police-station of Nasirnagar have submitted petitions to the District Magistrate asking for gratuitous relief?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: Government have no information on this point.

All-Bengal Registration Employees' Association.

*68. **Mr. J. N. GUPTA:** (a) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Education Department be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the All-Bengal Registration Employees' Association approached the Inspector-General of Registration, Bengal, and the Secretary, Education Department, Bengal, for official recognition?

(b) If so, with what result?

MINISTER in charge of the EDUCATION DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Mr. A. K. Fazlul Huq): (*a*) Yes.

(*b*) The matter is under consideration.

Mr. J. N. GUPTA: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state how long Government will take to communicate their decision?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: As soon as the investigations are complete.

Chukani holdings in Jalpaiguri Duars Khas Mahal.

*70. **Babu UPENDRA NATH BARMAN:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Revenue Department be pleased to state whether it is a fact—

(*i*) that *chukani* holdings in Jalpaiguri Duars *khas mahal* existing from the time of Mr. Sunder's settlement were freely transferable up to the time of Mr. Mukherjee's settlement; and

(*ii*) that all *chukani* holdings in the said *khas mahal* have been recorded as non-transferable without the consent of the *jotedar*, at the time of Mukherjee settlement?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the reason thereof?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of removing the restriction of transfer of all *chukani* holdings?

(*d*) If the answer to (*c*) is in the negative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state the reason thereof?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: (*a*) (*i*) These holdings were not freely transferable before Rai Bahadur B. B. Mukherjee's settlement. Attention is invited to paragraph 2 at page 85 of Milligan's Survey and Settlement Final Report from which it will be seen that Mr. Sunder definitely reported that *chukanudars* possessed no definite rights. The transferability of such holdings therefore depended on consent of the superior right—the *jotedar*.

(*ii*) There has been no change in the condition of transferability in Rai Bahadur Mukherjee's settlement.

(*b*) and (*d*) Do not arise.

(*c*) The matter will be considered in connection with Mr. Stuart's report on *khas mahal* administration.

Babu UPENDRA NATH BARMAN: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether *chukani* holdings from the time of Mr.

Sunder to the time of Mr. Milligan which were transferable in practice have been deprived of the right of being transferred by the settlement records at the time of Mr. Milligan?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: I will refer the honourable member to the reply (*a*) (*i*). I think that is complete and I have nothing further to add.

Number of Debt Settlement Officers in Bengal.

***71. Mr. ABUL HOSAIN AHMED:** Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Co-operative Credit and Rural Indebtedness Department be pleased to state separately, district by district, the number of appointments made in the posts of Debt Settlement Officers in Bengal from the different districts of the province since the present Ministry has come in power?

MINISTER in charge of the CO-OPERATIVE CREDIT and RURAL INDEBTEDNESS DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Mr. Mukunda Behary Mullick): The honourable member is referred to the answer given to starred question No. 82 on the 1st March, 1938. Four appointments were subsequently made, one each from Dacca, Calcutta, Malda and Khulna.

Grants to schools functioning in place of defunct circle schools in Bengal.

***72. Mr. KIRAN SANKAR ROY:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Education Department be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the Director of Public Instruction, Bengal, by his letter No. 2814-18P/3C-1P—25, dated Calcutta, the 14th August, 1925, wrote to the Divisional Inspector of Schools that "grants sanctioned in Government order No. 3835 Edn., dated the 22nd December, 1924, to schools functioning in place of the defunct circle schools are permanent"?

(*b*) If the reply to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether it is a fact that the grant to Nyamasti Anantamoyee Middle English School (which is a defunct circle school) in the district of Noakhali in the Chittagong Division has been reduced by Rs. 30 per year since 1933?

(*c*) Are the Government considering the desirability of restoring the old permanent grant to the said school?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: (*a*) and (*b*) Yes.

(*c*) The old grant which had been subjected to 10 per cent. cut has already been restored.

Gratuitous relief and agricultural loans in the province.

*73. **Mr. SERAJUL ISLAM:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Revenue Department be pleased to lay on the table a statement showing, district by district, for the year 1938-39—

(*i*) the amount of gratuitous relief and agricultural loans that have been spent for the flood-affected areas; and

(*ii*) the amount of gratuitous relief given and agricultural loans advanced in the subdivision of Bongaon in the district of Jessore?

(*b*) Is it in the contemplation of Government to spend any further amount either by way of relief or loans for the said subdivision of Bongaon?

(*c*) If so, when?

(*d*) If not, why not?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: (*a*) A statement is laid on the table.

(*b*) Further amounts will be granted if the local officers of Government find it necessary to apply for them.

(*c*) and (*d*) Do not arise.

Statement referred to in the reply to clauses (a) (i) and (ii) of starrred question No. 73.

Name of district or subdivision.	Amount distributed as agricultural loan.	Amount spent on gratuitous relief.	
	Rs.	Rs.	a.
1. 24-Parganas	56,000	14,561	0
2. Khulna	2,89,650	45,000	0
3. Nadia	1,99,500	17,000	0
4. Murshidabad	6,42,434	58,431	11
5. Dacca	1,72,350	30,194	12
6. Faridpur	4,20,925	23,828	0
7. Mymensingh	1,57,900	3,000	0
8. Bakarganj	66,900	1,957	0
9. Rajshahi	3,43,879	9,956	1
10. Rangpur	3,59,247	15,942	0
11. Pabna	5,47,400	71,967	0
12. Bogra	2,00,000	2,000	0
13. Dinajpur	97,000	2,902	0
14. Malda	3,08,377	40,000	0
15. Jessore	3,10,000	27,210	0
Total ..	41,72,562	3,63,949	8
Bongaon subdivision	58,000	7,000	0

Mr. ATUL KRISHNA GHOSE: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what was the amount that the District Magistrate of Jessore recommended for the relief of the people?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: Government sanctioned the whole amount that was recommended by the Collector of Jessore.

Mr. ATUL KRISHNA GHOSE: My question has not been answered, Sir. I wanted to know what was the exact amount recommended by the District Magistrate to the Government?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: The whole amount is mentioned here.

Mr. ATUL KRISHNA GHOSE: What is the amount?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: It is mentioned here; please read it.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if he is aware that the Secretary, Revenue Department, through letters, dated 20th December, 1938, and demi-official letter, dated 7th February, 1939, to the District Magistrate had recommended voluntary realisation of agricultural loans in 1939?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: Yes.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if he is aware that there is a serious failure of crops in most of the areas mentioned and even *rabi* crops are in a very bad way and realisation even in the name of voluntary realisation would lead to serious hardship?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: Voluntary realisation is voluntary realisation; it cannot lead to hardship. There is no equivocation; and it is not Government's information that there has been complete failure of *rabi* crops in the areas mentioned.

Mr. ATUL KRISHNA GHOSE: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if it is a fact that the amount recommended by the District Magistrate of Jessore was not given?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: That is not a fact.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that in the name of voluntary realisation actual hardship is being inflicted upon the tenantry of Murshidabad and Nadia districts, especially in the subdivisions of Lalbagh and Sadar and subdivision of Krishnagar?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: I repudiate that allegation.

Khan Bahadur MOHAMMED ALI: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if he is aware of the fact that gratuitous relief distributed in the district of Bogra has been quite inadequate?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: It depended on the recommendation made by the Collector and Government sanctioned the money on that recommendation.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state if he is aware of the fact that the District Officers and particularly the Circle Officers have been instructed privately by the District Magistrates that although voluntary realisation is recommended, they should see that sufficient realisation is shown?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: No, Sir. On the other hand, Government's distinct instructions are that realisations should be absolutely voluntary and there should be no element of coercion.

Flood relief at Madaripur.

***74. Mr. MD. ABUL FAZL:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Revenue Department aware—

(*i*) that the flood-stricken people of the western part of the Madaripur subdivision (Faridpur) are already in the grip of hunger;

(*ii*) that many of them in batches approached the Subdivisional Officer, Madaripur, in January, 1939, for relief or other help immediately needed; and

(*iii*) that the Subdivisional Officer has not taken any steps for their relief as prayed for?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) (*i*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state what steps, if any, are being taken by Government for their immediate relief?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: (*a*) (*i*) There is some distress due to the partial failure of crops last summer and autumn.

(*ii*) Some people approached the Subdivisional Officer.

(*iii*) No.

(*b*) Rs. 40,000 has been distributed as agricultural loans and Rs. 1,000 as gratuitous relief. Another sum of Rs. 45,000 is being distributed as agricultural loans and relief works are being started where needed.

Mr. SURENDRA NATH BISWAS: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether it is the intention of the Government to give agricultural loan to every needy agriculturist who wants loan for the purchase of seeds?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: Agricultural loans are being distributed on the principle that Government must see that lands of no cultivators remain fallow for want of money.

Mr. SURENDRA NATH BISWAS: Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that recently about 15,000 agriculturists approached the Subdivisional Officer for agricultural loan for the purpose of paddy seeds?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: I do not think the number is so large as 15,000, but some agriculturists did approach the Subdivisional Officer and Government have taken action for their relief.

Mr. SURENDRA NATH BISWAS: Will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether the Government are prepared to give agricultural loans to all needy agriculturists for the purchase of paddy seeds?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: I have already explained the Government policy and I have nothing further to add.

Female waiting room in Sub-Registry Offices.

*75. **Mr. JATINDRA NATH CHAKRABARTY:** (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Education (Registration) Department aware that female executants of documents of Kurigram, Ulipur, Chilmari and Lalmonirhat Sub-Registry Offices in the district of Rangpur have to suffer inconveniences for want of waiting rooms and latrines?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, are the Government considering the desirability of taking any action in the matter?

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: (*a*) and (*b*) No complaint has ever been received in this connection. There are waiting rooms for female registrants at the Sub-Registry Offices at Kurigram and Lalmonirhat but there are no waiting rooms at Ulipur and Chilmari. The offices are held in rented buildings and no sweepers are available at these places. The parties make their own arrangements in this respect. I am, however, making enquiries into the matter with a view to taking any action that may be found necessary.

Prohibition in Noakhali.

*76. **RAI HARENDRA NATH CHAUDHURI:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Forests and Excise Department be pleased to state what progress has been achieved up to date in the matter of prohibition of liquor in the district of Noakhali?

(*b*) With reference to the reply to clause (*a*) of starred question No. 46 of the 5th August, 1938, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state why a large number of new licences have been granted?

(*c*) What are the reasons that the scheme of prohibition undertaken in Noakhali does not extend to consumption of liquor?

(*d*) How far the Government scheme has resulted in the—

(*i*) diminution of consumption of liquor;

(*ii*) reduction of quantity of liquor sold; and

(*iii*) reduction of number of liquor shops and licences issued, in the district of Noakhali?

(*e*) How long will it take to secure total prohibition of liquor even in one such district as Noakhali?

(*f*) Is the Hon'ble Minister aware that Bengal consumes more intoxicating drugs than most of the other provinces of India do?

(*g*) Why has no scheme of prohibition of intoxicating drugs been undertaken as well?

MINISTER in charge of the FORESTS and EXCISE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Mr. Prasanna Deb Raikut): (*a*) No alcoholic beverage has been sold in the Noakhali district since the 1st April, 1938.

(*b*) No new licences have been granted in the Noakhali district.

(*c*) The restrictions imposed on the right of the individual to purchase and manufacture amount in practice to prohibition of consumption without in theory affecting the individual's right to consume, a right which is recognised in all other parts of the province.

(*d*) (*i*) No figures are available.

(*ii*) There has been no liquor sold in the Noakhali district from the 1st April, 1938.

(*iii*) All the then existing country spirit and foreign liquor shops have been abolished.

(*e*) The member is referred to replies to parts (*d*) (*i*) and (*ii*) of this question.

(*f*) The fact is not so. On the other hand consumption of *ganja*, *bhang* and opium, which are main heads of intoxicating drugs, is smaller in Bengal—per head of population—than in several other provinces as shown below—

Ganja—Consumption per head of population is lower than in Bombay, Central Provinces and Berar, Assam, Bihar and Orissa, and only slightly higher than in United Provinces.

Opium—Consumption per head of population is lower than in Bombay, Punjab, Central Provinces and Berar, Assam and Orissa and only slightly higher than in United Provinces and Bihar.

Bhang—Consumption per head of population is lower than in Punjab, United Provinces, Bombay and Orissa, and only slightly higher than Madras.

Charas—Consumption in Bengal is very much lower than in Bombay, United Provinces, Punjab and Central Provinces and Berar.

(*g*) With a view not to cause hardship. Opium, to take an example, is consumed for semi-medicinal purposes and as the last panacea in old age, particularly in rural areas.

Appointments in Revenue Department in the regime of present Hon'ble Minister.

*77. **Mr. ABDULLA-AL MAHMOOD:** Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Revenue Department be pleased to state—

(*a*) how many appointments have been made in his department during his term of office till 1938, December;

(*b*) how many of them are (1) Hindus and (2) Muhammadans;

(*c*) the number of appointments made either permanently or temporarily in the office of the Revenue Commission; and

(*d*) how many of them are (1) Muslims and (2) Hindus?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: (*a*) Permanent 6 and temporary (for short periods) 17.

(*b*) (1) Hindus—Permanent 2 and temporary 11.

(2) Muslims—Permanent 4 and temporary 6.

(*c*) Nine (2 of the posts are held by permanent assistants deputed from the Revenue Department and one stenographer from Howrah Collectorate).

(*d*) (1) Muslims 3 and (2) Hindus 6.

Services and posts not under Public Service Commission, Bengal.

*78. **Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL:** (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Finance Department be pleased to lay on the table a complete list of services and posts in which it is not necessary to consult the Provincial Public Service Commission as per Regulations made under section 266 (*3*) of the Government of India Act up to the 31st January, 1939, together with the dates of such Regulations?

(*b*) What procedure has been laid down for appointments to such posts specially to prevent nepotism and irregular selection of candidates?

(*c*) Is it a fact that contrary to the provisions of section 266 (*4*) of the Act, Government are interfering with the work of the Public Service Commission in "promotions" as well as in new appointments on the ground of allocation between communities?

(*d*) Is it a fact that apart from allocating the share of various communities generally, Government have been fettering the selection of candidates by the Public Service Commission through—

(*i*) preliminary selections by other persons or authorities;

(*ii*) stipulations that candidates belonging to particular communities only should be recommended; or

(*iii*) requests that incumbents who had been previously appointed as temporary hands without reference to the Public Service Commission may be selected?

(*e*) What steps have been taken so far or are under contemplation of Government to remove the drawbacks mentioned in the Annual Report of the Public Service Commission ending 31st March, 1938, specially with reference to—

(*i*) extension of the scope and functions of the Commission;

(*ii*) expedition in the decision of Government in making appointments after receipt of the recommendation of the Commission; and

(*iii*) adoption of the convention that the recommendations of the Commission shall be accepted as a matter of course save in exceptional circumstances?

MINISTER in charge of the FINANCE DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Mr. Nalini Ranjan Sarker): (*a*) A statement is laid on the table. A corrected copy of the Bengal Public Service Commission Regulations to which a reference has been made in the statement is laid on the Library table. The Regulations were brought into effect by a notification, dated the 1st April, 1937. Subsequent changes giving dates thereof have been shown in the copy placed on the Library table.

(*b*) No particular procedure has yet been prescribed nor have Government any evidence of nepotism or irregularity. On the contrary I am informed that the appointing authorities have increasingly of their own accord resorted to competitive examination as a means of recruitment in recent years.

(*c*) The answer is in the negative.

(*d*) My information is that there have been cases in which the Public Service Commission have been asked to do one or other of the following things:—

(*i*) To select candidates from among candidates approved by a preliminary Selection Board.

(*ii*) To recommend candidates belonging to particular communities.

(*iii*) To approve of candidates taken in temporarily for permanent posts.

(*e*) The observations of the Commission are receiving attention.

Statement (showing the list of services and posts in which it is not necessary to consult the Public Service Commission), referred to in the reply to starred question No. 78 (a).

(1) All posts included in the Bengal Subordinate Services (other than clerical).

(2) All clerical posts under the Government barring those included in Schedule C to the Bengal Public Service Commission Regulations of 1937.

(3) Posts and services referred to in sections 32, 33, 34, 39, 40, 41, 42, 42A, 49, 50 and 51 of the Bengal Public Service Commission Regulations.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble the Finance Minister be pleased to state if it is a fact that by amendments to Regulations on various dates subsequent to the assumption of office by the present Government changes have been introduced excluding from

the purview of the Public Service Commission such posts as Sub-Registrars, Government Pleaders, Public Prosecutors, Deputy Secretaries to Government and others?

The Hon'ble Mr. NALINI RANJAN SARKER: I want notice.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Will the Hon'ble the Finance Minister be pleased to state with reference to answer (3) whether Government are considering the desirability of laying down certain definite procedure in these cases?

The Hon'ble Mr. NALINI RANJAN SARKER: The matter is under our consideration.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: With reference to answer (*c*), will the Government be pleased to state whether the practice of seniority and merit being the only two considerations for promotion is still continuing as has been in the past?

The Hon'ble Mr. NALINI RANJAN SARKER: Yes.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: With reference to answer (*d*) (*i*), will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state who are the members of the preliminary Selection Board referred to and how they have been constituted?

The Hon'ble Mr. NALINI RANJAN SARKER: I want notice.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: With reference to answers (*d*) (*ii*) and (*iii*), do the Government consider the desirability of making further investigation into the matter so that interference with the work of the Public Service Commission may not be encouraged?

The Hon'ble Mr. NALINI RANJAN SARKER: There is no interference at present and I don't admit that there has been any.

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: May I point out to the House that Dr. Sanyal has been quoting from unpublished Government records?

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: On a point of personal explanation, Sir. The Hon'ble the Chief Minister has made several observations and I would like to make a personal explanation. I submit that it is entirely within the right of every member of this House to obtain information, from whatever sources it may be possible for him to do—even from the pockets of the Hon'ble Ministers, if possible.

The Hon'ble Mr. A. K. FAZLUL HUQ: Even by thieving!!

UNSTARRED QUESTIONS

(answers to which were laid on the table)

Oppression by the Chittagong Forests Department.

33. Maulana MD. MANIRUZZAMAN ISLAMABADI: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Forests and Excise Department be pleased to state—

(*i*) whether any information of his visit to Chittagong, a few months ago, was given to the local M.L.A.'s who took in this House special interest in forest affairs and public grievances;

(*ii*) whether he has arrived at any definite conclusion regarding the public grievances against the Forest Department; and

(*iii*) whether any step has been taken for the redress of the said grievances?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) (*ii*) and (*iii*), is in the negative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state whether he proposes to take any step in near future?

The Hon'ble Mr. PRASANNA DEB RAIKUT: (*a*) (*i*) Yes.

(*ii*) and (*iii*) The matter is under consideration. Orders will issue shortly.

(*b*) Does not arise.

Suspension of certificate procedure.

34. Babu SHYAMA PROSAD BARMAN: (*a*) Will the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Revenue Department be pleased to state whether it is a fact—

(*i*) that the Chief Minister gave the assurance that the certificate procedure should be suspended for two years from the year 1345 B.S.; and

(*ii*) that it has been suspended in some of the districts?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state why arrears of rents are being realised by certificate procedure from the tenants under the attached estates in the district of Dinajpur?

The Hon'ble Sir BIJOY PRASAD SINGH ROY: (*a*) (*i*) The assurance was for suspension of certificates for realisation of rents in Crown Estates and Court of Wards Estates only.

(*ii*) It has been suspended in all districts according to the assurance referred to in (*i*) above.

(*b*) Because if District Boards are to function properly, their cess receipts must be made available to them promptly to secure which end section 99 of the Cess Act has been devised. It may also be noted that the Hon'ble the Chief Minister's assurance did not relate to these demands.

Kulti Channel scheme.

35. Babu RADHANATH DAS: (*a*) Is the Hon'ble Minister in charge of the Local Self-Government Department aware—

(*i*) that the Calcutta Corporation have acquired (through the Land Acquisition Collector, 24-Parganas), in December, 1937, vast tracts of land for the Kulti Channel scheme;

(*ii*) that awards for compensation for all lands have not as yet been made; and

(*iii*) that the delay in making the award tells heavily upon the poor tenants as well as the landowners?

(*b*) If the answer to (*a*) is in the affirmative, will the Hon'ble Minister be pleased to state—

(*i*) the cause of the delay in making the award;

(*ii*) when the payment of the award is likely to be made; and

(*iii*) that owing to the delay in making the award the Calcutta Corporation may be made liable to pay huge sums of money as interests?

(*c*) If the answer to (*b*) (*iii*) is in the affirmative, what do the Government propose to do in the matter?

(*d*) Are the Government considering the desirability of making an enquiry into the cause of the large number of references made by various parties in connection with this matter?

MINISTER in charge of the LOCAL SELF-GOVERNMENT DEPARTMENT (the Hon'ble Nawab Khwaja Habibullah Bahadur, of Dacca): (*a*) (*i*) Yes. 1,728·80 acres.

(*ii*) Awards have been already made in respect of 1,406·41 acres and remain to be made for 232·19 acres. The balance of 90·2 acres will not be acquired.

(iii) The awards have been made as quickly as possible and there has been no undue delay.

(b) (i) There has been no delay. Acquisition of 1,638·5 acres or about five thousand bighas of land will necessarily take time particularly in view of the fact that the award involves very detailed calculations and apportionments and also of the fact that other important and more urgent projects were and are in hand.

(ii) Payment of Rs. 2,97,998-3-7 has been already made out of Rs. 4,53,331-3-1 awarded. The balance will either be paid to the parties or remitted to the Civil Court or placed in revenue deposits on the expiry of the statutory periods for filing references.

(iii) The Calcutta Corporation took possession of the waste and arable lands in advance on condition that they would pay interest for those lands at 6 per cent. per annum from the date of possession till the date of payment. This expedited the completion of their scheme.

(c) Does not arise.

(d) No. Out of the 12,075 interests dealt with up to date references have been made in respect of 140 interests only for apportionment and 22 interests for valuation. The apportionment cases were contentious and the parties did not settle them before the Land Acquisition Officer. The valuation cases relate only to ·0018 per cent. of the interests, i.e., 18 cases per 10,000 interests.

GENERAL DISCUSSION OF THE BUDGET.

The General Discussion on the Budget was resumed.

Mr. PROMATHA RANJAN THAKUR: Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, on the last day of the general discussion, I rise to say a few words regarding the budget presented by the Hon'ble the Finance Minister. I have been carefully going through it for the last few days and I find that in its broad outline it does not differ in any respect from any budget presented to this province by any former Finance Member of the old regime. There is no change in the policy of the Government though it poses as a popular Swadeshi Government. There is no planned policy behind any of the heads of expenditure, either in the matter of retrenchment or in the matter of increasing the grants. The stereotyped make-up of the former Government has been considered to be so very sacred by the Finance Minister.

Now, Sir, coming to the budget itself, we find that the Finance Minister has purposely neglected to grant sufficient sum which could help the poor people of Bengal to proceed on a nation-building line. The large sums of money that have been proposed to be expended for erecting halls, buildings and other institutions in big cities like

Calcutta or Dacca, will neither help the illiterate rural people of Bengal to educate them nor improve their status in any way. What the rural people of Bengal want is primary education and up till now the present Cabinet has done practically nothing towards that end.

The unemployment is increasing day by day and the present Ministry fails to adopt sufficient means to check its progress by providing more money for speedily industrialising Bengal. The present Ministry is thinking more of the suppression of the socialist and communist movements in the province by providing more money on the Police Head. But the time is not very far when the whole of Bengal will be in a communist conflagration, if the present Cabinet carries on the Government by ignoring the legitimate demands of the people.

Sir, the present budget is nothing but a systematic plan to loot the public treasury of Bengal. Every farthing of the money which the present Cabinet has got the authority to spend has come from the poor toiling peasants of Bengal. The Ministers who are on the Treasury Benches cannot even imagine how the people of rural Bengal are being swept away by cholera and other epidemics, simply for want of good drinking water, food and medical treatment. They only enjoy the thrill of sitting on the Treasury Benches. They do not realise the great responsibility on their shoulders.

Sir, I am a member of the Scheduled Castes, and lastly I would like to say a few words about them. The Finance Minister has been good enough to grant a few thousand rupees to them for scholarships and stipends. I can tell the House that we 30 Scheduled Caste members have not come to the Assembly for a few thousand of rupees. We can make it a present to the Hon'ble the Finance Minister who would do well to give it to "Azad" or any other communal paper: and that will please his chief, no doubt. The best thing for us Scheduled Castes will be to go back and unite with the Caste Hindus and do away with this invidious distinction which is only helping the British Imperialism to fulfil its object.

Lastly, Sir, I cannot resume my seat without congratulating the Finance Minister on his mastery over the art of pleasing his chief in presenting the budget. He has devised two measures of taxation to realise money; but the House will not be surprised if he proposes to impose the "jizia" on the Bengal Hindus if it only pleases his Muslim chief.

With these few words, Sir, I resume my seat.

Mr. C. GRIFFITHS: Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, dealing with the budget as an Anglo-Indian it reminds me of a story I once heard, that when a young man in College was asked to differentiate between the Greater and the Lesser prophets, he replied, "God forbid that I should

comment on such great men as these". In like manner I must also refrain from commenting on the effects the budget will have on the Muslims and Hindus, especially when they so indifferently disposed of my community's claims with only two seats in the Calcutta Municipal (Amendment) Bill, 1939. However, it is to be hoped that when the Bill comes up for discussion they will recognise our claim as an important community and be more generous. The budget for the year 1939-40 with the introduction of the new tax is not a satisfactory one for us. When Sir John Woodhead in 1936, the year before the inauguration of Provincial Autonomy, said, on presenting his last budget, "That there were better times ahead for Bengal" we naturally felt that our troubles would soon be over. We find that his predictions have come true for the revenue receipts are steadily on the rise—

1937-38—Rs. 12 crores 55 lakhs,

1938-39—Rs. 13 crores 13 lakhs,

1939-40—Rs. 13 crores 78 lakhs,

and yet the electricity tax, which was an emergency measure, is still in force and now we are threatened with a fresh tax of Rs. 30 a year on trades, professions, occupations and callings which will affect the educated middle class in which category the majority of my people are included, who are on the lower rungs of the ladder of all those who pay income-tax. This tax in my opinion should be graduated, for it is not fair for a man drawing Rs. 2,000 a year to pay the same tax as one drawing Rs. 20,000 a year.

We note the interest the Government are taking in education. We only hope that ample provision will be made by Government in industries to open out new avenues of employment and to absorb the educated classes. We find that recruitment of Indians to the services that were once a monopoly of ours, has brought about widespread distress among us. Just as the educated Hindus have been displacing the Anglo-Indians in the past we now find that the Muslims are displacing both the Hindus and the Anglo-Indians. We find that keen competition brings about the protection of rights to all trades, callings and professions, i.e., for instance a license will not be given to a petrol shop if there is one in the vicinity within a certain distance, in the same way a fresh licence will not be granted for opening a retail liquor or opium shop. Therefore, in the same way the rights of the different people might be protected. Bengal should be for the Bengalees. In the city preference should be given to the urban people.

The Europeans might give preference to Domiciled Europeans and Anglo-Indians in their firms and so on. Otherwise, a small community like ours can be soon forced into a depressed class. If this protection cannot be given, then licences should be granted to Anglo-Indians for

every trade. As we have been displaced in the services, so provision should be made to displace those who hold practically the monopoly of certain trades——

(At this stage the member having reached the time-limit resumed his seat.)

Maulvi MD. MOZAMMEL HUQ: (The member spoke in Bengali of which the following is an English Translation.) Mr. Deputy Speaker, we are disappointed at the budget proposals for 1939-40 which the Hon'ble the Finance Minister has presented before us. (A member from the Congress Group: "More disappointment is in store.") He is reputed to be an expert economist. There was a sensation in the country over a surplus of 34 lakhs of rupees in his first year's budget estimates. But in the third year's budget we find that the income has increased from Rs. 13,35,00,000 to the extent of Rs. 13,78,00,000, yet he has put forward a proposal for launching a loan for one crore of rupees. (From the Proja Party: "Let your eyes be opened.") The party opposite to us often make the comment, pointing to us, that we play the role of silent spectators when Government say or do something. But, if we get nothing from the Government for the poor and the distressed, we, the supporters of Government, would like to bring it to the notice of the Government and seek for its redress through strong criticism. I can proclaim it with a loud voice that in the matter of beneficient measures for tenants our Government have acquitted themselves more creditably than the Congress Governments by enacting many laws. But the Bombay Government's scheme for nation-building and prohibition work this year has brought about a deficit of roughly 2½ crores of rupees in their budget. Nevertheless they have accepted the scheme for the benefit of the country. This is a matter for great rejoice. We, too, had cherished hopes that our efficient Finance Minister would bring forward one scheme or another for the relief of the poor and the distressed in this hapless country. But in these three years, though three budgets have been introduced, yet, to our utter misfortune, we have not been able to discover any trace of this in them. The speakers who preceded me said that the Hon'ble the Finance Minister increased the estimate for Civil Works by 24 lakhs of rupees. My friend has remarked that along with the estimate for other buildings he has proposed to spend ¾ lakh on the construction of witness sheds and my friend has regretted it. But in my opinion there is nothing to regret at. You are all aware what a spotless white palace touching the sky has been built by our Hon'ble the Finance Minister in the heart of this city of Calcutta. Indeed, his palace is one among the sights worth seeing in Calcutta. Can the wailings of the poor rise in his heart when lying down on a soft and milkwhite bed in that spotless white palace he dreams happy dreams? So much zeal on his

part for the construction of buildings is due to the fact that he himself lives in a palace like that. But owing to the establishment of Debt Settlement Boards litigations have considerably decreased. Consequently, the rush of witnesses to courts has not been as heavy as before. Hence, what reason he has for incurring the aforesaid amount for the construction of witness sheds——

(At this stage the member having reached the time-limit resumed his seat.)

Mr. SYED JALALUDDIN HASHEMY: Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, I have not the slightest intention to take much of the time of this House, and I purposely refrain from making any observation during the general discussion of the Budget. I shall not take any notice of what the members of the Opposition suggested or said in criticising the budget provision of this year. But, Sir, the speeches of Mr. Abdul Bari and Mr. Abdul Latif Biswas and some other members of the Coalition Party gave me inspiration to rise and to take two or three minutes of this House. I can only suggest to Mr. Abdul Bari and Mr. Abdul Latif Biswas that if they are really dissatisfied with the provisions made in the budget for free and compulsory education, at least they two, the greatest pillars of the Government party—I mean, the Coalition Party—should come over to this side and learn lesson from us as to how to change, alter, amend and refuse grants, provisions for which have been made in the budget; or, Sir, if that party has no sympathy for us, let them form their own Cabinet. Let Mr. Abdul Bari take over the portfolio of Education himself. The Treasury Bench is their creation. They can dismiss and do away with any Minister at any moment. We have examples before us of Ministers being appointed and dismissed one after another. Let Mr. Bari take over the portfolio of Education and satisfy his ideal by making provision for free and compulsory primary education. Let Mr. Abdul Latif Biswas take over the portfolio of Agriculture and make provision for the betterment of the agriculturists of this province. Sir, the Government party,—I mean the Coalition Party—is in majority, and they can make and unmake Ministers at their own sweet will——

(At this stage the member having reached the time-limit resumed his seat.)

Miss MIRA DATTA GUPTA: Mr. Deputy Speaker, Sir, it is not my intention to take much of the time of the House on the last day of discussion of the Budget. The House has already witnessed severe condemnation of the Government policy from both the Opposition and the Government benches. The deliberations of the last three days have made it amply clear that the present Ministry is following a most reactionary policy, unworthy of any civilised Government. We have seen how dear is the cause of the Police and the administration to the

Hon'ble the Finance Minister and how prompt he is to maintain the machinery of repression in a tip top condition. In Fascist Germany, we know Goering wanted guns instead of butter. Our Finance Minister also wants guns when millions of our people need food. He wants to place high velocity rifles in the hands of military police and train police officers in the use of tear gas bombs, the whole thing costing more than a lakh of rupees. On the other hand, Sir, the House has learnt how the nation-building activities are suffering not only from a chronic lack of funds but also from definite sabotaging activities on the part of the Government. The Hon'ble the Finance Minister proposes to pay a special premium on communalism and the general policy of the Government have given a new lease of life to the monster of communalism.

Sir, what are the records of the Government in the two years during which we had a taste of Provincial Autonomy? What are the prospects for the future?

The financial policy of the Hon'ble the Finance Minister will very soon drive our province to bankruptcy. Just before the Hon'ble Ministers were entrusted with the affairs of our province, that is in 1936-37, there was a surplus of 40 lakhs of rupees. Within two years this surplus is being replaced by a deficit of Rs. 22 lakhs and in the year 1939-40 this deficit will soar up to near about a crore. This, however, does not give us a correct picture of the real situation. If we allow for 2½ crores from the jute export duty received by this province since 1937-38, we see that compared to the surplus of Rs. 40 lakhs in 1936-37 the Provincial budget has been showing huge deficit under the present Ministry, namely, one crore in the first year, 2½ crores in the second year, and 3 crores in the third year. By the end of 1939-40 the financial position of the province will deteriorate by more than 3½ crores as compared to that of 1936-37. It is well-known by now that this terrible situation has been created not because the Government are spending huge sums of money for nation-building activities, but because Government choose to keep the machinery of imperialism in a perfect condition, while the nation groans under poverty, degradation and repression. Sir, the present Ministry is not only drawing the last ounce of blood from the people of Bengal, it is also forcing our people to pay with their lives for the reactionary policy of the Government. In every quarter of 1937-38, excepting the first, the death-rate of Bengal increased compared with the corresponding quarter of 1936-37. A comparison of Bengal with the United Provinces strikingly brings out the differences between the Coalition Ministry and the Congress Ministry. Although the population of Bengal is less than that of the United Provinces, in 1937-38 the mortality in Bengal was two lakhs more than that of the United Provinces. I maintain, Sir, that these two lakhs of people have died simply because of the

criminal negligence of the Government. Can the Government deny that they undertook to build only one new dispensary in the whole of Bengal during the two years of office and that even this dispensary is not yet complete?

What benefit have our poor peasants and workers obtained from the Ministry? None. The Hon'ble the Finance Minister has in graceful terms told the peasants and workers to go to the Devil. If the peasants want education, health, and good living, they must pay. And what of the money the peasants are already paying? That goes to pay for high velocity rifles, tear-gas bombs, police barracks and hospitals, to construct prison cells and new Criminal Investigation Department buildings. "The workers cannot have benefit," warns the Hon'ble the Finance Minister, because Industry will be burdened. But the Government have readily obliged the jute magnates by lifting their burden and allowing the mill-owners to throw out 25,000 jute-workers. The rate of accidents in the factories of Bengal increases every year. In 1926 the accident rate was 5 per 1,000; in 1936, 13; and in 1937, 14. The Government have done nothing to check this alarming increase of accidents, because it may mean paying out a little out of the profits of the capitalists. The Hon'ble the Finance Minister wants to put a fresh burden of tax on our people. He wants to introduce a new income-tax, which will hit the middle class people most. But the peasants and the middle class of Bengal cannot pay more than they are doing to-day. The Hon'ble the Finance Minister wants more money but holds out no prospect for the future of our people. In reality, Sir, there is no dearth of money in Bengal. Let the Government make the rich pay——

(At this stage the member having reached the time-limit resumed her seat.)

Mr. TULSI CHANDRA GOSWAMI: Mr. Deputy Speaker, at the fag end of a general discussion of the budget, it may be most cruel and unfair for me to inflict a long speech. The lack of interest in this unreal discussion—it was meant to be an unreal discussion—the lack of interest is evident in the House to-day. We have had already three days of this general discussion. I submit that even on the fourth day we shall not be able to make it any more fruitful than it has been during the last three days. I have heard it said, and I have read in one or two books, that it is customary Parliamentary practice to bestow congratulations on the Finance Minister or the Chancellor of Exchequer, as the case may be. Sir, my honourable friend, the leader of the European group, lived up to that advice. He bestowed praises on the Finance Minister, not only on things which he approved but also on things which he did not approve. It was an amusing thing to hear him at the same breath praising the Finance Minister and, at the same time, criticising some very important matters in the budget. I shall say

this that, whole-heartedly, I am prepared to congratulate the Finance Minister on one thing, not on a successful budget but on a very successful window-dressing. The labyrinthine maze of figures bewilders us. That is the characteristic of all budgets but, at the same time, it is our duty to find out our way through that labyrinthine maze, in order to get at the centre of the budget.

My first and chief complaint against the present budget is that there has been no change of outlook since the last budget. The present Finance Minister has been exceedingly fortunate, probably more fortunate than any of his predecessors during countless years. He was the inheritor of great privileges, financial privileges for this province, and he is to-day administering the finances of this province with the confidence which his predecessors could not possibly have. And what is the result? The result is increase of expenditure instead of decrease of expenditure in General Administration. I can quite understand why there has been no change of outlook. I am not speaking disrespectfully of the Finance Minister himself, but it has been evident, during the last two years that the present Council of Ministers has been in office, that most of the time of most of the Ministers is taken up in their own personal propaganda. Naturally, additional touring expenses had to be provided for, and Hon'ble Ministers are more busy in stamping public platforms just as camelopards and tigers bounded in the Flavian Amphitheatre. It is not possible for them to find time to evolve a fresh outlook. And as regards the claim of certain Ministers that they are lions, may I say this that certain animals of lesser breed enclothed in skins of dead lions do not become lions themselves? This is a charge which is not a trivial charge, because I feel that the entire budget is animated by one purpose, *i.e.*, keeping the administration top-heavy. The administration was top-heavy already, and it has been sought to make it even more top-heavy. You take any item of increase in expenditure which appears on page 81 of the Red Book. You find that more attention is paid to overhead expenses than to the actual work to be done. Take Civil Works. Take any other item. Take "Buildings," take "Educational Institutions". More is provided for the overhead charges than for the actual work to be done. On the side of Receipts, Government expect to get Rs. 13,77,76,000. Out of this, the amounts taken from local bodies amount to Rs. 92,55,850, that is to say, the net receipts amount to Rs. 12,85,20,150. That means an increase of 13,91,150 or roughly 14 lakhs, and the greatest part of this increase is expected from land revenue, that is to say, 7,63,000. From the melancholy account which we find in the Hon'ble Finance Minister's budget speech, it is more than optimistic to expect this additional revenue. And if I may refer to his speech, he said: "Collections from permanently settled estates have dropped by 7 lakhs while collections from Government estates have dropped by 19½ lakhs". Now I do not know exactly the proportion of

permanently settled lands to *khas mahal* lands, but I take it that the *khas mahal* lands are very much smaller than the permanently settled estates, and yet even if in the *khas mahals*, there is a deficit of 19½ lakhs as against 7 lakhs from permanently settled estates, I cannot understand how the Hon'ble the Finance Minister expects an additional revenue from lands to the extent of Rs. 7,63,000. Then he expects about 5 lakhs more from "Stamps". Five lakhs from Stamps is very problematic—in any case, it is optimistic. Why I raise this question is this: he is borrowing a crore of rupees on the strength of this expectation—about 13 lakhs of rupees—and he is increasing expenditure. Then he proposes additional taxation. The additional taxation is supposed to yield about Rs. 12 lakhs—that is his estimate. Now, with regard to additional taxation, the tax on professions has been criticised very severely in this House, and very rightly too. It is wrong from many points of view. It is hard on the middle classes and also it does not spread evenly according to the needs of the population. Additional taxation you cannot justify except in an emergency or unless you are undertaking fresh works of nation-building departments. Of nation-building, we find very little in the budget. Those grants which have been made to some specific institutions are like trims and frills which cover the dead bones of a bankrupt budget. You may grant Rs. 2½ lakhs to the Seva Sadan—a good work done; you may grant a sum of money to the Viswa Bharati—again, I say a good work done; but the total amount of these grants which are like doles, which are in the form of patronage, bears only a small proportion to the revenues of the province.

The increase in the "General Administration" is very significant. There is absolutely no reason for increase in the "General Administration" expenditure. We are to-day thinking in terms of nation-building activities. We are thinking of making our nation as strong and as well-equipped for life as possible. All these things appear not in the budget speech, but in an appendix. Questions of rural credit —the most essential thing in the life of this Province—are all relegated to Appendix III of the printed budget speech. Why? Because Government have no policy in that matter. A Government of this kind can never have a policy. I have a feeling that the permanent officials laugh in their sleeves because they know that with the advent of this so-called Provincial Autonomy, they are much freer than they ever were before. Steelframe rules still hold good. I am not saying this because I happen to be in the Opposition, but this is a feeling which is growing in me that the permanent officials have a greater hold on the administration than they ever had before, because in the past, at any rate, their representatives had to explain the policy of the Government. Now they know that they have puppet Ministers who have only to sign. In order to please these puppet Ministers, they allow them a little latitude in their dealings.

Government have allotted Rs. 30,000 to the *Azad*. This Rs. 30,000 is a very small amount for a Government like this. At the same time, there is the question of principle. There is the Publicity Department; there are two papers—one English and one Bengali run by the Government—a commercial enterprise unheard of in a Government. One must complain against it. Although Rs. 30,000, as I said, was a very small amount, it has been given to a little rag which fans the flame of communalism, which day in and day out pours out venom which poisons the atmosphere of this country. I think, it is a case of utter shamelessness that such a thing was done. I am not one of those who believe that increased grants for scholarships for classes which require special aid in education are not needed. I fully justify increased grants for those communities which need them, especially in the sphere of education. I am not complaining against that, although one or two fancy items may be criticised; indeed if I had the power to give, I would give even more grants for educational facilities for those communities which require education. I am not a communalist by any means. I do not think, any of my friends would accuse me of that. But, at the same time, the fancy grants call for a little criticism, but I shall not on this occasion, when the time is very short, enter into them. I believe, they have been mentioned in the House during the discussion by other members. But one thing is certain that education, as such, should be one of the primary considerations of a Government especially in a country like ours, in a province like ours, where literacy has got to be improved, where facilities for education for all communities have to be provided for, and I feel, Government have not done sufficient justice to education as a whole. This lack of funds this year when the Provincial Exchequer is probably more prosperous than it has ever been is indeed something which does not plead the bankruptcy of the province but the bankruptcy of goodwill and intelligence.

Universities have been provided, but I do not think that they have been adequately provided.

What about the scheme for primary education? Mind that only pious wishes have been expressed by the Finance Minister, but where is that scheme of primary education? It is said that primary education means money and therefore it must take time for development, but has he got a scheme of primary education? During the two years of so-called Provincial Autonomy I should imagine that there was plenty of time to think out these problems—primary education and public health.

As regards roads, another very vital problem in the economic life of the country, they have been constructed only to suit certain purposes. As a Divisional Commissioner has to visit some places, a road is constructed; a District Magistrate has to go somewhere and a

road is constructed for that purpose; but what about a scheme for constructing roads in the villages? I know that it will take time. I am not so foolish, not so blind as not to know that you cannot straight-away construct roads in the villages, but at the same time I have witnessed, as most of us have witnessed, the great difficulties that villagers feel when they are cut off from even a town which is two or three miles away, when doctors cannot be found, just because there is no means of communication on account of lack of roads. Now I should expect from the Finance Minister who has given us a lot of advice, who has expressed very good intentions, to have some definite plans of road construction.

As regards the hospitals, the few grants which have been made are entirely laudable and I congratulate the Finance Minister on having made those grants, but what about hospitals in areas where there are no hospitals? Nothing is said in the Budget.

The excess of expenditure over the revised estimates of 1938-39 is Rs. 78,99,150, that is to say Rs. 79 lakhs roundly speaking. Now it has been very difficult for the Finance Minister in his speech to justify that large increase. He is relying on reserves, but the reserves may fall and if his calculations go wrong, the finances of this province would be in great jeopardy. I was recently reminded in this House, I believe, by one of our European colleagues, that Rome was not built in a day. I believe that is the plea which the Finance Minister will put forward, and I have no desire to anticipate his reply. I am afraid, that is what he is going to do. Rome was not built in a day; Bengal was not built in a day either. Bengal has been built up by toil and sacrifice, by the exercise of intelligence and of intellect and what we want is not the building of Bengal, because Bengal is already built. What we fear is that some of the broken arches of that building, arches broken by the past administration and which are going to be broken, as I fear they will be broken, by the present ministry if it continues in office long, will have to be repaired. It is to the re-building of the arches to which we must devote our attention. I feel that in winding up this discussion one word of warning must be given to the present Ministry. If they wish to continue in office—I have no desire and I can assure Mr. Suhrawardy that I do not want to become a Minister—, they should devote their attention not merely to repairing the broken arches of the previous regime but also to enlarge the mansion to make it habitable for the people of Bengal.

The Hon'ble Mr. NALINI RANJAN SARKER: The task of the Finance Minister is an unenviable one all over the world, and I am hardly surprised at the vehemence of the attack on the budget from all sides—from the left, from the right, and from the centre. Even some of the supporters of the Ministerial Party have not spared me? I am, however, thankful for the support and reasoned criticisms I have

received from the Leader of the European Group, the Maharaj Kumar of Burdwan representing the small nationalist group to which I have the honour to belong, and Messrs. Abul Hashim, Mohammed Ali and other members of the Muslim Group. I do not find it easy, much less a pleasant task to reply to the general discussion on the budget, when general discussion, it appears, is understood in the benches opposite to be something largely pointless. Most of the discussion has been characterised by a singular indifference to the hard realities of the situation which confront us. These critics have their heads in clouds, even though their feet do not rest on the heels. They have talked of the ideal, without fully realising the limitations both as regards men and in money by which our practical efforts towards national uplift must perforce be circumscribed; they have criticised the budget without troubling to consider what in fact they can rightly expect in a budget; and in all the attacks they have launched against the Government there seems to persist the idea that the Government in Bengal were particularly at fault, that they have failed or omitted to do what Governments elsewhere in India had all accomplished. As I have already said, I have been attacked by the left and by the right and as these are the days of the leftists, I think I should begin with the criticisms of the left.

I will first begin with Mr. Pramatha Nath Banerjee who initiated the budget discussion from the Congress side. The language, diction and delivery of Mr. Banerjee were all that one would expect from a professor of his eminence and reputation, but, unfortunately, Sir, so far as concrete criticism of the budget was concerned, I was rather disappointed by his speech. I hope my honourable friend will take it sportingly if I say that trying to scan the points in his speech I was irresistably reminded of the description that Shakespeare gives of Gratiano in the Merchant of Venice—"Gratiano talks an infinite deal of nothing, more than any man in Venice. His reasons are as two grains of wheat, hid in two bushels of chaff; you shall seek all day ere you find them; and when you have found them they are not worth the search". Mr. Banerjee, Sir, has tried to enliven the House by his humours and also indulged in puns sometimes, I am afraid, by rather straining the meaning more for mere effect than by way of any genuine criticism of the budget. For example, Mr. Banerjee has complained about the allotment of 15 minutes' time only to each speaker, and remarked that at this rate you had allowed only one minute for each 1 crore of rupees in a 15 crore budget. I quite appreciate the point of his complaint. But if by a 15-line resolution his party can hope to purchase the rights of zemindars on payment of fair compensation, to end the 150-year old Permenent Settlement, and thereby to provide for nation-building scheme costing Rs. 15 crores or more per annum, perhaps a crore a minute is after all not so very unfair.

My friend has also sarcastically referred to the Government's preference for bulls—stud bulls, Hariana bulls and John Bull. But in an agricultural economy, bulls must at all times occupy a place of importance. And I am afraid, even if my honourable friend were to have the reins of Government in his hand he would not find it so easy to dislodge the bull—whether it is stud bull or John Bull. When Mr. Banerjee first entered the legislative arena, his attitude to the Government of India Act, I believe, was that of a bull in a China shop —to destroy everything around it. But this attitude has already changed, and my friend and his party are now ready to work that Act, although the Act keeps all provisions for John Bull out of their hands altogether. However, we have had enough of bulls, I believe. I would only add that if this Government have a preference for bulls, they also know very well how to take a bull by the horns when this is necessary, as they did recently in Burdwan.

Professor Banerjee, Sir, has repeated the usual "hardy annuals" about the budget failing to solve the problem of unemployment, to provide *dal-bhat* to the man behind the plough, to liquidate the claims of trade, commerce and industry, to give irrigation to West Bengal and navigation to East Bengal, in short, to bring about the millenium which he seems to think the budget could bring with magical celerity. I have on numerous occasions emphasised that it was not possible to change the face of the land overnight. No Government possess a magic wand by which they could do so. The road to success, the road to big results, is not to be run upon by seven-leagued boots. Step by step, little by little, bit by bit—that is the way to well-being, that is the way to wisdom and that is the way to success and glory in the life of a nation as much as in the life of an individual. And to the extent that we may hasten, we must, under the circumstances, hasten slowly. I do not for a moment suggest that the Government have no deficiencies or shortcomings or that they have done everything possible. Perhaps an extraordinarily competent group of men would have been able to do more. Nevertheless, I do not believe that under the prevailing conditions and with our resources it would be possible even for such a group of persons to show such extraordinary results, as Mr. Banerjee would like to see materialise. There are other neighbouring Governments who are confronted with similar problems and who have the same objective as we have, viz., that of mass amelioration, but who are popularly supposed to be more capable and earnest than we are. They have also one decided advantage over us, that they have not to waste time and energy in fighting an opposition whose aim seems to embarrass the Government in any way. And yet, I ask honourable members, have they been able to solve the *dal-bhat* problem? Are their provinces flowing with milk and honey? The real fact, Sir, is that whether in Bengal or elsewhere the task of national regeneration is by its very nature a stupendous one, and, moreover, whatever the

calibre of a Government, the endeavours for national regeneration have everywhere to be made under various limitations, so that quick results of revolutionary changes are obviously out of the question. But even with those shortcomings, the Government are trying their best within the limitations of their resources, within such limitations as the available human material and the machinery and agencies that exist for giving effect to their schemes inevitably impose. I opened the pages of a budget of a sister Province—a Congress Province—and so far as the budget itself is concerned I did not find in it any of the things which Mr. Banerjee expects to see in a budget, viz., an easy formula for the removal of unemployment or a solution of the problem of *dal-bhat* for the masses. With your permission, Sir, I propose to give to the House some interesting comparative facts from the budget of that province for honourable members to consider: the facts will show how the two provinces stood on the date Provincial Autonomy began, and the extent of the increase in expenditure in each nation-building department which has since taken place in both. It will be clear from these facts that this province does not at all compare unfavourably so far as budget provisions are concerned.

Comparative Analysis of expenditure on Nation-building Departments.

(Figures are in thousands.)

	Bengal.				Bombay.			
	1937-38, Actuals	1938-39, Revised	1939-40, Budget	Increase since 1937-38	1937-38, Actuals	1938-39, Revised	1939-40, Budget	Increase since 1937-38
	Rs.	Rs	Rs	Rs	Rs	Rs	Rs	Rs.
Education	1,36,96	1,55,82	1,68,06	31,10	1,68,05	1,90,74	2,00,92	32,87
Medical	52,87	55,97	58,80	5,93	43,54	45,18	47,63	4 09
Public Health	30,32	43,12	48,52	18,20	24,06	31,59	31,48	7,42
Agriculture	11,53	14,16	16,69	5,16	13,68	15,77	13,06	−62
Veterinary	5,31	5,30	6,45	1,14	3,98	4,17	4 40	42
Co-operation	11,61	13,36	15,49	3,88	6,09	6,55	15,08	8,99
Industries	16,05	18,39	21,21	5,16	7,57	9,64	13,14	5,57
Debt Conciliation ..	7,93	12,09	21,12	13,19	..	..	2,48	2,48
Rural Reconstruction (General Administration)	..	32	2,26	2,26	..	63	52	52
Rural uplift (other than nation-building heads).	..	1,88	3,11	3,11	..	1,84	1,60	1,60
Civil works—								
Expenditure on Nation-building Departments only.	2,89	10,54	12,72	9,83	3,61	4,13	4,62	1,01
	2,75,47	3,30,97	3,74,4[illegible]	98,96	2,70,58	3,10,24	3,34,93	64,35
Expenditure from Road Development Fund.	13,22	23,31	29,61	16,39	38,90	36,89	36,00	−2,90
Total ..	2,88,69	3,54,28	4,04,04	1,15,35	3,09,48	3 47,13	3,70,93	61,45

I may assure the House that since the assumption of office by us we have not spent less than what other Governments have been able to do. As a matter of fact, we can show that we have done in many departments much more than what other provinces have done.

Sir, with reference to Mr. Banerjee's speech, he has again often tried to be too critical of my budget statement, without unfortunately being sufficiently correct. I am, Sir, citing a few specific instances. He says that we have eaten up the surplus and an additional taxation of Rs. 5,85,00,000 of jute duty in these two years. Sir, so far as jute duty is concerned, 50 per cent. of it always came to Bengal till 1936-37. So, when we assumed office we took advantage only of 12½ per cent. more. The opening balance at the commencement of 1937-38 was one crore and six lakhs of rupees and our closing balance, as a result of the working of the budget year, would be Rs. 78 lakhs. So, there was a drop of Rs. 28 lakhs only out of the balances. So far, out of the new taxation we have received in income-tax in 1937-38 Rs. 25 lakhs and in 1938-39 Rs. 30 lakhs. From jute duty we have received in 1937-38 Rs. 47 lakhs. We have got Rs. 1,43,00,000 and Rs. 28 lakhs from the opening balance. So, altogether we have taken advantage of Rs. 1,71,00,000 whereas in 1937-38 and 1938-39 we have provided new expenditure to the extent of Rs 1,89,00,000, of which about 90 per cent. are for nation-building departments.

Then, Sir, Mr Banerjee said, that I have kept the estimates particularly lower so that I can justify my taxation proposals. I need not reply to that assumption of Mr. Banerjee, because his Deputy Leader Mr. Goswami has said that my estimate under "Land Revenue" at least is much more on the liberal side, and I can only say that for taxation proposal it is not necessary to keep the revenue at a lower figure because taxation is always necessary for doing nation-building work.

Then, Sir, dog racing has been fortunate in evoking some sympathy from Mr. Banerjee but unfortunately Mr. Banerjee's concern for the more domesticated animal is not justified by the reasons he has adduced. What I have done for dog racing is merely to remove the loophole so far as that subject is concerned. As regards betting on horse race, I may say that it is already taxed and that about Rs. 10 lakhs is being realised from this source for the current year.

Then, Sir, Mr. Banerjee has said much about my taxation proposal. I do not want to waste your time to-day by giving my reply to these charges. I will make them when I introduce the taxation Bills.

Then, Sir, Mr. Banerjee and Mr. Goswami and some other members also have criticised our allotment of Rs. 30,000 for the "Azad." I believe the Hon'ble the Chief Minister who is in charge of the

Publicity Department will be able to make things quite clear at the time of the voting of grants. So far as my information goes, I may assure the House that the authorities of the paper in question did not approach the Government for this grant——

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: Unsolicited!

The Hon'ble Mr. NALINI RANJAN SARKER: There are many things given unsolicited, Dr. Sanyal knows it.

The attitude of the 'big' papers who call themselves nationalist papers, towards this Government is too well known to need any mention. The Government's supporters in the countryside are mostly Mahomedans, and it is the "Azad" which circulates among them. The paper does not at present possess such resources as to be able to print a sufficiently large number of copies and to have these circulated throughout the mufassil. This grant is meant only to help them in this respect, to enable them to print more copies and increase their circulation. It is a capital grant and not a recurring one. The Government also felt that as this was a new line of expenditure, they must take the legislature into confidence in this matter. They wanted the subject to be openly discussed in the legislature before taking any action. There has been nothing surreptitious, nothing malafide about the matter at all, which must be obvious from the fact that the paper has been clearly named and the matter is being placed before the legislature.

Dr. NALINAKSHA SANYAL: That is the only consolation.

The Hon'ble Mr. NALINI RANJAN SARKER: If for Dr. Sanyal's consolation I have been able to contribute even one matter, I am satisfied.

Now, Sir, I come to the speech of Rai Harendra Nath Chaudhuri. Mr. Chaudhuri is indignant, because I had the temerity to refer to international conditions. He has also accused me of inability to even frame estimates correctly.

As to what Mr. Chaudhuri said about my references to the international situation, I must confess that I felt vastly amused. I have no intention, Sir, to trench on the monopoly rights of those opposite who feel that they only are privileged to react to the frowns of Herr Hitler or the smiles of Signor Mussolini. But even to them, Sir, it should have been apparent—or am I presuming too much—that a Finance Minister who has to frame his estimates largely on receipt expected from an international and sensitive commodity like jute has perforce to take into account world conditions.

Mr. Chaudhuri has also had occasion to feel indignant, Sir, on the score that my estimates have not proved quite correct. I am willing to concede, Sir, that it would have been much better if they had proved reasonably correct. But, whatever care or caution I may take, estimates are liable to vary even widely on account of factors over which we have no control. Even at the risk of incurring Mr. Chaudhuri's displeasure again, I should like to refer him to the case of jute and I would like to show how the receipts that might be expected from the jute duty were estimated, but were subsequently belied as a result of world economic conditions.

Sir, when I framed the budget estimates of 1937-38 in the month of July, 1937, I took the figures of the revenues which were given on account of jute export duty in the previous year. Then the situation so improved that when I made the budget estimates in December and also prepared the revised estimates in the same month I found on the basis of seven months' actual that the jute duty as given was much more than what we had budgeted for on the lines of the last year. It was so much so that even the Accountant-General, Bengal, advised us to put the revised estimates at Rs 2,80,00,000 and he advised the Government of India also to accept that sum as the revised estimate. But when the time came, we scrutinised those figures. In view of the grave conditions, instead of Rs. 2,80,00,000 we put them at Rs. 2,56,00,000 and the Government of India accepted it afterwards. So in framing the budget, we have done our best, as far as it was possible to visualise in the month of December, 1938, and January, 1939.

Mr. Chaudhuri has criticised my estimates, and has said that since railway earnings had improved, there was no reason why our estimates should err so much on the wrong side. Not only has Mr. Chaudhuri not adequately realised the relation between railway earnings and provincial revenues, but, in this particular case, he has resorted to not a creditable device in quoting Sir Thomas Stewart in trying to condemn my estimates. He has quoted only a portion of a sentence from Sir Thomas's speech, viz., "Goods earnings mainly accounted for the improvement in receipts." I should like to read to the House what immediately followed: viz, "that the principal commodities contributing to it being coal, metallic ores, wheat, manufactured cotton goods and grains". Now, if Mr. Chaudhuri had only had the fairness to quote the whole sentence, it would have been apparent that increased earnings from these sources may not necessarily have—as in fact they had not—any relationship on the revenues of Bengal. The factors which helped to augment railway revenue have obviously no bearing on the jute trade or on the failure of Khas Mahal tenants to pay up their dues—and it is these and such other causes that have adversely affected our revenues. May I also cite an instance, Sir, to show the absurdity of Mr. Chaudhuri's contention in certain circumstances.

If, for example, a province is visited by famine, and food grain has to be imported from other provinces, railways will gain from freight charges on such transport but the budget of the affected province cannot fail to suffer from the effects of the famine.

Sir, may I instance another specimen of Mr. Chaudhuri's argument? "I do not know" he says "whether the year 1937 in which more than one million hundredweights of seeds were imported to Great Britain was a year of deterioration for jute trade or not", implying thereby that it could not be so. Sir, I really confess my inability to follow his argument. Whether jute trade in the international markets had suffered or not is a question of fact. Statistics show it has. If Mr. Chaudhuri feels sore at this fact, let him quarrel with the statistics, but not with me.

Another meaningless criticism of Mr. Chaudhuri is again this. Since Bombay revenues have increased in spite of deterioration in world economic conditions, why should Bengal revenues deteriorate?—says Mr. Chaudhuri. The answer is not so difficult if Mr. Chaudhuri had only cared to find it. The revenues of Bombay do not depend so largely on an item like the jute duty, whose yield is liable to vary so much for reasons outside our control. Further, Bombay has not either a land system as we have in Bengal. Again, the slight improvement of 11 lakhs in Bombay does not reflect any general improvement. It consists of a windfall from probate duties, and additional income from certain duties, like electricity duty, betting, tax, etc.

I will cite another instance in which Mr. Rai Chaudhuri has detached an observation from its context with the result that wholly unwarranted conclusions have been drawn from it. He attributes to me the statement that half of a gross decline of 80 lakhs in revenue receipts this year is due to world causes and the rest to a mixture of economic and political causes. Sir, the causes of the decline have been set forth on page 14 of the printed copy of my Budget Statement and honourable members will see that I have not said that half of the gross decline was due to world causes. The expression which has been quoted will be found on page 2 of the Budget Statement where I was explaining the net decline of 41 lakhs. It is a fact that out of this net decline, 22 lakhs, namely, 9 lakhs under Jute Duty and 13 lakhs under non-judicial stamps were due to poor trading results. So, there was nothing wrong in what I said unless it is transposed to a context which misinterprets its meaning.

Mr. Chaudhuri has not been satisfied by merely criticising my estimates. In his attempt to discredit the efforts of Government to provide more money for education, he has resorted to a peculiar arithmetical theory of his own. "In 1929-30" he says, "when the total expenditure of the province was about 12 crores 'Education' expenditure covered 12·60 per cent. and now when our total expenditure is

proposed to be 14·65 crores 'Education' is going to get only 11·5 per cent. This is a progress in the wrong direction." Sir, compared to 1929-30, the expenditure for education has gone up by nearly 21 lakhs but nevertheless in Mr. Chaudhuri's view this is the reverse of progress. As for Mr. Chaudhuri's arithmetical theory I can only express my surprise at the fact that it should have been propounded seriously before an Assembly of grown up and intelligent men. Sir, a sum of Rs. 100 divided equally between Education and Public Health ensures to each 50 per cent. of the total expenditure. If a further sum of Rs. 100 is divided between the same departments in the same proportion, though the provision for each is doubled Mr. Rai Chaudhuri would not call it progress for does not the total percentage still remain as 50?

Sir, while the pressing nature of the problem of unemployment, of the problem of *dal bhat* for the people has been emphasised in discussions on the budget, there has at the same time been opposition to more expenditure on civil and public works. Capital expenditure on brick and mortar, on road construction, on construction of bridges and buildings, etc., is one of the well-recognised methed of providing employment especially in times of distress. Where agriculture does not provide employment throughout the year, public works such as road and bridge construction, etc., certainly offer most valuable avenues for gainful employment whose utility could hardly be exaggerated. To oppose such expenditure therefore and yet to press for the removal of unemployment is certainly not a reasonable attitude.

I must here also refer to one argument which has been advanced for curtailing or even altogether holding up expenditure on civil works. The argument proceeds on the belief that with the money that would be realised by holding up expenditure on civil works, far-reaching progress could be made with primary education The argument is specious but not correct. In the first place, the money thus available would be insignificantly small compared to our vast needs for primary education. Moreover, what is more important, is that for the extension of free and compulsory primary education we shall require a very large recurring expenditure regularly year after year. But money spent on civil works is capital expenditure and does not continue from year to year, and this can never provide the regular and recurring funds that we require for primary education.

While on the subject of primary education, I may be permitted briefly to refer to the policy and position in this matter, the details of which the Hon'ble the Minister in charge will no doubt narrate to the House at the time of the voting of the education grants. As regards the Government's policy in regard to primary education, I may state that the Government are committed to the extension of free and universal compulsory primary education. They have also imposed a cess for this purpose; full effect would most probably have been given during the

current year itself to the provisions of the Act imposing the cess, but this could not be done owing to widespread floods in the province and due to requests from the public for exemption from cess during this year of distress. It is hoped that the Act will be fully implemented during the next year. But there are two things I would like to emphasise in this connection. In the first place, it must be clearly realised that the extension of universal primary education would not be possible without the payment of the cess, and, secondly, not only must the cess be paid, but it must also be paid regularly and punctually; for unless the payment is regular and punctual, the machinery devised for extension of primary education cannot work. These are very important factors which I would request honourable members to realise. If they are serious in their desire to see primary education extend over the entire province, this is an aspect of the question which they must seriously consider and not merely try to find fault with Government.

In connection with the primary education the Deputy Leader of the Opposition, Mr. Goswami, has said that there is no scheme for primary education. May I tell him that this is the only province which has prepared a scheme for primary education, which has already passed an Act for the imposition of education cess and for devising machinery through which primary education can be extended. I think Mr. Goswami, in this primary education matter, has spoken without understanding or without knowing full well the present position.

There has been a good deal of criticism on the ground that the needs of the Scheduled Castes have not received proper consideration at the hands of Government. This I must say is far from being the case. Fortunately for us in Bengal the Scheduled Castes labour under no special disabilities as they do in some other provinces. Whatever measures for improvement may be taken, whether it is in agriculture, in industry, in public health or education, primary or adult, the benefits are available to them fully in common with member of other communities. Educational institutions in the province from the lowest to the highest, which are open to Hindus in general are equally open to them also. They do not require any special institutions like madrasahs for Muslims for their cultural education, since their culture is common with Hindus in general. In these circumstances, all that they really require is that they may be enabled to derive the maximum benefit from the facilities which exist for them in common with others. With this end in view, the Government have provided special scholarships and stipends in various spheres of general, medical and technical education for students of Scheduled Castes. The proposal which has been put forward by the Scheduled Castes Education Committee that all students of these castes should be enabled to receive education free of charge appears to me to be neither sound nor really for the best interest of the community at large, because it makes no distinction

between the needy and the affluent and by helping even those who require no aid, it reduces the relief which the truly necessitous might otherwise obtain. I also consider that in those areas such as, for example, Jalpaiguri, Midnapore, Bankura, 24-Parganas, where Scheduled Castes predominate and where there may not be a sufficient number of educational institutions, the Government should establish such institutions in the interest of promotion of education among Scheduled Castes: and I may mention that this is a matter which is under the consideration of Government. I can fully assure my friends of the Scheduled Castes that the Government are as anxious as they themselves to assist Scheduled Castes members and to remove all genuine obstacles in the path of their progress and prosperity. But like every other thing, such objects also cannot be realised overnight.

Sir, I would now like to address a few words to those members of the Coalition Party who have spoken bitterly about inefficiency in working the departments of the Government. I realise that it is mostly their anxiety to go ahead with an ameliorative programme that has inspired these criticisms. But I have been at pains to emphasise that the solution of a problem does not become any easier just because we realise the urgency of it. We must never lose sight of the realities of the situation, the limitations under which we must work and strive for the solution of our problems; our growth, our development, our efforts must all be inevitably conditioned by the environment and circumstances in which we are placed. But if in spite of all this party members are still not satisfied, I need hardly point out that it is with the support of the Coalition Party that Government are continuing and carrying on their work. It is the Coalition Party which practically runs the Government. If members of the party genuinely feel that the present Government or any of the departments of the present Government are not functioning efficiently, and if they think that there are other members in the party who would be able to run the Government or the departments more efficiently and lead the province quicker towards the solution of the problem of *dal-bhat* for the masses or the problems of unemployment, primary education, etc., would it not be conducive to a healthier atmosphere to replace the present Ministers by others better able to run the administration in the opinion of the party members? That would probably be a more straightforward course and there is constitutional sanction behind it. For, since they are the arbiters of the Government, the Government in power should have their fullest support and confidence. For, as I have said, the party has the power to change the present Government should it be considered unequal to the task imposed upon it. And should it so happen that the majority party does not possess men who could run the administration better it has no choice but to accept and support the best team that is available in the circumstances.

It is true that our problems are many and it is also necessary that the problems should be solved as speedily as possible. But we cannot get the solution merely by wishing it. In those civilized countries where a great advance has been made in tackling such problems and whose examples are cited so often in this House, the advance has been the result of years of careful thinking, planning and execution. And progress in those countries has been comparatively easier because the general atmosphere is far more favourable, far more receptive for any such work, for things are understood easier and appreciated better. The general level here in every respect is yet so much lower that our environment itself provides impediment to quick results. In our public life the claims of merit and efficiency have yet to be tempered by considerations of caste and community, and that being the position, it would be idle to expect national progress to take great strides such as were not possible even under the regime of a Hitler, a Mussolini or a Roosevelt. A Government of the people must depend for its success on the measure of intelligence, capacity for work, morality, sense of justice and sense of proportion of its people. This is a fundamental truth to ignore the full import of which would be folly. I may explain the position further by an analogy. If we are yet in a stage of economic civilisation where the bullock cart must remain the principal means of transport over vast areas, it would be idle to sigh for motor cars and for the speed and comfort in travel that a motor car means. We must have the resources for a motor car first, we must have motorable roads throughout, our bullock cart drivers must be trained to handle motor cars before we can think of having our bullock carts replaced by motor cars. I hope members of the Coalition Party would give their most serious thought to these hard realities of our situation.

Sir, I want to say one or two words in reply to Mr. Mozammel Huq's speech to-day. I admit that I have got the misfortune to wear clean and white clothes and I also shave. If that is my disqualification—wearing of clean cloths and shaving—if these are disqualifications, Mr. Mozammel Huq has every liberty to disclose the names of those who according to his opinion are competent enough to carry on the administration. There is also misapprehension that whichever proposal is brought into the budget, everything, is the handiwork of one man, viz., the Finance Minister. That is not the case. The proposals are first made by the departments concerned. The Finance Minister has to provide money for it only. He has nothing to do with any scheme particularly as the Finance Minister, except to the extent that he is equally responsible with other Ministers for every proposal made.

Mr. Narendra Narayan Chakravarty said that co-operation with this Ministry for the prosecution of even a constructive ameliorative programme was an impossibility, since it was, in his opinion, reactionary

in character. Miss Mira Datta Gupta also has spoken in the same vein to-day. Knowing as I do some of the members of the Bengal Congress Party, such a reply was not quite unexpected. It is, however, fortunate that all Congressmen do not apparently share such a view. I may in this connection narrate an incident. A friend, who is a prominent Congressman, had sought Mahatmaji's advice as to whether it would be proper for him to approach the Government of Bengal for assistance to a certain institution. Mahatmaji replied with his characteristic frankness that there was certainly nothing wrong in his seeking the help and assistace of the Government of Bengal, for the Bengal Government, as Mahatmaji put it, is also a national Government, though not a Congress Government (A voice from the Congress benches: "Mahatmaji's certificate is a great joy to Mr. Sarker.")

Why are my friends so perturbed over Mahatmaji's letter?

Babu NARENDRA NARAYAN CHAKRABARTY: I request you to follow Mahatma Gandhi.

The Hon'ble Mr. NALINI RANJAN SARKER: Are you following Mahatmaji always?

Mr. DHIRENDRA NATH DATTA: Is the letter addressed to you?

The Hon'ble Mr. NALINI RANJAN SARKER: It was addressed to a friend, as I have clearly said; he is also a prominent Congressman of Bengal.

I do not want to waste your time any more because we shall get ample opportunities at the time of voting of grants to give expression to the various specific things which have been said in the budget discussion in this House. I want to thank the honourable members that though they have criticised me bitterly, they have given me a patient hearing for which I am grateful to them.

Adjournment.

The House was then adjourned till 4-45 p.m. on Monday, the 27th February, 1939, at the Assembly House, Calcutta.

Index to the
Bengal Legislative Assembly Proceedings.
(Official Report.)

Vol. LIV—No. 1—Fifth Session, 1939.

15th, 16th, 20th, 21st, 22nd, 23rd and 25th February, 1939.

[(Q.) Stands for question.]

Abdul Bari, Maulvi

Budget Discussion pp. 206-210.

Causes of floods in Murshidabad: (Q.) p. 81.

Damage of Kalai crops in Murshidabad (Q.) p. 205.

Rabi crops in Murshidabad (Q.) p. 309.

Abdul Hafiz, Mr. Mirza

Budget Discussion pp. 239-240.

Abdul Hamid, Mr. A. M.

Budget Discussion pp. 295-297

Abdul Hamid Shah, Maulvi

Minimum salary of Government servants. (Q.) p. 33.

Number of processes executed by the District Nazir of the Howrah Civil Courts (Q.) p. 25.

Abdulla-Al Mahmood, Mr.

Appointments in Revenue Department in the regime of present Hon'ble Minister: (Q.) p. 319.

Appointment of Muhammadans as Sub-Registrars for last two years (Q.) p. 199.

Budget Discussion pp. 213-215.

Clerical establishment in Civil Courts of Patna: (Q.) p. 259.

Distress due to floods in Serajganj Subdivision: (Q.) p. 150.

Abdulla-Al Mahmood, Mr. (*Contd.*)

Elliot Bridge at Serajganj. (Q.) p. 4.

Introduction of Rural Reconstruction Scheme: (Q.) p. 85.

Ratio in Government Services and compulsory retirement (Q.) p. 8.

Witness shed in the Civil and Criminal Courts, Serajganj (Q.) p. 21.

Abdul Latif Biswas, Maulvi

Buchanan-trained persons as District Organisers. (Q.) p. 249

Budget Discussion pp. 217-220.

Establishment of Drawing Office under the Chief Engineer (Q.) p. 5.

Abdul Wahab Khan, Mr.

Budget Discussion pp. 292-294.

Confirmation of one Muslim temporary clerk (Q.) p. 242.

Extension of clerical staff of the Eastern Circle. (Q.) p. 253.

Muslim percentage in clerical and subordinate services in Communication and Works Department: (Q.) p. 241.

Temporary posts in Eastern Circle: (Q.) p. 141.

Abdur Rashid Mahmood, Mr.

Budget Discussion: pp. 280-281.

Abdur Rauf, Mr. Shah

Budget Discussion. pp. 284-285.

Abolition of Subdivisional Munsif system: (Q.) p. 26.

Abu Hosain Sarkar, Maulvi

Budget Discussion: pp. 184-185.

Calcutta Khilafat Committee: (Q.) p. 122.

Honorary Magistrates at Gaibandha: (Q.) p. 20.

Stationery articles for process-servers: (Q.) p. 35.

Working hours of clerks of Gaibandha Civil Courts: (Q.) p. 20.

Abul Fazl, Mr. Muhammad

Ad valorem court-fees for the awards of Debt Settlement Boards: (Q.) p. 135.

Budget Discussion pp 294-295.

Flood relief at Madaripur: (Q.) p. 316.

Insufficient Government loan to the flood-stricken people of Bengal (Q.) p. 9.

Membership of the Debt Settlement Board: (Q.) p. 144.

Abul Hashim, Maulvi

Budget Discussion: pp 272-273.

Abul Hosain Ahmed, Mr.

Number of Debt Settlement Officers in Bengal: (Q.) p. 313.

Accident in Santahar Yard of Eastern Bengal Railway. Enquiry into p. 132.

Adjournment Motion

Regarding promulgation of the Bengal Jute Ordinance: p. 41.

Regarding promulgation of section 144 of Criminal Procedure Code on 13th February, 1939, in certain parts of the Burdwan district: pp. 99-118.

Adjournment of the House: pp. 78, 118, 194, 240, 300, 301, 347.

Ad valorem court-fees for the awards of Debt Settlement Boards: (Q.) pp. 135, 144.

Agricultural loan in Tippera district. (Q.) p. 310.

Agricultural loans and gratuitous relief in the province: (Q.) p. 314.

Ahmed Hosain, Mr.

Budget Discussion: pp. 234-235.

Cinemas in Bengal excluding Calcutta: (Q.) p. 137.

Non-Bengalis in menial services of Government: (Q.) p. 129.

All-Bengal Registration Employees' Association: (Q.) p. 311.

Amir Ali, Md., Mia

Budget Discussion p. 297.

Appointment(s)

In different grades of services (Q.) p 243.

In Revenue Department in the regime of present Hon'ble Minister (Q.) p. 319

Of an Assistant Matron for Presidency Jail (Q.) p. 24.

Of Government Pleader and Public Prosecutor of Rajshahi (Q.) p. 11.

Of Muhammadans as Sub-Registrars for last two years: (Q.) p. 199.

To all grades of clerical and menial posts in Civil Courts in Bengal: (Q.) p. 260.

Asimuddin Ahmed, Mr.

Budget Discussion: pp. 232-233.

Attacks on Hindu processions by non-Hindus: (Q.) p. 124.

Attendance: pp. 1, 79, 119, 195, 241, 301, 302.

Azhar Ali, Maulvi

Budget Discussion: pp 274-275.

Representation regarding Ishurdi-Pabna-Sadhuganj Railway Project: (Q.) p. 128.

Baby Show at Dinajpur: (Q.) p. 136.

Bakarganj

Establishment of Debt Settlement Board at Nlamatty (Q.) p. 151.

Silting up of the Bishkhali Done (Q.) p. 142.

Subidpur Debt Settlement Board (Q.) p. 151.

Balurghat. Complaints against Sub-divisional Officer of (Q.) p 119.

Banerjee, Mr. Pramatha Nath

Adjournment Motion pp. 99-103

Budget Discussion pp. 178-183.

Banerjee, Mr. Sibnath

Adjournment Motion p. 41.

Change in the Order of Business p. 76.

Banerjee, Dr. Suresh Chandra

Budget Discussion pp. 223-225.

Banerji, Mr. P.

Adjournment Motion. pp. 114-116.

Bangaon Local Board, Jessore: (Q.) p. 140.

Barman, Babu Shyama Prosad

Ad valorem court-fees for the awards of Debt Settlement Boards. (Q.) p. 144.

District Board of Dinajpur (Q.) p. 140.

Suspension of certificate procedure: (Q.) p. 323.

Barman, Babu Upendra Nath

Chukani holdings in Jalpaiguri Duars Khas Mahal: (Q.) p. 312.

Basu, Mr. Jatindra Nath

Tribute to Lord Brabourne: p. 305.

Beldanga Municipality: (Q.) p. 252.

Bengal

Influx of foreigners in (Q.) p. 147.

Bengal Agricultural Debtors Act. Hardship to the debtors and creditors for fees under. (Q.) p. 145.

Bengal Duars Railway. Bridge on: (Q.) p. 21.

Bengal Provincial Students' Federation.

Suppression of. (Q.) p. 195.

Bhagirathi embankment at Haridasmati, Berhampore, Murshidabad: (Q.) p. 151.

Bhatiapara Railway line. Extension of up to Barisal via Madaripur (Q.) p 257.

Biswas, Mr. Rasik Lal

Budget Discussion pp. 229-231.

Biswas, Mr. Surendra Nath

Extension of Bhatiapara Railway line up to Barisal via Madaripur (Q.) p 257.

Bongaon-Kamdevpur Road in Jessore district (Q.) p. 243.

Bose, Mr. Sarat Chandra

Change in the Order of Business: pp. 74, 75, 77.

Tribute to Lord Brabourne: p. 304.

Brabourne, Lord. Tribute to: pp. 302-309.

Breaches in the Gumti Embankment: (Q.) p. 203.

Bridge on Bengal Duars Railway: (Q.) p. 21.

Bridges and Roads Projects: (Q.) p. 36.

Buchanan-trained persons as District Organisers: (Q.) p. 249.

Budget
Time-limit of speeches on the general discussion of: p. 117.

Budget Discussion: pp. 177-194, 206-240, 260-300, 325-347.

Budget Estimates for 1939-40. Hon'ble Finance Minister's Speech: pp. 42-72.

Bus licences. Issue of—by Magistrates of the 24-Parganas: (Q.) p. 35.

Calcutta Khilafat Committee: (Q.) p. 122.

Campbell, Sir George

Budget Discussion: pp. 260-262.

Tribute to Lord Brabourne: p. 304.

Cattle protection scheme: (Q.) p. 204.

Causes of floods in Murshidabad: (Q.) p. 81.

Certificate procedure. Suspension of (Q.) p. 323.

Chakrabarty, Mr. Jatindra Nath

Bridge on Bengal Duars Railway. (Q.) p. 21.

Female waiting room in Sub-Registry Offices: (Q.) p. 317.

Chakrabarty, Babu Narendra Narayan

Budget Discussion: pp. 185-187.

Construction of the Pabna-Bera Road: (Q.) p. 255.

Change

In the Order of the Agenda: pp. 97, 98.

In the Order of Business: pp. 72-78.

Chaudhuri, Rai Harendra Nath

Attacks on Hindu processions by non-Hindus: (Q.) p. 124.

Budget Discussion: pp. 210-213.

Irrigation problems of the province: (Q.) p. 95.

Prohibition in Noakhali: (Q.) p. 318.

Release of political prisoners: (Q.) p. 244.

Revision of Jail Codes: (Q.) p. 124.

System of ballot voting by symbols in Municipal and Union Board Elections: (Q.) p. 133.

Chief Engineer. Establishment of drawing Office under (Q.) p. 5.

Chittagong Forests Department. Oppression by (Q.) p. 323.

Chukani holdings in Jalpaiguri Duars Khas Mahal (Q.) p. 312.

Cinemas in Bengal excluding Calcutta: (Q.) p. 137.

Civil Courts in Bengal. Appointment to all grades of clerical and menial posts in: (Q.) p. 260.

Civil Courts of Pabna. Clerical establishment in: (Q.) p. 259.

Clerical and menial posts in Civil Courts in Bengal. Appointment to all grades of: (Q.) p. 260.

Clerical establishment in Civil Courts of Pabna: (Q.) p. 259.

Clerks

In the Mymensingh district. Transfer of (Q.) p. 149.

Revision of pay of—in offices of District and Assistant Inspectors of Schools: (Q.) p. 33.

Clerks and peons

In the 24-Parganas Civil Court appointed during 1936-37 and 1937-38. Names and home addresses of (Q.) p. 30.

In the 24-Parganas Collectorate appointed during 1936-37 and 1937-38. Names and home addresses of (Q.) p. 30.

Comilla-Daudkandi Road: (Q.) p. 254.

Communication and Works Department. Muslim percentage in clerical and subordinate services in (Q.) p. 241

Complaints

Against Debt Settlement Boards: (Q.) p. 143.

Against Subdivisional Officer, Balurghat (Q.) p. 119.

Compulsory retirement and ratio in Government Services: (Q.) p. 8.

Condition of the Nabaganga between Naldi and Lohagara: (Q.) p. 201.

Confirmation of one Muslim temporary clerk: (Q.) p. 242.

Construction of the Pabna-Bera Road (Q.) p. 255.

Dacca Collectorate. Rent clerk in the. (Q.) p. 149.

Dairy farming attached to Bengal Veterinary College. Schemes for: (Q.) p. 27.

Damage of kalai crops in Murshidabad: (Q.) p. 205.

Das, Mr. Anukul Chandra

Tribute to Lord Brabourne: p. 306.

Das, Mr. Monmohan

Budget Discussion: pp. 225-227.

Grievances of fishermen of Bengal (Q.) p. 125.

Private deed-writers of Registration Offices in Bengal: (Q.) p. 80.

Das, Babu Radha Nath

Kulti Channel Scheme. (Q.) p. 324.

Datta, Mr. Dhirendra Nath

Agricultural loan in Tippera district (Q.) p. 310.

Breaches in the Gumti embankment (Q.) p. 203.

Budget Discussion. pp. 235-238.

Comilla-Daudkandi Road: (Q.) p. 254.

Complaints against Debt Settlement Boards (Q.) p. 143.

Hardship to the debtors and creditors for fees under Bengal Agricultural Debtors Act (Q.) p. 145.

Debt Settlement Board(s)

Ad valorem court-fees for the awards of (Q.) p. 135.

Ad valorem court-fees for the awards of (Q.) p. 144.

Complaints against: (Q.) p. 143.

Establishment of—at Niamatty, Bakarganj. (Q.) p. 151.

Membership of. (Q.) p. 144.

Subidpur—in Bakarganj (Q.) p. 151.

Debt Settlement Officers in Bengal. Number of: (Q.) p. 313.

Deputy Director of Sericulture: (Q.) p. 12.

Deputy Speaker (Mr. M. Ashraf Ali)

Tribute to Lord Brabourne: pp. 308-309.

Dinajpur Baby Show: (Q.) p. 136.

Dinajpur District Board: (Q.) p. 140.

Direct road from Naldi to Kalia in Jessore: (Q.) p. 79.

Disallowance of plying motor buses and taxis from Raghunathganj to Daffarpur by Subdivisional Officer of Jangipur. (Q.) p. 152.

Distress due to floods in Serajganj subdivision: (Q.) p. 150.

District Board of Dinajpur: (Q.) p. 140.

District Nazir of the Howrah Civil Courts. Number of processes executed by: (Q.) p. 25.

District Organisers. Buchanan-trained persons as: (Q.) p. 249.

Dutta Gupta, Miss Mira

Budget Discussion: pp. 329-331.

Revision of text-books at Government's direction: (Q.) p. 203.

Using of Government rent-free land: (Q.) p. 22.

Eastern Bengal Railway. Enquiry into accident in Santahar Yard: (Q.) p. 132.

Eastern Circle. Extension of clerical staff of the: (Q.) p. 253.

Edbar, Mr Upendranath

Budget Discussion: pp. 187-190.

Education Department. Ministerial officers of—on extension of service: (Q.) p. 28.

Election of Rangpur District Board: (Q.) p. 256.

Elections

System of ballot voting by symbols in Municipal and Union Board: (Q.) p. 133.

Elliot Bridge at Serajganj: (Q.) p. 4.

Embankment of Bhagirathi at Haridasmati, Berhampore, Murshidabad: (Q.) p. 151.

Emdadul Haque, Kazi

Budget Discussion: pp. 192-194.

Enquiry into accident in Santahar Yard of Eastern Bengal Railway: (Q.) p. 132.

Establishment

Of Debt Settlement Board at Niamatty, Bakarganj. (Q.) p. 151.

Of Drawing Office under the Chief Engineer (Q.) p. 5.

Extension

Of Bhatiapara Railway line up to Barisal via Madaripur. (Q.) p. 257.

Of clerical staff of the Eastern Circle: (Q.) p 253

Fazlul Huq, the Hon'ble Mr. A. K.

All-Bengal Registration Employees' Association: (Q.) p. 312.

Appointment of Muhammadans as Sub-Registrars for last two years: (Q.) p. 199.

Buchanan-trained persons as District Organisers (Q.) p. 249.

Change in the Order of the Agenda: p. 98.

Change in the Order of Business: p. 78.

Female waiting room in Sub-Registry Offices. (Q.) p. 318.

Grants to schools functioning in place of defunct circle schools in Bengal: (Q.) p. 313.

Ministerial officers of Education Department on extension of service: (Q.) p. 28.

Miss Muktaprova Bose, Assistant Head Mistress, Vidyamoyee Girls' School, Mymensingh: (Q.) p. 90.

Fazlul Huq, the Hon'ble Mr. A. K. (*Contd.*)

Night Classes in Vidyasagar College, Calcutta: (Q.) p. 41.

Private deed-writers of Registration Offices in Bengal: (Q.) p. 80.

Regarding Breach of Privilege. p. 72.

Reply to the statement of Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed: pp. 168-177

Revision of pay of clerks in offices of District and Assistant Inspectors of Schools: (Q.) p. 33.

Revision of text-books at Government's direction: (Q.) p. 203.

Scholarship to a relation of Hon'ble Minister, Co-operative Credit and Rural Indebtedness (Q.) p. 247.

Suppression of Bengal Provincial Students' Federation (Q.) p. 195.

Tribute to Lord Brabourne pp. 302-304

Fazlur Rahman, Mr. (Mymensingh)

Budget Discussion pp. 264-266

Transfer of clerks in Mymensingh district: (Q.) p. 149.

Female waiting room in Sub-Registry Offices: (Q.) p. 317.

Fishermen of Bengal. Grievances of: (Q.) p. 125.

Flood-affected people of Tippera. Gratuitous relief and agricultural loan to: (Q.) p. 145.

Flood relief at Madaripur: (Q.) p. 316.

Flood-stricken people of Bengal. Insufficient Government loan to the: (Q.) p. 9.

Forests Department, Chittagong. Oppression by: (Q.) p. 323.

Faridpur

Honorary Magistrates at: (Q.) p. 20.

Faridpur Civil Courts. Working hours of clerks of: (Q.) p. 20.

General Discussion of the Budget: pp. 177-194, 206-240, 260-300, 325-347.

Ghose, Mr. Atul Krishna

Budget Discussion: pp. 262-264.

Condition of the Nabaganga between Naldi and Lohagara: (Q.) p. 201.

Direct road from Naldi to Kalia in Jessore. (Q.) p. 79.

Prisoners' food in jail. (Q.) p. 123.

Resuscitation of the Nabaganga: (Q.) p. 130.

Goswami, Mr. Tulsi Chandra

Budget Discussion: pp. 331-335.

Government rent-free land. Using of: (Q.) p. 22.

Government servants. Minimum salary of (Q.) p. 33.

Government services. Ratio in—and compulsory retirement (Q.) p. 8.

Grand Trunk Road. Repair of the: (Q.) p. 205.

Grants to schools functioning in place of defunct circle schools in Bengal: (Q.) p. 313.

Gratuitous relief

And agricultural loans in the province: (Q.) p. 314.

And agricultural loan to flood-affected people of Tippera. (Q.) p. 145.

Grievances of fishermen of Bengal: (Q.) p. 125.

Griffiths, Mr. C.

Budget Discussion: pp. 326-328.

Tribute to Lord Brabourne: p. 307.

Gumti embankment. Breaches in the: (Q.) p. 203.

Gupta, Mr. Jagesh Chandra

Change in the Order of Business: pp. 72, 73, 78.

Gupta, Mr. J. N.

All-Bengal Registration Employees' Association: (Q.) p. 311.

Enquiry into accident in Santahar Yard of Eastern Bengal Railway: (Q.) p. 132.

Smoke evils in the residential quarters of railway staff: (Q.) p. 2.

Workers in Railway Conciliation Board: (Q.) p. 84.

Habibullah, the Hon'ble Nawab Bahadur, K., of Dacca

Bongaon Local Board, Jessore: (Q.) p. 140.

District Board of Dinajpur: (Q.) p. 140.

Election of Rangpur District Board: (Q.) p. 256.

Kulti Channel Scheme: (Q.) p. 324.

Municipality at Beldanga: (Q.) p. 252.

Present Deputy Director of Sericulture: (Q.) p. 13.

Status and standard of Government Silk Weaving Institute at Berhampore: (Q.) p. 8.

System of ballot voting by symbols in Municipal and Union Board Elections: (Q.) p. 133.

Hamiduddin Ahmad, Khan Sahib

Budget Discussion: pp. 288-290.

Hardship to the debtors and creditors for fees under Bengal Agricultural Debtors Act: (Q.) p. 145.

Hasina Murshed, M.B.E., Mrs.

Budget Discussion: pp. 190-191.

Health Officer for Maternity Home, Suri, Birbhum: (Q.) p. 142.

Hindu possessions. Attacks on—by non-Hindus: (Q.) p. 124.

Honorary Magistrates at Gopiganjha: (Q.) p. 20.

Idris Ahmed Mia, Mr.

Budget Discussion: pp. 227-229.

Improvement of lands within Hijole area in Murshidabad: (Q.) p. 198.

Influx of foreigners into Bengal: (Q.) p. 147.

Inspectors. Promotion of—to the rank of District Superintendents of Police: (Q.) p. 33.

Insufficient Government loan to the flood-stricken people of Bengal. (Q.) p. 9.

Introduction of Rural Reconstruction Scheme: (Q.) p. 85.

Invalid, infirm and deformed persons in Bengal. Statistics of: (Q.) p. 128.

Irrigation problems of the province: (Q.) p. 95.

Ishurdi-Pabna-Sadhuganj Railway Project. Representation regarding: (Q.) p. 128.

Issue of bds licences by Magistrate of the 24-Parganas: (Q.) p. 35.

Jail

Prisoners' food in: (Q.) p. 123.

Jail Codes. Revision of: (Q.) p. 124.

Jalaluddin Hashemy, Mr. Syed

Budget Discussion: p. 329.

Poor Fund: (Q.) p. 244.

Tribute to Lord Brabourne: p. 307.

Jalpaiguri Duars Khas Mahal. Chukani holdings in: (Q.) p. 312.

Jasimuddin Ahmed, Mr.

Abolition of Subdivisional Munsif system: (Q.) p. 26.

Issue of bus licences by Magistrate of the 24-Parganas: (Q.) p. 35.

Ministerial officers of Education Department on extension of service (Q.) p. 28.

Names and home addresses of clerks and peons in the 24-Parganas Collectorate appointed during 1936-37 and 1937-38 (Q.) p. 30

Names and home addresses of clerks and peons in the 24-Parganas Civil Court appointed during 1936-37 and 1937-38: (Q.) p. 30.

Promotion of Inspectors to the rank of District Superintendents of Police: (Q.) p. 33.

Revision of pay of clerks in offices of District and Assistant Inspectors of Schools: (Q.) p. 33

Jessore

Bongaon Local Board. (Q.) p. 140.

District. Bongaon-Kamdevpur Road: (Q.) p. 243.

Direct road from Naldi to Kalia: (Q.) p. 79.

Kalai Crops in Murshidabad. Damage of: (Q.) p. 205.

Karatoya Resuscitation Project: (Q.) p. 94.

Khaitan, Mr. Debi Prosad

Tribute to Lord Braboarne: pp. 306-307.

Khilafat Committee, Calcutta: (Q.) p. 122.

Kulti Channel Scheme: (Q.) p. 324.

Kundu, Mr. Nishitha Nath

Baby Show at Dinajpur: (Q.) p. 136.

Budget Discussion: pp. 215-217.

Complaints against Subdivisional Officer, Balurghat: (Q.) p. 119.

Non-agriculturist tenants: (Q.) p. 126.

Landless agriculturists in Bengal. Statistics of: (Q.) p. 3.

Lands within Hijole area in Murshidabad. Improvement of: (Q.) p. 198.

Madaripur Flood Relief: (Q.) p. 316.

Mahatab, Maharajkumar Uday Chand

Budget Discussion pp. 266-268.

Mahtabuddin Ahmed, Khan Bahadur Maulvi

Budget Discussion: pp. 281, 282.

Maiti, Mr. Nikunja Behari

Budget Discussion. pp. 297-298.

Maji, Mr. Adwaita Kumar

Adjournment Motion. pp. 106-107.

Majumdar, Mrs. Hemaprova

Adjournment Motion: pp. 105-106.

Mal, Mr. Iswar Chandra

Budget Discussion: pp. 270-272.

Mandal, Mr. Jagat Chandra

Budget Discussion: pp. 285-286.

Mandal, Mr. Jogendra Nath

Budget Discussion: pp. 276-278.

Maniruddin Akhand, Maulvi

Budget Discussion: pp. 286-288.

Maniruzzaman Islamabadi, Maulana Md.

Budget Discussion: pp. 268-270.

Oppression by the Chittagong Forests Department: (Q.) p. 323.

Maqbul Hosain, Mr.

Budget Discussion: p. 238.

Gratuitous relief and agricultural loan to flood-affected people of Tippera: (Q.) p. 145.

Maternity Home, Suri, Birbhum. Health Officer for: (Q.) p. 142.

Membership of the Debt Settlement Board: (Q.) p. 144.

Menial services of Government. Non-Bengalis in: (Q.) p. 129.

Message conveying wishes for His Excellency's speedy recovery

Message conveying sincere wishes of the House for His Excellency Lord Brabourne's speedy recovery from illness: p. 155.

Minimum salary of Government servants: (Q.) p. 33.

Minister, Co-operative Credit and Rural Indebtedness. Scholarship to a relation of: (Q.) p. 247.

Ministerial officers of Education Department on extension of service: (Q.) p. 28.

Mohammed Ali, Khan Bahadur

Budget Discussion: pp. 290-291.

Karatoya Resuscitation Project: (Q.) p. 94.

Mookerjee, Dr. Syamaprasad

Tribute to Lord Brabourne: pp. 305-306.

Mosiem Ali Mollah, Maulvi

Appointment of Government Pleader and Public Prosecutor of Rajshahi: (Q.) p. 11.

Budget Discussion: p. 298.

Motor buses and taxis from Raghunathganj to Daffarpur. Disallowance of plying—by Subdivisional Officer of Jangipur: (Q.) p. 152.

Mozammel Huq, Maulvi Md.

Budget Discussion. pp. 328-329.

Muhammadans. Appointment of—as Sub-Registrars for last two years: (Q.) p. 199.

Muhammad Israil, Maulvi

Budget Discussion pp. 282-284.

Mukherjee, Mr. B.

Adjournment Motion pp. 103-105.

Muktaprova Bose, Miss. Assistant Head Mistress, Vidyamoyee Girls' School, Mymensingh (Q.) p. 89.

Mullick, the Hon'ble Mr. Mukunda Behari

Ad valorem court-fees for the awards of Debt Settlement Boards: (Q.) p. 135.

Ad valorem court-fees for the awards of Debt Settlement Boards: (Q.) p 144.

Complaints against Debt Settlement Boards: (Q.) p. 143.

Establishment of Debt Settlement Board at Niamatty, Bakarganj: (Q.) p. 151.

Hardship to the debtors and creditors for fees under Bengal Agricultural Debtors Act: (Q.) p. 145.

Membership of the Debt Settlement Board: (Q.) p. 144.

Number of Debt Settlement Officers in Bengal: (Q.) p. 313.

Subidpur Debt Settlement Board, Bakarganj: (Q.) p. 151.

Municipal and Union Board Elections
System of ballot voting by symbols: (Q.) p. 133.

Municipality at Baidanga: (Q.) p. 252.

Murshidabad

Bhagirathi embankment at Haridasmati, Berhampore (Q.) p. 151.
Causes of floods in. (Q.) p. 81.
Damage of kalai crops in (Q.) p. 205.
Improvement of lands within Hijole area (Q.) p. 198.
Rabi crops (Q.) p. 309.

Musharruff Hossain, the Hon'ble Nawab, Khan Bahadur

Abolition of Subdivisional Munsif system (Q.) p. 26.
Appointment of Government Pleader and Public Prosecutor of Rajshahi (Q.) p. 11.
Appointment to all grades of clerical and menial posts in Civil Courts in Bengal. (Q.) p. 260.
Clerical establishment in Civil Courts of Pabna: (Q.) p. 259.
Honorary Magistrates at Gaibandha (Q.) p. 20.
Minimum salary of Government servants: (Q.) p. 33.
Names and home addresses of clerks and peons in the 24-Parganas Civil Court appointed during 1936-37 and 1937-38: (Q.) p. 31.
Number of processes executed by the District Nazir of the Howrah Civil Courts: (Q.) p. 26.
Stationery articles for process-servers: (Q.) p. 35.
Surplus process-fees: (Q.) p. 23.
Witness shed in the Civil and Criminal Courts, Serajganj: (Q.) p. 22.
Working hours of clerks of Gaibandha Civil Courts: (Q.) p. 21.

Muslim percentage in clerical and subordinate services in Communications and Works Department: (Q.) p. 241.

Muslim temporary clerk. Confirmation of: (Q.) p. 242.

Mymensingh district: Transfer of clerks in the: (Q.) p. 149.

Mymensingh Vidyamoyee Girls' School

Miss Muktaprova Bose, Assistant Head Mistress of: (Q.) p. 89.

Nabaganga

Resuscitation of (Q.) p. 130.

Nabaganga between Naldi and Lohagara

Condition of: (Q.) p. 201.

Names and home addresses

Of clerks and peons in the 24-Parganas Civil Court appointed during 1936-37 and 1937-38 (Q.) p. 30.
Of clerks and peons in the 24-Parganas Collectorate appointed during 1936-37 and 1937-38. (Q.) p. 30.

Nandy, the Hon'ble Maharaja Srischandra, of Cossimbazar

Bhagirathi embankment at Haridasmati, Berhampore, Murshidabad: (Q.) p. 152.
Bongaon-Kamdevpur Road in Jessore district (Q.) p. 244.
Breaches in the Gumti embankment: (Q.) p. 204.
Bridge on Bengal Duars Railway: (Q.) p. 21.
Causes of floods in Murshidabad: (Q.) p. 81.
Comilla-Daudkandi Road: (Q.) p. 254.
Condition of the Nabaganga between Naldi and Lohagara: (Q.) p. 202.
Confirmation of one Muslim temporary clerk: (Q.) p. 242.
Construction of the Pabna-Bera Road: (Q.) p. 255.
Direct road from Naldi to Kalia in Jessore: (Q.) p. 79.

Nandy, the Hon'ble Maharaja Sris-chandra, of Cossimbazar (*contd.*)

Elliot Bridge at Serajganj: (Q.) p. 4.

Establishment of Drawing Office under the Chief Engineer: (Q.) p. 6.

Extension of Bhatiapara Railway line up to Barisal via Madaripur: (Q.) p. 257.

Extension of clerical staff of the Eastern Circle: (Q.) p. 253.

Improvement of lands within Hijole area in Murshidabad: (Q.) p. 198.

Irrigation problems of the province: (Q.) p. 95.

Karatoya Resuscitation Project: (Q.) p. 94.

Muslim percentage in clerical and subordinate services in Communication and Works Department: (Q.) p. 241.

Repair of the Grand Trunk Road. (Q.) p. 206.

Representation regarding Ishurdi-Pabna-Sadhuganj Railway Project. (Q.) p. 129.

Resuscitation of the Nabaganga. (Q.) p. 131.

Roads and bridges projects (Q.) p. 36.

Silting up of the Bishkhali Done, Bakarganj: (Q.) p. 143.

Temporary posts in Eastern Circle. (Q.) p. 141.

Nasker, Mr. Hem Chandra

Repair of the Grand Trunk Road: (Q.) p. 205.

Nazimuddin, the Hon'ble Khwaja Sir, K.C.I.E.

Adjournment Motion: pp. 99, 107-112.

Appointment of an Assistant Matron for Presidency Jail: (Q.) p. 24.

Attacks on Hindu processions by non-Hindus: (Q.) p. 124.

Baby Show at Dinajpur: (Q.) p. 136.

Calcutta Khilafat Committee: (Q.) p. 122.

Change in the Order of Business: pp. 73, 77, 78.

Nazimuddin, the Hon'ble Khwaja Sir, K.C.I.E. (*contd.*)

Cinemas in Bengal excluding Calcutta: (Q.) p. 137.

Complaints against Subdivisional Officer, Balurghat: (Q.) p. 120.

Disallowance of plying motor buses and taxis from Raghunathganj to Daffarpur by Subdivisional Officer of Jangipur: (Q.) p. 153.

Enquiry into accident in Santahar Yard of Eastern Bengal Railway: (Q.) p. 132.

Influx of foreigners into Bengal: (Q.) p. 147.

Issue of bus licences by the Magistrate of the 24-Parganas: (Q.) p. 36.

Poor Fund (Q.) p. 245.

Prisoners' food in jail (Q.) p. 123.

Promotion of Inspectors to the rank of District Superintendents of Police: (Q.) p. 34.

Release of political prisoners: (Q.) p. 244.

Revision of Jail Codes (Q.) p. 125.

Special posts created since 1st April, 1937: (Q.) p. 14.

Statistics of invalid, infirm and deformed persons in Bengal: (Q.) p. 128.

Night classes in Vidyasagar College, Calcutta: (Q.) p. 40.

Noakhali. Prohibition in: (Q.) p. 318.

Non-agriculturist tenants: (Q.) p. 126.

Non-Bengalis in menial services of Government: (Q.) p. 129.

Number of Debt Settlement Officers in Bengal: (Q.) p. 313.

Number of processes executed by the District Nazir of the Howrah Civil Courts: (Q.) p. 25.

Oath

Mr. H. Brabant Smith: p. 1.

Mr. David Hendry: p. 119.

Obituary.

Mr. W. L. Armstrong: p. 2.

Offices of District and Assistant Inspectors of Schools. Revision of pay of clerks in: (Q.) p. 33.

Oppression by the Chittagong Forests Department: (Q.) p. 323.

Order of Agenda. Change in: pp. 97, 98.

Order of Business. Change in. pp. 72-78.

Pabna. Clerical establishment in Civil Courts: (Q.) p. 259.

Pabna-Bera Road. Construction of the. (Q.) p. 255.

Panel of Chairmen

(1) Sir George Campbell
(2) Mr. Sarat Chandra Bose
(3) Mr. Pulin Behary Mullik.
(4) Mrs. Hasina Murshed, M.B.E p. 1

Percentage of Muslims in clerical and subordinate services in Communication and Works Department (Q.) p. 241

Political prisoners. Release of (Q.) p. 244.

Poor Fund: (Q.) p. 244.

Posts. Special—created since 1st April, 1937: (Q.) p. 14.

Present Deputy Director of Sericulture: (Q.) p. 12.

Presidency Jail. Appointment of an Assistant Matron for (Q.) p. 24.

Price of sugar adversely affected by the legislation in the United Provinces and Bihar: (Q.) p. 31.

Prisoners. Political—. Release of: (Q.) p. 244.

Prisoners' food in jail: (Q.) p. 123.

Private deed-writers of Registration Offices in Bengal: (Q.) p. 80.

Privilege, Question of

Regarding expunction of certain sentences of Dr. Nalinaksha Sanyal from the Select Committee Report on the Bengal Money-lenders' Bill: pp. 155-177.

Regarding publication of the Budget Speech in the newspaper prior to the delivery of the same in the House: p. 72.

Regarding Mr. Sibnath Banerjee's difficulty to attend Assembly Sessions in connection with a case against him in the Court of Subdivisional Officer of Howrah p. 281.

Process-fees. Surplus (Q.) p. 23.

Process-servers. Stationery articles for: (Q.) p. 35.

Prohibition in Noakhali: (Q.) p. 318.

Promotion of Inspectors to be District Superintendents of Police (Q.) p. 33.

Rabi crops in Murshidabad: (Q.) p. 309.

Raikut, the Hon'ble Mr. Prasanna Deb

Oppression by the Chittagong Forests Department: (Q.) p. 323.

Prohibition in Noakhali: (Q.) p. 318.

Railway Conciliation Board. Workers in: (Q.) p. 84.

Railway project. Ishurdi-Pabna-Sadhuganj—. Representation regarding: (Q.) p. 128.

Rajibuddin Tarafdar, Maulvi,

Budget Discussion: pp. 231-232.

Rajshahi. Appointment of Government Pleader and Public Prosecutor of: (Q.) p. 11.

Rangpur District Board. Election of: (Q.) p. 256.

Ratio in Government Services and compulsory retirement: (Q.) p. 8.

Registration Employees' Association. All-Bengal: (Q.) p. 311.

Registration offices in Bengal. Private deed-writers of: (Q.) p. 80.

Release of political prisoners: (Q.) p. 244.

Rent clerk in Dacca Collectorate: (Q.) p. 149.

Repair of the Grand Trunk Road: (Q.) p. 205.

Representation regarding Ishurdi-Pabna-Sadhuganj Railway Project: (Q.) p. 128.

Resuscitation of the Nabaganga: (Q.) p. 130.

Resuscitation Project of Karatoya: (Q.) p. 94.

Revenue Department in the regime of present Hon'ble Minister Appointments in. (Q.) p. 319.

Revision of Jail Codes: (Q.) p. 124.

Revision of pay of clerks in offices of District and Assistant Inspectors of Schools: (Q.) p. 33.

Revision of text-books at Government's direction. (Q.) p. 203.

Road, Comilla-Daudkandi: (Q.) p. 254.

Roads and Bridges Projects: (Q.) p. 36.

Roy, the Hon'ble Sir Bijoy Prasad Singh

Agricultural loan in Tippera district: (Q.) p. 311.

Appointments in Revenue Department in the regime of present Hon'ble Minister: (Q.) p. 320.

Chukani holdings in Jalpaiguri Duars Khas Mahal: (Q.) p. 312.

Distress due to floods in Serajganj subdivision: (Q.) p. 150.

Flood relief at Madaripur: (Q.) p. 317.

Gratuitous relief and agricultural loan to flood-affected people of Tippera: (Q.) p. 146.

Gratuitous relief and agricultural loans in the province: (Q.) p. 314.

Grievances of fishermen of Bengal: (Q.) p. 125.

Insufficient Government loan to the flood-stricken people of Bengal: (Q.) p. 9.

Names and home addresses of clerks and peons in the 24-Parganas Collectorate appointed during 1936-37 and 1937-38. p. 30.

Non-agriculturist tenants (Q.) p. 127.

Rabi crops in Murshidabad: (Q.) p. 310

Rent clerk in Dacca Collectorate: (Q.) p. 149

Statistics of landless agriculturists in Bengal. (Q.) p. 3.

Suspension of certificate procedure: (Q.) p. 324.

Transfer of clerks in Mymensingh district. (Q.) p. 149.

Using of Government rent-free land: (Q.) p. 22.

Roy, Mr. Dhananjoy

Appointment to all grades of clerical and menial posts in Civil Courts in Bengal: (Q.) p. 260.

Roy, Mr. Kiran Sankar

Grants to schools functioning in place of defunct circle schools in Bengal: (Q.) p. 313.

Roy, Mr. Patiram

Budget Discussion: pp. 275-276.

Rural Reconstruction Scheme. Introduction of: (Q.) p. 85.

Sagaruddin Ahmed, Mr.

Establishment of Debt Settlement Board at Niamatty, Bakarganj: (Q.) p. 151.

Silting up of the Bishkhali Done, Bakarganj: (Q.) p. 142.

Subidpur Debt Settlement Board, Bakarganj: (Q.) p. 151.

Surplus process-fees. (Q.) p. 23.

Salim, Mr. S. A.

Rent clerk in Dacca Collectorate (Q.) p. 149.

Sanaullah, Dr.

Health Officer for Maternity Home, Suri, Birbhum: (Q.) p. 142

Night classes in Vidyasagar College, Calcutta. (Q.) p. 40

Sanyal, Dr. Nalinaksha

Appointment of an Assistant Matron for Presidency Jail: (Q.) p. 24.

Breach of Privileges p. 72.

Change in the Order of Business. pp. 73, 76, 78.

Disallowance of plying motor buses and taxis from Raghunathganj to Daffarpur by Subdivisional Officer of Jangipur. (Q.) p. 152.

Influx of foreigners into Bengal (Q.) p. 147.

Miss Muktaprova Bose, Assistant Head Mistress, Vidyamoyee Girls' School, Mymensingh: (Q.) p. 89.

Point of Privilege: p. 281.

Price of sugar adversely affected by the legislation in the United Provinces and Bihar: p. 31.

Sanyal, Dr. Nalinaksha (*Contd.*)

Question of Privilege: pp. 155-158, 165, 172.

Roads and Bridges Projects: (Q.) p. 36.

Schemes for dairy farming attached to Bengal Veterinary College: (Q.) p. 27.

Scholarship to a relation of the Hon'ble Minister, Co-operative Credit and Rural Indebtedness: (Q.) p. 247.

Services and posts not under the Public Service Commission, Bengal: (Q.) p. 320.

Special posts created since 1st April, 1937: (Q.) p. 14.

Suppression of Bengal Provincial Students' Federation: (Q.) p. 195.

Sanyal, Mr. Sasanka Sekhar

Bhagirathi embankment at Haridasmati, Berhampore, Murshidabad: (Q.) p. 151.

Budget Discussion. pp. 191-193.

Improvement of lands within Hijole area in Murshidabad: (Q.) p. 198.

Municipality at Beldanga: (Q.) p 252.

Present Deputy Director of Sericulture: (Q.) p. 12.

Statistics of invalid, infirm and deformed persons in Bengal. (Q.) p. 128.

Statistics of landless agriculturists in Bengal: (Q.) p. 3

Status and standard of Government Silk Weaving Institute at Berhampore (Q.) p. 8.

Sarker, Babu Madhusudan

Budget Discussion: p. 299.

Sarker, the Hon'ble Mr. Nalini Ranjan

Appointments in different grades of services: (Q.) p. 243.

Budget Discussion. pp. 335-347.

Budget Speech for 1939-40: pp. 42-72.

Non-Bengalis in menial services of Government: (Q.) p. 129.

Sarkar, the Hon'ble Mr. Nalini Ranjan (*Contd.*)

Ratio in Government services and compulsory retirement: (Q.) p. 9.

Services and posts not under Public Service Commission, Bengal: (Q.) p. 321.

Schemes for Dairy Farming attached to Bengal Veterinary College: (Q.) p. 27.

Scholarship to a relation of Hon'ble Minister, Co-operative Credit and Rural Indebtedness: (Q.) p. 247.

Schools functioning in place of defunct circle schools in Bengal. Grants to: (Q.) p. 313.

Serajganj

Witness-shed in the Civil and Criminal Courts in: (Q.) p. 21.

Serajganj Elliot Bridge: (Q.) p. 4.

Serajganj subdivision. Distress due to floods in: (Q.) p. 150.

Serajul Islam, Mr.

Appointments in different grades of services: (Q.) p. 243.

Bongaon-Kamdevpur Road in Jessore district: (Q.) p. 243.

Bongaon Local Board, Jessore: (Q.) p. 140.

Budget Discussion: pp. 291-292.

Cattle Protection Scheme: (Q.) p. 204.

Gratuitous relief and agricultural loans in the province: (Q.) p. 314.

Services

Appointments in different grades of: (Q.) p. 243.

Services and posts not under Public Service Commission, Bengal: (Q.) p. 320.

Shahedali, Mr.

Budget Discussion: pp. 220-222.

Shamsuddin Ahmed, Mr.

Statement: pp. 159-168.

Shamsuddin Ahmed, the Hon'ble Mr.

Schemes for dairy farming attached to Bengal Veterinary College: (Q.) p. 27.

Silk Weaving Institute of Government at Berhampore. Status and standard of: (Q.) p. 8.

Silting up of the Bishkhali Done, Bakarganj: (Q.) p. 142.

Singha, Babu Kshetra Nath

Budget Discussion: pp. 222-223.

Election of Rangpur District Board: (Q.) p. 256.

Tribute to Lord Brabourne: pp. 307-308.

Smoke evils in the residential quarters of railway staff: (Q.) p. 2.

Speaker, Mr. (The Hon'ble Khan Bahadur M. Azizul Haque, C.I.E.) Rulings and observations on

Adjournment Motion regarding promulgation of Bengal Jute Ordinance: p. 41.

Adjournment Motion regarding promulgation of section 144 of Criminal Procedure Code in the Burdwan district: pp. 99-100.

Change in the Order of the Agenda: (Q.) pp. 97-98.

Change in the Order of Business: pp. 74, 75, 76, 77, 78.

Informing the House of His Excellency Lord Brabourne's sad death: p. 301.

Message conveying wishes for His Excellency's speedy recovery: p. 155.

Question of Privilege raised by Dr. Nalinaksha Sanyal regarding expunction of certain sentences from the Select Committee Report on the Bengal Money-lenders' Bill: pp. 156-157, 158, 173.

pcial posts created since 1st April, 1937: (Q.) p. 14.

atement of Mr. Shamsuddin Ahmed: pp. 159-168.

ationery articles for process-servers: (Q.) p. 35.

atistics

Of invalid, infirm and deformed persons in Bengal (Q.) p. 128.

Of landless agriculturists in Bengal (Q.) p. 3.

ates and standard of Government Silk Weaving Institute at Berhampore (Q.) p. 8.

udents' Federation. Bengal Provincial —. Suppression of (Q.) p. 195.

bdivisional munsif system. Abolition of (Q.) p. 26.

bdpur Debt Settlement Board, Bakarganj: (Q.) p. 151.

b-Registrars. Appointment of Muhammadans for last two years (Q.) p. 199.

b-Registry Offices. Female waiting room in (Q.) p. 317.

gar

Price of—adversely affected by the legislation in the United Provinces and Bihar (Q.) p. 31.

hrawardy, the Hon'ble Mr. H. S.

Change in the Order of Business p. 77.

Introduction of Rural Reconstruction Scheme (Q.) p. 85.

Price of sugar adversely affected by the legislation in the United Provinces and Bihar (Q.) p. 32.

Workers in Railway Conciliation Board (Q.) p. 84.

Suppression of Bengal Provincial Students' Federation: (Q.) p. 195.

Suri, Birbhum. Health Officer for Maternity Home (Q.) p. 142.

Surplus process-fees: (Q.) p. 23.

Suspension of certificate procedure: (Q.) p. 323.

System of ballot voting by symbols in Municipal and Union Board Elections (Q.) p. 133.

Tamizuddin Khan, the Hon'ble Mr.

Cattle Protection Scheme (Q.) p. 204.

Damage of *kalai* crops in Murshidabad (Q.) p. 205.

Health Officer for Maternity Home, Suri Birbhum (Q.) p. 142.

Smoke evils in the residential quarters of railway staff (Q.) p. 3.

Temporary posts in Eastern Circle: (Q.) p. 141.

Tenants, non-agriculturist: (Q.) p. 126.

Text-books

Revision of at Government's direction (Q.) p. 203.

Thakur, Mr. Promatha Ranjan

Budget Discussion pp. 325-326.

Time-limit of speeches on the General Discussion of the Budget p. 117.

Tippera district. Agricultural loan in (Q.) p. 310.

Transfer of clerks in Mymensingh district: (Q.) p. 149.

Tribute to late Lord Brabourne: pp. 302-309.

Using of Government rent-free land: (Q.) p. 22.

Vidyasagar College, Calcutta: Night classes in: (Q.) p. 40.

Witness shed in the Civil and Criminal Courts, Serajganj: (Q.) p. 21.

Wordsworth, Mr. W. C.

Adjournment Motion: pp. 112-114.

Workers in Railway Conciliation Board: (Q.) p. 84.

Working hours of clerks of Gaibandha Civil Courts: (Q.) p. 20.

Zaman, Mr. A. M. A.

Budget Discussion: pp. 278-279.

B. G. Press—1939-40—6137A—800.